IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Proposed resolution for miscellaneous comments on recirculation SA ballot on D5.0: Part 2 | | | | |
| Date: 2024-03-13 | | | | |
| Author: | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Edward Au | Huawei Technologies | Ottawa, Ontario, Canada |  | [edward.ks.au@gmail.com](mailto:edward.ks.au@gmail.com) |

##### 

##### This submission present proposed resolutions for the following 13 editorial CIDs:

Clause 12: 7207, 7216, 7212, 7165, 7060, 7119, 7118, 7117, 7149, 7101, 7185

Clause 13: 7164

Annex J: 7183

##### The proposed changes are based on REVme D5.0.

##### Revision history:

##### R0 – Initial version

##### R1 – Updated based on the discussion on Wednesday PM2 in the March 2024 plenary

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7207 | 12.6.9 | 3064 |  | "PSK-based" has a heretical hyphen | Change to "PSK based" (2x) |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter’s comment for the sake of consistency.

***Proposed resolution for CID 7207:***

Accepted.

Note to the Editors: The locations are 3064.33 and 3064.37.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7216 | 12.5.4.2 | 3038 | 65 | "bit 4 reserved" should be "bit 4 is reserved" | As it says in the comment |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter that “is” is missing.



***Proposed resolution for CID 7216:***

Accepted.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7212 | 12.13.4 | 3163 |  | SNONCE should be SNonce and ANONCE should be ANonce | As it says in the comment |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter that SNONCE should be SNonce and ANONCE should be ANonce.



***Proposed resolution for CID 7212:***

Accepted.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7165 | 12.4.7.2.1 | 3008 | 60 | "integer-to-octet string conversion" should be spaces not hyphens | As it says in the comment |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter’s comment for the sake of consistency.



Option 1: Accepted.

Option 2: Revised. Change “integer to octet string conversion” to “integer-to-octet-string conversion”, and “octet string to integer conversion” to “octet-string-to-integer conversion” throughout P802.11REVme D5.0.

Option 3: Rejected. This is quoting material from an external source.

Option 4: Revised. Change “integer to octet string conversion” to “Integer-to-OctetString Conversion”, and “octet string to integer conversion” to “OctetString-to-Integer Conversion” throughout P802.11REVme D5.0.

Straw poll results: 0/5/2/7

***Proposed resolution for CID 7165 (reassigned to Mark R. “More work required”):***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7060 | 12.5.2.3.3 | 3022 | 53 | An introductory sentence is missing from the beginning of 12.5.2.3.3 | At the cited location, insert the following paragraph: "The AAD is constructed as follows:" |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter that an introductory sentence is missing.



***Proposed resolution for CID 7060:***

Accepted.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7119 | 12.6.1.2.2 | 3050 | 36 | It is not clear, that "A STA and AP establish an initial security association" is the case of "Initial Contact between the STA and the ESS" | Replace: "A STA and AP establish an initial security association via the following steps:" With: "During initial contact between a STA and an ESS an initial security association between the STA and the AP is established via the following steps:" |

***Discussion:***

The commenter points out that the wordings at the beginning of the second paragraph may not be clearly related to the first case as shown in the first paragraph, i.e., an initial contact between the STA and the ESS.



***Proposed resolution for CID 7119:***

Accepted.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7118 | 12.6.1.2.2 | 3050 | 33 | The statement "BSS transition by the STA within the ESS" is grammatically confusing and awkward. | Replace: "BSS transition by the STA within the ESS" With: "The STA transitioning to a different BSS within the ESS" |

***Discussion:***

The commenter refers to the second case as shown in the first paragraph of the subclause.



***Proposed resolution for CID 7118:***

Accepted.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7117 | 12.6.1.2.2 | 3051 | 30 | The statement "a STA BSS transitioning with in an ESS" is grammatically confusing and basically incorrect. | Replace: "a STA BSS transitioning with in an ESS" With: "a STA transitioning to a different BSS within the ESS" |

***Discussion:***

Agree with the commenter that the sentence can b eimproved.



***Proposed resolution for CID 7117 (reassigned to Joe L., “More work required”)***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7149 | 12.7.2 | 3095 | 35 | "(#1843)The following (#1836)EAPOL-Key PDUs are used to implement the (#3416)handshakes: " to "The key wrap algorithm selected depends on the negotiated AKM as defined in 12.7.3 (EAPOL-Key PDU construction and processing)." shouldn't be in the middle of the KDE specifications | Move this block of material to the end of the subclause |

***Discussion:***

These two paragraphs were located between a few paragraphs about the IGTK format (Figure 12-44) and KDE format (Figure 12-45). Agree with the commenter that these two paragraphs are better placed at the end of the subclause.

***Proposed resolution for CID 7149:***

Accepted.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7101 | 12.13.1 | 3155 | 35 | "Base AKMP" should be "base AKMP" | Change "Base AKMP" to "base AKMP". Same thing at P800.39, P3155.37, P3155.39 (x2), P3155.46, P3155.47, P3155.50 (x2), P3157.43, P3157.45, P3157.48, P3157.49, P3157.51, P3157.59, P3158.2, P3158.4, P3158.19, P3158.25, P3158.30, P3159.2, P3159.40 (x3), P3159.41, P3159.46, P3159.49, P3159.51, P3160.26, P3160.43, P3161.17, P3161.18 (x2), P3161.19, P3161.22, P3161.26, P3161.59, P3162.22, P3162.24, P3162.28, P3162.53, P3162.58, P3163.19, P3163.26, P3164.33, P3164.40, P3164.45, P3165.12, P3165.13, P3165.26, and P3165.27. |
| 7185 | 12 |  |  | "Base AKMP" should be "base AKMP" (except at start of sentence/cell/etc.) | As it says in the comment |

***Discussion:***

None.

***Proposed resolution for CID 7101:***

Accepted.

***Proposed resolution for CID 7185:***

Revised.

Change “Base AKMP” to “base AKMP” at P800.39, P3155.35, P3155.37, P3155.39 (x2), P3155.46, P3155.47, P3155.50 (x2), P3157.43, P3157.45, P3157.48, P3157.49, P3157.51, P3157.59, P3158.2, P3158.4, P3158.19, P3158.25, P3158.30, P3159.2, P3159.40 (x3), P3159.41, P3159.46, P3159.49, P3159.51, P3160.26, P3160.43, P3161.17, P3161.18 (x2), P3161.19, P3161.22, P3161.26, P3161.59, P3162.22, P3162.24, P3162.28, P3162.53, P3162.58, P3163.19, P3163.26, P3164.33, P3164.40, P3164.45, P3165.12, P3165.13, P3165.26, and P3165.27.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7164 | 13.4.4 |  |  | "Authentication frame" in the figure needs to be just "Authentication" (2x) | As it says in the comment |

***Discussion:***

The commenter refers to the term “Authentication frame” as shown in Figure 13-4. Agree with the commenter’s comment for the sake of consistency.



***Proposed resolution for CID 7164:***

Revised.

Replace “Authentication frame” with “Authentication-Request” at 3188.10.

Replace “Authentication frame” with “Authentication-Response” at 3188.12.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Clause | Page | Line | Comment | Proposed Change |
| 7183 | J |  |  | "802.11 Header" should be "MAC Header" (6x) | As it says in the comment |

***Discussion:***

None.

***Proposed resolution for CID 7183:***

Accepted.

Note to the Editors: The locations are 6037.63, 6038.1, 6041.24, 6057.29, 6057.33, 6057.64.