IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Recirculation SA ballot – CR for misc CIDs | | | | |
| Date: 2024-06-25 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Laurent Cariou |  |  |  | laurent.cariou@intel.com |

Abstract

Spec text proposal for resolution of following CIDs for Recirculation SA Ballot on 11be D6.0:

23145, 23109, 23135, 23136, 23057, 23054, 23055

1. **Introduction**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Must Be Satisfied** | **Clause Number(C)** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 23145 | Robert Stacey | No | 9.4.2.44 | 225.01 | On behalf of Po-Kai. For the note "NOTE 5A Reduced Neighbor Report element is not carried in the Nontransmitted BSSID Profile subelement and contains information relevant for all the BSSs in the multiple BSSID set. See 9.4.2.169.2 (Neighbor AP Information field) for the fields setting (especially the Same SSID and the AP MLD ID fields) when the Reduced Neighbor Report element is included in a frame sent by an AP corresponding to a transmitted BSSID." It is clear that reduced neighbor report is inherited by the nontransmitted BSSID because the note says "contains information relevant for all the BSSs". It is better to have description to clarify this. | change "NOTE 5A Reduced Neighbor Report element is not carried in the Nontransmitted BSSID Profile subelement and contains information relevant,,," to "NOTE 5A Reduced Neighbor Report element is not carried in the Nontransmitted BSSID Profile subelement (but is inherited by the BSS corresponding to each nontransmitted BSSID profile) and contains information relevant,,," | Revised -  The RNR is not fully inherited because some fields like Same SSID and AP MLD ID are in reference to the transmitted BSSID and not to the nonTransmitted BSSID. Modify the note to clarify that there is a special treatment for RNR, and modify also 11.1.3.8.4 to reflect that special treatment. Apply the changes marked as #23145 in this document. |
| 23109 | Benjamin Rolfe | Yes | 11.8.3 | 397.08 | Poor (very) specification practice: "An EHT AP shall not schedule quiet intervals that would require a value higher than 127 in the Quiet Count field of the Quiet element and the Quiet Channel element" | Change to:  A quite interval scheduled by an EHT AP shall conform to a value corresponding to less than or equal to a value of 127 in the Quiet Count field of the Quiet element and the Quiet Channel element | Rejected –  The comment fails to identify a technical issue. The term “shall not schedule” is commonly used, e.g., 5 instances in IEEE802.11REVme D4.0, and clearly indicates the intent/requirement. The proposed change uses a word “shall conform” which is ambiguous and seldomly used (could not find any instances in the baseline). |
| 23135 | Benjamin Rolfe | Yes | 3.2 | 61.41 | Definitions should not include references to other parts of the standard. An informative note may be provided to refer the user to another part of the standard. " (IEEE standards style manual, clause 12). [reference to clause 35.3.7.2] | Remove definition, or include xref in an informative note. | Revised – Modify the sentence to indicate “as described in” along the lines of other usages in clause 3. Apply the changes marked as #23135 in this document |
| 23136 | Benjamin Rolfe | Yes | 3.2 | 61.25 | Definitions should not include references to other parts of the standard. An informative note may be provided to refer the user to another part of the standard. " (IEEE standards style manual, clause 12). [reference to clause 35.3.7.2] | Remove definition, or include xref in an informative note. | Modify the sentence to indicate “as described in” along the lines of other usages in clause 3 Apply the changes marked as #23136 in this document |
| 23057 | Michael Montemurro | Yes | 35.3.23 | 610.56 | [AK] The condition of setting the Link Removal Imminent subfield to 0 is not relevant for the cited sentence that deals with the setting of the Disassociation Timer value. In other words, the sentence is correct even if the Link Removal Imminent subfield is set to 1. In addition, change "shall be set to 0 or set to the number..." to "shall be set to 0 or to the number..." Please revise the sentence as suggested. | The sentence should be revised as follows: "When an AP MLD transmits a BSS Transition Management Request frame through an affiliated AP the Disassociation Imminent field equal to 1 to a non-AP MLD, the Disassociation Timer field in the BSS Transition Management Request frame shall be set to 0 or to the number of TBTTs that will occur prior to the AP MLD disassociating the non-AP MLD" | Revised -  agree in principle except that the resolution also adds “with” between “affiliated AP” and “the Disassociation Imminent field”. TGbe editor:  Please change the cited sentence as follows: "When an AP MLD transmits a BSS Transition Management Request frame through an affiliated AP with the Disassociation Imminent field equal to 1 to a non-AP MLD, the Disassociation Timer field in the BSS Transition Management Request frame shall be set to 0 or to the number of TBTTs that will occur prior to the AP MLD disassociating the non-AP MLD" |
| 23054 | Michael Montemurro | Yes | 35.3.23 | 611.04 | [AK] 1. The sentence is missing an important condition that the non-AP MLD has more than a single setup link with the associated AP MLD 2. The sentence is missing a condition that the BSS Termination Included field is set to 1 3. The language should be revised for a clear requirement for the non-AP MLD 4. Remove the reference to 35.3.7.5.2. (Affiliated AP link disablement) since the non-AP MLD is not affected in this case. Please revise the sentence as suggested. | The sentence should be revised as follows: " A non-AP MLD that \*has more than a single setup link with its associated AP MLD and that\* receives a BSS Transition Management Request frame with the \*BSS Termination Included field equal to 1 and\* Link Removal Imminent subfield equal to 1 \*shall follow\* the procedure defined in 35.3.6.3 (Removing affiliated AP(s)). " | Reject – all these points are for Link disablement or Link Removal. Behavior for these STAs is described in the referenced subclauses and therefore don’t need to be repeated in this subclause. |
| 23055 | Michael Montemurro | Yes | 35.3.23 | 611.01 | [AK] Need to revise the text "the BSS termination means that the AP MLD is shutting down, and the nonAP MLD will be disassociated from the AP MLD. " for a clear normative behavior language, as suggested | The sentence should be revised as follows: " the nonAP MLD should be disassociated by the AP MLD and the AP MLD shall be shut down " | Revised – Change the sentence to: “the non-AP MLD will be disassociated by the AP MLD and the AP MLD shall be shut down”. |

1. **Proposed spec text**

**3.2 Definitions specific to IEEE 802.11**

TGbe Editor: Please change following paragraph in section 3.2 Definitions specific to IEEE 802.11 (#23135)

**disabled link:** A setup link between an access point (AP) multi-link device (AP MLD) and an associated non-access point (non-AP) multi-link device (non-AP MLD) to which no traffic identifier (TID) is mapped neither in downlink (DL) nor in uplink (UL) as described in 35.3.7.2 (TID-To-Link Mapping (TTLM)).

TGbe Editor: Please change following paragraph in section 3.2 Definitions specific to IEEE 802.11 (#23136)

**enabled link:** A setup link between an access point (AP) multi-link device (AP MLD) and an associated non-access point (non-AP) multi-link device (non-AP MLD) to which at least one traffic identifier (TID) is mapped either in downlink or in uplink as described in 35.3.7.2 (TID-To-Link Mapping (TTLM)).

**11.1.3.8.4 Inheritance of element values**

TGbe Editor: Please change following paragraph in section 11.1.3.8.4 Inheritance of element values (#23145)

(#4)If an element, except a Reduced Neighbor Report element, identified by (#3195)Element ID and Element ID Extension fields (if applicable), is carried in a Probe Response frame, Beacon frame, DMG Beacon frame, or S1G Beacon frame transmitted by an AP corresponding to the transmitted BSSID and there is no element having the same Element ID and Element ID Extension (if applicable) present in a nontransmitted BSSID profile, and the element is not listed in the NonInheritance element (if included) in the nontransmitted BSSID profile for that BSS, then a non-AP STA receiving the frame shall consider the element to be part of that nontransmitted BSSID’s profile and the contents of the Information field shall apply to the nontransmitted BSSID. Otherwise, a non-AP STA receiving the frame shall not consider the element to be part of the nontransmitted BSSID profile.

A Reduced Neighbor Report element is neither inherited nor non-inherited. A Reduced Neighbor Report element shall not be carried in the Nontransmitted BSSID Profile subelement. When present in the frame, the values of fields in the element, except the Same SSID and the AP MLD ID field(s), shall be interpreted the same way by all the BSSs in the multiple BSSID set. In addition, the Same SSID field and the AP MLD ID field are interpreted with respect to the transmitted BSSID.

**9.4.2.44 Multiple BSSID element**

TGbe Editor: Please change following Note in section 9.4.2.44 Multiple BSSID element (#23145)

NOTE 5—A Reduced Neighbor Report element is not carried in the Nontransmitted BSSID Profile subelement. When present in the frame, the values of fields in the element, except the Same SSID subfield(s) apply to all the BSSs in the multiple BSSID set. In addition, the Same SSID field and the AP MLD ID field are interpreted with respect to the Transmitted BSSID (see 11.1.3.8.4).