Proposed Comments on P802d and P802.1CQ PARs

Document Number:
IEEE 802.16-15-0045-00-Gcon

Date Submitted:
2015-11-07

Source:
Roger B. Marks
Voice: +1 802 capable
EthAirNet Associates
E-mail: roger@ethair.net
4040 Montview Blvd
Denver, CO 80207 USA

Re:
draft PARs P802d and P802.1CQ <http://www.ieee802.org/PARs.shtml>

Base Contribution:
none

Purpose:
For review by 802.16 Working Group at Session #100 as the basis of comments to 802.1 Working Group, by 2014-11-10 (18:30)

Notice:
This document does not represent the agreed views of the IEEE 802.16 Working Group or any of its subgroups. It represents only the views of the participants listed in the “Source(s)” field above. It is offered as a basis for discussion. It is not binding on the contributor(s), who reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.

Copyright Policy:
The contributor is familiar with the IEEE-SA Copyright Policy <http://standards.ieee.org/IPR/copyrightpolicy.html>.

Patent Policy:
The contributor is familiar with the IEEE-SA Patent Policy and Procedures:
Two PARs from 802.1 WG

- See http://www.ieee802.org/PARs.shtml
- P802.1d
  - URN namespace for YANG models
- P802.1CQ
  - Address Assignment
Proposed comments to 802.1 WG

- The material below is proposed for submittal to the 802.1 WG
Comments of 802.16 WG on Draft P802d and P802.1CQ PARs

IEEE 802.16 WG
2015-11-10
Comments of 802.16 WG on Draft P802d PAR
Proposed P802d PAR Change:
PAR 1.1 (Project Number)

• change as follows: “P802\textsuperscript{802}d”

• reason: obvious
Proposed P802d PAR Change: PAR 2.1 (Title)

• change as follows: “URN Namespace for YANG Models”

• reason: As stated in 8.1, “It is vital that 'YANG' appear in the project title to inform potential participants and the target readership of the amendment.”

• Note: update CSD accordingly.
Proposed P802d CSD Change:
CSD 1.1.1 (Managed objects)

• change as follows: “802.1Q”

• reason: The proposed amendment is to IEEE Std 802 and would apply to all IEEE 802 implementations.
Comments of 802.16 WG on Draft P802.1CQ PAR
Proposed P802.1CQ PAR Change: PAR 2.1 (Title)

• change as follows: “Multicast and Local Addresses Assignment”

• reason: more conventional wording
Proposed P802.1CQ PAR Change:
PAR 5.2 (Scope)

• change as follows: “to ports”

• reason 1: It is not clear from the PAR that ports may be virtual, though this is stated in the CSD.

• reason 2: Some expected assignments (that is, in the multicast case) are not to ports at all.
Proposed P802.1CQ PAR Change:
PAR 5.3 (dependency)

• change as follows: “Local Media Access Control (MAC) Addressing Usage”

• reason: To reflect the true title of the P802c project.
Proposed P802.1CQ CSD Change: Title Slide

• change as follows: “CSD for P802.1CQ Multicast and Local Address assignment protocol”

• reason: To match the title of the proposed P802.1CQ PAR.