**IEEE P802.15**

**Wireless Personal Area Networks**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Project | IEEE P802.15 Working Group for Wireless Personal Area Networks (WPANs) | |
| Title | 802.15 TG10 (L2R) Comment Resolution for CIDs #3063, #3064, #3096, #3101, #3102 | |
| Date Submitted | [15 March 2016] | |
| Source | [Charlie Perkins] [Futurewei] | Voice: [+1-408-330-4586] Fax: [+1-408-330-5088] E-mail: [charliep@computer.org] |
| Re: | [TG10 (L2R) comment resolution.] | |
| Abstract | This document provides comment resolutions for comments CIDs #3063, #3064, #3096, #3101, and #3102 related to metric definitions and mesh configuration parameters | |
| Purpose | [TG10 (L2R) comment resolution to produce next draft.] | |
| Notice | This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE P802.15. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein. | |
| Release | The contributor acknowledges and accepts that this contribution becomes the property of IEEE and may be made publicly available by P802.15. | |

**Comments #3063, #3064, #3096, #3101, #3102**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3063 | Stephen Chasko | Landis +Gyr | 32 | 5.2.2.1 | 7 | Pmin and Pmax are measured and can vary by implementation leading to variance in how link quality will be calculated which will cause some devices to calculate link quality differently | describe how Pmin and Pmax are measured in sufficient detail |
| 3064 | Verotiana Rabarijaona | NICT | 34 | 5.2.2.2 | 51 | "until an acknowledgement is received" implies that the ETX can only be used when ACKs are required at the MAC sublayer | Indicate that the ETX requires all data frame transmissions to be ACKed at the MAC sublayer |
| 3096 | Don Sturek | SSNI | 47 | 5.4.1.2 | 15 | This section claims to support US, DS and P2P routing. However, the diagram only offers two options: US and DS. Either the P2P option needs to be added or a similar diagram for P2P added | Add P2P forwarding |
| 3101 | Tero Kivinen | INSIDE Secure | 51 | 5.4.1.5 | 5 | This text says that acknowledgment wait time is out of scope, but should the higher layer still have a way to specify it? I mean now it seems to be the L2R layer picks it somehow, and upper layer cannot affect it. It should either be in the L2IB, or it should be in the L2R-DATA.request as parameter. | Add way for the upper layer to set the acknowledgment wait time, even if the specific values are outside the scope of this document, telling L2R layer what time to use is needed. |
| 3102 | Tero Kivinen | INSIDE Secure | 51 | 5.4.1.5 | 9 | I think we should explicitly say that frame with E2E ACK IE must not have E2E AR field set to 1. |  |

**CID 3063:**

*P*min and *P*max are currently specified as L2IB configuration parameters *l2rPmax* and  *l2rPmin* in Table 51, page 112. In equipment where the values would be determined by measurement, the measurement techniques are outside the scope of this document.

**Resolution: Accept with revision**

* **Add the following sentence to 5.2.2.1 at line 27 on page 33:**

The values for *P*min and *P*max are determined by the configuration parameters *l2rPmax* and  *l2rPmin* as shown in Table 51 in section 7.3.

**CID 3064:**

**Resolution: Accept**

* **Add the following sentence to section 5.2.2.2**

In order to use the ETX metric, all data frame transmissions should be ACKed at the MAC sublayer.

**CID 3096:**

Figure 22 may not be amenable to modification that would help a better understanding of P2P routing. It might be better to include a new figure that shows when P2P routing may be selected. For cases in which P2P routing is recommended, the positive branch would be taken; otherwise the negative branch would lead to the decision tree indicated in Figure 22.

**Resolution: Accept with revision**

* **Replace the following text in the caption for Figure 22 on page 47, line 18 of 5.4.1.2**

~~Routing direction~~ US versus DS routing decision algorithm based on the NT

* **Add a new figure on** **page 47, line 31 of 5.4.1.2**

<need to draw a figure showing decision factors enabling P2P>

**CID 3101:**

**Resolution: Accept**

* **Add the following L2R-DATA.request parameter at line 33, page 105 in section 7.2.1**

E2eArTime

* **Add a row containing** *E2eArTime* **in table 48**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| E2eArTime | Integer | — | Indicates the time, in units of .01seconds to wait for the E2E acknowledgement to arrive |

**CID 3102:**

**Resolution: Accept**

* **Add the following sentence to section 5.4.1.5 at line 10, page 51**

A frame that contains the E2E ACK IE should not have the E2E AR field set to 1.