**IEEE P802.15**

**Wireless Personal Area Networks**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Project | IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs) | |
| Title | 802.15 TG10 (L2R) Comment Resolution for CID #3145 | |
| Date Submitted | [28 March 2016] | |
| Source | [Charlie Perkins] [Futurewei] | Voice: [+1-408-330-4586] Fax: [+1-408-330-5088] E-mail: [charliep@computer.org] |
| Re: | [TG10 (L2R) comment resolution.] | |
| Abstract | This document provides comment resolutions for comments CID #3145 related to metric definitions and mesh configuration parameters | |
| Purpose | [TG10 (L2R) comment resolution to produce next draft.] | |
| Notice | This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.15. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. | |
| Release | The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by P802.15. | |

**Comment #3145**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3145 | Don Sturek | SSNI | all |  |  | So far, I find US/DS routing, P2P routing, sibling routing, multicast routing, TMCTP and service routing. It would really help to have some explanation at the top as to what works with what. For example see Figure 31. Conceptually, I think some of these fields cant be set with others (eg, mesh address mode must be long for TMCTP, P2P Route Discovery and Storing Mode don't seem to go together). It would be great to see these different routing modes better defined and then a clear picture from Figure 31 as to the allowable operating modes | Help clarify what works with what. Seems like P2P and multicast routing don't have anything to do with one another (is that right?). It seems that P2P and US/DS are orthogonal. Seems like MCO works only with US/DS (right?). Not clear you can use TMCTP with P2P (is that even possible?). |

**CID 3145:**

**Resolution: Accept with revision**

This contribution provides some discussion about interrelationships between mesh address mode, multi-channel PAN operation (MPO), US/DS routing, P2P routing, sibling routing, multicast routing, TMCTP, as well as clarification about service routing.

Here, higher-layer operation is not considered; as one result, multicast routing means multicast at layer 2.

Sibling routing is a possible feature of US/DS routing, and so is not used for multicast routing or P2P routing.

Multicast routing is constrained to use US/DS routing; use of P2P routing for multicast is out of scope for this specification.

US/DS routing is always available.

P2P routing can be used in addition to US/DS routing.

P2P routing can be used in storing mode or non-storing mode.

When “ RA IE Required” is set to 0, the *macPromiscuousMode* PIB attribute should be set to FALSE.

Multicast requires RA IE, even if “RA\_IE\_Required” is 0. It should be discussed whether the latter is prohibited when multicast is configured.

Service routing is not defined in the document. Recent work provides for advertisement of a meshID, which may be interpreted as a kind of service advertisement. If all services are accessible by the mesh root, then service routing is a subset of US routing. In that case, routing for a service amounts to routing through the mesh root, which is always available.

MPO operation requires long address mode. For this reason, the MPO descriptor bit has been moved to be adjacent to the Mesh Address Mode bit. TMCTP operation is a particular kind of MPO operation; therefore, TMCTP also requires long address mode.

In a SSPAN, it is specified that Number of Services = 0. For this reason, the “Number of Services” field has been moved to be adjacent to the SSPAN descriptor bit.

***Modify Figure 31 as follows:***



**Figure 31—Format of the Descriptor field of the L2R-D IE**