**IEEE P802.15**

**Wireless Personal Area Networks**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Project | IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs) |
| Title | **LB207/D01 comment resolution -- Accept as proposed -- CIDs 42, 79, 117, 119, 120, 121, 123, 124, 159, 173, 303, 487, 498, 502, 1159, 1160, 1175, 1197, 1212, 1222, 1306, 1335, 1337, 1338, 1339, 1398** |
| Date Submitted | Sep 12, 2024 |
| Sources | Alex Krebs (Apple)krebs @ apple.com |
| Re: |   |
| Abstract |  |
| Purpose | To propose resolution for MMS related comments for “P802.15.4ab™/D (pre-ballot) C Draft Standard for Low-Rate Wireless Networks”. |
| Notice | This document does not represent the agreed views of the IEEE 802.15 Working Group or IEEE 802.15.4ab Task Group. It represents only the views of the participants listed in the “Sources” field above.It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individuals. The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributors reserve the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. |

# Accept as proposed

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name** | **Index #** | **Page** | **Sub-clause** | **Line #** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Disposition Detail** |
| Tero Kivinen | 303 | 23 | 8.3.4 | 19 | The note says that IE list parameters are not applicable, but there are also lots of other parameters which are not applicable for compact frames. For example DstPanID, SecurityParas, most of the TxOptions. The end of the table 8-30 already has NOTE saying that some values may be unsupported etc, so do we need another note here?  | Remove "Note, that the IE list parameters ..." text. | Accept. |
| B. Rolfe | 1337 | 59 | 10.38.3.3 | 20 | " may be changed by the next higher" is a hint this is improper use of "may".  | change "may" to "might" | Accept. |
| B. Rolfe | 1338 | 60 | 10.38.3.4  | 15 | "device may be provided by higher layer functionality" is stating a possibility, not an option. | change "may" to "might" | Accept |
| Billy Verso | 1159 | 66 | 10.38.3.7 | 7 | "configured", maybe "agreed" is better, if we accept that this is really in the realms of next higher layer since it is NHL that is initiating the interactions in each slot. | Change accordingly. | Accept. |
| Billy Verso | 1160 | 66 | 10.38.3.7 | 8 | "shall be applied" is something strange to do with defaults. Maybe the upper layer should reset the MAC before starting, but perhaps that goes without saying. There is already a primitive to do that in the base standard. | delete the sentence. | Accept. |
| B. Rolfe | 1339 | 66 | 10.38.3.7 | 9 | " round may be updated by the next higher layer. " s/b "might" | change "may" to "might" | Accept. |
| Mickael Maman | 42 | 68 | 10.38.5 | 23 | RSF fragments are not mandatory in case of RIF only. Then change "shall" to "may" | In the ranging phase, the initiator may transmit phyUwbMmsRsfNumberFrags RSF fragments | Accept. |
| Pablo Corbalán Pelegrín | 1306 | 70 | 10.38.6 | 5 | Shouldn't it be the "responder's report in the first period"? | Change "initiator's report" to "responder's report" | Accept. |
| Billy Verso | 1175 | 71 | 10.38.7.4.1 | 19 | First sentence seems unnecessary here. | Delete it | Accept. |
| Billy Verso | 1197 | 78 | 10.38.9.2.1  | 21 | "RPA\_prand" with underscore is a format not typically used in the base standard to describe something. Also this particular sentence (being first mention of the term) is a good place to introduce it, but it should be defined in clause 3.1 too.  | Change: "The initiator shall communicate a 3-octet output RPA\_prand of the CSPRNG in the..." to "The initiator shall use the CSPRNG to generate a 3-octet random bit sequence, herein termed the 'RPA prand', which it shall communicate in the…" ; and, change all occurrences of "RPA\_prand" to "RPA prand" ; and, add a definition of "RPA prand" into clause 2.1: "a random number used in the resolvable private address scheme (for Compact frames)". | Accept |
| Bin Qian | 159 | 81 | 10.38.9.3.6 | 13 | The last sentence is not completed. The field information is missing | It seems that the length of the octet string is indicated by the PT Data Length field value. If so, it is duplicated with Line 10 and it is suggested to remove the last sentence | Accept |
| Tero Kivinen | 487 | 81 | 10.38.9.3.7 | 21 | The NbChannelAffineSet is not obtained from the bits 42 to 46, it is constructed from those bits.  | Change "NbChannelAffineSet is obtained" to "NbChannelAffineSet is constructed". | Accept |
| Tero Kivinen | 498 | 82 | 10.38.9.3.8 | 25 | The NbChannelAffineSet is not obtained from the bits 10 to 14, it is constructed from those bits.  | Change "NbChannelAffineSet is obtained" to "NbChannelAffineSet is constructed". | Accept. |
| Tero Kivinen | 502 | 83 | 10.38.9.3.9 | 15 | The NbChannelAffineSet is not obtained from the bits 32 to 36, it is constructed from those bits.  | Change "NbChannelAffineSet is obtained" to "NbChannelAffineSet is constructed". | Accept. |
| Billy Verso | 1212 | 86 | 10.38.9.3.12 | 10 | "lowermost" is an odd word… perhaps should be more explicit. | change to "lowest value channel number enabled by the macMmsNbChannelAllowList…" | Accept |
| Rojan Chitrakar | 117 | 94 | 10.38.9.5 | 3 | It is better to list the present fields that may be non-zero to avoid having to change the sentence if any new presence bit is added to the presence bitmap. | change as:"…, except that the fields other than the NB Channel Map Present field, the Management PHY Configuration Present field, the Management MAC Configuration Present field, the Ranging PHY Configuration Present field, the Ranging MAC Configuration Present field, the SMC TLVs Present field, the MMS Ranging Mode Configuration Present field and the Extended Presence Bitmap Present field shall all be set to zero." | Accept. |
| Rojan Chitrakar | 119 | 94 | 10.38.9.5 | 8 | "field" is missing | add "field" | Accept. |
| Rojan Chitrakar | 120 | 94 | 10.38.9.5 | 10 | If the sentence in line 3 is modified as suggested in another comment, this sentence is not necessary and can be deleted. | Delete the sentence since this can be covered by the sentence in line 3. | Accept. |
| Rojan Chitrakar | 121 | 94 | 10.38.9.5 | 15 | "field" is missing | add "field" | accept. |
| Rojan Chitrakar | 123 | 96 | 10.38.9.6 | 5 | the MMS Ranging Mode Configuration field and the Extended Presence Bitmap Present field needs to be added to the list. | add the MMS Ranging Mode Configuration field and the Extended Presence Bitmap Present field to the end of the sentence | Reassign to Rojan. |
| Rojan Chitrakar | 124 | 96 | 10.38.9.6 | 8 | Sentence needs to be updated | change as:"The encoding and meaning of the NB Channel Map, the Management PHY Configuration field, Management MAC Configuration field, Ranging PHY Configuration field and the Ranging MAC Configuration field is identical to that of the fields of the same name in the Advertising ResponseCompact frame with Message Control field value equal to 0x00." | Reassign to Rojan. |
| Billy Verso | 1222 | 100 | 10.38.9.9 | 1 | Passthrough size in figure 80 says 0/variable, but from 10.38.9.3.6 it looks like it should be 1/variable.  | Chane to 1/variable in this figure and any other figures with passthrough data. | Reject. Field might be completely absent. |
| Bin Qian | 173 | 124 | 10.38.10.1 | 16 | The range of macMmsConotrolPhaseMode and macMmsReportPhaseMode is 1-8, 14, 15 | Change the range to 1-8, 14, 15 | Accept |
| Mickael Maman | 79 | 125 | 10.38.10.1 | 1 | Rp duration is between 0 and 4095 according to section 10.38.9.3.12 | as in comment | Revise. Change value in column range to "1-4095" |
| Alex Krebs | 1398 | 125 | 10.38.10.1  | 1 | UwbChannel range 1-16 | Change range to include extended channels 1-113 as defined in 16.4.1.2 | Revise: Apply proposed resolution with correct range 0-113 |
| B. Rolfe | 1335 | 56 | 10.38.3.1 | 31 |  " may be changed by the higher layer " indicates a that his is a statement of possibility,not a permissible action defined in this standard. | Change "may be changed" to "are set by" | Accept. |