IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 11bi D0.5 CR for 10.71.2.2 | | | | |
| Date: 2024-08-01 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jerome Henry | Cisco Systems |  |  | jerhenry@cisco.com |
| Domenico Ficara | Cisco Systems |  |  | dficara@cisco.com |
| Ugo Campiglio | Cisco Systems |  |  | ucampigl@cisco.com |
| Javier Contreras | Cisco Systems |  |  | jacontre@cisco.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for the following CIDs:

1328, 1011, 1077, 1079, 1012, 1081, 1021, 1330, 1168, 1063, 1020, 1332.

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGbi D0.4 Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGbi D0.4 Draft. (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents). TGbi Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGbi Editor” are instructions to the TGbi editor to modify existing material in the TGbi draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGbi editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGbi Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause** | **P.L** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| *1328* | Mark RISON | 10.71.2.2 | 55.44 | "Epoch minimum Pacing element. If the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration in the Minimum Epoch Pacing elemen" -- what is the element called? And anyway all words should start with an uppercase letter. Also "field" is missing. More similar horrors lower down | As it says in the comment | REVISED  The element was called Epoch minimum Pacing element, then Minimum Epoch Pacing element. In both cases, the word field was missed. The name of the epoch is corrected to Minimum Epoch Pacing element, and the word ‘field’ is added (two instances). |
| *1011* | Chaoming Luo | 10.71.2.2 | 55.45 | Correct the name of the element. | Change to: the Minimum Epoch Pacing element | ACCEPTED |
| *1077* | Julien Sevin | 10.71.2.2 | 55.45 | Replace "Epoch minimum Pacing element" by "Minimum Epoch Pacing" | As in comment | ACCEPTED |
| 1079 | Julien Sevin | 10.71.2.2 | 55.45 | Replace "non-AP MLD" by "CPE non-AP MLD" in the sentence "A non-AP MLD may include in its (Re)Association Request frame the Epoch minimum Pacing element" | As in comment | REVISED |
| *1012* | Chaoming Luo | 10.71.2.2 | 55.48 | Epoch ID is not defined. Should it be "Group ID"? | Change to: Group ID | ACCEPTED |
| *1081* | Julien Sevin | 10.71.2.2 | 55.48 | The term "Epoch ID" is not defined | Please specify "Epoch ID" | REVISED  Epoch ID is a typo, replaced with Group ID (0) |
| 1021 | Chaoming Luo | 10.71.2.2 | 55.48 | How does the assignment carry out? The non-AP STA hasn't got any epoch setting when sending the (Re)Association Request frame. Is it assigned by protected Association Response? | Change to: the CPE non-AP MLD shall be assigned to the default group EDP epoch by the AP MLD in the protected (Re)Association Response. | REJECTED  10.71.2.2 is about EDP epoch request mechanism. 10.71.2.4 already states “then the AP MLD shall assign the CPE non-AP MLD to the default group EDP Epoch if association succeeds.  The protected Association Response frame provides the default group EDP information in the EDP Epoch Settings field of the Group Enhanced Privacy Element.” It is better to limit repeats. However, consolidation might be useful. |
| 1330 | Mark RISON | 10.71.2.2 | 55.49 | "both the AP MLD and non-AP MLD support group EDP epoch." -- how does a STA signal this support? | As it says in the comment | REJECTED  10.71.2.3 states “A CPE AP MLD advertises group EDP epoch support in Beacon and Probe Response frames by setting value 1 to the Group EDP Epoch Supported field of the Extended RSN Capabilities field.  A CPE non-AP MLD advertises group EDP epoch support in (Re)Association Request frames by setting value 1 to the Group EDP Epoch Supported field of the Extended RSN element.” It is better to limit repeats. However, consolidation might be useful |
| 1168 | Patrice Nezou | 10.71.2.2 | 55.50 | What is a CPE BSS ? | Add a definition to subclause 3 or replace CPE BSS by "BSS in which the corresponding AP supports the EDP Epoch" | REVISED  Our baseline is very inconcsistent there, using “associates with/to the AP” often, but also in places “associates to the BSSID” and sometimes “associates to the BSS”. However, BSS does not necessarily include an AP. Here the whole paragraph talks about non-AP MLD and AP MLD relationship, it is likely better to keep that clarity and replace BSS with AP. |
| *1063* | Antonio DeLaOlivaDelgado | 10.71.2.2 | 55.51 | The non-AP STA joins the default group upon association as defined 10.71.2 but in 10.71.2.2 it says "The non-AP MLD is not member of any default group at (re)association otherwise". I am not sure what is this last phrase referring to. | Remove the phrase | REVISED  The intent clearly is to say that the non-AP MLD is not member of a group by default otherwise, but the wording makes it vague, the position of the sentence makes it difficult to parse too. |
| *1020* | Chaoming Luo | 10.71.2.2 | 55.52 | The word "any default group" implies there may be multiple default groups, whilst the first sentence of the paragragh says there is only one, which is group 0. | Change to: The non-AP MLD is not assigned to any group EDP epoch at (re)association otherwise. | ACCEPTED |
| 1332 | Mark RISON | 10.71.2.2 | 55.57 | "EDP epoch setting protected action request frame." should be "EDP <something with uppercase letters and not saying Action" frame." More similar horrors lower down | As it says in the comment | REVISED |

**Discussion:**

CID1328, 1011, 1077

Added requested text for additional clarification

A non-AP MLD may include in its (Re)Association Request frame the Minimum (#1328, 1011, 1077) Epoch ~~minimum~~ Pacing element. If the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field (#1328) in the Minimum Epoch Pacing element is equal or larger than the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field (#1328) for the default EDP Epoch group (group 0), then the CPE non-AP MLD shall be assigned to the default group EDP epoch, with a Epoch ID of 0, when the non-AP MLD associates to the CPE BSS and both the AP MLD and non-AP MLD support group EDP epoch. The group EDP epoch setup is described in 10.71.2.4 (Group EDP epoch setup). The non-AP MLD is not member of any default group at (re)association otherwise.

CID1079

Accepted

A CPE (#1079) non-AP MLD may include in its (Re)Association Request frame the Minimum (#1328, 1011, 1077) Epoch ~~minimum~~ Pacing element. If the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field (#1328) in the Minimum Epoch Pacing element is equal or larger than the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field (#1328) for the default EDP Epoch group (group 0), then the CPE non-AP MLD shall be assigned to the default group EDP epoch, with a Epoch ID of 0, when the non-AP MLD associates to the CPE BSS and both the AP MLD and non-AP MLD support group EDP epoch. The group EDP epoch setup is described in 10.71.2.4 (Group EDP epoch setup). The non-AP MLD is not member of any default group at (re)association otherwise.

CID1012 CID1081

Accepted Revised

A CPE (#1079) non-AP MLD may include in its (Re)Association Request frame the Minimum (#1328, 1011, 1077) Epoch ~~minimum~~ Pacing element. If the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field (#1328) in the Minimum Epoch Pacing element is equal or larger than the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field (#1328) for the default EDP Epoch group (group 0), then the CPE non-AP MLD shall be assigned to the default group EDP epoch, with a ~~Epoch~~ Group (#1012, #1081) ID of 0, when the non-AP MLD associates to the CPE BSS and both the AP MLD and non-AP MLD support group EDP epoch. The group EDP epoch setup is described in 10.71.2.4 (Group EDP epoch setup). The non-AP MLD is not member of any default group at (re)association otherwise.

CID1168

Revised

A CPE (#1079) non-AP MLD may include in its (Re)Association Request frame the Minimum (#1328, 1011, 1077) Epoch ~~minimum~~ Pacing element. If the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field (#1328) in the Minimum Epoch Pacing element is equal or larger than the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field (#1328) for the default EDP Epoch group (group 0), then the CPE non-AP MLD shall be assigned to the default group EDP epoch, with a ~~Epoch~~ Group (#1012, #1081) ID of 0, when the non-AP MLD associates to the CPE ~~BSS~~ AP MLD (#1168) and both the AP MLD and non-AP MLD support group EDP epoch. The group EDP epoch setup is described in 10.71.2.4 (Group EDP epoch setup). The non-AP MLD is not member of any default group at (re)association otherwise.

CID1063 CID 1020

Revised Accepted

A CPE (#1079) non-AP MLD may include in its (Re)Association Request frame the Minimum (#1328, 1011, 1077) Epoch ~~minimum~~ Pacing element. If the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field (#1328) in the Minimum Epoch Pacing element is equal or larger than the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field (#1328) for the default EDP Epoch group (group 0), then the CPE non-AP MLD shall be assigned to the default group EDP epoch, with a ~~Epoch~~ Group (#1012, #1081) ID of 0, when the non-AP MLD associates to the CPE ~~BSS~~ AP MLD (#1168) and both the AP MLD and non-AP MLD support group EDP epoch. ~~The group EDP epoch setup is described in 10.71.2.4 (Group EDP epoch setup).~~ If the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field is less than the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field for the default EDP Epoch group (group 0), then (#1063) the non-AP MLD is not ~~member of~~ assigned to (#1020) any ~~default~~ group EDP epoch (#1063) at (re)association ~~otherwise~~. The group EDP epoch setup is described in 10.71.2.4 (Group EDP epoch setup) (#1063).

CID 1332

Revised

A CPE non-AP MLD may subsequently send an EDP Epoch Request to join a specific group EDP epoch or the CPE non-AP MLD can request the AP MLD to start a new group EDP epoch that matches specified EDP epoch settings by sending an EDP Epoch Setting Request ~~protected Action~~ ~~request~~ (#1332) frame.

The AP MLD shall respond with an EDP Epoch Setting Response ~~protected~~ ~~response~~ (#1332) ~~Action~~ frame, accepting or rejecting the request.

A CPE non-AP MLD may leave the group EDP epoch by sending an EDP Epoch Setting Request ~~protected Action~~ ~~request~~ (#1332) frame.

**Proposal:**

*TGbi editor: Modify Clause 10.71.2.2 as follows (track change on):*

**10.71.2.2 EDP epoch request**

A CPE (#1079) non-AP MLD may include in its (Re)Association Request frame the Minimum (#1328, 1011, 1077) Epoch Pacing element. If the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field (#1328) in the Minimum Epoch Pacing element is equal or larger than the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field (#1328) for the default EDP Epoch group (group 0), then the CPE non-AP MLD shall be assigned to the default group EDP epoch, with a Group (#1012, 1081) ID of 0, when the non-AP MLD associates to the CPE AP MLD (#1168) and both the AP MLD and non-AP MLD support group EDP epoch. If the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field is less than the value of the Group Epoch Interval Duration field for the default EDP Epoch group (group 0), then (#1063) the non-AP MLD is not assigned to (#1020) any group EDP epoch (#1063) at (re)association otherwise. (#1063)

A CPE non-AP MLD may subsequently send an EDP Epoch Request (#1332) to join a specific group EDP epoch or the CPE non-AP MLD can request the AP MLD to start a new group EDP epoch that matches specified EDP epoch settings by sending an EDP Epoch Setting Request (#1332) frame.

The AP MLD shall respond with an EDP Epoch Setting Response (#1332) frame, accepting or rejecting the request.

A CPE non-AP MLD may leave the group EDP epoch by sending an EDP Epoch Setting Request (#1332) frame.