**IEEE P802.15**

**Wireless Personal Area Networks**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Project | IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs) | |
| Title | **Resolution of SRM Related CIDs** | |
| Date Submitted | [15 November, 2018] | |
| Source | [Shoichi Kitazawa, Hidetoshi Yokota] [, Landis+Gyr] [address] | Voice: [ ] Fax: [ ] E-mail: [kitazawa@ieee.org] |
| Re: |  | |
| Abstract | [Proposed resolution of SRM related CID for the 802.15.4md D01 Draft Comments] | |
| Purpose | [This document is used to submit comments for an 802.15.4md] | |
| Notice | This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.15. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. | |
| Release | The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by P802.15. | |

**Proposed Resolution**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 162 | 8.2.26.1 | The StartTime does not include any information what is the resolution or units of the value, and what is the epoch. | Add missing text. |

Resolution: Revised

Proposed Resolution:

That information is described in Section 7.5.27 (l.5 of p.269). The proposed change is to add that information in the corresponding Description as "The time at which the requested measurement should be started as defined in 7.5.27."

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 163 | 8.2.26.1 | Duration field does not include resolution or units of the value. | Add missing text. |

Resolution:

Proposed Resolution:

That information is described in Section 7.5.27 (l.8 of p.269). The proposed change is to add that information in the corresponding Description as "The duration over which the requested measurement should be measured as defined in 7.5.27."

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 164 | 8.2.26.1 | The description what is supposed to happen when this primitive is called is missing. | Add missing text. |

Resolution: Revised

Proposed Resolution:

Add the following sentence on l.3 "On receipt of MLME-SRM.request primitive by a device, the MLME of the device attempts to generate a SRM Request command as described in 7.5.27 with the information contained in this primitive, and if successful, sends it to the destination device according to the DstAddr parameter."

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 170 | 8.2.26.2 | The description what is supposed to happen when this primitive is called is missing. | Add missing text. |

Resolution: Revised

Proposed Resolution:

Revise l.2-.3 as follows, "The MLME-SRM.indication primitive is generated by the MAC sublayer and issued to the next higher layer on receipt of a SRM Request command, which then takes a designated action (e.g., get or set PIB attributes) as described in 6.17.2.3. The detailed usage of the MLME-SRM.indication primitive by the next higher layer is beyond the scope of this document."

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 171 | 8.2.26.2 | The SrmHandle description is wrong, as if I understand correctly it actually comes from the sending node, and there is no guarantee that it will be unique, as there might be two devices in the network sending you two different SRM requests which same SRM Token value. | Clarify the role of the SrmHandle |

Resolution: Rejected

Proposed Resolution:

The role of SrmHandle in MLME-SRM.response is to match the corresponding Response as described in Table 8-76. SrmHandle is locally unique and distinguished by the source address in the SRM Request.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 174 | 8.2.26.3 | The description what is supposed to happen when this primitive is called is missing. | Add missing text. |

Resolution: Revised

Proposed Resolution:

When the MLME-SRM.response is received by the MLME, an SRM Report command defined in 7.5.28 is generated and sent to the originated device.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 175 | 8.2.26.4 | Why do we have DeviceAddrMode, DeviceAddress, MeasuredDEviceAddrMode, and MeasuredDeviceAddress in this primitive? Those are not needed as we have SrmHandle to match the corresponding request. | Remove extra parameters. |

Resolution: Rejected

Proposed Resolution:

Could be removed for simplicity, but useful for maintaining consistency.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 176 | 8.2.26.4 | The description what is supposed to happen when this primitive is called is missing. | Add missing text. |

Resolution: Revised

Proposed Resolution:

The SRM.confirm primitive is generated by the MLME and issued to its next higher layer in response to an SRM.request primitive. The SRM.confirm primitive returns a Status value defined in Table 8-78.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 183 | 8.2.27.1 | The description when this primitive is called is missing. | Add missing text. |

Resolution:

Proposed Resolution:

When the MLME-SRM-REPORT.request is issued by the next higher layer of a device, the MLME of the device acknowledges it by sending back an MLME-SRM-REPORT.confirm primitive with a Status code. The MLME then generates SRM Report command and attempts to send it to the specfied destination device.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 184 | 8.2.27.1 | The SrmMetricId is defined as bit fields not as number, so you need to define how that group of bits is converted to interger. Or change the SrmMetricId to be defined as interger. Also 7.5.30 does not define SmrMetricId. | Add missing text. |

Resolution: Revised

Proposed Resolution:

The 5 bits of SrmMetricId (b0..b5) defined in Table 7-15 shall be converted to an Integer value with b6 and b7 filled with zero.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 192 | 8.2.27.3 | The description when this primitive is called is missing. | Add missing text. |

Resolution: Revised

Proposed Resolution:

The MLME-SRM-REPORT.confirm primitive is generated by the MLME and issued to its next higher layer in response to an MLME-SRM-REPORT.request primitive. The MLME-SRM-REPORT.confirm primitive returns a Status value defined in Table 8-81.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 193 | 8.2.27.3 | The description what is supposed to happen when this primitive is called is missing. | Add missing text. |

Resolution: Revised

Proposed Resolution:

Same as CID#192

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 200 | 8.2.28.1 | The description when this primitive is called is missing. | Add missing text. |

Resolution: Revised

Proposed Resolution:

When the MLME-SRM-INFORMATION.request is issued by the next higher layer of a device, the MLME of the device acknowledges it by sending back an MLME-SRM-INFORMATION.confirm primitive with a Status code. The MLME then generates SRM Information command and attempts to send it to the specfied destination device.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 201 | 8.2.28.1 | The description what is supposed to happen when this primitive is called is missing. For example how does the AskedConfirm change the processing rules. Or the SignalMethod. | Add missing text. |

Resolution: Revised

Proposed Resolution:

Same as CID#200

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 204 | 8.2.28.2 | The description when this primitive is called is missing. | Add missing text. |

Resolution: Revised

Proposed Resolution:

The MLME-SRM-INFORMATION.indication primitive is generated by the MAC sublayer and issued to the next higher layer on receipt of a SRM Information command. The usage of the MLME-SRM-INFORMATION.indication primitive by the next higher layer is beyond the scope of this document.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 205 | 8.2.28.2 | The description what is supposed to happen when this primitive is called is missing. | Add missing text. |

Resolution: Revised

Proposed Resolution:

Same as CID#204

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 207 | 8.2.28.3 | The description when this primitive is called is missing. | Add missing text. |

Resolution: Revised

Proposed Resolution:

The MLME-SRM-INFORMATION.confirm primitive is generated by the MLME and issued to its next higher layer in response to an MLME-SRM-INFORMATION.request primitive. The MLME-SRM-INFORMATION.confirm primitive returns a Status value defined in Table 8-84.