IEEE P802.15  
Wireless Specialty Networks

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| IEEE 802.15.13  March to May 2020 Telco Minutes | | | | |
| Date: 2020-04-02 | | | | |
| Author: | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Volker Jungnickel | HHI |  |  | volker.jungnickel@hhi.fraunhofer.de |

Abstract

# This document contains the TG13 Multi-Gigabit/s Optical Wireless Communications Telco minutes from March to May 2020.

**Monday, March 16, 2020, 10:00-12:00 Central Europe time**

**Attendance:**

* Volker Jungnickel (HHI)
* Sang-Kyu Lim (ETRI)
* Joerg Robert (Uni Erlangen), left after beginning
* Kai Lennert Bober (HHI)
* Tuncer Baykas (Mediopol)
* Nikola Serafimofski (pureLiFi)

1. The phone call was opened by the Chair. The Chair noted that the CRG is able to make technical motions changing the draft, as all members are in the call, and 50% attendance is required.
2. The Atlanta meeting has been cancelled due to the Corona Virus crisis. TG13 contiunues its operations via teleconferences. It is planned to held a 1-2 hours meeting every week. The Technical Editor will send out a WebEx invite for every Monday 10-12 CET.
3. LB168 is finished. Collected comments are in doc. 15-20/0096r0. 140 new comments have been received, some of which are related to old ones that were rejected in LB166. Some comments need really complex work. One No vote has been turned into Yes. The Chair send out emails last week to all No voters and got a reply from one of the stating it is difficult to check the draft before the deadline due to other letter ballots running in parallel.
4. The communication with the WG Chair about title changes shows that “we would not be able to take any action on either of these until the July meeting per 802 rules. Meanwhile we will move forward with what we have and reevaluate where things stand as we get closer to the July meeting.”
5. The TG13 started going through the comments in doc. 15-20/0096r0 until CID #588. The discussion on CID #589 was postponed to the next telco meeting. The Technical Editor will upload a revised doc. 15-20/0096r1 with all the resolutions completed so far.
6. The meeting recessed. Next meeting is Thursday, March 19, 10-12 CET. Note there is also a Closing plenary meeting of the working group during the regular time it would have been held in Atlanta.

**Thursday, March 19, 2020, 10:00-12:00 Central Europe time**

**Attendance:**

* Volker Jungnickel (HHI)
* Sang-Kyu Lim (ETRI) until 11:00
* Kai Lennert Bober (HHI)
* Tuncer Baykas (Mediopol)
* Joerg Robert (Uni Erlangen), on standby if needed
* Nikola Serafimofski (pureLiFi)
* Jonathan Goldberg (IEEE) from 11:30 on

1. The phone call was opened by the Chair. The Chair noted that the CRG is able to make technical motions changing the draft, as 3 CRG members are in the call, and 50% attendance is required.
2. After recommendation by the WG Chair, Bob Heile, the group talked about the mandatory MEC review. There is a webpage guiding through it <https://standards.ieee.org/develop/drafting-standard/mecform.html> and a checklist <https://mentor.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/chklist.pdf>.
3. The Technical Editor went through the checklist. Actions to be taken will be reflected additionally in the comment list against D2.
4. Some figures need to be checked for compliance, in particular in the LB PHY.
5. Some normative clauses contain informative statements like “…8B10B coding is applied…” which should be converted into normative statements using “shall”, “should” or “may be”. The authors should check their text and provide a new contribution indication where such changes are needed and make an additional comment in the comments list. Clause 4 is o.k., everybody should check Clauses 5, 6, Lennert will check Clause 7, 8, Volker, Lennert and Sang-Kyu check Clause 9, Nikola will check Clause 10, Volker and Lennert check Clause 11.
6. Variables in mathematical expressions need to be checked.
7. The open items in the MEC review checklist will be reflected by the Technical Editor as new comments in the comments list and resolved by the CRG. That means the D3 will comply with the checklist and accordingly, the mandatory MEC review will be started in parallel to recirculate D3.
8. The group continued to resolve the comments against D2.
9. Jonathan explained the process of the MEC review. After starting it, between 8-30 days later the IEEE SA provides a report which has two parts: A mandatory (technical) part and an editorial part. Only after the mandatory changes are fulfilled, the SA ballot can be started. After some discussion the group decided to stick with the decision made above, i.e. send D3 to the mandatory MEC review and next recirculation in parallel.
10. Jonathan informed the group about next EC telcos which are scheduled on April 7 1-3 p.m., April 21, 1-3 p.m., and May 6 all Eastern time. He informed the group also that it has been already decided yesterday that the May Interim will be cancelled as well.
11. Next telcos are on Monday 23 and Thursday 26, 9:30-11:00 Central European time. The group will continue comment resolution.
12. The meeting recessed.

**Monday, March 23, 2020, 9:30-11:00 Central Europe time**

**Attendance:**

* Volker Jungnickel (HHI)
* Sang-Kyu Lim (ETRI)
* Kai Lennert Bober (HHI)

1. The phone call was opened by the Chair. The Chair noted that the CRG is not yet able to make technical motions changing the draft, as only 2 CRG members are in the call, and 50% attendance is required.
2. April 7 is EC phone call. Two things related will be on the agenda: TG13 PAR change and TG13 SA ballot. The group decided that the Chair start the PAR change right now but wait for the SA ballot until D3 is ready. For the PAR change, the Chair will prepare a document 15-17/0076r5 in the WG folder on Mentor and the CRG will do the TG Motion on Thursday, March 26.
3. The group continued the comment resolution. The Technical Editor added CIDs 718-723 to make the draft compliant with the mandatory MEC review, as it has been discussed in the last telco. Some comments were resolved.
4. There was a longer discussion about CID714 which is on coexistence. Even after the changes made to the CAD, there was criticism from 802.11 people. TG13 should rethink the coexistence again and update the CAD before submitting the draft to SA ballot.
5. The Technical Editor noted that the comment resolution is almost done for Clause 4. He will check the residual comments and identify which can be solved easily and which require a lot of discussion.
6. The phone call recessed.

**Monday, March 26, 2020, 9:30-11:00 Central Europe time**

**Attendance:**

* Volker Jungnickel (HHI)
* Sang-Kyu Lim (ETRI)
* Kai Lennert Bober (HHI)
* Stephan Berner (pureLiFi)
* Tuncer Baykas (Mediopol) since 10:20

1. The phone call was opened by the Chair. The Chair noted that the CRG is able to make technical motions changing the draft, as 3 CRG members are in the call, and 50% attendance is required.
2. The Technical Editor continued with the comment resolution following the Clause numbers. After the call, around 90 from 140 comments were still unresolved.
3. Tuncer asked, what was the response from NO voters. The Chair explained that there was no response yet. In privat email exchange, the WG Chair Bob Heile did not consider this a blocking point to start the PAR title change and the submission of the draft to the SA ballot in the next EC telco.
4. The phone call recessed.

**Thursday, April 2, 2020, 10:00-12:00 Central Europe time**

**Attendance:**

* Volker Jungnickel (HHI)
* Sang-Kyu Lim (ETRI)
* Joerg Robert (Uni Erlangen), left after beginning
* Kai Lennert Bober (HHI)
* Stephan Berner (pureLiFi)
* Tuncer Baykas (Mediopol)
* Nikola Serafimofski (pureLiFi)

1. The phone call was opened by the Chair. The Chair noted that the CRG is able to make technical motions changing the draft, as all members are in the call, and 50% attendance is required. Joerg can be called if needed.
2. The group discussed the title issue change again. The Chair reported on a phone call he has had with Bob Heile who responded to the title suggested by the group. Bob said that goes into the opposite direction of what WG, EC and NESCOM want us to go. We should not make it more general but more specific, otherwise it needs personal discussion and could only be finished in July. Moreover, Bob’s recommendation was to use features in the existing scope text that are not properly reflected in the title. Following a similar proposal made by Bob, the following new title was suggested:

*Multi-Gigabit per Second Optical Wireless Communications (OWC) for both mobile and stationary devices with Ranges up to 200 Meters.*

The Chair will send this proposal to Bob in order to start the WG letter ballot instead of the normal Motion for sending this further to the EC.

1. The group continued comment resolution, led by the Technical Editor. New resolutions are reflected in doc. 15-20/0096r3. After this telco there are 58 open and 29 postponed comments where additional work is needed.
2. The group decided to continue with two telcos per week on Monday and Thursday 10-12 central European time. The Chair will send out invitations.
3. The phone call recessed.

**Monday, April 6, 2020, 10:00-12:00 Central Europe time**

**Attendance:**

* Volker Jungnickel (HHI)
* Kai Lennert Bober (HHI)
* Stephan Berner (pureLiFi)
* Tuncer Baykas (Mediopol)

1. The phone call was opened by the Chair. The Chair noted that the CRG is not able to make technical motions changing the draft, as only 2 CRG members are in the call, and 50% attendance is required.
2. The group discussed the title issue change again. There has been further discussion in the WG. Ben suggested to leave the range statement away and add it only if the EC requires that.

*Multi-Gigabit per Second Optical Wireless Communications (OWC) for both mobile and stationary devices (with Ranges up to 200 Meters)*

1. The group continued comment resolution, led by the Technical Editor. New resolutions are reflected in doc. 15-20/0096r4.
2. The group decided to have 1:30 hour meetings from Thursday on.
3. The meeting recessed.

**Thursday, April 9, 2020, 10:00-12:00 Central Europe time**

**Attendance:**

* Volker Jungnickel (HHI)
* Sang-Kyu Lim (ETRI)
* Kai Lennert Bober (HHI)
* Stephan Berner (pureLiFi)
* Tuncer Baykas (Mediopol)

1. The phone call was opened by the Chair. The Chair noted that the CRG is able to make technical motions changing the draft, as 3 CRG members are in the call, and 50% attendance is required.
2. The group continued comment resolution, led by the Technical Editor. New resolutions are reflected in doc. 15-20/0096r5. This document also contains few additional comments starting from CID #727 that have also been resolved by the CRG. After this telco, there are still 39 fully open comments and 35 postponed comments where additional work is needed.
3. Next Thursday, Tuncer will make a presentation of the relaying.
4. The meeting recessed.

**Thursday, April 16, 2020, 10:00-12:00 Central Europe time**

**Attendance:**

* Volker Jungnickel (HHI)
* Kai Lennert Bober (HHI)
* Sang-Kyu Lim (ETRI)
* Stephan Berner (pureLiFi)
* Nikola Serafimofski (pureLiFi)
* Refik Kizilirmak (Nazarbayev University)
* Tuncer Baykas (Mediopol)

1. The phone call was opened by the Chair. The Chair noted that the CRG is not able to make technical motions this time, as only 2 CRG members are in the call, and 50% attendance is required.
2. Refik Kizilirmak (Mediopol) presented doc. 15-20/0117r0 on “Relaying for 802.15.13” showing that changes in few clauses are needed only.
3. The discussion in the group clarified that Type II relaying shall be supported. It further identified a simple but powerful scheme which could be supported.
4. Refik and Tuncer promised to prepare a text contribution how such scheme can be integrated into the draft.
5. The group continued comment resolution, led by the Technical Editor. New resolutions are reflected in doc. 15-20/0096r6.
6. The meeting recessed.

**Monday, April 20, 2020, 10:00-11:30 Central Europe time**

**Attendance:**

* Volker Jungnickel (HHI)
* Kai Lennert Bober (HHI)
* Stephan Berner (pureLiFi)
* Nikola Serafimofski (pureLiFi)
* Tuncer Baykas (Mediopol)

1. The phone call was opened by the Chair. The Chair noted that the CRG is able to make technical motions this time, as 3 CRG members are in the call, and 50% attendance is required.
2. The group continued comment resolution, led by the Technical Editor. New resolutions will be reflected in doc. 15-20/0096r7.
3. Lennert (in place of Stephan) uploaded a document with text changes for the LB PHY in doc. 15-20/00120r0. An update of the document has been prepared during the telco which will be uploaded as doc. 20/00120r1 onto the Mentor.
4. With exempt of one comment all comments regarding the LB PHY could be resolved in this telco.
5. During next telcos, the focus will shift to Clause 9 and 11 and the integration of relaying.
6. The meeting recessed.

**Thursday, April 23, 2020, 10:00-11:30 Central Europe time**

**Attendance:**

* Volker Jungnickel (HHI)
* Kai Lennert Bober (HHI)
* Stephan Berner (pureLiFi)
* Sang-Kyu Lim (ETRI)
* Nikola Serafimofski (pureLiFi)
* Tuncer Baykas (Mediopol)

1. The phone call was opened by the Chair. The Chair noted that the CRG is able to make technical motions this time, as 3 CRG members are in the call, and 50% attendance is required.
2. The group discussed that any input into D3 will be needed until Wednesday so that D3 can be created by the end of the week. There will be major inputs after the next recirculation, so that D4 will be the last draft which includes changes. D5 will be the last unchanged draft.
3. The group continued comment resolution, led by the Technical Editor. New resolutions will be reflected in doc. 15-20/0096r8.
4. The meeting recessed.

**Monday, April 27, 2020, 10:00-11:30 Central Europe time**

**Attendance:**

* Volker Jungnickel (HHI)
* Kai Lennert Bober (HHI)
* Stephan Berner (pureLiFi)
* Sang-Kyu Lim (ETRI)

1. The phone call was opened by the Chair. The Chair noted that the CRG is not able to make technical motions this time, as only 2 CRG members are in the call, and 50% attendance is required.
2. The group continued comment resolution, led by the Technical Editor. New resolutions will be reflected in doc. 15-20/0096r9.
3. The Chair reminded the group again about the plan that there will be the last recirculation after D3 where missing text can be included. D4 is the last draft with changes. D5 should not contain any more changes so that it can be passed into the SA letter ballot.
4. The meeting recessed.

**Thursday, April 30, 2020, 10:00-11:30 Central Europe time**

**Attendance:**

* Volker Jungnickel (HHI)
* Kai Lennert Bober (HHI)
* Stephan Berner (pureLiFi)
* Nikola Serafimofski (pureLiFi)
* Tuncer Baykas (Mediopol)

1. The phone call was opened by the Chair. The Chair noted that the CRG is able to make technical motions this time, as 3 CRG members are in the call, and 50% attendance is required.
2. The group continued comment resolution, led by the Technical Editor. New resolutions will be reflected in doc. 15-20/0096r11.
3. Motion

**Move to instruct the Technical Editor to include all changes in doc. 15-20/0096r11 into draft D3 and start recirculation.**

**Moved:               Nikola Serafimofski**

**Seconded:          Tuncer Baykas**

**Y / N/ A = 3 / 0 / 0    Motion passed.**

1. Nikola announced there will be major changes in the LB PHY which will relate it closer to the 802.11 PHY. The Chair asked for providing working text that can be easily introduced into the draft.
2. The Chair reminded the group again about the plan that there will be a last recirculation after D3 where new text can be included, i.e. D4 should be the last draft with any more changes. D5 should not contain any more changes so that it can be passed over to the SA letter ballot.
3. There are 124 comments to be worked in, from which 14 have been done. There are some formatting issues which take a lot of time. The Technical Editor will work on the draft, which is expected not before end of May.
4. The meeting recessed.

**Monday, June 29, 2020, 10:00-11:00 Central Europe time**

**Attendance:**

* Volker Jungnickel (HHI)
* Kai Lennert Bober (HHI)
* Stephan Berner (pureLiFi)
* Tuncer Baykas (Mediopol)
* Sang-Kyu Lim (ETRI)

1. The phone call was opened by the Chair. The Chair noted that the CRG is able to make technical motions this time, as 3 CRG members are in the call, and 50% attendance is required.
2. The Technical Editor explained the status of the draft. Following items are open:
3. Include changes proposed by Stephan
4. Equations need variables declared 🡪 every proposer should check and send inputs to Lennert Editorial changes).
5. Proposers should finally check if their normative statements are correct 🡪 check all Clauses (Technical changes) 🡪 postponed to the SA ballot
6. Start MEC review and recirculation
7. Motion

**Move to instruct the Technical Editor to include all changes in doc. 15-20/0154r0 into draft D3 and make Editorial changes for MEC review.**

**Moved:              Tuncer Baykas**

**Seconded:          Sang-Kyu Lim**

**Y / N/ A = 3 / 0 / 0   Motion passed.**

1. D3 will be available tomorrow and the Technical Editor will start recirculation.
2. Comments will be available and discussed during the July session when WG members can attend.
3. The Chair will send an email to Bob Heile to discuss the MEC review.
4. The Chair informed about the planning for the July meeting which will be held online. Please check emails sent out by Bob Heile as attendance may have implications on voting rights.
5. The meeting recessed.