Dear <Working Group Chair>:

I completed the pre-ballot review of Draft 5 of IEEE P802.15.16™, and my comments (below) will help ensure your draft is ready for ballot.

Section I comments shall be resolved before the ballot begins. The draft *cannot* be balloted or recirculated until these issues are resolved.

Section II comments shall be resolved before the final recirculation. These issues have to be resolved, then reviewed by balloters.

Please note that comprehensive formatting and editing (i.e., spelling, punctuation, grammar) will take place after the draft has been approved. This MEC addresses only issues that may stand in the way of IEEE SA Standards Board approval.

Thank you for the opportunity to review this draft. If you have any queries about the comments in this MEC, please contact Michelle. via email (Michelle Turner).

Your OPM Program Manager, Christy Bahn. will assist you with next steps.

SECTION I: Shall be resolved before the ballot begins.

Copyright

Copyright Permission

If applicable, : Copyright permission letters for borrowed text (including definitions), tables, and figures shall be submitted to IEEE prior to the start of ballot. Submit all copyright permission letters to your OPM Program Manager.

- More information on the IEEE SA Copyright Policy can be found at: https://standards.ieee.org/ipr/.
- Sample permission letters can be downloaded from Templates at: https://standards.ieee.org/develop/drafting-standard/.

Content

Comments and Tracked Changes

Explanation of requirement: The draft submitted for ballot shall be "clean," without tracked changes or comments.

Word usage subclause

Mandatory Text

Explanation of requirement: The Word usage subclause shall consist of the following text with footnotes:

1.x Word usage

<This subclause is mandatory, and the definitions of shall, should, may, and can appear as defined in 6.4.7 of the IEEE SASB Operations Manual and shall not be modified.>

The word shall indicates mandatory requirements strictly to be followed in order to conform to the standard and from which no deviation is permitted (shall equals is required to).[1,2]

The word should indicates that among several possibilities one is recommended as particularly suitable, without mentioning or excluding others; or that a certain course of action is preferred but not necessarily required (should equals is recommended that).

The word may is used to indicate a course of action permissible within the limits of the standard (may equals is permitted to).

The word can is used for statements of possibility and capability, whether material, physical, or causal

(can equals is able to).

1The use of the word must is deprecated when stating mandatory requirements; must is used only to describe unavoidable situations.

2The use of will is deprecated when stating mandatory requirements; will is only used in statements of fact.

SECTION II: Shall be resolved before the final recirculation.

Absolute Verbiage

Explanation of requirement: Words making explicit or implicit guarantees should be modified if there is a possibility that unforeseen situations or circumstances may alter an outcome, especially those that are safety related. "Ensure" might be changed to "help ensure," and "to prevent" might be changed to "to reduce."

Please consider the recommended edits as follows:

The coordinator may shift (rotate) its beacon transmission time, as specified in 8.13.2, from one offset from the 14 start of current beacon period (superframe) to another offset from the start of next beacon period (superframe), thereby shifting the time reference for all scheduled allocations, to <u>help</u> prevent large-scale repeated transmission collisions between its BAN and neighbor BANs.

To <u>help</u> prevent a prolonged collision between overlapped transmissions by the coordinator and its nodes, after retrying a frame for up to pMICSCoordinatorMaxRetries without receiving an expected response, the coordinator should enter the receive mode to allow for transmission and reception of possible Emergency frames

Commercial Terms and Conditions, Trademarks

Explanation of requirement: References to commercial equipment or products in a standard shall be generic and shall not include trademarks or other proprietary designations. IEEE standards shall not include terms or conditions that are primarily contractual or commercial in nature, as opposed to technical or scientific in nature.

- More information on commercial terms and conditions can be found in the IEEE SA Policy set forth in 6.2 of the IEEE SA Standards Board Operations Manual and the primer dated 1 January 2023 at: https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/03/primer-ieee-sa-commercial-terms-conditions-policy.pdf.

Highlighted Text: p17 - Medical Implant Communications Service MICS

Registration Objects

Explanation of requirement: Drafts containing a registration of objects shall be submitted to the IEEE Registration Authority (IEEE RA) for mandatory coordination. The text containing the registration information should be highlighted in the draft, and the clause should be noted in the email to the IEEE RA.

- ore information on registration objects can be found at: https://standards.ieee.org/products-programs/regauth/.
- Submit drafts for Registration Authority review to rac-chair@ieee.org.

Highlighted Text: p9 - cid

Instruction to WG: This draft has been submitted to the Registration Authority for review.

Normative references:

FIPS Pub 186-5 is not cited normatively in text, if it is not needed for the implementation of the standard, please move to the bibliography. If it is need please site normatively in the normative text.

Content

Language

Highlighted Text: p163 - 游明朝

This should be remedied when comments are removed from the draft and the clean draft is submitted for ballot.

Instruction to WG: ['Please remove or translate into English non-Latin alphabet characters and words.']