P802.16n to Sponsor Ballot: Conditional Approval Request

20 July 2012

Rules: OM (2012-06-04) Clause 13

motions requesting conditional approval to forward when the prior ballot has closed shall be accompanied by:

- Date the ballot closed
- Vote tally including Approve, Disapprove and Abstain votes
- Comments that support the remaining disapprove votes and Working Group responses.
- Schedule for recirculation ballot and resolution meeting.

Dates the ballots closed

Stage	Open	Close
WG Letter Ballot #37	5 Feb	6 Mar 2012
WG Recirc #37a	5 Apr	4 May 2012
WG Recirc #37b	8 Jun	9 Jul 2012

Vote tally including Approve, Disapprove and Abstain votes

42 Approve (97.7%)

- 1 Disapprove with comment
- 0 Disapprove without comment
- 5 Abstain
- Return ratio requirement met (55%)

Comment resolution

Disapprove comment status

Working Group Letter Ballot #37

  1 disapprove comment. Member changed vote to approve in LB #37a

Working Group Recirculation Letter Ballot #37a

  5 disapprove comments by one member. Member did not submit a new vote on LB 37b

Working Group Recirculation Letter Ballot #37b

  0 disapprove comments.

Disapprove Comment Details

Comment Text	Comment #	Decision	Resolution Description
The definition of Coexistence is not clear. 1) The definition says: "… same radio frequency channel …". Is it intended that several systems in a same vicinity sharing a same radio frequency are not coexistent if they use different channels? 2) What is the extent of a communications system? The definition 3.237 (Self-coexitence) references "coexistence of multiple HR cells". Is a HR cell a system? Or is "coexistence of multiple HR cells something different? If so, what? 3) The "mother" standard 802.16Rev3 already defines coexistence. Are the two consistent? Can one be deleted in favor of the other? What happens when this amendment is merged into the standard 802.16; will the two definitions be able to coexist (pun intended)?	103	Superceded	Superceded – affected parts have been removed by 101.
The definition of Self-coexistence is not clear. What does "coexistence of multiple HR cells" mean? What about non-HR-cells?	104	Superceded	Self-Coex not in 16n draft.
The definite article ("the") or the indefinite article ("a' or "an") is missing in many, many places; too many to mention them all and too many to be acceptable for a publication.	150	Rejected	Reason: Incomplete Remedy Note: The editors will implement clean-up for next draft revision.
Bit 5 is already taken by 802.16Rev3, as shown in Clause 6.3.2.3.5, although Clause 11.5 fails to show it . Bits 5-7 are also taken by P802.16p.	107	Superceded	Superceded by 105 After discussion with M2M TG, it is decided that: Bit 5 is already used in Rev3, Bit 6 will be used for 16n for ranging request, and bit 7 will be used by 16p for power down reporting. The contribution 300r1 (part of comment 105) is correct as submitted, and resolves this comment.
This clause is too terse. It does not specify which messages are exchanged, whether there are any timers involved, what happens if one HR-MS receives the message from the HR-BS and the other does not, or if the HR-BS does not receive a response from one of the HR-MS. Furthermore, what does: "The HR-MS shall reply with reasons to HR-BS when it receives the link deletion request from HR-BS." mean? Which TLV or field does "reasons" refer to?	141	Rejected	No remedy was provided

Schedule for recirculation ballot

- Ballot Group formation is completed
- 15 day WG Confirmation Ballot (approximately 27 July 2012 to 11 August 2012)
- if conditions met:
  - 30-day Sponsor Ballot (approximately 13 Aug – 10 Sept 2012)
- else
  - Comment resolution followed by recirc

802.16 WG Motion

802.16 Closing Plenary: 2012-07-19

Motion: "To request EC Conditional approval to forward Draft P802.16n/D4 to Sponsor Ballot"

- Proposed: Tim Godfrey
- Seconded: Eunkyung Kim
- Approved 14-0-0

LMSC Motion

- To grant conditional approval, per Clause 13 of the IEEE 802 Operations Manual, to forward P802.16n for Sponsor Ballot

- Moved:

- Seconded:

- Approve:

- Disapprove:

- Abstain: