|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Comment** | **Text in PAR/CSD** | **Remarks / Answers to the Comments** |
| **In response to the comments from IEEE 802.3:** | | |
| **CSD:** When 802.3 reviewed the 802.15ma PAR, we briefly discussed the rule on CSD requirements. When I personally reviewed the 802.15.3ma PAR, it hit me that my similar assumption that a CSD was not required might be wrong. Though most of us know significant new functionality is in scope for a revision project under SA rules, and such new functionality may be introduced during balloting and not known at the time a revision PAR is created, the appropriateness for a CSD response is ambiguous between historical application of the rules and the exact text in the rules. What made me personally not propose a similar “CSD not required” comment was going back and reading the rule after seeing that a new frequency band was planned to be added in the revision, I think 802.15 was wise to include a CSD based on the text of the exemption to a CSD in LMSC Operations Manual 9.2:  "PARs that which introduce no new functionality are exempt from the requirement to provide a CSD statement."  They plan to add new functionality and therefore per my reading of the above sentence are not exempt. I think it was very appropriate for them to fill out a CSD per the rules. | n/a | Thanks for the observation and the discussion. |
| **In response to the comments from IEEE 802.11:** | | |
| **2.1** – NesCom Conventions states  “For PARs for new projects, standards developers who use general terms to represent ranges (e.g. high, medium, low) within the title, scope, or purpose, must numerically define such ranges where they first appear (title, scope, or purpose, as applicable). Any exception to this must be explained.”  So, the title should be considered to be updated to include the range that the revision will cover. As 802.15 is now not just Low data rate or personal area networks, the title should be updated to include a range per convention. | **2.1 Standard for Wireless Multi-Media Networks** | **2.1.**: Thank you for the comment. We remove “High Data Rate” from the title.  Reasoning for the suggested change:   1. “High Data Rate” is in fact meaningless. 2. Everything, including changing the title, is within scope of a revision. 3. There is absolutely no reason to include specific data rates in the title of the standard. Note that there is no data rate range given in the title (or scope) of 802.11 for example 4. Reducing it to “Multi-media Networks” would be consistent with, for example, the title of 802.11. 5. The range of data rates for 15.3 is now vast and expected to expand 6. If we specify a specific range, to exceed the specified range would require a revision instead of an amendment (to change the title) 7. “Multi-Media Networks” differentiates 802.15.3 clearly from other 802.15 standards 8. The suggested remedy to add a range is impractical and based on what appears an incorrect assumption that 802.15.3 was previously a low data rate target |
| **5.5** Properly cite “802.15.3d, 802.15.3e and 80.15.3f” ..e.g. IEEE std 802.15.3d…” | **5.5 Need for the Project:** It is a requirement of the Standards Association that the Sponsor shall initiate a  revision of a standard whenever any of the material in the standard (including all amendments, corrigenda, etc.) becomes obsolete or incorrect, or if multiple amendments to a base standard exist three years after its approval or most recent reaffirmation. Since the last revision of the standard three amendments have been  completed. These are IEEE Std. 802.15.3d, IEEE Std. 802.15.3e and IEEE Std. 802.15.3f. This revision is needed to roll up the three completed amendments, to make various corrections and to add additional frequency bands in the frequency  range 356 to 450 GHz. IEEE Std. 802.15.3 includes a reference priority mapping using IEEE Std. 802.1D, which is being withdrawn. The reference priority mapping will be replaced in order to use IEEE Std. 802.1Q. | **5.5:** In response to your comments, we have made the edits to 5.5 shown to the left |
| **8.1** Please list the full Standard name for those standards cited in the PAR:  5.5 Standards cited in the PAR:  802.15.3d, 802.15.3e and 80.15.3f.  IEEE Std. 802.1D-2004,  IEEE Std. 802.1Q | **8.1 Additional Explanatory Notes:**  The full name of all standards listed in 5.5 are as follows:  Sponsor Organization: IEEE 802  Standard Number: IEEE 802.15.3  Standard Date: 2016-05-16  Standard Title: Part 15.3: Wireless Medium Access Control (MAC) and Physical Layer (PHY) Specifications for High Rate Wireless PersonalArea Networks (WPANs  Sponsor Organization: IEEE 802  Standard Number: IEEE 802.15.3d  Standard Date: 2017-10-18  Standard Title: Part 15.3: Wireless Medium Access Control (MAC) and Physical Layer (PHY) Specifications for High Rate Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs): Amendment 2 for a 100Gbps wireless switched point-to-point physical layer  Sponsor Organization: IEEE 802  Standard Number: IEEE 802.15.3e  Standard Date: 2017-06-07  Standard Title: Part 15.3: Wireless Medium Access Control (MAC) and Physical Layer (PHY) Specifications for High Rate Wireless PersonalArea Networks (WPANs): Amendment 1: High-Rate Close Proximity Point-to-Point Communications  Sponsor Organization: IEEE 802  Standard Number: IEEE 802.15.3f  Standard Date: 2017-12-06  Standard Title: Part 15.3: Wireless Medium Access Control (MAC) and Physical Layer (PHY) Specifications for High Rate Wireless PersonalArea Networks (WPANs): Amendment 3: Extending the Physical Layer (PHY) Specification for Millimeter Wave to Operate from 57.0 GHz to 71 GHz  Sponsor Organization: IEEE 802  Standard Number: IEEE 802.1D  Standard Date: 2004-02-09  Standard Title IEEE Standard for Local and metropolitan area networks--Bridges and Bridged Networks  Sponsor Organization: IEEE 802  Standard Number IEEE 802.1Q  Standard Date: 2018-07-06-18  Standard Title: IEEE Standard for Local and Metropolitan Area Network--Bridges and Bridged Networks | **8.1:** In response to your comments, we have made the edits to 8.1 shown to the left |
| **CSD: Not required for Revision Projects. – Thanks for the effort.** | n/a | Thanks for the observation |