
**IEEE P802.22
Wireless RANs**

IEEE 802.22b ISO PSDO Ballot Comment Resolutions**Date:** 2016-11-08**Author(s):**

Name	Company	Address	Phone	email
Apurva Mody	WhiteSpace Alliance	Chelmsford, MA, USA	+1-404-819-0314	Apurva.mody@WhiteSpaceAlliance.org

Abstract

This document provides the IEEE 802.22b Comment Resolutions to the 60 Day ISO/IEC/JTC1 Ballot

IEEE 802.22b ISO/IEC/JTC1 Comments and Resolutions

BACKGROUND

- IEEE 802.22b 60-day pre-ballot passed on 3 April 2016 but a response is required
- **Drafts sent to SC6: sent**
- IEEE 802.22b was liaised in July 2015 to SC6 to allow them to become familiar with it before submission for approval under the PSDO process
- **60-day pre-ballot: passed on 3 April 2016 and a response is required**
- IEEE 802.22b was submitted for 60-day ballot in December 2015, and after a delay the ballot passed on 3 April 2016 (N16415)
- Substantive comments were received from China NB & Japan NB

- **China NB comment 1**
- *The security in both ISO/IEC/IEEE 802.22a (6N16378) and ISO/IEC/IEEE 802.22b (6N16379) is based on IEEE 802.1X. Since the technical concerns China NB proposed in 6N15555 still haven't been reasonably disposed in this text, China NB has to vote against on this ballot*
- **China NB request 1**
- *Remove the IEEE 802.1X-2010-related descriptions from the text.*

- **IEEE 802 response to China NB comment & request 1**
- The China NB has requested that IEEE 802.1X-2010 related descriptions are removed from the text of IEEE 802.22b.
- IEEE 802 declines to make this change because:
 - IEEE 802.22b does not contain any IEEE 802.1X-2010 related descriptions
 - There is no technical justification to remove any IEEE 802.1X-2010 related descriptions from any standard
- While the base IEEE 802.22-2011 specification does reference various IEEE 802.1 specifications including IEEE 802.1X, IEEE 802.22b includes no such references.
- IEEE 802 recognizes that the China NB has asserted this in past that man-in-the-middle (and other) attacks are possible against IEEE 802.1X based systems. However, the technical details of such an attack (or a demonstration of an attack) have not yet been supplied by the China NB. In the absence of technical substantiation of the claims, there is no justification to remove references to IEEE 802.1X-2010 from any standard.

- **Japan NB comment 1**
- *There is Radio Act before using the frequency band for analog television broadcasting service in Japan.*
- **Japan NB request 1**
- *Align technology with Radio Act.*

- **IEEE 802 response to Japan NB comment & request 1**
- *During the next revision of IEEE 802.22b, IEEE 802.22 WG will consider adding a paragraph in an Annex that will ensure that 802.22 systems will adhere to the Japanese Radio Act for co-existence with the analog TV*

