IEEE P802.19
Wireless Coexistence

|  |
| --- |
| TG1 November 2012 Plenary Minutes |
| Date: 2012-11-15 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Company | Address | Phone | email |
| Mika Kasslin | Nokia | Otaniementie 19, 02150 Espoo, Finland | +358-50-4836294 | mika.kasslin@nokia.com |

The document contains IEEE 802.19 TG1 minutes from the November 2012 Plenary.

# **Monday November 12th, 2012 PM2**

The meeting was called to order at 16:00.

### Call for secretary

Nobody from the TG volunteered for secretary for the meeting and the TG chair acted as the recording secretary for the TG for the November 2012 session.

### IEEE IPR statement

The chair informed the TG about the IEEE patent policy and showed the set of 5 slides identified as “Highlights of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws* on Patents in Standards” available at the IEEE PATCOM web site (<http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>).

The chair made a call for essential patents: No one came forward.

### Approval of minutes from the TG1 September 2012 meeting and TG1 teleconferences since the September 2012 meeting

**Motion: Approve TG1 minutes (19-12/0164r4) from the September 2012 interim meeting**

**Moved by: S.Filin**

**Seconded by: H.Kang**

**Motion passes with unanimous consent**

**Motion: Approve minutes from TG1 teleconferences on October 10 2012 (19-12/0187r0), October 31 2012 (19-12/0190r0) and November 7 2012 (19-12/0203r0)**

**Moved by: S.Filin**

**Seconded by: J.Junell**

**Motion passes with unanimous consent**

### Review and discuss TG1 status and objectives for this session

The chair presented an opening report (19-12/0211r0). The objective of the week is to review and discuss all the comment groups. Additionally, the TG is expected to resolve as many comments as possible.

### Review and discuss draft topics

The chair gave a presentation on TG1 draft topics for November 2012 (19-12/0208r0). The intention is to address the selected comments per groups/topics instead of addressing them one-by-one.

### Call for submissions, discussions and approval of agenda

The chair gave an introduction to agenda proposal in 19-12/0207r1.

**Motion: Approve TG1 agenda (19-12/0207r1) for the November 2012 plenary**

**Moved by: S.Shellhammer**

**Seconded by: S.Filin**

**Motion passes with unanimous consent**

The meeting was recessed at 17:00.

# **Tuesday November 13th, 2012 AM1**

The meeting was called to order at 08:03

### Comment resolutions

The chair presented the presentation on TG1 draft topics for November 2012 (19-12/0208r0) with focus on questions related to topic 1. The TG discussed the related comments.

**Motion: Move that the CE to WSO interface shall not be specified in the normative manner by the 802.19.1 standard**

**Moved by: I.Reede**

**Seconded by: J.Junell**

**Motion: Move to table the motion to ” Move that the CE to WSO interface shall not be specified in the normative manner by the 802.19.1 standard” until AM1 November 14, 2012.**

**Moved by: I.Reede**

**Seconded by: J.Junell**

**Motion passes with unanimous consent**

The meeting was recessed at 09:57.

# **Tuesday November 13th, 2012 AM2**

The meeting was called to order at 10:33

### Comment resolutions

The TG continued discussion on comments related to the draft structure and style.

The meeting was recessed at 11:42

# **Tuesday November 13th, 2012 PM1**

The meeting was called to order at 14:00

### Comment resolutions

The TG continued discussion on comments related to the draft structure and style.

The TG adopted the following structure as a working assumption for a new informative annex which includes selected clauses from clause 10:

1. **Coexistence discovery algorithms**
	1. 10.5.6
2. **Coexistence decision algorithm**
	1. 10.4.1
	2. 10.4.2 + 10.5.1 (merger of the two algorithms)
	3. 10.4.3
	4. 10.4.4
	5. 10.4.7
	6. 10.4.8
3. **Decision topology management algorithms**
	1. 10.5.4
4. **Other algorithms**
	1. 10.4.5
	2. 10.4.6
	3. 10.5.2
	4. 10.5.3
	5. 10.5.5

A draft annex proposal will be reviewed later during the week.

The TG started reviewing comments on CDIS structure (CID30-33).

* Stanislav Filin was assigned to prepare resolution proposal for comment with CID32.
* Jari Junell presented contribution 191-12/0220r0 about coexistence discovery. The contribution is related to comment s with CID30 and CID31.

The meeting was recessed at 15:30

# **Tuesday November 13th, 2012 PM2**

The meeting was called to order at 16:00

### Comment resolutions

* Comment with CID34 and CID35 were assigned to Stanislav Filin.
* Golnaz Farhadi presented contributions 19-12/0212r0, 19-12/0213r0 and 19-12/0214r0 which contains comment resolution proposal for comments with CID36, CID37, CID38, CID39, CID48 and CID49, respectively.
* Comment with CID59 was assigned to Hyunduk Kang.

The meeting was recessed at 17:17

# **Wednesday November 14th, 2012 AM1**

The meeting was called to order at 08:02

### Comment resolutions

* Jari Junell presented contribution 19-12/0191r0 as a comment resolution proposal for comment with CID85. The resolution proposal was accepted and the comments with CID85 and CID86 were resolved with the proposed resolution.
* Jari Junell presented contribution 19-12/0192r0 as a comment resolution proposal for comment with CID87. The resolution proposal was accepted and the comments with CID87 and CID88 were resolved with the proposed resolution.
* The comment with CID89 was resolved with the resolution to comments with CID85 and CID87.
* The TG discussed the comment with CID95.

The meeting was recessed at 10:00.

# **Wednesday November 14th, 2012 AM2**

The meeting was called to order at 10:32.

### Comment resolutions

Stanislav Filin presented contribution 19-12/0215r0 on update to entity operations.

**Move that the CE to WSO interface shall not be specified in the normative manner by the 802.19.1 standard**

**Move: Ivan Reede**

**Second: Jari Junell**

**Y/4, N/4, A/0**

**Motion fails**

**Move that the 802.19.1 standard has one clause which specifies entity operations as proposed in 19-12/0215r0.**

* The clause specifies common and entity specific operations and how parameters are set in those operations.
* The clause specifies how profiles effect on entity operations.

**Move: S.Filin**

**Second: H.Kang**

**Y/10, N/0, A/1**

**Motion passes**

**Move that the 802.19.1 draft uses IETF PAWS protocols for interface C**

**Move: S.Filin**

**Second: G.Farhadi**

**Y/11, N/0, A/0**

**Motion passes**

The meeting was recessed at 12:00

# **Wednesday November 13th, 2012 PM1**

The meeting was called to order at 13:30

### Comment resolutions

The TG continued comment resolutions.

* Jari Junell presented contribution 19-12/0194r0 as a comment resolution proposal for comment with CID108. The resolution proposal was accepted and the comments with CID108 and CID109 were resolved with the proposed resolution.
* Jari Junell presented contribution 19-12/0195r0 as a comment resolution proposal for comment with CID110. The proposal was revised by deleting the first sentence in the proposed text and the resolution proposal 19-12/0195r1 was accepted and the comments with CID110, CID111 and CID112 were resolved with the proposed resolution.
* Comment with CID129 closed by accepting the proposed resolution.
* Comment with CID130 closed by accepting the proposed resolution.
* Comment with CID131 closed by accepting the proposed resolution.
	+ It was agreed that the definition of ResourceReconfigurationRequest message on page 90 of the draft needs to be reviewed. At least the comment on the newOperatingResource parameter has to be revised.
* Comment with CID133 closed by accepting the proposed resolution in principle. The message shall be modified to allow indication of multiple channel numbers or frequency ranges. The channels or the frequency ranges do not need to be adjacent.
* Comment with CID136 closed by accepting the proposed resolution.
* Comment resolution proposal preparation of comment with CID137 was assigned to Tsuyoshi Shimomura.

The meeting was recessed at 15:27

# **Wednesday November 14th, 2012 PM2**

The meeting was called to order at 16:02

### Comment resolutions

The TG continued comment resolutions.

* Comment with CID61 closed by accepting the proposed resolution.
* Donghun Lee presented 19-12/0220r0 which contains resolution proposals to CID61, CID62, CID63, CID64, CID65, CID69, CID130 and CID131.
	+ CID62&CID63 resolution proposal accepted
	+ CID64 resolution proposal accepted
	+ CID65 resolution proposal accepted
	+ CID69 resolution proposal accepted
* Comment with CID141 closed by accepting the proposed resolution.
* Comment with CID142 closed by accepting the proposed resolution.
* Comment with CID143 resolved by giving rational behind the algorithm: “Step 3 and 4 consider CE/WSO served by the CM itself. Steps 5 and 6 involve CE/WSO served by other CMs.”
* Comment with CID144 resolved by giving rational behind the algorithm. It was noted that the figure needs to be updated to clarify the difference between the steps.
* Comment with CID145 resolved by giving rational behind the algorithm. More text is needed about the scheduling in step 7.
* Comment with CID146 accepted in principle.
* Comment with CID147 accepted in principle.
* Comment with CID167 accepted.
* Preparations of resolution proposal for comment with CID168 assigned to Stanislav Filin.
* Preparations of resolution proposal for comments with CID170, CID171, CID172, CID173, CID174 and CID175 assigned to Mika Kasslin.

**Move that the TG1 agenda is modified to have the Thursday, November 15, 2012, AM1 meeting to start at 09:00AM.**

**Move: D.Lee**

**Second: H.Kang**

**Motion passes with unanimous consent**

The meeting was recessed at 17:27

# **Thursday November 14th, 2012 AM1**

The meeting was called to order at 09:00

**Move that 19-12/0207r4 is adopted as the agenda**

**Move: S.Filin**

**Second: J.Junell**

**Motion passes with unanimous consent**

### Comment resolutions

* Jari Junell presented contribution 19-12/0193r1 as proposed comment resolution to comment with CID106. The resolution proposal accepted and the resolution closes also comment with CID107.
* Jari Junell presented contribution 19-12/0197r0 as proposed comment resolution to comments with CID83, CID84 and CID105. The proposal didn’t contain description of new messages required for new proposed procedure and a new revision of the proposal is needed before decision on the proposal.
* Jari Junell presented contribution 19-12/0196r0 as proposed comment resolution to comment with CID126.
* Tsuyoshi Shimomura presented contribution 19-12/0219r0 as proposed comment resolution to comments with CID68 and CID137. It was agreed that the issue of frequency capability indication needs to be discussed and analysed further in the TG. The TG chair will have the issue as a TG teleconference agenda item.

The meeting was recessed at 10:00.

# **Thursday November 15th, 2012 AM2**

The meeting was called to order at 10:30

### Comment resolutions

* Hyunduk Kang presented contribution 19-12/0216r0 as proposed comment resolution to comment with CID59. The proposed comment resolution was accepted.
* Jari Junell presented contribution 19-12/0197r1 as proposed comment resolution to comments with CID83, CID84 and CID105. The proposed comment resolution was accepted for all three comments.

**Move that the 802.19.1 draft has the following structure to define the algorithms with content from sub-clauses in clause 10 of the DF3.02 as indicated below with the algorithms under heading 1, 2, 3 and 4 defined in a clause defining algorithms and the algorithms under heading 5 defined in an informative annex**

1. **Coexistence discovery algorithms (algorithm clause sub-clause)**
	* **10.5.6**
2. **Coexistence decision algorithm (algorithm clause sub-clause)**
	* **10.4.1, 10.4.2+10.5.1, 10.4.3, 10.4.4, 10.4.7, 10.4.8**
3. **Decision topology management algorithms (algorithm clause sub-clause)**
	* **10.5.4**
4. **Algorithms to support coexistence decision algorithms (algorithm clause sub-clause)**
	* **10.5.2, 10.5.5**
5. **Other algorithms (informative annex on algorithms)**
	* **10.4.5, 10.4.6, 10.5.3**

**Move: S.Filin**

**Second: H.Kang**

**Y/7, N/0, A/5**

**Motion passes**

* Jari Junell presented contribution 19-12/0199r0 as a comment resolution proposal for comments with CID138 and CID139. The intent is to give a short introduction to the proposal and discuss the proposed changes more in details in teleconferences.

The meeting was recessed at 11:50

# **Thursday November 15th, 2012 PM1**

The meeting was called to order at 13:35

### Review and vote on submissions

No submissions to review or vote on.

### Review and vote on comment resolutions

* Comment resolution proposals for comments with CIDs 148 through 166 were reviewed and accepted.

**Move to approve comment resolutions in file 19-12/0204r4**

**Move: S.Filin**

**Second: H.Kang**

**Y/8, N/0, A/0**

**Motion passes unanimously**

### Review and vote on next steps

No material to review or vote.

### Plan for January 2013 interim and teleconferences

The plan is to continue comment resolutions and close as many comments as possible.

The TG agreed to have teleconferences before the January 2013 interim on the week of January 14 as follows:

1. November 28, 2012, 01:00-02:00 AM EST
2. December 12, 2012, 01:00-02:00 AM EST
3. December 19, 2012, 01:00-02:00 AM EST
4. January 9, 2013, 01:00-02:00 AM EST

The teleconference agendas will address at least the following topics: a) How to indicate frequency capabilities of a WSO?, b) Open comments and resolution proposals, c) Review of updated TG1 schedule

The meeting was adjourned at 13:50