

---

**IEEE P802.19**  
**Wireless Coexistence**

---

Project IEEE P802.19 Wireless Coexistence WG

---

Title **Compendium of Comment Resolution Committee Teleconference Minutes**

---

Date Submitted July 1, 2020

---

Source Benjamin A. Rolfe  
Blind Creek Associates E-mail: Ben.Rolfe @ ieee.org

---

Re: Task Group 3 Comment Resolution Committee

---

Abstract Collects together the minutes from each CRC teleconference call into one convenient document.

---

Purpose Provide the meeting minutes for easy reference.

---

Notice This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.19. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.

---

Release The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by IEEE P802.19.

---

## Table of Contents

Wed, May 13, 2020.....	5
Attendance.....	5
Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides.....	5
Agenda.....	5
Review of comments received.....	6
Next Steps.....	6
AoB.....	6
Adjourned.....	6
Wed, May 20, 2020.....	7
Attendance.....	7
Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides.....	7
Agenda.....	7
Review of comments received.....	8
Next Steps.....	8
AoB.....	8
Adjourned.....	8
Wed, May 27, 2020.....	9
Attendance.....	9
Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides.....	9
Agenda.....	9
Comment Resolution.....	10
Next Steps.....	10
July Virtual Plenary.....	10
AoB.....	11
Adjourned.....	11
Wed, Jun 03, 2020.....	12
Attendance.....	12
Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides.....	12
Agenda.....	12
Comment Resolution.....	13
Next Steps.....	13
July Virtual Plenary.....	13
AoB.....	13
Adjourned.....	14
Wed, Jun 10, 2020.....	15
Attendance.....	15
Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides.....	15
Agenda.....	15
Comment Resolution.....	16
Motions:.....	16
Next Steps.....	17
July Virtual Plenary.....	17
AoB.....	17

---

Adjourned .....	17
Wed, July 1, 2020 .....	18
Attendance.....	18
Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides .....	18
Agenda .....	18
Ballot Report .....	19
Comment Review and Resolution.....	19
July Virtual Plenary, Next Steps .....	19
AoB.....	20
Adjourned .....	20
Wed, Jul 08, 2020.....	21
Attendance.....	21
Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides .....	21
Agenda .....	21
Comment Resolution .....	22
CRC Motions.....	22
July Virtual Plenary (Next Steps).....	22
AoB.....	23
Adjourned .....	23
Useful Links .....	24
Recirculation 1 .....	24
Recirculation 2 .....	24



## Wed, May 13, 2020

Called to order 0702 PDT.

### Attendance

<b>CRC Roll Call</b>	<b>May 13, 2020</b>
Benjamin Rolfe	Yes
Jianlin Guo	Yes
Kazuto Yano	Yes
Takenori Sumi	Yes
Shoichi Kitazawa	Yes
Joerg Robert	Yes
<b>Quorum</b>	<b>Yes</b>

Other: None.

Quorum is met.

### Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides

IEEE Patent, copyright and conduct slides presented (see 802.19-20/0011r00 "Meeting Preamble").

An opportunity for disclosures is provided by the chair: No disclosures heard.

### Agenda

Agenda:

1. Meeting Preamble
2. Review comments received on 2nd recirculation
3. Next steps
4. AoB

Following neither discussion nor objection, agenda is approved by unanimous consent.

## Review of comments received

Reviewed and had discussion of comments in Document 802.19-20/0015r0

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0015-00-0003-second-wg-recirculation-comments.xlsx>

Editorial comments to be reviewed by Technical Editor, who will identify any requiring discussion.

Technical and General worked on by the group and assigned to volunteers for resolution. Results of work captured in Document 802.19-20/0015r1.

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0015-01-0003-second-wg-recirculation-comments.xlsx>

## Next Steps

Plan: Assignees to work and report on reflector and next call per assignments in 802.19-20/0015r1.

## AoB

None

## Adjourned

Having reached the end of the agenda, meeting adjourned 0803 PDT.

---

## Wed, May 20, 2020

Called to order at 15:01 Pacific Time

### Attendance

<b>CRC Roll Call</b>	<b>May 13, 2020</b>
Benjamin Rolfe	Yes
Jianlin Guo	Yes
Kazuto Yano	Yes
Takenori Sumi	Yes
Shoichi Kitazawa	Yes
Joerg Robert	Yes
<b>Quorum</b>	<b>Yes</b>

Other: None.

Quorum is met.

### Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides

IEEE Patent, copyright and conduct slides presented (see 802.19-20/0016r00 "Meeting Preamble"). <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0016-00-0003-crc-telecon-slides.pptx>

An opportunity for disclosures is provided by the chair: No disclosures heard.

### Agenda

Agenda:

1. Meeting Preamble
2. Comment resolution (continued)
3. Next steps
4. AoB

Following neither discussion nor objection, agenda is approved by unanimous consent.

## Review of comments received

Editor has updated with editing progress: 802.19-20/0015r2

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0015-02-0003-second-wg-recirculation-comments.xlsx> Reviewed and discussed.

Editorial report: 76 comment resolutions have been applied (65.52%).

Editorials requiring discussion: Discussed and recorded in revised comment XLS.

Results of work captured in Document 802.19-20/0015r3.

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0015-03-0003-second-wg-recirculation-comments.xlsx>

## Next Steps

Continue comment resolution.

- Editor to apply those marked as Ready.
- BR expects to have revised figures and text for 9.6 and 9.7 summary sub-clauses for next weeks call
- JR to have revised figure 2 by next call
- JG working on parameter descriptions, will report progress on next call

## AoB

None

## Adjourned

Having reached the end of the agenda, meeting adjourned 1557 PDT.



---

## Wed, May 27, 2020

Called to order at 07:03 Pacific Time

### Attendance

<b>CRC Roll Call</b>	<b>May 27, 2020</b>
Benjamin Rolfe	Yes
Jianlin Guo	Yes
Kazuto Yano	Yes
Takenori Sumi	Yes
Shoichi Kitazawa	Yes
Joerg Robert	No
<b>Quorum</b>	<b>Yes</b>

Other: None.

Quorum is met.

### Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides

IEEE Patent, copyright and conduct slides presented (see 802.19-20/0016r02 "Meeting Preamble"). <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0016-02-0003-crc-telecon-slides.pptx>

An opportunity for disclosures is provided by the chair: No disclosures heard.

### Agenda

Agenda:

1. Meeting Preamble
2. Comment resolution (continued)
3. Next steps
4. July virtual plenary
5. AoB

Following neither discussion nor objection, agenda is approved by unanimous consent.

## Comment Resolution

Editor has updated with editing progress: 802.19-20/0015r4

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0015-04-0003-second-wg-recirculation-comments.xlsx>

Reviewed and discussed proposed resolutions.

Results of work captured in Document 802.19-20/0015r5.

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0015-05-0003-second-wg-recirculation-comments.xlsx>

Review of assignments outstanding:

- JG completed parameter descriptions.
- BR and JR still have figures to provide, not done yet.
- BR to deal with the equations that are bit-maps.

## Next Steps

- Continue comment resolution.
- Editor to apply those marked as Ready.
- BR expects to have revised figures and text for 9.6 and 9.7 summary sub-clauses for next weeks call
- JR to have revised figure 2 by next call

## July Virtual Plenary

Report:

- The 802 EC has decided to hold a virtual plenary session in July
- Details are still being worked out
- 802.11 and 802.15 WGs will have virtual meetings
- 802.19 chair is undecided
  - requested input from TG3

Discussion:

- CRC calls are progressing OK
- Primary goal for July plenary is EC approval to initiate SA ballot
  - If can work out WG motions needed far enough ahead, then WG meeting not needed;
  - A virtual WG meeting would provide a chance for WG motions if needed before EC meeting
- TG is OK either way so long as the goal is met

- TG Chair to work with WG chair

## **AoB**

None

## **Adjourned**

Having reached the end of the agenda, meeting adjourned 0747 PDT.

---

## Wed, Jun 03, 2020

Called to order at 15:02 PDT

### Attendance

<b>CRC Roll Call</b>	<b>June 3, 2020</b>
Benjamin Rolfe	Yes
Jianlin Guo	Yes
Kazuto Yano	Yes
Takenori Sumi	Yes
Shoichi Kitazawa	Yes
Joerg Robert	Yes
<b>Quorum</b>	<b>Yes</b>

Other: None.

Quorum is met.

### Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides

IEEE Patent, copyright and conduct slides presented (see 802.19-20/0016r04 "Meeting Preamble"). <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0016-04-0003-crc-telecon-slides.pptx>

An opportunity for disclosures is provided by the chair: No disclosures heard.

### Agenda

Proposed Agenda:

1. Meeting Preamble
2. Comment resolution (continued)
3. Next steps
4. AoB

Following neither discussion nor objection, agenda is approved by unanimous consent.

## Comment Resolution

The current comment spreadsheet is: 802.19-20/0015r5

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0015-05-0003-second-wg-recirculation-comments.xlsx>

Figures have been revised in Visio. JG will pass the editor "pen" to BR to incorporate the figures and equations.

Review of assignments outstanding:

- BR to insert figures and equations
- JG to check when that is done

## Next Steps

- Complete and approve comment resolutions.
- Complete and review draft
- Approve draft for recirculation
- Get WG and EC approval to commence SA balloting

## July Virtual Plenary

Report:

- The 802 EC has decided to hold a virtual plenary session in July
- Further discussion on the June 2 call, but details remain undecided
  - There is ongoing discussion on if we call it a plenary
  - Further changes to 802 rules may be required
- 802.11 and 802.15 WGs still plan to have virtual meetings
- 802.19 not sure
  - Provided TG3 input from May 27th call to WG Chair
  - TG chair to work with WG officers to ensure goals can be met

## AoB

None.

## **Adjourned**

Having reached the end of the agenda, and hearing no objections, the meeting is adjourned at 15:35 PDT.

---

## Wed, Jun 10, 2020

Called to order at 07:02 PDT

### Attendance

CRC Roll Call	June 10, 2020
Benjamin Rolfe	Yes
Jianlin Guo	Yes
Kazuto Yano	Yes
Takenori Sumi	Yes
Shoichi Kitazawa	Yes
Joerg Robert	Yes
<b>Quorum</b>	<b>Yes</b>

Other: None.

Quorum is met.

### Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides

IEEE Patent, copyright and conduct slides presented (see 802.19-20/0016r04 "Meeting Preamble").

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0016-04-0003-crc-telecon-slides.pptx>

An opportunity for disclosures is provided by the chair: No disclosures heard.

### Agenda

Proposed Agenda:

1. Meeting preamble
2. Status updates
3. Technical contributions
4. Next steps
5. Any other business

Following neither discussion nor objection, agenda is approved by unanimous consent.

## Comment Resolution

### Status:

The current comment spreadsheet is: 802.19-20/0015r6

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0015-06-0003-second-wg-recirculation-comments.xlsx>

The resolutions in r6 have been applied and a proposed D04 has been uploaded (draft area).

Following the meeting, the approved comment resolution and status changes are uploaded as 802.19-20/0015r7.

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0015-07-0003-second-wg-recirculation-comments.xlsx>

### Technical contributions:

Summary text for clause 9.6 and 9.7 in doc # 802.19-20/0017r0 is presented and discussed. Editorial changes identified. Following discussion and revision, doc # 802.19-20/0015r1 is approved.

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0017-01-0003-clause-9-6-and-9-7-proposed-comment-resolutions.docx>

## Motions:

### Approve Comment Resolutions:

Move that the comment resolutions contained in document 19-20-0015-07 be approved and direct the Technical Editor to apply resolutions to produce P802-19.3-D04.

- Moved by: Jianlin Guo
- Seconded by: Shoichi Kitazawa
- Discussion: None
- Following neither discussion nor objection, motion carries by unanimous consent

### Initiate recirculation:

Move that 802.19 WG start a WG Electronic Ballot recirculating Draft P802-19.3-D04 to approve to forward document P802-19.3-D04 to Standards Association Ballot.

- Moved by: Jianlin Guo
- Seconded by: Joerg Robert
- Discussion: None
- Following neither discussion nor objection, motion carries by unanimous consent



## Next Steps

- Complete and approve comment resolutions. - DONE
- Approve recirculation -DONE
- Get WG and EC approval to commence SA balloting
- There will be a virtual 802 meeting in July, details being decided

## July Virtual Plenary

Report:

- The 802 EC has decided to hold a virtual session in July
- EC ballot underway to allow it to be a formal plenary
- The status is thus yet to be decided
  - If declared a plenary, WG elections will be required
  - Stay tuned to email reflectors for further updates
- 802.11 and 802.15 WGs still plan to have virtual meetings
- 802.19 will likely have a virtual WG session
- Task group 3 may have additional meetings that week if decided
  - TG Chair will schedule 1 meeting at the normal CRC call time (if allowed)
  - If CRC/TG members desire additional slots, advise the TG chair

## AoB

None.

## Adjourned

Having reached the end of the agenda, and hearing no objections, the meeting is adjourned at 07:47 PDT.

---

## Wed, July 1, 2020

Called to order at 15:05 PDT

### Attendance

<b>CRC Roll Call</b>	<b>June 10, 2020</b>
Benjamin Rolfe	Yes
Jianlin Guo	Yes
Kazuto Yano	Yes
Takenori Sumi	Yes
Shoichi Kitazawa	No
Joerg Robert	No
<b>Quorum</b>	<b>Yes</b>

Other: None.

Quorum is met [4/6].

### Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides

IEEE Patent, copyright and conduct slides presented (see 802.19-20/0016r06 "Meeting Preamble").

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0016-06-0003-crc-telecon-slides.pptx>

An opportunity for disclosures is provided by the chair: No disclosures heard.

### Agenda

Proposed Agenda:

1. Meeting preamble
2. Ballot report
3. Comment review and resolution
4. July virtual plenary planning / Next steps
5. Any other business

Following neither discussion nor objection, agenda is approved by unanimous consent.

## Ballot Report

- Vote stats:
  - Approve: 30
  - Disapprove: 2
  - Abstain: 3
  - Approval Rate: 93.75%
- Result: Ballot Passed
- Comments: 65 comments were received
  - General: 26
  - Technical: 9
  - Editorial: 30
  - Technical MBS: 9

Comment XLS: 802.19-20/0027r0

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0027-00-0003-wg-recirculation-comments-3.xlsx>

## Comment Review and Resolution

Editorial: Reviewed editorial comments and agreed to pass to TE to resolve.

General and Technical: Reviewed all, resolutions recored for all but 2:

- 58 : Assigned to Ben, to review each reference and verify it is properly cited or identify for moving to Bibliography.
- 60 : Assigned to Ben, revise definition to include improved resilience as a goal. Projected to be completed by next call

Proposed comment resolutions uploaded as 802.19-20/0027r1.

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0027-01-0003-wg-recirculation-comments-3.xlsx>

## July Virtual Plenary, Next Steps

Timeline for Draft 5: Prior to July 8th CRC call:

- Proposed resolutions to comment 56 and 60 to be circulated via email
- TE to review editorials and apply and/or identify items for discussion

On July 8th CRC call:

- Review and approve comment resolutions
- Approve recirculation of Draft 5

Virtual plenary objectives:

- Renew CRC (July WG)
- WG motion to start SA ballot (July WG)
- EC Approval to start SA ballot (July EC)

## **AoB**

None.

## **Adjourned**

Having reached the end of the agenda, and hearing no objections, the meeting is adjourned at 16:14 PDT.

---

## Wed, Jul 08, 2020

Called to order at 07:04 PDT

### Attendance

<b>CRC Roll Call</b>	<b>June 10, 2020</b>
Benjamin Rolfe	Yes
Jianlin Guo	Yes
Kazuto Yano	Yes
Takenori Sumi	Yes
Shoichi Kitazawa	Yes
Joerg Robert	Yes
<b>Quorum</b>	<b>Yes</b>

Other: Yuki Nagai

Quorum is met [6/6].

### Meeting preamble: IEEE-SA Policy slides

IEEE Patent, copyright and conduct slides presented (see 802.19-20/0016r07 "Meeting Preamble").

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0016-07-0003-crc-telecon-slides.pptx>

An opportunity for disclosures is provided by the chair: No disclosures heard.

### Agenda

Proposed Agenda:

1. Meeting preamble (the usual slides)
2. Editor's Report
3. Comment Resolution
4. July Virtual Plenary planning
5. Any other business

Following neither discussion nor objection, agenda is approved by unanimous consent.

## Comment Resolution

Editor report: TE presents status and comments that need discussion from Comment XLS: 802.19-20/0027r3

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0027-03-0003-wg-recirculation-comments-3.xlsx>

Document 802.19-20/0016r1 is presented and discussed:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0028-01-0003-comment-resolution-contribution.docx>

Following discussion, rev 2 is uploaded with suggested changes and approved by the group:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0028-02-0003-comment-resolution-contribution.docx>

The comment XLS is revised to include all comment resolutions and uploaded as 802.19-20/0027r4.

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0027-04-0003-wg-recirculation-comments-3.xlsx>

### CRC Motions

#### Approve Comment Resolutions:

Move that the comment resolutions contained in document 19-20-0027-04 be approved and direct the Technical Editor to apply resolutions to produce P802-19.3-D05.

- Moved by: Jianlin Guo
- Seconded by: Joerg Robert
- Discussion: None
- Hearing neither discussion nor objection motion carries by unanimous consent

#### Initiate recirculation:

Move that 802.19 WG start a WG Electronic Ballot recirculating Draft P802-19.3-D05 to approve to forward document P802-19.3-D05 to Standards Association Ballot.

- Moved by: Jianlin Guo
- Seconded by: Joerg Robert
- Discussion: None
- Hearing neither discussion nor objection motion carries by unanimous consent

## July Virtual Plenary (Next Steps)

Timeline for Draft 5:

- TE to complete D05 by end of this week
- TG Chair and WG Vice Chair to initiate recirculation

Virtual plenary objectives:

- We will have two (2) Task Group meetings on our usual call rotation:
  - Wed 15-July 18:00 EDT (15:00 PDT)
  - Wed 22-July 10:00 EDT (07:00 PDT)
- Working Group Meetings:
  - Opening: Mon 13-July 16:00 EDT (13:00 PDT)
  - Closing: Thr 23-July 16:00 EDT (13:00 PDT)
- WG motion to start SA ballot (conditional)
- EC Approval to start SA ballot (conditional)

## **AoB**

None.

## **Adjourned**

Having reached the end of the agenda, and hearing no objections, the meeting is adjourned at 08:09 PDT.

## Useful Links

### Recirculation 1

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0016-05-0003-crc-telecon-slides.pptx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0015-07-0003-second-wg-recirculation-comments.xlsx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0017-01-0003-clause-9-6-and-9-7-proposed-comment-resolutions.docx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0020-01-0003-figures-in-word-equation-editor.zip>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0018-01-0003-figures-9-thru-18-visio.zip>

### Recirculation 2

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0016-09-0003-crc-telecon-slides.pptx>

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.19/dcn/20/19-20-0027-04-0003-wg-recirculation-comments-3.xlsx>