IEEE 802ECSG  
OmniRAN

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes of OmniRAN EC SG Meeting in Los Angeles, CA, USA | | | | |
| Date: January 21-23, 2014 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Juan Carlos Zuniga | InterDigital | 1000 Sherbrooke W  10th Floor  Montreal, QC, Canada | +1 (514) 904 6300 | j.c.zuniga@ieee.org |

Abstract

Minutes of the OmniRAN EC SG meeting from face to face meeting in Los Angeles from 21st to 23rd of January, 2014.

**Tuesday, January 21st, 2014**

Chair: Max Riegel

Recording secretary: Juan Carlos Zuniga

**Call to order**

* Meeting called to order on Tuesday January 21, 2014 by Max Riegel at 10:30 hrs (PST).

**Appointment of secretary**

* Secretary position remains open as no volunteer showed up.
* Juan Carlos Zuniga volunteered to take notes

**Attendence**

* Attendence was recorded by attendance paper sheet.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **First** | **Name** | **Affiliation** |
| Daniel | Borges | Apple |
| Paul | Bottorff | HP |
| Woo-Jin | Byun | ETRI |
| Paul | Congdon | Tallac Networks |
| Yonggang | Fang | ZTE |
| James | Gilb | Tensorcom |
| Byun Jang | Jeong | ETRI |
| Funihide | Kojima | NICT |
| Jouni | Korhonen | Broadcom |
| Joe | Kwak | InterDigital |
| Roger | Marks | EthAirNet Assoc. |
| Michael | Montemurro | Blackberry |
| Hiro | Onishi | Alpine Electronics |
| Max | Riegel | NSN |
| Dick | Roy | SRA |
| Behcet | Sarikaya | Huawei |
| Pat | Thaler | Broadcom |
| Diego | Vincentin | Princeton University |
| Tao | Xing | Wuxi Sensingnet Institute |
| Xun | Yang | Huawei |
| Juan Carlos | Zuniga | InterDigital |

**Agenda**

<https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/14/omniran-14-0001-00-ecsg-jan-2014-losangeles-f2f-meeting-slides.pptx>

* Approval of minutes
* Reports
  + Summary documentation of OmniRAN
* Outline of the intended specification
  + Intentions and tentative ToC
  + Technical contributions
  + Tenets of IEEE 802 Access Network
* SDN Use Case Topics
  + Report on ONF status and activities
  + ToC Proposal
* Organization of the work
  + Cooperation with the other IEEE 802 WGs
    - Liaisons, inbound and outbound
  + Operation within IEEE 802.1
* Conference calls until March 2014 session
* Liaison report to IEEE 802 WGs
* AOB

**Approval of minutes**

* <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0097-00-ecsg-meeting-minutes-for-nov-2013-dallas-f2f.docx>
* Minutes of Nov meeting approved without objections
* <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0098-00-ecsg-meeting-minutes-december-11th-confcall.docx>
* Minutes of Dec conference call approved without objections

**Technical Reports**

* Max Riegel: Brief introduction to OmniRAN P802.1CF
  + <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0099-00-0000-brief-introduction-into-omniran-p802-1cf.pptx>
  + Group agreed that presented content appropriately reflects the OmniRAN project. Document should be made available on the OmniRAN website.
* Max Riegel: OmniRAN Results and Proposal
  + <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0100-00-0000-omniran-results-and-proposals.pptx>
  + Group discussion:
  + Include R5 again and identify gaps that can help the system, even if these are not 802-specific.
    - Gaps can be communicated to external organizations, e.g. WFA and ONF.
* Yonggang Fang: Recommended Practice ToC proposal
  + <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/14/omniran-14-0004-00-0000-toc-comments.pptx>
  + Group discussion
  + Proposal to the contributor: To clearly identify need for additional section in ToC, please update presentation with more comprehensive proposal of proposed contend for the ‘network configuration’ section based on the latest ToC

Meeting recessed at 12:30 hrs.

**Call to order**

Meeting reconvenied at 13:30 by Max Riegel.

* Behcet Sarikaya: SDN-based Control Plane and Data Plane Separation in OmniRAN Network Reference Model
  + <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/14/omniran-14-0002-00-0000-sdn-based-control-plane-and-data-plane-separation-in-omniran-network-reference-model.pptx>
  + Group discussion:
  + Proposal to the contributor: To better understand the need for putting a different label to the datapath part of the R3 reference point, please provide a more detailed proposal for the description of the datapath interface. So far, the MAC SAP of the Ethernet protocol stack is considered as datapath interface.
* Max Riegel: Thoughts about Tenets for 802.1CF
  + <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/14/omniran-14-0006-00-0000-thoughts-about-the-tenets-in-802-1cf.pptx>
  + Tenets should map to specific sections of the specification
  + <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/14/omniran-14-0005-00-0000-examples-for-the-802-1cf-tenets.docx>
  + Specification will define attributes, but may make reference to external specifications (e.g. OpenFlow, SNMP, CAPWAP, etc)
  + Roger/group: List of Tenets should be included as an informative annex at the end of the specification, making clear that the guidelines are (were) provided for the developers of the specification and not for the final reader/implementer.
  + List does not need to be finalized before writing the rest of the specification. It can grow in time as the group makes agreements about the way forward.

Meeting recessed at 15:20 hrs.

**Wednesday, January 22nd, 2014 PM1**

**Call to order**

Meeting reconvenied by Max Riegel at 13:33 hrs.

* Paul Congdon: Updte about ONF Wireless and Mobile WG
  + <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/14/omniran-14-0009-00-0000-onf-wireless-and-mobile-wg-status-update.pptx>
  + OmniRAN considered officially as one of the Use Cases considered by the ONF Wireless and Mobile WG
  + Roger asked for showing the presentation in the Wireless SDN BoF on Thursday.
* Juan Carlos Zuniga/Antonio de la Oliva: SDN Case ToC
  + <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/14/omniran-14-0007-00-0000-sdn-use-case-toc.pptx>
  + Group discussion:
    - Agreement about defining abstraction layers
    - Wireless/wired distinction should be Ethernet or not, as technologies such as 802.16 use Ethernet frames, but 802.11 does not
  + Agreement to generate based on this contribution an OmniRAN presentation to the Wireless BoF on Thursday about the status of the SDN Use Case in OmniRAN.
    - <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/14/omniran-14-0011-00-ecsg-omniran-update-on-sdn-use-case-for-bof-session.pptx>

Meeting recessed at 15:23

**Thursday, January 23rd, 2014 AM2**

Meeting reconvenied at 10:33

* Max Riegel: Reviewed status of discussion based on updated agenda slides
* <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/14/omniran-14-0001-01-ecsg-jan-2014-losangeles-f2f-meeting-slides.pptx>
* Max Riegel: OmniRAN Next Steps and Cooperation with External Groups
* <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0094-00-ecsg-considerations-for-cooperation-with-802-wgs.pptx>
* Mike Montemurro: On Slide 5, Scanning should probably be updated with Network Discovery. This would also match better with the proposed sections mentioned on Slide 6.
* Max Riegel: Network Detection Selection text example
* <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/14/omniran-14-0010-00-0000-network-detection-selection-text-example.docx>
* Juan Carlos Zuniga: Will text be drafted here and sent for comments?
* Max: We can consider different approaches. I would like experts to participate.
* Mike: For 802.11, the best group would be ARC.
* Max: For March meeting we could probably send out text.
* Max: Slides were presented in 802.19.1 and the group agreed to submit a group presentation responding to the request from OmniRAN’s chair
* OmniRAN can do several things to attract participants out of the WGs
  + Co-located sessions
  + Alignment of meeting schedules
  + Joint meetings
  + Attendance credit (TBD)
  + Teleconferences and email discussions
* Pat Thaler: 802.1 can do TG ballots, where comments are received and yes/no votes are less important. Not restricted to 802.1 WG voting members but can also invite comments out of other WGs.
* Max: does 802.1 make use of comment resolution groups?
* Pat: normally the editor does an initial comment resolution and posts it to the task group days before the meeting.
* Max: are there many technical votes at the WG level in 802.1?
* Pat/Paul: Very rarely. It has been probably years since the last technical vote was taken.
* Max: Meeting arrangements will be made to coordinate agenda time with the rest of the 802.1 WG.
* Max: Whether OmniRAN will meet in May with the wireless or the wired groups is still TBD.
* Max: One of the groups that has been addressed the less is 802.15. This is a case that will require further study.
* Max: about contribution 14-0010, that text will be discussed with WGs as a kind of dry-run to establish effective communication with other WGs
* Yonggang: We still need to discuss the ToC
* Max: Going into one section as procedural example is orthogonal to the continuation of the ToC discussion. The example text will be used to establish the communications with the other WGs. It is not a wasted effort as regardless of the final conclusion about the ToC, the content of the example will be needed for the final specification.

**Next steps until March meeting**

* Max Riegel: One conference call proposed: Wednesday 26th of February
* Agenda for teleconference: Text for NSD, SDN, ToC and March Agenda

**Liaison to 802.11**

* Mike Montemurro brought up proposal, which was unanimously revised by group.
* <https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/14/omniran-14-0008-00-ecsg-omniran-es-sg-liaison-report-january-2014.pptx>

**AOB**

* no other topics brought up

**Adjournment**

* Meeting adjourned at 12:27 hrs PST