IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| IEEE 802.11bf – Teleconference Minutes August-September 2024 |
| Date: 2024-08-23 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Leif Wilhelmsson | Ericsson AB | Mobilvägen 1, 22632 Lund, Sweden | +46-706-216956 | leif.r.wilhelmsson@ericsson.com |

Abstract

This document contains minutes for the TG 802.11bf teleconferences in August-September 2024.

Rev 0: Minutes for TG 802.11bf teleconference on the 1th of August added.

Rev 1: Minutes for TG 802.11bf teleconference on the 6th of August added.

Rev 2: Minutes for TG 802.11bf teleconference on the 20th of August and list of attendees for the 6th and 20th of August added.

**Thursday, August 1, 2024, 11:00pm - 01:00am (ET)**

**Meeting Agenda:**

The meeting agenda is shown below, and published in the agenda document:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-1356-02-00bf-tgbf-meeting-agenda-2024-08.pptx>

1. Call the meeting to order
2. Patent policy and logistics
3. TGbf Timeline
4. Call for contribution
5. Teleconference Times
6. Presentation of submissions
7. Initial SA Ballot (D4.0) CR Status
8. Any other business?
9. Adjourn
10. The chair, Tony Han, calls the meeting to order at 11:00pm ET (16 persons are on the call after 10 minutes of the meeting).
11. The chair goes through “Meeting Protocol, Attendance, Voting & Documentation Status” (slide 4), “Participants have a duty to inform the IEEE” (slide 6), and “Ways to inform IEEE” (slide 7).

The chair makes a Call for Potentially Essential Patents. No potentially essential patents reported, and no questions asked.

The chair goes through “Other Guideline for IEEE WG meetings” (slide 8), “Patent related information” (slide 9), “IEEE SA Copyright Policy” (slides 10 and 11), “Participant behavior in IEEE-SA activities is guided by the IEEE Codes of Ethics & Conduct” (slide 12), “Participants in the IEEE-SA “individual process” shall act independently of others, including employers”(slide 13), and “IEEE-SA standards activities shall allow the fair & equitable consideration of all viewpoints” (slide 14), and “Required notices” (slide 15).

The chair goes through the agenda (slide 16) and asks if there are any question on the agenda. No response from the group.

The chair asks if there is any objection to approve the agenda by unanimous consent. No response from the group. As a result, the agenda is approved.

1. The chair goes through the timeline (slide 17).
2. The chair goes through the call for contribution (slide 18).

The chair shows the teleconfernence times (slide 21).

1. The chair presents slide 19, which showes the results of the SA Ballot (D4.0). Claudio emphasizes that is would be good to finalize the comment resolutions before the September f2f as there are many other sessions people may want to attend.
2. Presentations:

**11-24/1349r1, “Proposed Resolutions for Comments on Replay Counter Signaling for Protected Sensing Frames”, Henry Ptasinski (Element 78 Communcations):**

This submission presents a proposed resolution for the following P802.11bf CIDs: 6016, 6017, 6186 regarding the signaling of the replay counter to be used for Protected Sensing frames.

CIDs 6016, 6017, 6086:

Question/Comment (Q): Seems you tie this to QMF, which I believe is not really correct.

Q: QMF is an independent capability and I believe we can do sensing without QMF

Answer (A): This is not what is suggested. Here the table is completed in case QMF is used.

Q: I have a concern related to that this would require a HW change at a very late stage.

Q: I also agree we don’t need to add it and that it is problematic to add it at this late stage.

**11-24/1348r0, “SA1 comment resolution for sensing capabilities”, Pei Zhou (TCL):**

This submission proposes resolutions to the following Initial SA ballot CIDs.

* 6025, 6202.

The text used as reference is 802.11bf D4.0.

CID 6025: No discussion.

CID 6202: No discussion.

**Straw Poll:** Move to approve resolutions to CIDs 6025, 6202, as specified in doc.: 11-24/1348r0 and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft.

**Result:** Unanimously supported

**11-24/1069r0, “Initial SA ballot comments – DMG comments Part 2”, Naren (Huawei):**

This document proposes the resolutions to the following “DMG” CIDs: 6133, 6143, 6146, 6150, 6140, 6142, 6144, 6147, 6148, 6159, 6160, 6156, 6161, 6163, 6164, 6165 (16 in total)

CIDs 6133, 6143, 6146: No discussion.

CID 6150: Naren changes the resolution from Accepted to Rejected. Will add a reason offline.

CIDs 6140, 6142, 6144, 6147, 6148: No discussion.

CIDs 6159, 6160, 6156: Some clarifying discussion.

CIDs 6161, 6163: No discussion.

CIDs 6164, 6165: No discussion.

Naren removes CID 6150 and will update to r1.

**Straw Poll:**Do you agree to the resolutions provided for CIDs 6133, 6143, 6146, ~~6150,~~ 6140, 6142, 6144, 6147, 6148, 6159, 6160, 6156, 6161, 6163, 6164, 6165 in 24/1069r1 to be included in the latest 11bf Draft?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-24/1352r0, “Initial SA Ballot Comment Resolution for CID 6018”, Zhuqing Tang (Huawei):** This submission contains the proposed comment resolutions for the CID 6018 submitted to Initial SA Ballot. The reference text is 11bf D4.0.

 The proposed resolution has been discussed offline with the commenter.

CID 6018: No discussion.

**Straw Poll:** Do you support the proposed resolution to the CID 6018 and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-24/1353r0, “Initial SA Ballot Comment Resolution for OST”, Zhuqing Tang (Huawei):** This submission contains the proposed comment resolutions for the CIDs 6024, 6032, 6171, 6172 submitted to Initial SA Ballot. The reference text is 11bf D4.0.

CID 6024: Some discussion, and as a result the CID is deferred.

CID 6032: Some clarifying discussion.

CIDs 6171 and 6172: Some clarifying discussion. As a result, it is agreed that some more discussion is needed.

Because several of the CIDs need more discussion, the straw poll is deferred.

1. Any other business. No response from the group
2. The meeting is adjourned without objection at 00:45am.

**List of Attendees:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
| TGbf | 01/08/2024 23:00 | Beg, Chris | Cognitive Systems Corp. |
| TGbf | 01/08/2024 23:03 | da Silva, Claudio | Meta Platforms |
| TGbf | 01/08/2024 23:00 | Dong, Xiandong | Xiaomi Inc. |
| TGbf | 01/08/2024 23:40 | Ducca, Samuel | Universidade de Sao Paulo, USP |
| TGbf | 01/08/2024 23:03 | Huang, Po-Kai | Intel Corporation |
| TGbf | 01/08/2024 23:00 | Kim, Sang Gook | LG ELECTRONICS |
| TGbf | 01/08/2024 23:02 | narengerile, narengerile | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| TGbf | 01/08/2024 23:01 | Ptasinski, Henry | Element78 Communications LLC |
| TGbf | 01/08/2024 23:03 | Raissinia, Alireza | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| TGbf | 01/08/2024 23:03 | Tang, Zhuqing | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| TGbf | 01/08/2024 23:03 | Wei, Dong | Guangdong OPPO Mobile Telecommunications Corp.,Ltd |
| TGbf | 01/08/2024 23:01 | Wilhelmsson, Leif | Ericsson AB |
| TGbf | 01/08/2024 23:01 | Zhou, Pei | TCL |

**Tuesday, August 6, 2024, 10:00am - 12:00pm (ET)**

**Meeting Agenda:**

The meeting agenda is shown below, and published in the agenda document:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-1356-03-00bf-tgbf-meeting-agenda-2024-08.pptx>

1. Call the meeting to order
2. Patent policy and logistics
3. TGbf Timeline
4. Call for contribution
5. Teleconference Times
6. Presentation of submissions
7. Initial SA Ballot (D4.0) CR Status
8. Motion (567-570)
9. Any other business?
10. Adjourn
11. The chair, Tony Han, calls the meeting to order at 10:00am ET (16 persons are on the call after 10 minutes of the meeting).
12. The chair goes through “Meeting Protocol, Attendance, Voting & Documentation Status” (slide 4), “Participants have a duty to inform the IEEE” (slide 6), and “Ways to inform IEEE” (slide 7).

The chair makes a Call for Potentially Essential Patents. No potentially essential patents reported, and no questions asked.

The chair goes through “Other Guideline for IEEE WG meetings” (slide 8), “Patent related information” (slide 9), “IEEE SA Copyright Policy” (slides 10 and 11), “Participant behavior in IEEE-SA activities is guided by the IEEE Codes of Ethics & Conduct” (slide 12), “Participants in the IEEE-SA “individual process” shall act independently of others, including employers”(slide 13), and “IEEE-SA standards activities shall allow the fair & equitable consideration of all viewpoints” (slide 14), and “Required notices” (slide 15).

The chair goes through the agenda (slide 17) and asks if there are any question on the agenda. The chair explains he intends to run the motions before the presentation of submissions. No response from the group.

The chair asks if there is any objection to approve the agenda by unanimous consent. No response from the group. As a result, the agenda is approved.

1. The chair goes through the timeline (slide 18).
2. The chair goes through the call for contribution (slide 22).
3. The chair shows the teleconfernence times (slide 21).
4. The chair presents slide 20, which showes the results of the SA Ballot (D4.0)
5. Motions:

**Motion 567:** Move to approve resolutions to the following CIDs listed in the following document and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft:

* CIDs: 6025, 6202
* as specified in doc.: 11-24/1348r0

 **Move:** Pei Zhou

 **Second:** Lei Zhou

 **Result:** Motion passed by unanimous consent

**Note：**

* + Related document 11-24/1348r0
	+ SP Result: Unanimous consent

**Motion 568:** Move to approve resolutions to the following CIDs listed in the following document and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft:

* + CIDs: 6133, 6143, 6146, 6140, 6142, 6144, 6147, 6148, 6159, 6160, 6156, 6161, 6163, 6164, 6165
	+ as specified in doc.: 11-24/1069r1

**Move:** Narengerile

**Second:** Alecsander Eitan

**Result:** Motion passed by unanimous consent

**Note：**

* + Related document 11-24/1069r1
	+ SP Result: Unanimous consent

**Motion 569:** Move to approve resolutions to the following CIDs listed in the following document and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft:

* + CIDs: 6019, 6020
	+ as specified in doc.: 11-24/1064r0

 **Move:** Narengerile

 **Second:** Ali Raissinia

**Result:** Motion passed by unanimous consent

**Note：**

* + Related document 11-24/1064r0
	+ SP Result: Unanimous consent

**Motion 570:** Move to approve resolutions to the following CIDs listed in the following document and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft:

* + CIDs: 6018
	+ as specified in doc.: 11-24/1352r0

**Move:** Zhuqing Tang

**Second:** Ali Raissinia

**Result:** Motion passed by unanimous consent

**Note：**

* + Related document 11-24/1352r0
	+ SP Result: Unanimous consent
1. Presentations:

**11-24/1353r1, “Initial SA Ballot Comment Resolution for OST”, Zhuqing Tang (Huawei):** This submission contains the proposed comment resolutions for the CIDs 6024, 6032, 6171, 6172 submitted to Initial SA Ballot. The reference text is 11bf D4.0.

Revision 0 was presented in the previous teleconference and Zhuqing presents the changes made. Revision 1 contains revised resolutions for CID 6024, 6032, and 6172.

CID 6024: No discussion.

CID 6032: No discusison.

CID 6172: No discussion.

**Straw Poll**: Do you support the proposed resolutions to the CIDs and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-24/1357r0, “Resolution to CID 6181 and 6182”, Cheng Chen (Intel):** This submission proposes resolutions to the following comments submitted in SA1 Ballot under Exchange topic. The CIDs are referring to D4.0. The text used as reference is D4.0.

 CIDs: 6181 6182

CIDs 6181 and 6182: No discussion.

**Straw Poll:** Do you support the proposed resolutions to the CIDs and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-24/1127r1, “Initial SA ballot comments – DMG comments Part 3”, Naren (Huawei):** This document proposes the resolutions to the following “DMG” CIDs: 6179, 6201, 6193, 6194, 6195, 6192, 6150 (7 in total)

CID 6179: Based on feedback from the group, the proposed resolution text is slightly updated.

CID 6201: No discussion.

CID 6193, 6194, and 6195: No discussion.

CID 6192: Some clarifying discussion and some minor updates of the text.

CID 6150: No discussion.

**Straw Poll:** Do you agree to the resolutions provided for CIDs 6179, 6201, 6193, 6194, 6195, 6192, 6150 in 24/1127r2 to be included in the latest 11bf Draft?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-24/1338r0, “Initial SA ballot DMG cid set1”, Alecsander Eitan (Qualcomm):** This submission contains the proposed comment resolutions for the CIDs 6009, 6141 and 6173 submitted to Initial SA Ballot. The reference text is 11bf D4.0.

CID 6009: No discussion.

CID 6141: Based on feedback from the group, the proposed resolution text is slightly updated.

CID 6173: No discussion.

**Straw Poll:** Do you agree with the proposed resolutions in revision 0 of this document (11-24-1338-01-00bf-initial-sa-ballot-dmg-cid-set1.docx)?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

Claudio gives a status update of the CRs based on document 11-24/1113r5.

1. Any other business. No response from the group
2. The meeting is adjourned without objection at 11:12am ET.

**List of Attendees:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
| TGbf | 08/06 | Kim, Sang Gook | LG ELECTRONICS |
| TGbf | 08/06 | Wei, Dong | Guangdong OPPO Mobile Telecommunications Corp.,Ltd |
| TGbf | 08/06 | Kamel, Mahmoud | InterDigital, Inc. |
| TGbf | 08/06 | Raissinia, Alireza | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| TGbf | 08/06 | narengerile, narengerile | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| TGbf | 08/06 | Zhou, Lei | H3C Technologies Co., Limited |
| TGbf | 08/06 | Eitan, Alecsander | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| TGbf | 08/06 | Schweizer, Benedikt | Apple Inc. |
| TGbf | 08/06 | Lim, Dong Guk | LG ELECTRONICS |
| TGbf | 08/06 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| TGbf | 08/06 | Beg, Chris | Cognitive Systems Corp. |
| TGbf | 08/06 | Wilhelmsson, Leif | Ericsson AB |

**Tuesday, August 20, 2024, 10:00am - 12:00pm (ET)**

**Meeting Agenda:**

The meeting agenda is shown below, and published in the agenda document:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-1356-06-00bf-tgbf-meeting-agenda-2024-08.pptx>

1. Call the meeting to order
2. Patent policy and logistics
3. TGbf Timeline
4. Call for contribution
5. Teleconference Times
6. Presentation of submissions
7. Initial SA Ballot (D4.0) CR Status
8. Motion (571-574)
9. Any other business?
10. Adjourn
11. The chair, Tony Han, calls the meeting to order at 10:00am ET (18 persons are on the call after 10 minutes of the meeting).
12. The chair goes through “Meeting Protocol, Attendance, Voting & Documentation Status” (slide 4), “Participants have a duty to inform the IEEE” (slide 6), and “Ways to inform IEEE” (slide 7).

The chair makes a Call for Potentially Essential Patents. No potentially essential patents reported, and no questions asked.

The chair goes through “Other Guideline for IEEE WG meetings” (slide 8), “Patent related information” (slide 9), “IEEE SA Copyright Policy” (slides 10 and 11), “Participant behavior in IEEE-SA activities is guided by the IEEE Codes of Ethics & Conduct” (slide 12), “Participants in the IEEE-SA “individual process” shall act independently of others, including employers”(slide 13), and “IEEE-SA standards activities shall allow the fair & equitable consideration of all viewpoints” (slide 14), and “Required notices” (slide 15).

The chair goes through the agenda (slide 18) and asks if there are any question on the agenda.

The chair asks if there is any objection to approve the agenda by unanimous consent. No response from the group. As a result, the agenda is approved.

Tony explains that the call on next Tuesday will be used to discuss some of the more controversial CIDs. Currently CIDs 6059 and 6060 belong to this group.

1. The chair goes through the timeline (slide 20).
2. The chair goes through the call for contribution (slide 21).
3. The chair shows the teleconfernence times (slide 24).
4. The chair presents slides 22 and 23, which showes the results of the SA Ballot (D4.0)
5. Motions:

**Motion 571:** Move to approve resolutions to the following CIDs listed in the following document and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft:

* + CIDs: 6181 and 6182
	+ as specified in doc.: 11-24/1357r0

**Move:** Ali Raissinia

**Second:** Claudio da Silva

**Result:** Motion passed by unanimous consent

**Note：**

* + Related document 11-24/1357r0
	+ SP Result: Unanimous consent

**Motion 572:** Move to approve resolutions to the following CIDs listed in the following document and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft:

* + CIDs: 6024, 6032, 6171, 6172
	+ as specified in doc.: 11-24/1353r1

**Move:** Zhuqing Tang

**Second:** Ali Raissinia

**Result:** Motion passed by unanimous consent

**Note：**

* + Related document 11-24/1353r1
	+ SP Result: Unanimous consent

**Motion 573:** Move to approve resolutions to the following CIDs listed in the following document and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft:

* + CIDs: 6179, 6201, 6193, 6194, 6195, 6192, 6150
	+ as specified in doc.: 11-24/1127r2

**Move:** Narengerile

**Second:** Alecsander Eitan

**Result:** Motion passed by unanimous consent

**Note：**

* + Related document 11-24/1127r2
	+ SP Result: Unanimous consent

**Motion 574:** Move to approve resolutions to the following CIDs listed in the following document and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft:

* + CIDs: 6009, 6141 and 6173
	+ as specified in doc.: 11-24/1338r1

**Move:** Alecsander Eitan

**Second:** Stephen McCann

**Result:** Motion passed by unanimous consent

**Note：**

* + Related document 11-24/1338r1
	+ SP Result: Unanimous consent
1. Presentations:

**11-24/1165r1, “SA Ballot Comment Resolutions on Tone Spacing”, Steve Shellhammer (Qualcomm):** The document provides comment resolutions for CIDs: 6188, 6189, 6190.

CIDs 6188, 6189, and 6190: No discussion.

**Straw Poll:** Do you agree to the resolutions provided for CIDs 6188, 6189, and 6190 in 24/1165r1 to be included in the latest 11bf Draft?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-24/1398r0, “SA1 Reporting CID 6044 Resolution”, Chris Beg(Cognitive Systems):** This submission addresses SA1 CID 6044

CID 6044: Some clarifying discussion regarding the need for signaling the puncturing pattern. The reason basically being that the report should be self-sufficient, without any need to reach the conclusion by combining the report with other information.

**Straw Poll:** Do you support the resolution to CID 6044 from 11-24/1398r0 and incorporating the changes into the latest TGbf draft?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-24/1351r1, “Initial SA Ballot Comment Resolutions for DMG Part 2”, Rui Du(Huawei):** This submission contains the proposed comment resolutions for the CIDs 6083, 6090, 6100, 6101, 6102, 6103, 6104, 6107, 6108, 6109, 6111, 6125, 6126, 6120, 6121, 6128 submitted to Initial SA Ballot. The reference text is 11bf D4.0.

CID 6083: No discussion.

CID 6090: Comment from Claudio that if the comment is accepted no more instruction to the editor should be provided.

CID 6100: The resolution is changed to revised.

CID 6101: The resolution is changed to revised.

CIDs 6102, 6103, and 6104: No discussion.

CID 6107: The resolution is changed to revised.

CIDs 6108 and 6109: The resolutions are changed to revised.

CID 6111: No discussion.

CIDs 6125 and 6126: No discussion.

CID 6120: No discussion.

CID 6121: No discussion.

CID 6128: No discussion.

**Straw Poll:** Do you support resolutions to the following CIDs and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft: 6083, 6090, 6100, 6101, 6102, 6103, 6104, 6107, 6108, 6109, 6111, 6125, 6126, 6120, 6121, 6128 in 11-24/1351r2?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-24/1417r0, “BSS Color and frame format”, Ali Raissinia (Qualcomm):** This contribution proposes to include normative text for the use of BSS Color field & frame format(s).

Some minor editorial comments.

**Straw Poll:** Do you support the changes proposed in 24/1417r1?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-24/1420r1, “Initial SA ballot comments – DMG Beam Sector comment”, Pu (Perry)Wang (MERL):**This document proposes the resolutions to the following “DMG Beam Sector” CIDs:6065, 6084, 6113 (3 in total).

CID 6065: Some clarifying discussion and as a result the reolution is changed to Accept.

CID 6084: No discussion.

CID 6113: No discussion.

**Straw Poll:** Do you support the proposed changes in 24/1420r2?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

Claudio gives an update of the CID status.

1. Any other business. No response from the group
2. The meeting is adjourned without objection at 12:05pm ET.

**List of Attendees:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Name | Timestamp | Affiliation |
| TGbf | Raissinia, Alireza | 2024-08-20 | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| TGbf | Kim, Sang Gook | 2024-08-20 | LG ELECTRONICS |
| TGbf | Lim, Dong Guk | 2024-08-20 | LG ELECTRONICS |
| TGbf | Wilhelmsson, Leif | 2024-08-20 | Ericsson AB |
| TGbf | Sand, Stephan | 2024-08-20 | German Aerospace Center (DLR) |
| TGbf | narengerile, narengerile | 2024-08-20 | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| TGbf | Beg, Chris | 2024-08-20 | Cognitive Systems Corp. |
| TGbf | feng, Shuling | 2024-08-20 | MediaTek Inc. |
| TGbf | McCann, Stephen | 2024-08-20 | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| TGbf | Wei, Dong | 2024-08-20 | Guangdong OPPO Mobile Telecommunications Corp.,Ltd |