**IEEE P802.15**

**Wireless Personal Area Networks**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Project | IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs) | |
| Title | Task Group 4z meeting minutes for January 2020 | |
| Date Submitted | 16-Jan-2020 | |
| Source | [Benjamin Rolfe] [Blind Creek Associates]  [Benjamin A. Rolfe]  [BCA] | E-mail: [ben.rolfe @ ieee.org ] |
| Re: | Meeting minutes | |
| Abstract | Task Group minutes | |
| Purpose | Document task group meeting | |
| Notice | This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.15. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. | |
| Release | The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by P802.15. | |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Page | Subclause | Line | Comment | Disposition Status | Disposition Detail |
| i-222 | 0 | 0 | 0 | This whole amendment is way too complex. I think it would be good idea to remove some optional features, or at least try to reduce number of different configurations how this can be configured. | Rejected | The Comment Resolution Group (CRG) disagrees with the comment that amendment is too complex. The CRG believes the features in the draft are within the project scope of the project. The features in this amendment enhance the UWB PHYs and associated ranging technique. The amendment includes features that enhance ranging integrity and accuracy, and provide for exchange of ranging information. |
| i-223 | 0 | 0 | 0 | Adding 21 new information elements just for ranging is absurd. | Rejected | The Comment Resolution Group (CRG) disagrees with the comment that the additional Information Elements (IE) are in any way absurd. The group has discussed extensively each new IE and refined the content of each to balance the trade-off between number of IEs, IE length and IE complexity. The group concensus is that further consolodation will make individual IEs more complex and less efficient, increasing the overall complexity of the standard without benefit. |
| i-221 | 12 | 2 | 3 | I do not think the IEEE 802.15.9 is normative reference for this amendment. The 6.9.6.9 using it says it can be used, it is not mandatory, thus 802.15.4z can be implemented without implementing 802.15.9 or even reading that document at all. | Revised | Replace the third and forth sentences of the first paragraph of 6.9.6.9 as follows: When used for this purpose, the MPX IE shall be used as follows: (refer to Figure 9 of 21 IEEE Std 802.15.9).  Replace the second paragraph of 6.9.6.9: The Transfer Type field shall be set to one (0b001) to indicate that the Multiplex ID associated with the dispatch code for the MPX IE is indicated by the Transaction ID field of the Transaction Control field. The Transaction ID field contains the five least significant bits of the Multiplex ID used as the dispatch code as defined in Table 20, of IEEE Std 802.15.9, and is used as an identifier to specify that this frame contains information used for Ranging Enhanced Secure Transactions.  Change third sentence of third paragraph of 6.9.6.9 to: When used for this purpose, the Upper-Layer Frame Fragment field of the MPX IE  carries information to identify and distinguish transactions, with MAC payload used by the next higher layer to route the payload, and shall be formatted as shown in Figure 12. |
| i-217 | 12 | 2 | 5 | I do not think ISO/IEC 7816-4:2013 is normative reference for 802.15.4. | Rejected | The CRG disagrees with the comment: ISO/IEC 7816-4 is referenced normatively in Table 5 and Table 6 (6.9.6.9); the role and siginficance of the reference is clear: it is defining format of a field in an over the air data structure, the format of which is defined in this standard. The reference contains information users of the standard must have and understand in order to correctly implement the Information Element. |
| i-218 | 12 | 2 | 7 | I do not think ISO/IEC 7816-5:2013 is normative reference for 802.15.4. | Rejected | The CRG disagrees with the comment: ISO/IEC 7816-4 is referenced normatively in Table 5 and Table 6 (6.9.6.9); the role and siginficance of the reference is clear: it is defining format of a field in an over the air data structure, the format of which is defined in this standard. The reference contains information users of the standard must have and understand in order to correctly implement the Information Element. |
| i-219 | 12 | 2 | 9 | I do not think JIS X 6319-4:2016 is normative reference for 802.15.4. | Rejected | The CRG disagrees with the comment: JIS X 6319 is referenced normatively in Table 5 and text in 6.9.6.9; the role and siginficance of the reference is clear as it is defining format of a field in an over the air data structure defined in this standard. The reference contains information users of the standard must have and understand in order to correctly implement the Information Element. |
| i-216 | 34 | 6.9.6.9 | 33 | Text starting from the line 33 with sentence "The Upper-Layer Frame Fragment" describes application protocol to be run between two secure elements and which does not belong to this standard. The MPX IE with <ANA> allocated dispatch code allows upper layers to include their own data with ranging data for secure transactions. The actual specification of this application layer protocol belongs to some other document, and most likely to some other SDO. This application layer protocol is also outside the PAR of the 802.15.4z. | Rejected | The CRG disagrees with the comment: This sub-clause provides a capability that ehances ranging techniques by providing a standardized information exchanged supporting a widely used ranging application. The feature is optional, but when used, the group believes defining how it is done enables doing so in an interoperable manner. |