

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-24

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 7 Line 29 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3.6

"if needed to update" is ambiguous. How does an implementation know when update is needed

Suggested Remedy

Clarify normative requirement

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Remove "if needed to update," in line#29, page7, P802.16n/D5.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-23

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 3 Line 20 Fig/Table# Subclause 3.87

This isn't a definition of a term, but a description of a function that belongs in a normative clause

Suggested Remedy

Delete def and move to appropriate normative clause.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Delete definition 3.187

Accept remedy 3 from 598r1.

Also, remove section numbers from all definitions to be consistent with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-22

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 3 Line 17 Fig/Table# Subclause 3.186

Delete "see also" as it is unnecessary (one can deduce that if they don't know what "base station" means they would look for "base station").

Suggested Remedy

delete "see also" ; this same error is made throughout clause 3, delete it EVERYWHERE the "see also" is repeating the obvious.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Remove the entire definition 3.186.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-21

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 3 Line 14 Fig/Table# Subclause 3.185

Delete "see also" as it is unnecessary (one can deduce that if they don't know what "base station" means they would look for "base station").

Suggested Remedy

delete "see also" ; this same error is made throughout clause 3, delete it EVERYWHERE the "see also" is repeating the obvious.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

This definition has been deleted.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-20

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 3 Line 11 Fig/Table# Subclause 3.184

Delete "see also" as it is unnecessary (one can deduce that if they don't know what "base station" means they would look for "base station").

Suggested Remedy

delete "see also" ; this same error is made throughout clause 3, delete it EVERYWHERE the "see also" is repeating the obvious.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Remove the definition - 3.184

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-19

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 3 Line 9 Fig/Table# Subclause 3.183

Delete "see also" as it is unnecessary (one can deduce that if they don't know what "base station" means they would look for "base station").

Suggested Remedy

delete "see also" ; this same error is made throughout clause 3, delete it EVERYWHERE the "see also" is repeating the obvious.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

On page 3, line 9, delete from "see also" until the end of the sentence.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-18

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 3 Line 6 Fig/Table# Subclause 3.182

Delete "see also" as it is unnecessary (one can deduce that if they don't know what "base station" means they would look for "base station").

Suggested Remedy

delete "see also" ; this same error is made throughout clause 3, delete it EVERYWHERE the "see also" is repeating the obvious.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Delete from "see also" until the end of the sentence on line 6.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-17

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 3 Line 2 Fig/Table# Subclause 3.18

Delete "see also" as it is unnecessary (one can deduce that if they don't know what "base station" means they would look for "base station").

Suggested Remedy

delete "see also" ; this same error is made throughout clause 3, delete it EVERYWHERE the "see also" is repeating the obvious.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Rejected

The "see also" is consistent with use in the baseline document 802.16-2012. (see definition of "multihop relay base station (MR-BS)" in 802.16-2012)

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # **i-16**

Document under Review: **IEEE P802.16n/D5**

Ballot ID: **802.16n-r0**

Comment Type **Technical** Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page **2** Line **4** Fig/Table# Subclause **2**

Missing normative references? T

Suggested Remedy

Either add missing referecnes or delete null clause

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: **Accepted-Modified**

Remove text in line#4-8, page 2, P802.16n/D5.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # **i-15**

Document under Review: **IEEE P802.16n/D5**

Ballot ID: **802.16n-r0**

Comment Type **General** Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page **0** Line **0** Fig/Table# Subclause **0**

Incorrect editing instructions where "insert" is used. Per the intro on page 1, staring at line 15: Underline, strikeouts are used for "Change" instructions; Insert means new text, not underlined.

Suggested Remedy

Correct editing instructinos, use "insert" correctly.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: **Accepted-Modified**

Remove the underline format on the new text corresponding to the editing instruction "insert..."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # **i-14**

Document under Review: **IEEE P802.16n/D5**

Ballot ID: **802.16n-r0**

Comment

Type **General**

Part of Dis

☐

Satisfied

☐

Page **0**

Line **0**

Fig/Table#

Subclause **0**

This standard does not conform to the requirements for an IEEE standard as defined in the 2012 IEEE Standards Style Manual and should not be submitted to balloting in this form.

Suggested Remedy

correct deficiencies and resubmit to an INITIAL ballot when the amendment conforms to IEEE requirements.

Group Resolution

Decision of Group: **Accepted-Modified**

The style deficiencies have been corrected to the extent possible, while maintaining consistency with the baseline document.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-13

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page Line 23 Fig/Table# Subclause 3.177

Delete "see also" as it is unnecessary (one can deduce that if they don't know what "base station" means they would look for "base station").

Suggested Remedy

delete "see also" ; this same error is made throughout clause 3, delete it EVERYWHERE the "see also" is repeating the obvious.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Because the term mobile base station is not used, remove the entire definition 3.177.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-12

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 2 Line 22 Fig/Table# Subclause 3.176

Definition is out of scope of this standard, which does not have the scope to define what is essential to the core function of society and the economy", and and "required availability" is a dangerous term also out of scope,

Suggested Remedy

delete definition

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Remove definition of robustness in line #20-22, page 2.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Rolfe, Benjamin

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # **i-11**

Document under Review: **IEEE P802.16n/D5**

Ballot ID: **802.16n-r0**

Comment Type **Technical** Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page **2** Line **18** Fig/Table# Subclause **3.175**

"degraded network" is not a term that needs to be defined as the definition illustrates by restating the obvious. As the term is used exactly twice in this standard, it would be more correct and less obuscating to simply say what you mean in the normative text.

Suggested Remedy

delete definition

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: **Accepted-Modified**

Delete the entire definition 3.175.

This definition is now included in the overview. See comment i-4

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-10

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment

Type General

Part of Dis

☐

Satisfied

☐

Page vii

Line

Fig/Table#

Subclause

Participant info is invalid.

Suggested Remedy

Replace Participant info as follows:

This standard was developed by the IEEE 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access, which develops the WirelessMAN(R) Standard for Wireless Metropolitan Area Networks.

IEEE 802.16 Working Group Officers

Roger B. Marks, Chair

Harry Bims, Secretary

Primary development was carried out by the Working Group's GRIDMAN Task Group, with the following Leadership Team:

Tim Godfrey, Chair Eldad Zeira, Secretary Anh Tuan Hoang, Chief Editor Ming-Tuo Zhou, Co-Editor

The following members of the IEEE 802.16 Working Group on Broadband Wireless Access participated in the Working Group Letter Ballot in which this standard was prepared and finalized for IEEE Ballot:

Hassan Al-Kanani

Phillip Barber

Harry Bims

Inbar Bratspiess

Jaesun Cha

Sung-Cheol Chang

Erik Colban

Dan Gal

Tim Godfrey

Anh Tuan Hoang

Vinh Dien Hoang

Ying-Chuan Hsiao

Chun-Yen Hsu

Satoshi Imata

Soojung Jung

Hyunjeong Kang

Brian Kiernan

Eunkyung Kim

Seokki Kim
Anseok Lee
Hyun Lee
Honggang Li
Lu Liru
Andreas Maeder
Roger Marks
Shantidev Mohanty
Ron Murias
Masayuki Oodo
Jisoo Park
Jaya Shankar Pathmasuntharam
Fei Qin
Sam Sambasivan
Takashi Shono
Rakesh Taori
Joseph Teo
Alessandro Triglia
Arthur Wang
Haiguang Wang
Lei Wang
Hung-Yu Wei
Wai Leong Yeow
Nader Zein
Eldad Zeira
Xin Zhang
Shoukang Zheng
Yan-Xiu Zheng
Lei Zhou
Mingtuo Zhou

GroupResolution **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes **Editor's Actions**

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-9

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment

Type General

Part of Dis

☐

Satisfied

☐

Page v

Line 4

Fig/Table#

Subclause

Introduction is inadequate.

Suggested Remedy

Replace Introduction text (below box) with a version of this:

This amendment provides the WirelessMAN-OFDMA air interface with enhanced support for higher reliability. As of the publication date, the current applicable version of IEEE Std 802.16 is IEEE Std 802.16-2012, as amended by IEEE 802.16p-2012 and IEEE 802.16n-201x.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-8

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type General

Part of Dis

☐

Satisfied

☐

Page iii

Line

Fig/Table#

Subclause

Keywords are missing.

Suggested Remedy

Supply keywords.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

On page iii, line 2, replace "<Select this text and type or paste keywords>" by the keywords "higher reliability networks".

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-7

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type General

Part of Dis

☐

Satisfied

☐

Page iii

Line

Fig/Table#

Subclause

Abstract is missing.

Suggested Remedy

Insert an appropriately edited version of the PAR Scope. Here is a starting point:

This amendment to IEEE Std 802.16-2012 specifies protocol enhancements to the medium access control layer (MAC) for enabling increased robustness and alternate radio path establishment in degraded network conditions. Limited orthogonal frequency-division multiple access physical layer extensions are included for enabling operation with radio path redundancy and direct communication between subscriber stations. Mobile base stations and mobile relay stations are supported.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Accept remedies in 590r1

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Marks, Roger

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-6

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment

Type General

Part of Dis

☐

Satisfied

☐

Page 999

Line

Fig/Table#

Subclause

Figures and tables need to be renumbered in accordance with the numbering in the base standard (IEEE Std 802.16-2012).

Suggested Remedy

Update figure and table numbering in accordance with the numbering in the base standard (IEEE Std 802.16-2012). Provide base standard (and prior 802.16p amendment, when final) to the ballot group on recirculation.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-5

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment

Type General

Part of Dis

☒

Satisfied

☐

Page 105

Line 23

Fig/Table#

Subclause 16.7

The section is empty.

Suggested Remedy

Introduce means for traffic control and prioritization.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Resolution accomplished in comment 0064.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

Comment by:

Freedman, Avraham

Membership Status:Date:Comment # i-4Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0CommentType GeneralPart of DisSatisfiedPage 2Line 1Fig/Table#Subclause 1

It is not reasonable that such a significant amendment would not be reflected in the overview chapter.

Suggested Remedy

1. In section 1.2 Purpose: Insert "highly reliable" in the first sentence of the section in 802.16.1-2012

2. Add section 1.7: Highly Reliability Networks

The standard provides high reliability by enabling alternative communication paths in case of infrastructure failure. These include Multi-mode operation of base stations as relays, support for direct communication between MS's, support for forwarding of MS traffic to the network by other MS, support for a standalone network, support for local forwarding bypassing backhaul links and path management against single point of failures by providing alternative radio and backhaul paths.

GroupResolutionDecision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Accept remedies in 590r1

Reason for Group's Decision/ResolutionGroup's NotesEditor's NotesEditor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Soranno, Robert

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # i-3

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type General Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 42 Line 1 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.4.3

This is only one example of the horrendous grammar that is used throughout the document. In this example, it appears that 3 sentences are thrown into one. Please have someone go through the document prior to final publication and clean up this mess.

Suggested Remedy

In the VHF mode, the subcarrier allocation scheme of PUSC (defined in 8.4.6.1.2.1.1 a 1 nd 8.4.6.2.2) is used for both UL and DL. The duplex method is TDD. MIMO and the STC scheme are not used.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

The editor is authorized to fix other grammatical errors as he discovers them, or they are identified for him.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Methley, Steven

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # **i-2**

Document under Review: **IEEE P802.16n/D5**

Ballot ID: **802.16n-r0**

Comment Type Editorial

Part of Dis ☒ Satisfied ☐

Page 72

Line 6

Fig/Table#

Subclause 16.1.2

"Error! Reference not found"

Suggested Remedy

... find it !

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: **Accepted-Modified**

Replace "Error! Reference source not found." by "16.1.2.3" in line#6, Page 72, P802.16n/D5

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Turner, Michelle

Membership Status:

Date:

Comment # **i-1**

Document under Review: **IEEE P802.16n/D5**

Ballot ID: **802.16n-r0**

Comment Type Editorial

Part of Dis ☒ Satisfied ☐

Page 0

Line 0

Fig/Table#

Subclause 0

This draft meets all editorial requirements.

Suggested Remedy

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0001

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

<u>Comment</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Part of Dis</u>	<u>Satisfied</u>	<u>Page</u>	<u>Line</u>	<u>Fig/Table#</u>	<u>Subclause</u>
Section number is wrong.	Editorial	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	2	2		1

Suggested Remedy

[Change the line#2-3 in page2, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

~~4.11~~ 1.1 Scope

~~4.12~~ 1.2 Purpose

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Remove subclauses 1.11 and 1.12 in lines 2-3, page 2.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0002

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 4 Line 6 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3

Table number and section number are wrong according to the baseline documnet (IEEE Std 802.16-2012).

Suggested Remedy

[Change line#6, page 4 - line#1, page 5 in P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

Change Table ~~536-51~~ in ~~6.2.3.3~~ 6.3.2.3 as indicated:

Table ~~536-51~~ - MAC management messages

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0003

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial

Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐

Page 7

Line 32

Fig/Table#

Subclause 6.3.2.3.6

Cross reference is wrong.

Suggested Remedy

[Change the line32 in page7, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

HR multicast service flow update mapping info (see ~~11.1.13~~11.1.17)

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Note: editors will confirm the cross-reference and ensure its consistency

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0004

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 8 Line 6 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3.9

Table number is wrong according to the baseline documnet (IEEE Std 802.16-2012).

Suggested Remedy

[Change line#6 in page 8, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

Table ~~656~~63 - PKM message codes

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0005

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 10 Line 3 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3.42

Cross reference is wrong.

Suggested Remedy

[Change the line3 in page10, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

HR multicast service flow update mapping info (see ~~11.1.13~~11.1.17)

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Note: editors will confirm the cross-reference and ensure its consistency

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0006

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 10 Line 11 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3.47

Table number is wrong according to the baseline documnet (IEEE Std 802.16-2012).

Suggested Remedy

[Change line#11-12 in page 10, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

Change Table ~~4676~~6-165 as indicated:

Table ~~4676~~6-165 - MOB_BSHO-REQ message format

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0007

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 12 Line 8 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3.47

Table number is wrong according to the baseline documnet (IEEE Std 802.16-2012).

Suggested Remedy

[Change text in line#8-9, page 12, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

Change Table ~~1686~~-166 as indicated:

Table ~~1686~~-166 - MOB_MSHO-REQ message format

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0008

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 13 Line 14 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3.99

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined for MAC managment messages for HR-Network (in 6.3.2.3.99 and any cross references).

Suggested Remedy

[Change the Table number (including its cross reference) with prefix 229 (from Table 229a to Table 229ii) in 6.3.2.3.99, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

Table ~~229~~6-227

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Note: editors will ensure the table number consistency.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0009

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 15 Line 17 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 145" by "Table 6-160" in line #17, page 15, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0010

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 17 Line 14 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 680" by "Table 11-20" in line #14, page 17, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0011

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 18 Line 3 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 680" by "Table 11-20" in line #3, page 18, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Won-Ik Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0012

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 22 Line 14 Fig/Table# 229i Subclause 6.3.2.3.99.9

This contribution suggests the corrections of typos and modification of the sentences related to multimode operation over IEEE P802.16n/D5.

Suggested Remedy

Please discuss and adopt the proposed text of the contribution, IEEE 802.16-12-0550-00-000n or the latest version.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Accept 550r1

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0013

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 23 Line 16 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3.99.12

Text shall be rewritten.

Suggested Remedy

[Chage the line#16-18 in page 23, P802.16n/D5 to separate paragraph as follows:]

A DC-LD-REQ message is transmitted by an HR-BS to both HR-MSs of a direct communication link to request those HR-MSs to remove the direct communication link.

Table 229I — DC-LD-REQ message format

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0014

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 25 Line 4 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 319" by "Table 8-112" in 4th row and 3rd column, Table229p, page 25, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0015

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 26 Line 4 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3.99.17

Text defined by GRIDMAN TG not included in baseline document shall be underlined.

Suggested Remedy

Uderline the text line#4-5, page 26 in P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Superceded by comment i-15.

(Follow the convention that text under editing instruction "insert..." shall not be underlined.)

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0016

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 26 Line 10 Fig/Table# 229r Subclause 6.3.2.3.99.18

The length(range) of "Number of neighbor HR-MSs" shall be described.

Suggested Remedy

Define the Number of neighbor HR-MSs in Table 229r, page 26, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Insert two new rows below the 3 row, with the following content:

| Number of neighbor HR-MSs| 4 | Number of neighbor HR-MSs included in this message||
| reserved | 4 | |

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0017

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 31 Line 7 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Re-define the "Table 437, 438, 439" in 5th row and 3rd column, Table229w, page 31, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Change "Table 437, 438, 439" to "Table 8-249, 8-250, 8-251"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0018

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 34 Line 4 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Re-define the "Table 574" in 9th row and 3rd column, Table229z, page 34, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Replace "Table 574" with "Table 11-18"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0019

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 36 Line Fig/Table# 229d Subclause 6.3.2.3.99.26

M is variable and it's length is needs to be correct.

Suggested Remedy

[Change the text in the last row and 3rd column of Table 229dd, page 36, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

, where ML is the length of MGID (i.e. 16) and length the value of M is ~~256 (= 2^{ML-1})~~ among $\{2^0, 2^1, \dots, 2^{ML-1}\}$.

0: There is no multicast traffic for any of

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0020

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 38 Line Fig/Table# 229e Subclause 6.3.2.3.99.27

K is calculated based on the M.

Suggested Remedy

[Change the text in the 2nd row and 3rd column of Table 229ee, page 38, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

multicast group has multicast data to transmit, where the Q-th bit of MTIND bitmap [MSB corresponds to Q = 0] corresponds to MGID in the subgroup (Q is the value of logK LSB of multicast group and MSB logM of multicast group is defined by HR-MGIND message. ~~Length of K is $2^{ML}-1$ that is the same as length of M. $K=2^{ML}/M$.~~

0: There is no multicast traffic for the corresponding multicast group

1: There is multicast traffic for the corresponding multicast group

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0021

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 39 Line 9 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3.99.29

Text shall be rewritten.

Suggested Remedy

[Chage the line#9-10 in page 39, P802.16n/D5 to separate paragraph as follows:]

To add or remove an HR-MS to or from a pagers group the HR-BS transmits an MSPG-GRP message.

Table 229gg — MSPG-GRP message format

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

"To add or remove an HR-MS to or from a pagers group, the HR-BS transmits an MSPG-GRP message."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0022

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial

Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐

Page 40

Line 2

Fig/Table#

Subclause 6.3.2.3.99.30

Text shall be rewritten.

Suggested Remedy

[Chage the line#2-4 in page 40, P802.16n/D5 to separate paragraph as follows:]

To control the paging operation of the group of paging HR-MSs accessing resources used by them, MSPG-PG message is transmitted by an HR-BS.

Table 229hh — MSPG-PG message format

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

"To control the paging operation of the group of paging HR-MSs accessing resources used by them, HR-BS transmits MSPG-PG message."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0023

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 42 Line 6 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.4.4

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

[Change the text in line#5-6, page 42, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

For VHF mode, CC encoding used on DL-MAP is selected as “Coding Indication” from DL frame prefix format shown in ~~Table 393~~
Table 8-105. The FFT size of 1024 is selected from ~~Table 394~~ Table 8-106.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0024

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

<u>Comment</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Part of Dis</u>	<u>Satisfied</u>	<u>Page</u>	<u>Line</u>	<u>Fig/Table#</u>	<u>Subclause</u>
	Editorial	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	42	9		8.4.5.2

Table number is wrong according to the baseline documnet (IEEE Std 802.16-2012).

Suggested Remedy

[Change line#9-10 in page 42, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

Change Table ~~404~~8-113 as indicated:

Table ~~404~~8-113 - OFDMA frame duration (T_f ms) codes

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0025

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 43 Line 2 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.5.3.2.3

Table number is wrong according to the baseline documnet (IEEE Std 802.16-2012).

Suggested Remedy

[Change line#2-7 in page 43, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

A DL-MAP IE entry with an Extended-2 DIUC = 0xF indicates that the IE carries special information and conforms to the structure shown in Table ~~4088~~[8-120](#). A station shall ignore an extended-3 IE entry with an extended-3 DIUC value for which the station has no knowledge. In the case of a known extended-3 DIUC value but with a length field longer than expected, the station shall process information up to the known length and ignore the remainder of the IE.

Table ~~4088~~[8-120](#) — DL-MAP Extended-3 IE format

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0026

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 43 Line 9 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.5.3.2.3

Table number is wrong according to the baseline documnet (IEEE Std 802.16-2012).

Suggested Remedy

[Change line#9-10 in page 43, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

Table ~~409~~8-121 defines the encoding for extended-3 DIUC that shall be used by DL-MAP Extended-3 IEs.

Table ~~409~~8-121 — Extended-3 DIUC code assignment for Extended-2 DIUC = 15

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0027

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 43 Line 26 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.5.3.21

Table number is wrong according to the baseline documnet (IEEE Std 802.16-2012).

Suggested Remedy

[Change line#26 in page 43, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

Table ~~43~~48-143 — HARQ DL MAP IE format

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0028

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

<u>Comment</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Part of Dis</u>	<u>Satisfied</u>	<u>Page</u>	<u>Line</u>	<u>Fig/Table#</u>	<u>Subclause</u>
Table number is wrong according to the baseline documnet (IEEE Std 802.16-2012).	Editorial	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	46	12		8.4.5.3.29

Suggested Remedy

[Change line#26 in page 43, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

Table ~~4478~~-159 — Persistent HARQ DL MAP allocation IE

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0029

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 48 Line 7 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.5.4.4.1

Table number is wrong according to the baseline documnet (IEEE Std 802.16-2012).

Suggested Remedy

[Change line#5-7 in page 48, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

Change the text in Table ~~465~~8-177 as follows:

Table ~~465~~8-177 — Extended UIUC code assignment for UIUC = 15

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0030

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 49 Line 5 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.6.1.2.1

Figure number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first figure in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Figure 16-1, Figure 16-2)

Thus, Figure number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Figure 332a" by "Figure 8-78a" in line #5, line #13, and line #15, page 49, P802.16n/D5

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0031

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 49 Line 6 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.6.1.2.1

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 545a" by "Table 8-257a" in line #6 and line #8, page 49, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0032

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 49 Line 11 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.6.1.2.1

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 545b" by "Table 8-257b" in line #11, page 49 and line #1, page 50, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0033

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 50 Line 8 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.6.1.2.1

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 558a" by "Table 8-270a" in line #8, page 50 and line #1, page 51, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0034

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 50 Line 8 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.6.1.2.1

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 661" by "Table 11-1" in line #3, page 52, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0035

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 50 Line 10 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.6.2.1

Figure number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, Figure number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Figure 334a" by "Figure 8-80a" in line #10 and line #13, page 50, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0036

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 51 Line 6 Fig/Table# Subclause 8.4.9.3

Equation number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first equation in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., (16-1), (16-2))

Thus, equation number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "equation (121) and (122)" by "equation (8-121) and (8-122)" in line #6, page 51, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0037

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 51 Line 13 Fig/Table# Subclause 10.11

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 655" by "Table 10-1" in line #11 and line #13, page 51, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0038

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

<u>Comment</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Part of Dis</u>	<u>Satisfied</u>	<u>Page</u>	<u>Line</u>	<u>Fig/Table#</u>	<u>Subclause</u>
11.1.17 exists in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012).	Editorial	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	52	8		11.1.17

Thus, section number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "11.1.17" by "11.1.18" in line #8, page 52, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0039

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 53 Line 3 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.1.17

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 671a" by "Table 11-11a" in line #3, page 53, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0040

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 53 Line 9 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.3.1

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 675" by "Table 11-16" in line #9, page 53, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0041

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 54 Line 3 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.4.7

Cross referece is wrong.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "11.4.7" by "11.4.1" in line #3, page 54, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0042

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 54 Line 4 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.4.7

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 679" by "Table 11-19" in line #4, page 54, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0043

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 55 Line 2 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.4.7

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 681" by "Table 11-20" in line #2 and line #3, page 55, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0044

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 56 Line 2 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.5

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 686" by "Table 11-26" in line #2 and line #3, page 56, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0045

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 57 Line 3 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.5

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 688a" by "Table 11-28a" in line #5 and line #6, page 57, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0046

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 57 Line 9 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.6

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 689" by "Table 11-29" in line #9 and line #11, page 57, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0047

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 58 Line 3 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.8

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 695" by "Table 11-35" in line #3, page 58, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0048

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 59 Line 3 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.13

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 713" by "Table 11-53" in line #3 and line #5, page 59, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0049

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 59 Line 10 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.13

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 714" by "Table 11-54" in line #10 and line #11, page 59, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0050

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 64 Line 2 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.32.2

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 732a" by "Table 11-72a" in line#2 and line #5, page 64, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0051

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 67 Line 6 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.32.3

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 732b" by "Table 11-72b" in line#6, page 67, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0052

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 68 Line 1 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.32.5

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 732c" by "Table 11-72c" in line#1, page 68, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0053

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 68 Line 1 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.32

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 145" by "Table 6-160" in 5th row and 3rd column, Table 732c, page 68, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0054

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 68 Line 5 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.32.6

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 732d" by "Table 11-72d" in line#5, page 68, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0055

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 69 Line 3 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.32.7

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 732e" by "Table 11-72e" in line#3, page 69, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0056

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 69 Line 3 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.32.7

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 680" by "Table 11-20" in 3rd row and 4th column, Table732e, page 69, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0057

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 69 Line 7 Fig/Table# Subclause 11.32.8

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 732f" by "Table 11-72f" in line#7, page 69, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0058

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 70 Line 1 Fig/Table# Subclause 16

Table numbering and is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Suggested Remedy

Renumber the label of Tables (including their cross refereces) based on the rule:

the first table in section 16 with the number 16-1 (i.e., replace "Table 781" by "Table 16-1" in line #19 and #21, page 80)

and

the label of following tables shall be replace by preceding number (e.g., Table 16-2, Table 16-3).

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0059

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 70 Line 1 Fig/Table# Subclause 16

Figure numbering and is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first figure in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Figure 16-1, Figure 16-2)

Suggested Remedy

Renumber the label of Figures (including their cross refereces) based on the rule:

the first figure in section 16 with the number 16-1 (i.e., replace "Figure 516" by "Figure 16-1" in line #19 and #21, page 75)

and

the label of following figures shall be replace by preceding number (e.g., Figure 16-2, Figure 16-3).

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the figure number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Seokjoo Shin

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0060

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 72 Line 2 Fig/Table# Subclause 16.1.2

This contribution provides the modification of the sentences related to multimode operation in P802.16n/D5 to be consistent with P802.16.1a/D5.

Suggested Remedy

Please discuss and adopt the proposed text of the contribution, IEEE 802.16-12-0551-00-000n or the latest version.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Accept with change of word "commanded" to "initiated" in Remedy 1, 16.1.2, line 4.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0061

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 85 Line 34 Fig/Table# Subclause 16.2.2.2.2

Clarification on power control under direct communication, which includes:

- removing unnecessary sentence
- fixing typos

Suggested Remedy

Adopt the text proposal in IEEE 802.16-12-0535-00-000n or its latest revision.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Accept 535r0

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0062

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 89 Line 6 Fig/Table# Subclause 16.3.2

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined.

Suggested Remedy

Replace "Table 472" by "Table 8-184" in line #6, page 89, P802.16n/D5.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0063

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Editorial Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 98 Line 6 Fig/Table# Subclause 16.3.2.2.4

Table number is changed in baseline document (IEEE Std 802.16-2012), based on the following rule:

To label the first table in a clause with the number 1, preceded by the clause number (e.g., Table 16-1, Table 16-2)

Thus, table number shall be re-defined for MAC managment messages for HR-Network (in 6.3.2.3.99 and any cross references).

Suggested Remedy

[Change text in line#6-8, page98, P802.16n/D5 as follows:]

Resources for fast-feedback channels of forwarded HR-MS shall be signal by forwarded HR-MS through the Fast-feedback Extended F-MAP IE described in Table ~~229w~~6-227w of Section 6.3.2.3.99.25.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Editor will ensure the table number consistency with 802.16-2012

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Seokjoo Shin

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0064

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 105 Line 23 Fig/Table# Subclause 16.7

This is for priority access operation in 16n. In order to give higher success probability for priority users over non priority users in initial ranging, we insert new backoff window size parameters in UCD as well as assign a set of exclusive cdma codes for priority users.

Suggested Remedy

Please discuss and adopt the proposed text of the contribution, IEEE 802.16-12-0553-00-000n or the latest version.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Accept 553r2, with the modification that the line "16.7.1 Priority access operation in initial ranging" is removed.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Eunkyung Kim

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0065

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 112 Line 11 Fig/Table# Subclause 16.8.2.2

When mobile station is in idle mode, mobile station may not know whether multicast traffic is not transmitted or is transmitted unsuccessfully.

Thus, ACK-based feedback in idle mode should not be used.

Suggested Remedy

[Add the following text in line11, page 112, P802.16n/D5.]

The HR-BS should not use ACK-based feedback for HR-MS in idle mode.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

Comment by: Wooram ShinMembership Status: MemberDate: 2012/09/14Comment # 0066Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 23 Line 1 Fig/Table# Tabl Subclause 6.3.2.3.99.10

In the current draft standard, when DC link is created, HR-BS sends AAI-DC-LC-REQ messages to both source and destination HR-MSs, which include two CIDs for transmitting and receiving as an identification of their DC link. If an HR-MS get the chance to create DC links with multiple HR-MSs, then it can not distinguish for which flow a DC link would be created. Also, an HR-BS needs to send multiple AAI-DC-LC-REQ messages even if it wants to create multiple DC links of an HR-MS, which can be more efficient by allowing creating multiple DC links for an HR-MS. Similarly, in case of messaging AAI-DC-LC-RSP, it needs to include additional information to indicate for which flow the response to DC link creation request is done, and needs to support multiple responses on multiple DC link creation requests.

Suggested Remedy

Adopt the text proposal in IEEE 802.16-12-0567-00-000n or its latest version.

GroupResolutionDecision of Group: Accepted-Modified[Accept 567r2](#)Reason for Group's Decision/ResolutionGroup's NotesEditor's NotesEditor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by: Vinh-Dien Hoang

Membership Status: Member

Date: ?

Comment # 0067

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 26 Line 3 Fig/Table# Subclause 6.3.2.3.99.17

Clarification of Path Discovery and Management messages

Suggested Remedy

Accept the the contribution 568 or latest version to the AWD

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Accept 568r2

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Anseok Lee

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0068

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 26 Line 3 Fig/Table# Tabl Subclause 6.3.2.3.99.17

The PM-NBR-REQ message has Mode field with 4 values. However, there are no usage of value is 0b00 and 0b01 throughout the current draft.

Suggested Remedy

Remove the description of value is 0b00 and 0b01 in Mode field in the PM-NBR-REQ message field description (Table 229q). Or provide the details (usage and procedures) of those values of Mode field of PM-NBR-REQ message.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Accept 568r2

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Anseok Lee

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0069

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 101 Line 18 Fig/Table# Subclause 16.6.1.4

The current draft, the alternative path through an HR-MS can be activated after the HR-BS detects the loss of HR-MS (which has an alternative path to forwarding HR-MS) and commands start of FTN function (coverage extending process) to the target forwarding HR-MS.

Without providing method to detect loss of the HR-MS at the HR-BS, delays until the HR-BS start FTN function of the target forwarding HR-MS are inevitable. And this delay may affect the service of HR-MS as a significant interruption.

Suggested Remedy

Please discuss and adopt the proposed text of the contribution 16-12-0563-000n or the latest revision.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Accept 563r2

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions

2012/12/20

IEEE 802.16-12-0559-05

Comment by:

Anseok Lee

Membership Status: Member

Date: 2012/09/14

Comment # 0070

Document under Review: IEEE P802.16n/D5

Ballot ID: 802.16n-r0

Comment Type Technical Part of Dis ☐ Satisfied ☐ Page 101 Line 24 Fig/Table# Subclause 16.6.1.5

For proper operation of alternative path function when the HR-MS (which has an alternative path to forwarding HR-MS) loses connection with the HR-BS, the link between the HR-MS and the target forwarding HR-MS should be maintained. Without maintaining the link, alternative path may not exist when the HR-MS loses the connection with the HR-BS.

However, the current draft does not provide the procedure to maintain the link between the HR-MS and the forwarding HR-MS.

Suggested Remedy

Please discuss and adopt the proposed text of the contribution 16-12-0564-000n or the latest revision.

GroupResolution

Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified

Accept 564r3

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Editor's Notes

Editor's Actions