**IEEE P802.15**

**Wireless Personal Area Networks**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Project | IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs) |
| Title | **Revised comment resolution for i-116 from the sponsor ballot** |
| Date Submitted | 19 August 2016 |
| Source | \*[Verotiana Rabarijaona, Fumihide Kojima], †[Hiroshi Harada]\*[NICT], †[Kyoto University]\*[3-4, Hikarino-oka, Yokosuka, 239-0847 Japan], †[36-1 Yoshida-Honmachi, Sakyo-ku, Kyoto 606-8501 Japan] | Voice: [+81-46-847-5075]Fax: [+81-46-847-5089]E-mail: [rverotiana@nict.go.jp] |
| Re: | DCN 520r2, resolution to CID i-116 |
| Abstract | Provides a proposed resolution to CID i-116 |
| Purpose | To be used by the technical editor to apply the necessary changes to the draft to resolve CID i-116 |
| Notice | This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.15. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. |
| Release | The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by P802.15. |

**Comments**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Page** | **Clause** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 13 | 4.4.1 |  | What the route estabilishment requires and what can be used in the forwarding are different. This table looks to make a confusion. Source routing can be used in any unicast routing including DS in storing mode but only DS in non-store mode depends on it. Furthermore, source routing can be used for US routing if the node knows all of intermediate addresses correctly. | "Clarify dependency of DS establishment and US |

**Resolution: Revise**

* ***Modify the tables in document 520 r2 as follows***

In the first table (Functions required for each path establishment):

* the (RE1, Multicast) cell should be empty
* the (RE2, Multicast) cell should be O
* the (RE4, P2P) cell should be O
* SM1 and SM2 should be O.1 for mesh root centralized and P2P
* Broadcast does not require route establishment. Remove the column from the table and add a note in text saying so.

In the second table (Functions can be used for each data forwarding):

* (R1, UC US) should be empty
	+ ***Replace "routing information" with "DS routing information" on p.57 l.38***
	+ ***Mention in the text that source routing is not used for US routing***
* (R1, UC DS) SM1 and (R1, P2P) SM1 should be -. Based on the current spec in 5.4.1.1 source routing is only used in non-storing mode. Otherwise we need to modify the 5.4.1.1 to say that it is optional.
* (R2, P2P) SM2 should be -. In non-storing mode, there is no intermediate address list in the P2P-RQ, RP IEs, so there is no way to do source routing.
* (R3, multicast) should be PT1: O (5.4.2), PT2, PT3: -
* (R4, multicast) should be PT2, PT3: M (5.4.2)
* (RvS, unicast US) should be O (5.4.1.2)
	+ ***Insert*** "The next hop is an ancestor if the frame is routed US, or a descendant if the frame is routed DS. The next hop may also be a sibling if RvS is supported. US and DS route establishment are described in 5.2.3 and 5.2.4.1 respectively." ***after the first sentence of the second paragraph of 5.4.1.2.***
* (HR, Unicast US), (HR, Unicast DS), (HR, P2P): the reference should be 5.4.1.4

The resulting tables are as follows:

Table xx - Functions for route establishment

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Function** | **Mesh root centralized path establishment** | **P2P** | **Multicast** |
| RE1 | TC IE based US route establishment | M (5.2.3) | — | — |
| RE2 | RA IE based DS route establishment (RE1 required to use this function) | SM1: O (5.2.4) SM2: M (5.2.4) | — | O (5.2.6) |
| RE3 | L2R Routing IE based DS route establishment | SM1: M (5.2.4) SM2: — | — | — |
| RE4 | P2P route establishment | — | O (5.2.7) | — |
| SM1 | Storing mode | O.1 (5.2.4.1) | O.1 (5.2.7.1) | — |
| SM2 | Non-storing mode | O.1 (5.2.4.2) | O.1 (5.2.7.2) | — |

Table yy – Functions for routing

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Function** | **Unicast US** | **Unicast DS** | **P2P** | **Multicast** | **Broadcast** |
| R1 | Source routing | — | SM1: — SM2: M (5.4.1.1) | SM1: — SM2: M (5.4.1.1) | — | — |
| R2 | Hop-by-hop routing | M (5.4.1.2) | SM1: M (5.4.1.2) SM2: — | SM1: M (5.4.1.2) SM2: — | — | — |
| R3 | L2R multicast routing | — | — | — | PT1: O (5.4.2) PT2, PT3: — |  |
| R4 | Flooding | — | — | — | PT2, PT3: M (5.4.2) | M (5.4.3) |
| RvS | Routing via a sibling | O (5.4.1.2) | O, only when used in US routing (5.4.1.2) | — | — | — |
| HR | Hop-by-hop retransmission | O (5.4.1.4) | — | — |
| E2EA | End to end acknowledgment | O (5.4.1.5) | — | — |
| DCat | Data concatenation | O (5.4.1.6) | — | — |
| MPO | Multi-PAN operation | O (5.4.1.3) | — | O (5.4.3.3) |

* ***Reorder the tables as follows:***
	+ PAN type
	+ Functions required for each path establishment
	+ Functions can be used for each data forwarding