IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Minutes for REVme Telecon May 6 2024 |
| Date: 2024-05-06 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technology, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 WHighland, UT 84003 | +!-801-492-4023 | Jrosdahl @ ieee . org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for 802.11me (REVme) Telecon held on May 6, 2024.

Motions 150 to 156 were prepared to be made during the Telecon.

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon – Monday, May 6, 2024, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
	1. **Called to order** 10:02am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
	2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
		1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
		2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
		3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
		4. Secretary – Jon Rosdahl (Qualcomm)
	3. **Telecon Attendance:**
		1. IMAT Reported**:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Bankov, Dmitry | IITP RAS |
| 2 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
| 3 | Halasz, David | Morse Micro |
| 4 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 5 | Harkins, Daniel | Aruba Networks, Inc. |
| 6 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 7 | Li, Weiyi | Spreadtrum Communication USA, Inc |
| 8 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| 9 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 10 | Namvar, Nima | Charter Communications |
| 11 | Petrick, Albert | Jones-Petrick and Associates, LLC. |
| 12 | Ptasinski, Henry | Element78 Communications LLC |
| 13 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 14 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 15 | Sand, Stephan | German Aerospace Center (DLR) |
| 16 | Vaidya, Maulik | Charter Communications, Inc. |
| 17 | Wei, Dong | NXP Semiconductors |
| 18 | Zhong, Ke | Ruijie Networks Co.,Ltd. |
| 19 | Zhou, Lei | H3C Technologies Co., Limited |

* + 1. WebEx Report for those not on IMAT:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Mehdi Ganji | Charter |
| 2 | Aditi Singh | Charter |
| 3 | Shaima Abidrabbu | Vestel, IMU |
| 4 | Guarav Patwardhan | HPE |
| 5 | Emily QI | Intel |
| 6 | Hui Luo | Infineon |
| 7 | Yonggang Fang | Mediatek |
| 8 | Glovanni Chisci | Qualcomm |
| 9 | Ilya Levitsky | IITP RAS |
| 10 | Joseph Levy | InterDigital |
| 11 | Renlong Zhou | Sanechips |
| 12 | Roberto Metere | Universit of Yourk |
| 13 | mario lilli | Univesità degli studi di Milano |
| 14 | William Li | Spreadtrum-US |
| 15 | Luca Arnaboldi | University of Birmingham |

* 1. **Review Patent Policy/Copyright Policy**
		1. No Issues noted.
	2. **Review Agenda: 11-24/0627r4**
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0627-04-000m-march-may-teleconference-agenda.docx>
		2. (showing r5, for any changes)
		3. Approved Agenda:

1. Call to order, attendance (https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), and patent and copyright policy

a. Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE: i. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or

ii. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or

iii. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. Copyright Policy:

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c. Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides: See slides 5-18 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0250-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-march-2024.pptx>

d. Agenda Approval

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3. Motions – doc 11-24/33r6 (Slides 22-27)

4. Comment resolution:

a. SAE errata – doc 11-24/744 – Harkins (HPE)

b. CID 7196 – Rosdahl (Qualcomm)

c. CID 7076 – doc 11-24/771 – Sand (DLR)

d. CID 7034, 7080, 7081 – doc 11-23/775 – Sand (DLR)

e. CID 7016, 7017, 7018, 7020 – Kim (Qualcomm)

5. AOB

6. Adjourn

* + 1. Agenda review: Minor rearrangement on presentation order. CIDs 7021 (Levy) and 7228 (Rison) deferred to next call. Updated agenda approved UC.
	1. **Editor Report** – none
	2. **Motions**:
		1. **Motion 150:** **– EDITOR1, EDITOR2 CIDs (2024-05-06)**
			1. Approve the comment resolutions in the
			“Motion-ED1-SA2B” (4 CIDs) tab in 11-24/0489r4 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0489-04-000m-revme-sb2-ed1-ad-hoc-comments.xlsx>),
			"Motion ED2-SA2-002“ (17 CIDs) tab in  11-24/0472r5 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0472-05-000m-revme-sa-ballot-2-editor2-ad-hoc-comments.xlsx>), and incorporate the text changes into the TGme draft.
			2. Noted editorial update: 7136 minor typo (spurious full stop after “5 octets”) and missing article in “the content of Vendor Specific element”.  Also, second+third instance should be about “Vendor Specific Action and Vendor Specific Protected Action frames” and “Vendor Specific RLQP-element” respectively not “Vendor Specific element”
			3. Moved: Emily QI
			4. Second: Jouni MALINEN
			5. Results: Unanimous approval – Motion Passes
		2. **Motion 151 – GEN, MAC, PHY, SEC CIDs (2024-05-06)**:
			1. Approve the comment resolutions in the

“GEN Motion April” tab (9 CIDs) in 11-24/0484r2 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0484-02-000m-revme-gen-ad-hoc-comments-on-sb-recirc-1.xlsx>),

“Motion MAC-BM” tab (41 CIDs) except for CID 7213 in 11-23/2032r9 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2032-09-000m-revme-mac-sa-comments.xls>),

“PHY Motion 5” tab (2 CID) in 11-21/0727r33 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0727-33-000m-revme-phy-comments.xls>),

“SEC Motion B” tab (17 CIDs), updating the resolution for CID 7007 to add “for CID 7007” at the end of the comment resolution text, in 11-24/0491r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0491-03-000m-revme-sa-1-sec-adhoc-comments.xlsx>),

and incorporate the text changes into the TGme draft.

* + - 1. Moved: Jon Rosdahl
			2. Seconded: Youhan Kim
			3. Result: Approved with one abstention. Motion Passes**.**
		1. **Motion 152: CID 7218 (ED2) Group Address Indicator (2024-05-06)**
			1. Approve the comment resolution in the “Motion ED2-SA2-003" tab in 11-24/0472r5 ([https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0472-05-000m-revme-sa-ballot-2-editor2-ad-hoc-comments.xlsx](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0472-04-000m-revme-sa-ballot-2-editor2-ad-hoc-comments.xlsx)).
			2. Moved: Jouni MALINEN
			3. Seconded: Youhan KIM
			4. Results: No objection – Unanimous – Motion passes
		2. **Motion 153 – Non-AP regulatory connectivity (2024-05-06)**:
			1. Instruct the Editor to incorporate the changes under “Proposed edit (P5913L52):” from 11-24-0688r0 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0688-00-000m-non-ap-regulatory-connectivity-non-comment.docx>)

**into the REVme draft.**

* + - 1. Moved: Youhan KIM
			2. Second: Jouni MALINEN
			3. Results: No objection – Unanimous – Motion passes
		1. **Motion 154 – Channel usage (2024-05-06)**
			1. **Instruct the Editor to incorporate the changes under “Changes for this non-comment:” from 11-24/0706r0**

(<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0706-00-000m-channel-usage.docx>) **into the REVme draft.**

* + - 1. Postponed to May Interim
		1. **Motion 155 – Secure LTF test vector updates (2024-05-06)**:
			1. **Instruct the Editor to incorporate the changes from 11-24/0098r3**

(<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0098-03-000m-alignment-of-secure-ltf-normative-text-with-test-vectors.docx>) **into the REVme draft.**

* + - 1. Moved: Youhan KIM
			2. 2nd: Jouni MALINEN
			3. Results: No objection – Unanimous – Motion passes
		1. **Motion 156: CID 7072 (2024-05-06)**
			1. **Approve the comment resolution on the “Motion-CID7072” tab of 11-24/0489r4** (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0489-04-000m-revme-sb2-ed1-ad-hoc-comments.xlsx>)
			2. Moved: Emily QI
			3. Seconded: Jouni Malinen
			4. Discussion:
				1. A separate motion tab “Motion-CID7072” in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0489-04-000m-revme-sb2-ed1-ad-hoc-comments.xlsx>.
				2. Comment: CID 7072 is a 11az work item - it appears 9.6.34 has one subclause. Could 9.6.34.1 become 9.6.34?
				3. REJECTED (ED1: 2024-03-13 18:30:17Z) - keep as it is future expansion.
			5. Results: Unanimous Approved – Motion Passes.
	1. **Review doc 11-24/744r0** - SAE Errata – Dan Harkins, HPE
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0744-00-000m-resolution-of-final-errata.docx>
		2. Abstract: A set of errata on the SAE protocol were sent to the 802.11 chair. Most of these errata were addressed in 11-24/0027r3. This document addresses the rest.
		3. Review the proposed changes in the submission.
		4. First Erratum:
			1. Discussion on “Password identifiers are not used by a mesh STA”.
				1. Final form: “A mesh STA shall not use a password identifier.”
			2. Proposed Resolution: instruct the editor to modify section 12.4.3 as indicated: “Correction: Complete with further instructions, considering Mesh connections (which is included as part of the standard: ”SAE shall be implemented on all mesh STAs to facilitate and promote interoperability.“) and what behaviour should be followed by participants that both send a different password identifier to their peer.”
			3. No objection
		5. Eighth Erratum:
			1. Propose to reject.
			2. Discussion on if the SME is specified with requirements on the SAE, or if full behavior of SME for interaction with SAE needs to be added.
			3. After the discussion, it was determined that if there is an issue that needs to be addressed, it would need to be presented through the IEEE SA comment process. (Either from a ballot pool member or the public comment process).
			4. No objection

* + 1. Nineteenth Erratum:
			1. Review the proposed change.
			2. Proposed Resolution: instruct editor to modify section 12.4.8.6.4 as indicated:
			3. No objection

* + 1. Twenty-Second Erratum
			1. Review the discussion and proposed changes.
			2. Discussion on if PT=1 is possible or if it needs to be explicitly called out.
			3. Noted “= = “needed at end of while loop.
			4. Twenty-second Erratum: Agreed to the proposed resolution, with change of "=" to "==" on the last line of pseudocode
		2. Need to have the text changes prepared in a way that a motion can be made to affect the changes.
		3. ***ACTION ITEM #1:*** Dan Harkins to upload an r1, with the changes agreed today, for preparation of a motion.
	1. **CID 7196 (GEN)** - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
		1. Review status of CID.
		2. Review email discussion. While the comment says Deprecate 802.11e, the proposed change only deprecates HCCA. This is aligned with the discussion received.
		3. Proposed resolution: Accept.
		4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
	2. Note: CIDs 7179 and 7168 moved to May interim.
	3. **Review doc 11-24/0771r0**: Stephan Sand (DLR)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0771-00-000m-sa-ballot-cid-7076-comment-resolution.docx>
		2. CID 7076 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review discussion and proposed changes as described in the submission.
			3. Discussion on the use of Annex G as informative, and any Normative statement would be elsewhere.
			4. Discussion on minor changes/edits that needed to be made.
			5. An R1 will be posted.
			6. Proposed Resolution: Revised; CID 7076 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2024-05-06 15:28:24Z): Incorporate the changes in  <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0771-00-000m-sa-ballot-cid-7076-comment-resolution.docx>
			7. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	4. **Review doc 11-24/-775r0:** Stephan Sand (DLR)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0775-00-000m-sa-ballot-phy-cids-comment-resolution.docx>
		2. CIDs 7080, 7034 and 7081 (PHY):
			1. Review Comments
			2. Review discussion and proposed changes.
			3. Q: Has Youhan (author of the previous CID that made these changes) reviewed this reversion and new changes?
			4. C: Youhan: I think this is okay, but want to review off-line, with more time.
			5. Q: Why delete non-NGV from Note 3? A: Non-HE STA STA should already include non-NGV STA.
			6. C: Note: Non-NGV does not mean "not NGV"
			7. C: In Note 2, there is another "L" missing.
			8. ACTION: Mark R to add a "Note to Editor" to fix this, also.
			9. Discussion on whether Note 7 could be merged and simplified, but decided to keep it more separated and clear. Some off-line wording will be considered.
			10. Mark CIDs 7080, 7034 and 7081 (PHY): More work required.
			11. Assigned to Stephen SAND.
			12. Schedule to Bring back at Warsaw interim.
	5. **Review Document: 11-24/0698r3** - Youhan KIM (Qualcomm)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0698-03-000m-spatial-mapping-for-he-ranging.docx>
		2. CIDs 7016, 7017, 7018, 7020 (PHY):
		3. CID 7016 first
			1. C: Editorial: "an" or "a" Ntx?
			2. Q: "x" sometimes means matrix multiplication, but is also used to indicate a matrix size, which is confusing.
			3. A: Change it to "by" for the size descriptions, or spell out the rows and columns.
			4. Q: Is a permutation matrix a well defined term? (Do we need the NOTE?)
			5. A: Remove the NOTE.
			6. ACTION: Youhan will make the same/similar changes to the other CIDs, and post as r4.
			7. General agreement on Option B, with the changes discussed today.
		4. Proposed Resolution: CIDs 7016, 7017, 7018, 7020 (PHY): Revised. Incorporate the changes in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0698-04-000m-spatial-mapping-for-he-ranging.docx>.
		5. No Objection – Mark Ready for motion.
	6. **AOB:**
		1. The Chair Noted that we will hold elections and affirmations of leadership for the TG in Warsaw. The current officers have all agreed to continue in their current roles.
	7. **Having Reached End of agenda. Adjourned at 11:58 am ET.**

**References:**