IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| 11bi D0.4 CR for 9.4.2.1 |
| Date: 2024-08-13 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jerome Henry | Cisco Systems |  |  | jerhenry@cisco.com |
| Domenico Ficara | Cisco Systems |  |  | dficara@cisco.com |
| Ugo Campiglio | Cisco Systems |  |  | ucampigl@cisco.com |
| Javier Contreras | Cisco Systems |  |  | jacontre@cisco.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for the following CIDs:

1132, 1133, 1134, 1135, 1136, 1222, 1223

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGbi D0.4 Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGbi D0.4 Draft. (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents). TGbi Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGbi Editor” are instructions to the TGbi editor to modify existing material in the TGbi draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGbi editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGbi Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 1132 | Po-Kai Huang | 9.4.2.1 | 36.23 | Missing extensible and fragmentable description for EDP element. Likely NO for fragmentable and discuss whether we need the element to be extensible | As in comment | REVISEDProposed yes and no |
| 1133 | Po-Kai Huang | 9.4.2.1 | 36.24 | Missing extensible and fragmentable description for Minimum Epoch Pacing element. Likely NO for fragmentable and discuss whether we need the element to be extensible | As in comment | REVISEDProposed yes and no |
| 1134 | Po-Kai Huang | 9.4.2.1 | 36.27 | Missing extensible and fragmentable description for EGPA element. Likely NO for fragmentable and discuss whether we need the element to be extensible | As in comment | REVISEDProposed no and yes |
| 1135 | Po-Kai Huang | 9.4.2.1 | 36.29 | Missing extensible and fragmentable description for otaMAC Collision Warning element. Likely NO for fragmentable and discuss whether we need the element to be extensible | As in comment | REVISEDProposed no and no  |
| 1136 | Po-Kai Huang | 9.4.2.1 | 36.31 | Missing extensible and fragmentable description for EDP Epoch Setting element. Likely NO for fragmentable and discuss whether we need the element to be extensible | As in comment | REVISEDProposed no and no |
| 1222 | Mark RISON | 9.4.2.1 | 0.00 | The cells in the leftmost column of the table should not say "element" except in the xref | As it says in the comment | ACCEPTED |
| 1223 | Mark RISON | 9.4.2.1 | 0.00 | The cells in the leftmost column of the table should always have a xref to where the element is described | As it says in the comment | REVISEDAs per the comment |

**Discussion:**

CID1132

Revised

***Modify 9-130 (Element IDs) as follows:***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Element** | **Element ID** | **Element ID Extension** | **Extensible** | **Fragmentable** |
| ...... |  |  |  |  |
| ~~FILS~~ Nonce (see 9.4.2.188 (FILS Nonce element)) | 255 | 13 | No | No |
| ..... |  |  |  |  |
| DS MAC Address (see 9.4.2.336 (DS MAC Address element)) | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| Enhanced Data Privacy (EDP) element | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1132) | No (#1132) |
| Minimum Epoch Pacing element | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| Enhanced Group Privacy Availability (EGPA) element | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| OTA(#1010) MAC Collision Warning element | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| EDP Epoch Setting element | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| ... |  |  |  |  |
| NOTE—See 10.28.6 (Element parsing) on the parsing of elements. |  |  |  |  |

The EDP Element is as follows:

~~~~

In its current structure, the element does not seem to need to be fragmented. However, there is space left in the Reserved area, should we need to add other flags. Therefore, it may be extensible.

CID1133

Revised

***Modify 9-130 (Element IDs) as follows:***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Element** | **Element ID** | **Element ID Extension** | **Extensible** | **Fragmentable** |
| ...... |  |  |  |  |
| ~~FILS~~ Nonce (see 9.4.2.188 (FILS Nonce element)) | 255 | 13 | No | No |
| ..... |  |  |  |  |
| DS MAC Address (see 9.4.2.336 (DS MAC Address element)) | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| Enhanced Data Privacy (EDP) element | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1132) | No (#1132) |
| Minimum Epoch Pacing element | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1133) | No (#1133) |
| Enhanced Group Privacy Availability (EGPA) element | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| OTA(#1010) MAC Collision Warning element | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| EDP Epoch Setting element | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| ... |  |  |  |  |
| NOTE—See 10.28.6 (Element parsing) on the parsing of elements. |  |  |  |  |

The Minimum Epoch Pacing element is as follows:

~~~~

In its current structure, the element does not seem to need to be fragmented. However, there is space left in the Reserved area, should we need to add other flags. Therefore, it may be extensible.

CID1134

Revised

***Modify 9-130 (Element IDs) as follows:***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Element** | **Element ID** | **Element ID Extension** | **Extensible** | **Fragmentable** |
| ...... |  |  |  |  |
| ~~FILS~~ Nonce (see 9.4.2.188 (FILS Nonce element)) | 255 | 13 | No | No |
| ..... |  |  |  |  |
| DS MAC Address (see 9.4.2.336 (DS MAC Address element)) | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| Enhanced Data Privacy (EDP) element | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1132) | No (#1132) |
| Minimum Epoch Pacing element | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1133) | No (#1133) |
| Enhanced Group Privacy Availability (EGPA) element | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1134) | Yes (#1134) |
| OTA(#1010) MAC Collision Warning element | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| EDP Epoch Setting element | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| ... |  |  |  |  |
| NOTE—See 10.28.6 (Element parsing) on the parsing of elements. |  |  |  |  |

The Enhanced Group Privacy Availability element is as follows:

~~~~

In its current structure, the element can offer m groups, each with 17 octets. The Group count field is 255 bits long, so the possibility that the element would extend beyond 255 octects is possible. Therefore, fragmentation may be needed. There is no good reason for the extensible option in the currect structure.

CID1135

Revised

***Modify 9-130 (Element IDs) as follows:***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Element** | **Element ID** | **Element ID Extension** | **Extensible** | **Fragmentable** |
| ...... |  |  |  |  |
| ~~FILS~~ Nonce (see 9.4.2.188 (FILS Nonce element)) | 255 | 13 | No | No |
| ..... |  |  |  |  |
| DS MAC Address (see 9.4.2.336 (DS MAC Address element)) | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| Enhanced Data Privacy (EDP) element | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1132) | No (#1132) |
| Minimum Epoch Pacing element | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1133) | No (#1133) |
| Enhanced Group Privacy Availability (EGPA) element | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1134) | Yes (#1134) |
| OTA(#1010) MAC Collision Warning element | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1135) | No (#1135) |
| EDP Epoch Setting element | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| ... |  |  |  |  |
| NOTE—See 10.28.6 (Element parsing) on the parsing of elements. |  |  |  |  |

The otaMAC Collision Warning element is as follows:

~~~~

In its current structure, the element has no reason to extend beyond its current size, nor to be fragmented.

CID1136

Revised

***Modify 9-130 (Element IDs) as follows:***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Element** | **Element ID** | **Element ID Extension** | **Extensible** | **Fragmentable** |
| ...... |  |  |  |  |
| ~~FILS~~ Nonce (see 9.4.2.188 (FILS Nonce element)) | 255 | 13 | No | No |
| ..... |  |  |  |  |
| DS MAC Address (see 9.4.2.336 (DS MAC Address element)) | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| Enhanced Data Privacy (EDP) element | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1132) | No (#1132) |
| Minimum Epoch Pacing element | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1133) | No (#1133) |
| Enhanced Group Privacy Availability (EGPA) element | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1134) | Yes (#1134) |
| OTA(#1010) MAC Collision Warning element | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1135) | No (#1135) |
| EDP Epoch Setting element | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1136) | No (#1136) |
| ... |  |  |  |  |
| NOTE—See 10.28.6 (Element parsing) on the parsing of elements. |  |  |  |  |

The EDP Epoch setting element is as follows:

~~~~

In its current structure, the element has no reason to extend beyond its current size, nor to be fragmented.

CID1222

Accepted

***Modify 9-130 (Element IDs) as follows:***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Element** | **Element ID** | **Element ID Extension** | **Extensible** | **Fragmentable** |
| ...... |  |  |  |  |
| ~~FILS~~ Nonce (see 9.4.2.188 (FILS Nonce element)) | 255 | 13 | No | No |
| ..... |  |  |  |  |
| DS MAC Address (see 9.4.2.336 (DS MAC Address element)) | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| Enhanced Data Privacy (EDP) ~~element~~ (#1222) | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1132) | No (#1132) |
| Minimum Epoch Pacing ~~element~~ (#1222) | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1133) | No (#1133) |
| Enhanced Group Privacy Availability (EGPA) ~~element~~ (#1222) | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1134) | Yes (#1134) |
| OTA(#1010) MAC Collision Warning ~~element~~ (#1222) | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1135) | No (#1135) |
| EDP Epoch Setting ~~element~~ (#1222) | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1136) | No (#1136) |
| ... |  |  |  |  |
| NOTE—See 10.28.6 (Element parsing) on the parsing of elements. |  |  |  |  |

CID1223

Revised

***Modify 9-130 (Element IDs) as follows:***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Element** | **Element ID** | **Element ID Extension** | **Extensible** | **Fragmentable** |
| ...... |  |  |  |  |
| ~~FILS~~ Nonce (see 9.4.2.188 (FILS Nonce element)) | 255 | 13 | No | No |
| ..... |  |  |  |  |
| DS MAC Address (see 9.4.2.336 (DS MAC Address element)) | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| Enhanced Data Privacy (EDP) ~~element~~ (#1222) (see 9.4.2.337 (Enhanced Data Privacy (EDP) element)) (#1223) | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1132) | No (#1132) |
| Minimum Epoch Pacing ~~element~~ (#1222) (see 9.4.2.338 (Minimum Epoch Pacing element)) (#1223) | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1133) | No (#1133) |
| Enhanced Group Privacy Availability (EGPA) ~~element~~ (#1222) (see 9.4.2.339 (Enhanced Group Privacy Availability (EGPA) element)) (#1223) | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1134) | Yes (#1134) |
| OTA(#1010) MAC Collision Warning ~~element~~ (#1222) (see 9.4.2.340 (OTA MAC Collision Warning element)) (#1223) | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1135) | No (#1135) |
| EDP Epoch Setting ~~element~~ (#1222) (see 9.4.2.341 (EDP Epoch Setting element)) (#1223) | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1136) | No (#1136) |
| ... |  |  |  |  |
| NOTE—See 10.28.6 (Element parsing) on the parsing of elements. |  |  |  |  |

**Proposal:**

*TGbi editor: Modify table 9-130 in clause 9.4.2.1 as follows (track change on):*

***Modify 9-130 (Element IDs) as follows:***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Element** | **Element ID** | **Element ID Extension** | **Extensible** | **Fragmentable** |
| ...... |  |  |  |  |
| ~~FILS~~ Nonce (see 9.4.2.188 (FILS Nonce element)) | 255 | 13 | No | No |
| ..... |  |  |  |  |
| DS MAC Address (see 9.4.2.336 (DS MAC Address element)) | 255 | <ANA> |  |  |
| Enhanced Data Privacy (EDP) (#1222) (see 9.4.2.337 (Enhanced Data Privacy (EDP) element)) (#1223) | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1132) | No (#1132) |
| Minimum Epoch Pacing (#1222) (see 9.4.2.338 (Minimum Epoch Pacing element)) (#1223) | 255 | <ANA> | Yes (#1133) | No (#1133) |
| Enhanced Group Privacy Availability (EGPA) (#1222) (see 9.4.2.339 (Enhanced Group Privacy Availability (EGPA) element)) (#1223) | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1134) | Yes (#1134) |
| OTA(#1010) MAC Collision Warning (#1222) (see 9.4.2.340 (OTA MAC Collision Warning element)) (#1223) | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1135) | No (#1135) |
| EDP Epoch Setting (#1222) (see 9.4.2.341 (EDp Epoch Setting element)) (#1223) | 255 | <ANA> | No (#1136) | No (#1136) |
| ... |  |  |  |  |
| NOTE—See 10.28.6 (Element parsing) on the parsing of elements. |  |  |  |  |