|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Project | **IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group <**<http://ieee802.org/16>**>** | |
| Title | ***Proposed Responses to EC Comments on*** ***Draft P802.16r PAR in*** ***IEEE 802.16-12-0587-02*** | |
| Date Submitted | **2012-11-13** | |
| Source(s) | Roger B. Marks  EthAirNet Associates  4040 Montview Blvd  Denver, CO 80207 USA | Voice: +1 619 393 1913 E-mail: roger@ethair.net  \*<<http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/affiliationFAQ.html>> |
| Re: | Draft P802.16r PAR in IEEE 802.16-12-0587-02 | |
| Abstract | This document proposes responses to EC Comments on draft P802.16r PAR in IEEE 802.16-12-0587-02. | |
| Purpose | This contribution requests that the HetNet Study Group review the attached proposal and incorporate those comments into the next revision of IEEE 802.16-12-0587, also producing a document responded to the comments. | |
| Notice | *This document does not represent the agreed views of the IEEE 802.16 Working Group or any of its subgroups*. It represents only the views of the participants listed in the “Source(s)” field above. It is offered as a basis for discussion. It is not binding on the contributor(s), who reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. | |
| Copyright Policy | The contributor is familiar with the IEEE-SA Copyright Policy <http://standards.ieee.org/IPR/copyrightpolicy.html>. | |
| Patent Policy | The contributor is familiar with the IEEE-SA Patent Policy and Procedures:  <<http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws/sect6-7.html#6>> and <<http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3>>.  Further information is located at <<http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-material.html>> and <<http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat>>. | |

*Proposed Responses to EC Comments on*

*Draft P802.16r PAR in IEEE 802.16-12-0587-02*

Roger B. Marks

EthAirNet Associates

# Abstract

This document proposes responses to EC Comments on draft P802.16r PAR in IEEE 802.16-12-0587-02.

# Background

On 24 September 2012, the IEEE 802.16 Working Group Chair [notified](http://ieee802.org/secmail/msg15322.html) the IEEE 802 EC reflector of draft PAR P802.16r ([IEEE 802.16-12-0587-02](http://doc.wirelessman.org/16-12-0587-02) [“*IEEE Std 802.16 Amendment for Small Cell Backhaul (SCB) Applications: Proposed PAR*”]) for consideration at the November 802 Plenary. Per the IEEE 802 LMSC Operations Manual, comments received by other WGs by 5:00 p.m. on Tuesday of the plenary session must be addressed with a response to the EC reflector by 5:00 p.m. on Wednesday.

# Comments Received from EC Chair

EC Chair Paul Nikolich [submitted a comment](http://ieee802.org/16/arc/802-16list2/msg06752.html) reading:

*Roger,*

*I have one comment regarding the 802.k16r PAR.*

*Please explain the WG's rationale behind labeling the PAR with a particular application (SCB) as opposed to a generic label with it's functional capabilities (e.g., a BWA PHY/MAC with xxxxGbps peak capacity or throughput, etc.).*

*Another alternative is to take an approach similar to the 802.3 WG which labels some of their PHY projects simply with the peak data rate and physical media supported. This has the advantage, in my opinion, keeping the perception of the applications for the project wide open and, hence, may encourage wider participation.*

*Regards,*

*--Paul*

# Proposed Response to Comments Received from EC Chair

This contribution proposes the following response to comments received from the EC Chair:

Dear Paul,

Thank for your comments on the draft P802.16r PAR.

We appreciate your observation that the project may be more effective if the title is made less application-specific. We note that the scope would need to be modified accordingly. We do not believe that a peak data rate can be meaningfully assigned.

To address your comment, we will make the following changes:

*Title: Standard for Air Interface for Broadband Wireless Access Systems – Amendment for ~~Small Cell Backhaul (SCB) Applications~~ Enhanced* *Wireless Ethernet Transport*

*This project will develop an amendment specifying enhancements to the WirelessMAN-OFDMA air interface for effective use in fixed and nomadic wireless Ethernet transport applications, including small cell backhaul applications, providing core network services to radio access networks.*

# Comments Received from IEEE 802.11 WG

*The IEEE 802.11 WG* [*submitted a comment*](http://ieee802.org/16/arc/802-16list2/msg06753.html) *reading:*

*PAR 5.2b – suggest that you do not need the phrase “particularly below 6 GHz” or change to say that this is just below 6 GHz.*

*General Question: What is the expected data rate that you are looking to define?*

*What is the new standard providing that is not being provided by LTE?*

# Proposed Response to Comments Received from IEEE 802.11 WG

This contribution proposes the following response to comments received from the IEEE 802.11 WG:

Dear IEEE 802.11 WG,

Thank for your comments on the draft P802.16r PAR.

We appreciate your observation regarding the frequency range. To address your comment, we will make the following changes:

*It will focus on backhaul operating in licensed bands below ~~11 GHz, particularly below~~ 6 GHz*

In response to your question about data rates, we prefer to not state that in the PAR, since it will depend on factors such as the available spectral bandwidth. We are seeking views from external organizations regarding their capacity requirements. Numbers cited in our references are in the range of several tens of Mbit/s of backhaul capacity per subscriber station.

In response to your question “What is the new standard providing that is not being provided by LTE?”, the requirements addressed demand Ethernet transport, which is not supported by LTE. Furthermore, we believe that an optimized solution for this problem will operate with far more efficiency than one designed to support full mobility.