**IEEE P802.15**

**Wireless Personal Area Networks**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Project | IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs) |
| Title | **LB207/D01 comment resolution -- MMS operation, initialization -- CIDs 209, 395, 990, 1122, 1123, 1336, 1347, 1350** |
| Date Submitted | Aug 12, 2024 |
| Sources | Alex Krebs (Apple)  krebs @ apple.com |
| Re: |  |
| Abstract |  |
| Purpose | To propose resolution for MMS related comments for “P802.15.4ab™/D (pre-ballot) C Draft Standard for Low-Rate Wireless Networks”. |
| Notice | This document does not represent the agreed views of the IEEE 802.15 Working Group or IEEE 802.15.4ab Task Group. It represents only the views of the participants listed in the “Sources” field above.It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individuals. The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributors reserve the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name** | **Index #** | **Page** | **Sub-clause** | **Line #** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Proposed Resolution** |
| Tero Kivinen | 395 | 55 | 10.38.1 | 22 | What is the X in the figure 23? What is the Y in figure 23? I assume the X is supposed to be number of fragments, and Y is how many times each full thing is repeated or something like that. | Add description of X and Y to the Figure 23 (and Figure 24). | Revise. Extend sentence p.55 l.14-15 by: "...respectively, where X is phyUwbMmsRsfNumberFrags  and Y is phyUwbMmsRifNumberFrags." |
| Pooria Pakrooh | 1347 | 57 | 10.38.3.2 | 5 | Two sentences contradicting. Change to: "Unless renegotiated by OOB or during initialization phase, the default ranging configuration parnmeters" | As in the comment | Revise. Replace "Unless renegotiated during initialization and setup, the default ranging configuration parameters shall be used for the ranging session. Alternatively, the ranging session configuration could be agreed using an OOB mechanism." by  "Unless renegotiated during initialization and setup or via OOB methods, the default ranging configuration parameters are used for the ranging session." |
| Billy Verso | 1122 | 57 | 10.38.3.2 | 8 | I don't understand opportunistically receiving or listening as mentioned in this paragraph, I think higher layer decisions and protocols should really be defined to control the MAC/PHY activity here. I think the actual protocol is only loosely defined here, and is perhaps really for upper layer protocol to define. | The protocol is only loosely defined here, and really an upper layer protocol should be specified. I am not sure what change is best/necessary. Perhaps a way forward, rather than a vague descriptions would be to actually say that these details are left to the upper layer, but that an example is given in annex X. Then add annex X with a very specific example laid out from upper layer perspectives with specific example numbers, initiator device sending AP at interval n, and responder devices turning on for period p every interval m, so that .... etc. | Revise: change to  "8 To establish NB O-QPSK initialization, devices should ~~opportunistically~~ transmit and receive on the 9 dedicated initialization channel using the PHY modulation, as specified in the default ranging session 10 configuration (as described in Table 20) or as configured prior to initialization via higher layer protocols. 11 The initiator may send Advertising Poll Compact frames ~~opportunistically~~ at times and intervals at its 12 discretion as deemed suitable for the higher layer functionality to be supported. Similarly, the responder 13 should ~~may opportunistically~~ listen for incoming Advertising Poll Compact frames." |
| Billy Verso | 1123 | 57 | 10.38.3.2 | 17 | If there is only one response why is it listening in multiple slots? Also "shall" is perhaps specifying something in a protocol layer that is really above the MAC. | Change line to: "The initiator can then listen for incoming advertising responses in these subsequent initialization slots." | Discussion: There are multiple response slots in CAP one to many intialization for which the describe behaviour could be correct eventually, but I agree that should go in the O2M CAP section then.   Revise: Change "The initiator shall listen for an 17 incoming advertising response in these subsequent initialization slots." to   "Once the initiator has sent an advertising message, the initiator shall listen for an 17 incoming advertising response in the~~se subsequent~~ following initialization slot~~s~~." |
| Pooria Pakrooh | 1350 | 58 | 10.38.3.2 | 7 | Control phase seems to refer to "initialization phase" | Replace "control phase" with initialization phase | Reject. The first response after SOR is RESP, which is in control phase. Therefore the sentence is correct in D01. |
| Srivathsa Masthi Parthasarathi | 209 | 58 | 10.38.3.2 | 1,2 | strong assumption on Advertising Response has successfully received by the Initiator, which may not be true in all the scenarios | responder shall listen to SOR and if the SOR is not received then it may listen to the next Adv Poll the initiator may continue transmission of Adv Poll of Adv Response is not received | Revise. Change "Once" to "If" and "received" to "receives" in line 2. Append line 3 by: "Otherwise the initiator may reattempt initialization and setup by continuing to send Advertising Poll Compact frames." |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name** | **Index #** | **Page** | **Sub-clause** | **Line #** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Proposed Resolution** |
| Carlos Aldana | 990 | 57 | 10.38.3.2 | 20 | What frequency is used to transmit SOR frame? Please clarify. | As in comment | Discussion: It is the frequency given in 11.1.3.15 for the channel number given by macMmsNbInitChannel.  Revise. (see below) |
| B. Rolfe | 1336 | 59 | 10.38.3.3 | 18 | "may change" really means "might be changed by the higher layer" I think. SO it's a possibility of which the MAC has no control. | Change "may" to "might" | Revise. (see below) |

Discussion: Text can be simplified for better understanding.

Disposition detail: Change sentence on p.59 l.18 to: "The channel used for transmissions during the initialization phase is ~~specified by the~~macMmsNbInitChannel ~~attribute, which may be changed prior to initialization~~."