**IEEE P802.15**

**Wireless Personal Area Networks**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Project | IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs) |
| Title | **DraftC comment resolution - Duplicates & closely related - CIDs 164, 347, 348, 397, 400, 402, 514, 516, 520, 638, 647, 723, 734, 910, 911** |
| Date Submitted | May 02, 2024 |
| Sources | Alex Krebs (Apple)  krebs @ apple.com |
| Re: |  |
| Abstract |  |
| Purpose | To propose resolution for MMS related comments for “P802.15.4ab™/D (pre-ballot) C Draft Standard for Low-Rate Wireless Networks”. |
| Notice | This document does not represent the agreed views of the IEEE 802.15 Working Group or IEEE 802.15.4ab Task Group. It represents only the views of the participants listed in the “Sources” field above.It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individuals. The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributors reserve the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name** | **CID** | **p.** | **Sub-clause** | **l.** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Proposed Resolution** |
| Bin Qian | 347 | 71 | 10.38.10.4 | 17 | The number of occupied octets of SMC TLVs is missing | As in the comment | Revised. (see #514) |
| Tero Kivinen | 514 | 71 | 10.38.10.4 | 17 | the length of the SMC TLVs should most likely be variable not "?". | Change to variable. | Accept. (override editorial #736) |
| Tero Kivinen | 516 | 72 | 10.38.10.4 | 3 | SMC TLVs length should be variable. | Change to variable. | Accept. |
| Tero Kivinen | 520 |  |  |  | There seems to be lots of details missing in other frame formats too, I will not comment about them anymore. (74 \* ..., and 19 \* ???). | Fix other cases where there is … or ??? or ?? | Reject. Comment ambiguous, please resubmit on next draft if not fixed. |
| Carl Murray | 723 | 68 | 10.38.10.3.10 | 27 | Should RpDuration be linked to macMmsRpDuration (note they have incompatible ranges) | resolve | Revised. (dup #61, resolved in DCN 103) |
| Carl Murray | 734 | 71 | 10.38.10.4 | 14 | Looks like a random sentence | Delete | Revised. (#912 in DCN 103) |
| Benjamin Rolfe | 164 | 71 | 10.38.10.4 | 19 | Incomplete specification (TBD): Multiple fields lack definitions (SMC TLVs, CAP duration field, Initialization Slot Duration field). Note that I can not find this field used in any part of this draft other than frame definitions. Maybe we don't need it? | Complete definition or delete the fields that are not needed | Revised. (resolved in DCN 103, and DCN 24 (Bin Qian) for CIDs 518, 637, 741, 905, 519, 742, 906, 809, 810 and 381) |
| Bin Qian | 348 | 72 | 10.38.10.4 | 5-7 | The descriptions of the SMC TLVs field, CAP Duration field, Initialization Slot Duration field are missing | As in the comment | Revised. (see #164) |
| Rojan Chitrakar | 638 | 71 | 10.38.10.4 | 21 | To allow the slot duration to be updated via the Advertising Poll, the Initialization Slot Duration field should be included in all Advertising Poll versions, not just the ones with Cap Duration. Initialization slots are also applicable in one-to-one session initialization (see 10.38.3.2 Session initialization) | as in comment | Revised. (see #649 DCN 144r2) |
| Rojan Chitrakar | 647 | 79 | 10.38.10.10 | 16 | Contents are missing. | Add the contents | Revised. (#67 in DCN 198r2) |
| Mickael Maman | 910 | 98 | 10.38.10.21 | 21 | The Round-trip Time field … ??? | The Round-trip Time field is an unsigned integer that conveys the TX-to-RX Round-trip time in RSTU. | Revised. (#66/#67 in DCN 24-198r2) |
| Mickael Maman | 911 | 99 | 10.38.10.22 | 13 | The Reply Time field …??? | The Reply Time field is an unsigned integer that conveys the RX-to-TX Reply time in RSTU. | Revised. (#66/#67 in DCN 24-198r2) |
| Bin Qian | 397 | 99 | 10.38.10.22 | 11, 13, 20 | The description is not complete | As in the comment | Revised. Key ID resolved in DCN 24-17r2 (Rojan) |
| Bin Qian | 400 | 100 | 10.38.10.23 | 22, 24 | The description is not complete | As in the comment | Revised. (Key ID resolved in DCN 24-17r2 (Rojan), Round-trip time resolved in DCN 24-198r2 (Alex)) |
| Bin Qian | 402 | 101 | 10.38.10.24 | 15, 17 | The description is not complete | As in the comment | Revised. (Key ID resolved in DCN 24-17r2 (Rojan), Reply-time resolved in DCN 24-198r2 (Alex)) |