

19 November 2020
IEEE P802.15.9ma™

Re: Pre-ballot Mandatory Editorial Coordination (Pre-ballot MEC)

Dear Tero:

I have reviewed Draft 02 of IEEE P802.15.9ma™, and I have the following comments. Please note that this review has been organized into two sections and uses the “language of standards” to communicate necessary requirements (shall) of the IEEE SA standards process versus those issues that are voluntary (should) in nature.

Section I: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the ballot begins

The draft cannot be balloted or recirculated until these issues are resolved. Your Staff Liaison will review the updated draft for compliance prior to upload of the PDF for ballot.

NOTE—Fonts shall be embedded in the draft PDF. Instructions on creating a PDF with embedded fonts can be found at: <https://standards.ieee.org/develop/drafting-standard/write.html>

Section II: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the final recirculation

These issues have to be resolved and viewed by balloters. The items will be checked for completion by the Project Editor during the Sponsor ballot, then checked by the Review Committee (RevCom) of the IEEE SA Standards Board (IEEE SASB), and will impact approval unless rectified.

Please note that professional editing takes place once the document has been approved and, as such, this MEC does not address all of the editorial items that will be reviewed then (i.e., punctuation, grammar, formatting).

The following comments are derived from the *IEEE Standards Style Manual*. The complete *IEEE Standards Style Manual*, in viewable/downloadable format, can be found at:

<https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf>

SECTION I: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the ballot begins:

Copyright

- If applicable, all copyright permission for excerpted text, tables, and figures shall be submitted to the IEEE prior to the start of ballot. If there are missing permission response letters, please submit them immediately to STDS-PERM-LTRS@IEEE.org.

Sample permission letters can be found in Annex A of the [IEEE Standards Style Manual](#) or <https://mentor.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf>. More information on the IEEE SA Copyright Policy can be found at: <http://standards.ieee.org/ipr/copyright.html>

- The correct copyright statement shall appear on the first page of the standard. The statement can be found in 9.1.2 or Annex C of the [IEEE Standards Style Manual](#).
- Update frontmatter/copyright year to 2020.
- The correct copyright line shall appear on the bottom of every page, including the body of the standard:

Copyright © 20xx IEEE. All rights reserved.
This is an unapproved IEEE Standards Draft, subject to change.

Designation

The designation needs to be updated to reflect that this is a draft. Please change in every instance to IEEE P802.15.9ma/D02. Also, change IEEE to Draft in every instance of the title.

Word usage

- All documents shall include Clause 1. Overview. Clause 1 at a minimum shall include the 1.1 Scope and 1.2 Word usage. If draft has 1.1 Scope, 1.2 Purpose then 1.3 shall be included and entitled Word usage. Since you have a 1.4 already in your draft, please include a Word usage subclause as 1.5 in your draft.
- The following text shall appear in the Word usage subclause (with the following footnotes):

The word *shall* indicates mandatory requirements strictly to be followed in order to conform to the standard and from which no deviation is permitted (*shall equals is required to*).^{1,2}

The word *should* indicates that among several possibilities one is recommended as particularly suitable, without mentioning or excluding others; or that a certain course of action is preferred but not necessarily required (*should equals is recommended that*).

The word *may* is used to indicate a course of action permissible within the limits of the standard (*may equals is permitted to*).

The word *can* is used for statements of possibility and capability, whether material, physical, or causal (*can equals is able to*).

¹The use of the word *must* is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, *must* is used only to describe unavoidable situations.

²The use of *will* is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, *will* is only used in statements of fact.

Open source

- If your draft incorporates open source software developed by the Working Group, then Contributor Licensing Agreements (CLAs) from all contributors are required.

- You shall include OS text and a link to the OS files on the platform before the draft can proceed to ballot (so it is included on page ii of the draft) The link will be provided by the IEEE Open Source Community Manager (OSCM).
- The OSCM has to verify successful completion of the IPR Audit on all incorporated open source software developed by the Working Group. Please contact [oscontrib@ieee.org].

SECTION II: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the final recirculation

Legal: “Absolute” verbiage

- Please review the text for any explicit or implicit guarantees made within the document, especially those that are safety-related. Avoid making guarantees if there is a possibility of unforeseen situations or circumstances altering an outcome. For example, words such as “ensure,” “guarantee,” “maximize,” “minimize,” etc., should be modified, if they are inaccurate. Substitutions might include “reduce” or “improve.” For example, “to ensure safety” might be changed to “to improve safety” or “to prevent” might be changed to “to reduce.”

Trademarks or service marks

- Please review the use of trademarks in the draft, if applicable. References to commercial equipment or products in a standard shall be generic and shall not include trademarks or other proprietary designations. Where a sole source exists for essential equipment or materials, it is permissible to supply the name of the trademark owner in a footnote. The proper use guidelines for trademarks shall be determined by the trademark owner. Trademark owners must grant written permission before their trademarks may be referenced in a standard.
- Trademarks or other proprietary designations that are not commercial equipment or products should be avoided in standards. If used however, all trademarks shall be credited to the trademark owner in the front matter of the standard. The following text shall introduce any mention of specific trademark information:

The following information is given for the convenience of users of this standard and does not constitute an endorsement by the IEEE of these products. Equivalent products may be used if they can be shown to lead to the same results.

For more information on commercial terms and conditions see the IEEE SA Policy on commercial terms set forth in 6.2 of the IEEE SA [Standards Board Operations Manual](#).

Registration objects

- If the draft contains a registration of objects (for additional information, visit the IEEE Standards Web site (<https://standards.ieee.org/products-services/regauth/index.html>), the working group shall submit the document to the IEEE Registration Authority (IEEE RA) for mandatory coordination (submit to a.n.thomas@ieee.org for review). The text containing the registration information should be highlighted in the draft and the clause should be noted in the email. If the working group believes that the draft may potentially contain a registration of objects or if the working group would like information about setting up a registration, contact the IEEE RA as early as possible to prevent a delay in approval by the IEEE SA Standards Board. Search on the following words: object identifier, unique identifier, and assignment of unique numbers.

Absolute verbiage

- I know this was a Recommended Practice in 2016. As such, I think that many “should” clauses remain in this document. Since it is a standard now, you are most likely setting more requirements and therefore would need the use of more “shall” statements. Please go through and determine what are requirements and change to “shall”. Please note that this doesn’t mean all the “should” will simply be changed to “shalls,” but I believe some will need an update.

Front matter

- Update frontmatter from most recent template

- Make sure updated information has been included in the frontmatter. The most recent Notice to users section can be found in the latest templates at: <https://standards.ieee.org/develop/drafting-standard/resources.html>.

Please note that the following are next steps for this project.

a) After you have implemented this review, create the pdf that will be used for ballot (remember that the draft number shall be rolled to reflect that changes have been made to this document, e.g., P1234™/Dx+1).

b) Upon completion of the invitation to ballot please follow the next steps:

Instructions:

1. Login to myProject and click the **Balloting** tab
2. Click **Initiate Sponsor Ballot**
3. Select your project from the PAR drop down list
4. Enter the **Ballot Open Date**
5. Enter the **Ballot Close Date** (should be minimum of 30 days)
6. Enter the **Draft #:** (must match the draft number in the draft)
7. **Select File for Uploading:** Click the Browse button to find your draft file. The file must be in pdf.

NOTE—Fonts shall be embedded in the draft PDF. Instructions on creating a PDF with embedded fonts can be found at: <https://standards.ieee.org/content/dam/ieee-standards/standards/web/documents/other/embeddedfonts.pdf> .

8. Review the system generated text. If you would like to add additional instruction or information, use the **Sponsor Text Area**.
9. Click **Initiate Ballot**.

c) Note that compliance with items in Section I will be reviewed by the Staff Liaison when you upload the pdf to the URL in item b). The Project Editor will not review your draft until the Ballot MEC, which occurs during the Sponsor ballot.

d) The RevCom MEC will occur after you submit the final balloted draft to RevCom. At that time you will also be required to submit the document source file. If the figures are not native Word or Framemaker graphics, each graphic shall be submitted as a separate file following the requirements outlined in Clause 14 of the [IEEE Standards Style Manual](#).

<https://mentor.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf>

Thank you for the opportunity to review this draft. If you have any queries about the comments in this mandatory editorial coordination, please contact Catherine Berger via email (berger.catherine@ieee.org).

cc: [Jodi Haasz](#)