### IEEE P802.11Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Comment resolution for 9.3.1.22.7 and 9.3.1.22.8 and 9.3.1.22.9 |
| Date: 2025-04-08 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Alice Chen | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | alicel@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains comment resolutions for the following 15 CIDs related to subclause 9.3.1.22.7, 9.3.1.22.8 and 9.3.1.22.9.

* 1038, 1421, 1564, 1730, 1954, 2092, 2510, 2578, 2666, 2667,
* 2932, 2933, 2934, 3755, 3840.

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.
* Rev 1: Minor revisions.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the subsequent TGbn Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGbn Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGbn Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGbn Editor” are instructions to the TGbn editor to modify existing material in the TGbn draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGbn editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGbn Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 1038 | Matthew Fischer | 9.3.1.22.7 | 54.21 | There are two TBDs here in place of text that should say where the IFCS appears in the frame and how it is formatted/encoded | Provide text to indicate how/where/encoding of the IFCS within the frame | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution defines the fields that carry the I-FCS its encoding and location, namely the definition of two dedicated User Info fields that each carry portions of the I-FCS.TGbn editor to make the changes shown in 11-25/0636r1 under all headings that include CID 1038. |
| 1421 | SunHee Baek | 9.3.1.22.7 | 54.25 | How to signal I-FCS should be defined. | I-FCS can be signaled by using one or two User info fields | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution defines the fields that carry the I-FCS its encoding and location, namely the definition of two dedicated User Info fields that each carry portions of the I-FCS.TGbn editor to make the changes shown in 11-25/0636r1 under all headings that include CID 1421. |
| 1564 | Michail Koundourakis | 9.3.1.22.7 | 54.28 | This text "The Intermediate FCS field is not present except in a Trigger frame that is used as an initial Control framesubject to the requirements defined in 37.14 (Padding for an Initial Control Frame)." is very restrictive and reserves future behaviour. There is no good reason to do so, in the future we may find that other frames can benefit from Intermediate FCS and we will then be stuck with breaking backwards compatibility. | Remove this sentence. | Rejected –The I-FCS is added explicitly for the purpose of aiding recipient STAs of ICFs to transition from one state to another, upon verifying the validity of I-FCS. The proposed text is inline with this and inline with approved motion 12: “Define a way in 11bn to include in an initial control frame an intermediate FCS for UHR STA(s) that precedes padding and the FCS field”. |
| 1730 | Gaius Wee | 9.3.1.22.7 | 54.28 | Inconsistent capitalization for "initial control frame/response". Occurs elsewhere also | Replace "initial Control" with "initial control" throughout | Accepted |
| 1954 | Insik Jung | 9.3.1.22.9 | 54.41 | We need to define UHR variant common info/user info/special user info field to convey some parameters for the shared AP to configure the common pre-UHR portion in the following CoBF PPDU. | As the comment |  |
| 2092 | Vishnu Ratnam | 9.3.1.22.7 | 54.28 | The text "The Intermediate FCS field is not present except in a Trigger frame that is used as an initial Control frame subject to the requirements defined in 37.14 (Padding for an Initial Control Frame)." is not required. There can be other benefits of including I-FCS, such as to allow early termination of frame reception, and so this should be left to implementation. | Change the sentence to: "The Intermediate FCS field shall be present in a Trigger frame that is used as an initial Control frame subject to the requirements defined in 37.14 (Padding for an Initial Control Frame)." | Rejected –The I-FCS is added explicitly for the purpose of aiding recipient STAs of ICFs to transition from one state to another, upon verifying the validity of I-FCS. The proposed text is inline with this and inline with approved motion 12: “Define a way in 11bn to include in an initial control frame an intermediate FCS for UHR STA(s) that precedes padding and the FCS field”. |
| 2510 | Laurent Cariou | 9.3.1.22.7 | 54.22 | Define how to carry iFCS in trigger frame. Propose to define a new iFCS User Info field with a special AID value and include the iFCS field in 2 consecutive iFCS User Info fields | as in comment | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution defines the fields that carry the I-FCS its encoding and location, namely the definition of two dedicated User Info fields that each carry portions of the I-FCS.TGbn editor to make the changes shown in 11-25/0636r1 under all headings that include CID 2510. |
| 2578 | Minyoung Park | 9.3.1.22.8 | 54.35 | As 802.11 is operating more on per TID based, it would be good to have a preferred TID in the Basic Trigger frame.Please include a preferred TID in the Basic Trigger frame. | As in the comment | Rejected –Currently the basic Trigger frame has a preferred AC, which guides the STA in selecting from which queue to send data in the TB PPDU that is sent in response to the Basic Trigger frame. It is unclear what the benefit would be of adding a preferred TID in addition to the preferred AC which is already available.  |
| 2666 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.3.1.22.7 | 54.28 | There is no need to have a double negative. Better to state the presence requirements directly. | change the sentence to "The Intermediate FCS field is only present in a Trigger frame...." | Revised –Agree in principle and incorporating the changes. Also renamed the cited subclause to “(Use and requirements for initial Control frames) so that we can list which Trigger frames can act as ICFs depending on the modes of operation.TGbn editor to make the changes shown in 11-25/0636r1 under all headings that include CID 2666. |
| 2667 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.3.1.22.7 | 54.18 | The three mentions of intermediate FCS uses three different formats in this subclause, "Intermediate FCS", "intermediate FCS" and "Intermediate FCS field". They need to be made consistent | as in comment | Revised –Agree in principle. Calling this as intermediate FCS (I-FCS) and using this term throughout.TGbn editor to make the changes shown in 11-25/0636r1 under all headings that include CID 2667. |
| 2932 | Mark RISON | 9.3.1.22.7 | 54.15 | Assuming this is the field, then fields have one name, either "Intermediate FCS field" or "IFCS field" | Pick one and stick to it | Revised –Agree in principle. Calling this as intermediate FCS (I-FCS) and using this term throughout.TGbn editor to make the changes shown in 11-25/0636r1 under all headings that include CID 2932. |
| 2933 | Mark RISON | 9.3.1.22.7 | 54.23 | "The intermediate FCS is 32 bits. The intermediate FCS is located before the padding and the FCS field of the Trigger frame, with specific location and format that is TBD." -- first sentence duplicates first sentence of previous para, and second sentence duplicates second sentence of previous para | Delete the cited text | Revised –Agree to delete. Added “32-bit” to the previous paragraph as well.TGbn editor to make the changes shown in 11-25/0636r1 under all headings that include CID 2933. |
| 2934 | Mark RISON | 9.3.1.22.7 | 54.27 | "The Intermediate FCS field is not present except in a Trigger frame that is used as an initial Control frame subject to the requirements defined in 37.14 (Padding for an Initial Control Frame)." doesn't clearly say when it's present | Change to "The xxx field is present in yyy, and not present otherwise." | Revised –Agree in principle. Accounted for the suggested changes.TGbn editor to make the changes shown in 11-25/0636r1 under all headings that include CID 2934. |
| 3755 | kaiying Lu | 9.3.1.22.7 | 54.21 | A User Info field with a special AID in a trigger frame can be used to carry the Intermediate FCS field. Clarify the format and how to indicate the location of I-FCS if a User Info field is used to carry the I-FCS. | As in comment. | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution defines the fields that carry the I-FCS its encoding and location, namely the definition of two dedicated User Info fields that each carry portions of the I-FCS. **AA: Field that indicates the location of the I-FCS is work in progress.**TGbn editor to make the changes shown in 11-25/0636r1 under all headings that include CID 3755. |
| 3840 | Abhishek Patil | 9.3.1.22.6 | 54.21 | Delete this sentence. The next sentence has a TBD for the same purpose. | As in comment | Revised –Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution deletes the sentence and adds the details how the I-FCS is carried in the Trigger frame.TGbn editor to make the changes shown in 11-25/0636r1 under all headings that include CID 3840. |

* Intermediate FCS

***TGbn editor: Please change the paragraphs below as follows [#2993, 2667, 2932, 1038, 1421, 2510, 1730, 2666, 2934, 3755, 3840]:***

The Intermediate FCS (I-FCS) contains a 32-bit CRC*[#2993]* that is calculated following the rules in 9.2.4.9 (FCS field) except that the *calculation fields* only include all of the fields of the MAC header and the Frame Body field up to and excluding the two User Info fields that contain the I-FCS and any other fields (e.g., other User Info fields, Padding field, and FCS field) that are located after these two User Info fields*[#2667, 2932]*. *[#**1038, 1421, 2993, 3840]*

.*[#2993]*

The I-FCS is carried in two contiguous User Info fields, each with AID12 subfield equal to 2011, as shown in Figure 9-xxx (Formats of User Info fields with AID12 subfield equal to 2011).

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | B0   B11 | B12    B15 | B16 B39 |
| First User Info field | AID12 (2011) | Reserved | I-FCS[0:23] |
| Bits: | 12 | 4 | 24 |
|  | B0   B11 | B12    B15 | B16 B23 | B24   B39 |
| Second User Info field | AID12 (2011) | Reserved | I-FCS[24:31] | Reserved |
| Bits: | 12 | 4 | 8 | 16 |

Figure 9-xxx- Formats of User Info fields with AID12 subfield equal to 2011*[#1038, 1421, 2510, 3755, 3840]*

The I-FCS *[#2667, 2932]* is only present in a Trigger frame that is an initial Control frame, and that satisfies the requirements defined in 37.15 (Use and requirements of initial Control frames), and is not present otherwise.*[#1730, 2666, 2934]****Change the subclause number of Basic Trigger frame format from 9.3.1.22.6 to 9.3.1.22.8 as follows:***

* Basic Trigger frame format

***Change the subclause number of BFRP Trigger frame format from 9.3.1.22.7 to 9.3.1.22.9 as follows:***

* BFRP Trigger frame format

***TGbn editor: Please change title below as follows [#2666]:***

**37.15 Use and requirements of initial Control frames***[#2666]*

[TBD] If an intermediate FCS and padding are required, then a UHR STA affiliated with an MLD shall set the length of the Padding field of a Trigger frame, that is an initial Control frame, based on the rules defined in 35.5.2.2.3 (Padding for a Trigger frame), with the following superseding requirements:

— If a DPS STA is an intended receiver of the Trigger frame and the value in the DPS Padding Delay field received from the DPS STA is more than MinTrigProcTime, then the MinTrigProcTime is replaced by the value in the DPS Padding Delay field, and the last bit of the field that contains the intermediate FCS is at least LPAD, MAC, defined in Equation (35-1), where EMLSR\_PADDING\_DELAY is replaced by the value of the DPS Padding Delay field received from the DPS STA.