**IEEE P802.15**

**Wireless Personal Area Networks**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Project | IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs) |
| Title | **DraftC comment resolution - Simple (revise/reject) - CIDs 33, 85, 86, 88, 340, 398, 403, 404, 521, 609, 631, 689, 708, 837** |
| Date Submitted | May 02, 2024 |
| Sources | Alex Krebs (Apple)  krebs @ apple.com |
| Re: |  |
| Abstract |  |
| Purpose | To propose resolution for MMS related comments for “P802.15.4ab™/D (pre-ballot) C Draft Standard for Low-Rate Wireless Networks”. |
| Notice | This document does not represent the agreed views of the IEEE 802.15 Working Group or IEEE 802.15.4ab Task Group. It represents only the views of the participants listed in the “Sources” field above.It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individuals. The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributors reserve the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name** | **CID** | **p.** | **Sub-clause** | **l.** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Proposed Resolution** |
| Carl Murray | 689 | 48 | 10.38.3.4 | 13 | "… or change the values ..." it is not clear here what the changes are with respect to?  Currently all values are sent in the SOR. If there are prenegotiated default values should the SOR not have a configuration (i.e. message control) to only send the changes? | Change this text  For these fields, the initiator may either use the same values received via the Advertising Response Compact frame from the responder or change the values of each field before transmitting the updated field values in the Start of Ranging Compact frame.  to  For these fields, the initiator may choose to use any of the values received via the Advertising Response Compact frame from the responder before transmitting the field values in the Start of Ranging Compact frame.  Also add a SOR that does not have to transmit everything. | Revise. Discussion: Generally agree, but even better than the text proposed (highlighted) may be: "should choose the values" as this would assure that values will be acceptable for the responder. Last part of the proposed changed "Also dd..." should be treated as separate comment (689b).  Disposition detail:  " For these fields, the initiator should choose the values received via the Advertising Response Compact frame from the responder before transmitting the field values in the Start of Ranging Compact frame." |
| Rojan Chitrakar | 609 | 48 | 10.38.3.4 | 15 | NB\_Channel\_Select should be replaced with NB channel Map. | Replace NB\_Channel\_Select with the correct fields of NB Channel Map field. | Revise. Change sentence to: "If the initiator changes the value of the NB Channel Map field received from the Advertising Response Compact frame, it shall change the value such that the list of allowed channels is a subset of the channels requested by the responder." |
| Carl Murray | 708 | 58 | 10.38.8.4.1 | 9 | Is this statement correct - is the spectrum always shared?  "The NBA MMS combines O-QPSK narrowband PHY and the HRP UWB PHY and MAC protocols operating in shared spectrum" |  | Revise. Remove "operating in shared spectrum" |
| Rojan Chitrakar | 631 | 64 | 10.38.10.2.1 | 30 | How the IRKs are exchanged may indeed be done OOB, but it is critical for the IRKs to be exchanged prior to the RPAs to being resovled. | Rephrase to convey that it is mandatory to perform the IRK exchange between devices prior to Initialization and Setup phase. | Revise. Change sentence to: "The generation and mutual exchange of IRKs among initiator(s) and responder(s) is a prerequisite for private address resolution as described and is out of scope of this standard and may be conducted using higher layer methods." |
| Bin Qian | 340 | 65 | 10.38.10.3.3 | 26 | There is no Message ID, which is replaced by the Compact Frame ID | As in the comment | Revise. Replace "Message ID field" by "Message Control field" |
| Li-Hsiang Sun | 33 | 71 | 10.38.10.4 | 14 | "selects Message Control=0x00 for Msg IDs (0x02-0x07)."  This sentence should also indicate that msg ctrl 0x00 for these message IDs | as in comment | Reject. (comment not clear, sentence has been revised for #912 in DCN 103 before) |
| Pooria Pakrooh | 85 | 83 | 10.38.10.12 | 3 | Having a mode where Poll and response are swapped causes more complexity in implementation. What is the benefit of having this mode? Suggesting to remove this mode if there is no clear benefit. | Remove the message control mode of 0x06 where the Poll and Response are switched. | Reject. (Improves UWB coex: Acks to the responders that TX NB uplink to the initiator is good --> responder can omit UWB fragment transmission when POLL is not received). |
| Pooria Pakrooh | 86 | 88 | 10.38.10.14 | 29 | "cycle" is not a defined term. | Change "cycle" to "round". | Revise: Change "cycle" to "block". |
| Pooria Pakrooh | 88 | 96 | 10.38.10.20.1 | 16 | How is this "active period" measured? From the start of the block? Needs to be clarified for it to Convery useful info. | Clarify the definition of "Active Period Duration". | Revise. Replace "duration of active period" with "the time difference between the start and the end of UWB channel TX activity" |
| Bin Qian | 398 | 100 | 10.38.10.22 | 10 | The description of the NB Channel Map, Management PHY Configuration, Management MAC Configuration, Ranging PHY Configuration, and Ranging MAC Configuration is missing | As in the comment | Revise. Replace the words "Configuration" by "Config". (NB Channel Map has been defined in DCN 103. Management PHY Config is defined in 10.38.10.3.15. Management MAC Config is defined in 10.38.10.3.10. Ranging PHY Config is defined in 10.38.10.3.8. Ranging MAC Config is defined in 10.38.10.3.9.) |
| Bin Qian | 404 | 102 | 10.38.10.24 | 12 | The description of the NB Channel Map, Management PHY Configuration, Management MAC Configuration, Ranging PHY Configuration, and Ranging MAC Configuration is missing | As in the comment | Revise. Replace the words "Configuration" by "Config". (NB Channel Map has been defined in DCN 103. Management PHY Config is defined in 10.38.10.3.15. Management MAC Config is defined in 10.38.10.3.10. Ranging PHY Config is defined in 10.38.10.3.8. Ranging MAC Config is defined in 10.38.10.3.9.) |
| Bin Qian | 403 | 102 | 10.38.10.24 | 4, 13 | The description is not complete | As in the comment | Revised. (Key ID resolved in DCN 24-17r2 (Rojan), Reply-time resolved in DCN 24-198r2 (Alex)) |
| Tero Kivinen | 521 | 103 | 10.38.11.1 | 1 | macMmsNbAllowListLength is not needed, the interface is conseptual, thus it is assumed that macMmsNbChannelAllowList implicitly includes the length of the array. Remove macMmsNbAllowListLength. | Remove macMmsNbAllowListLength. | Accept/Revise: Also change p.59 line 16 to:  SelectedChannel = macMmsNbChannelAllowList [PrngValue MOD L], where L is the length of macMmsNbChannelAllowList. |
| Carl Murray | 837 | 103 | 10.38.11.1 | 1 | Recommend renaming macMmsReportEnable. An enable signal should not have 4 possible values but should be boolean |  | Revise: Rename macMmsReportEnable to macMmsReportSender here, and also on p.52, l.21. |