Minutes IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| IEEE 802.11 TGbh Plenary Meeting Minutes, March 10-15, 2024  Randomized and Changing MAC addresses (RCM) | | | | |
| Date: 2024-03-xx | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Peter Yee | NSA-CSD | Mountain View, CA, US |  | [peter@akayla.com](mailto:peter@akayla.com) |

Abstract

This document contains the minutes of the IEEE 802.11bh interim meeting of March 10-15, 2024.

Note: Highlighted text are action items.

Q- proceeds a question asked at the meeting

A- proceeds an answer

C- proceeds a comment

**Meeting March 12th, 2024, 1:30 p.m. to 3:30 p.m. MDT**

**Chair: Mark Hamilton (Ruckus/CommScope)**

**Vice Chair: Peter Yee (NSA-CSD/AKAYLA)**

**Vice Chair: Stephen Orr (Cisco)**

**Secretary: Peter Yee**

**Editor: Carol Ansley (Cox Communications)**

**The mixed-mode meeting was called to order by the Chair at 1:32 p.m. MDT.**

Agenda slide deck [11-24/0262r04](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0262-04-00bh-agenda-tgbh-2024-march-plenary.pptx)

1. **Policies and procedures were presented by Chair Mark Hamilton. (Slides 4 to 15)**

There were no Patent declarations.

Copyright policy slides were presented (Slides 11 and 12)

1. **Agenda:**

* **Attendance, noises/recording, meeting protocol**
* **Policies, duty to inform, participation rules**
* **Organization topics:**
  + March Plenary meetings: Tuesday, 13:30-15:30; Thursday 10:30-12:30
  + Approve January Interim and teleconference minutes (next slide)
  + Timeline reminder (slide 18)
  + Motions record: [11-22/0651r36](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0651-36-00bh-tgbh-motions-list.pptx)
* **Alignment issue/ANA assignments**
  + [11-24/0539r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0539-00-00bh-bit-assignment-of-optional-subelement-ids-for-beacon-request.pptx)
  + Editor update on ANA assignments
* **Comment Resolution**
  + Comment resolution document: [11-24/0380r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0380-01-00bh-ieee-802-11bh-lb283-comments.xlsx)
  + Review and disposition of LB283 comments
* **MDR Resolution**
  + Review MDR report [11-24/0140r7](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0140-07-0000-p802-11bh-d3-0-mdr-report.docx). Consider changes to draft/record in [11-24/0586r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0586-00-00bh-p802-11bh-d3-0-mdr-report-response.docx).
* **EC Report review:** [**11-24/0181r2**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0181-02-00bh-tgbh-report-to-ec-on-conditional-approval-to-go-to-sa-ballot.pptx)
* **If time:**
  + Comment resolution approval motions (see Motions deck)
  + SA Ballot start motions (see Motions deck)

The agenda was approved with unanimous consent.

1. **Approval of Minutes**

The minutes of the January interim session ([11-24/0134r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0134-00-00bh-minutes-tgbh-interim-meeting-january-2024.docx)) were approved by unanimous consent.

1. **Timeline Review**

The current timeline now shows a recirculation letter ballot (for a Draft 4.0) to be initiated coming out of this meeting. On the assumption that comes back clean, a conditional motion for approval to go to SA ballot will be prepared to keep things on track. The hope remains to wrap up all approvals by September 2024.

1. **Alignment issues/ANA**

Edward Au (Huawei) noted some clashes between IEEE 802.11be and IEEE 802.11bh in [11-24/0539r00](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0539-00-00bh-bit-assignment-of-optional-subelement-ids-for-beacon-request.pptx) (“Bit assignment of Optional subelement IDs for Beacon request”). This arises from a double assignment in Table 9-141 that was not noticed when the publication order of IEEE 802.11be and IEEE 802.11bh was swapped. The value of 165 is already in use and in production in at least one IEEE 802.11be product. It’s recognized that better coordination between document editors would help. This table is not (currently) under ANA control. The straightforward fix is for IEEE 802.11bh to use values 166 and 167 for its needs. It was suggested that a vendor prematurely baking values into a product for a not-yet-approved standard should be punished by making them change to the new values rather than pushing a change on IEEE 802.11bh. The group agreed to the renumbering and that will be part of the motions made at the close of the meeting.

1. **Editor update on ANA assignments**

Carol Ansley (Cox Communications) has worked with Robert Stacey (Intel) on the ANA assignments. The next draft of IEEE 802.11bh will not have any ANA indicators in it.

1. **Comment Resolution Status**

The spreadsheet of comments received and their current state is [11-24/0380r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0380-01-00bh-ieee-802-11bh-lb283-comments.xlsx). Most commenters agreed to withdraw their comments for later submission during the Standards Association ballot. This was done in order to ensure that the group can get the document into SA ballot according to the timeline. The chair thanked those commenters for their willingness to help things along. Seven comments remain to be resolved. Two refer to the baseline text and will be taken to TGme as they are outside of our purview. The remaining comments are important to the understanding of what the amendment is doing. While not truly technical, resolving them now will likely prevent unnecessary confusion and comments during the SA ballot. These are comment IDs (CIDs) 1046, 1049, 1052, 1071, and 1072. Three fix change tracking errors, one fixes an inappropriate change that somehow crept in, and one cleans up a glitch in Table 9-371. The group agreed to the resolutions of these comments, which means that there should be no outstanding comments left to resolve from the last ballot.

1. **MDR Resolution**

Mark Hamilton displayed [11-24/0586r00](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0586-00-00bh-p802-11bh-d3-0-mdr-report-response.docx), which is the draft task group response to the MDR (Mandatory Draft Review) Report ([11-24/0140r07](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0140-07-0000-p802-11bh-d3-0-mdr-report.docx)). Some items that were raised in the report are fairly obvious and don’t need further response from the task group. Other things like non-normative language in a normative clause need input from the task group. These are things like the use of “can” when “may” is appropriate. The group hashed out different options for some of the draft responses. Hamilton will post the updated responses in [11-24/0586r01](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0586-01-00bh-p802-11bh-d3-0-mdr-report-response.docx) for review during the next TGbh time slot. The technical editor will check for “magic numbers” in the draft that may need to be aligned/coordinated with any other revision/amendment projects.

**Meeting recessed at 3:30 p.m. MDT.**

**Meeting March 14th, 2024, 10:30 a.m. to 12:30 p.m. MDT**

**Chair: Mark Hamilton (Ruckus/CommScope)**

**Vice Chair: Peter Yee (NSA-CSD/AKAYLA)**

**Vice Chair: Stephen Orr (Cisco)**

**Secretary: Peter Yee**

**Editor: Carol Ansley (Cox Communications)**

**The mixed-mode meeting was called to order by the Chair at 10:31 a.m. MDT.**

Agenda slide deck [11-24/0262r06](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0262-06-00bh-agenda-tgbh-2024-march-plenary.pptx)

1. **Policies and procedures were presented by Chair Mark Hamilton. (Slides 4 to 15)**

There were no Patent declarations.

Copyright policy slides were presented (Slides 11 and 12)

1. **Agenda**

* **Attendance, noises/recording, meeting protocol**
* **Policies, duty to inform, participation rules**
* **Organization topics:**
  + March Plenary meetings: Tuesday, 13:30-15:30; Thursday 10:30-12:30
  + Timeline reminder (slide 18)
  + Motions record: [11-22/0651r38](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0651-38-00bh-tgbh-motions-list.pptx)
* **Comments, MDR Resolutions, ANA assignments and EC Report, finalize**
  + Review disposition of LB283 comments, Comment resolution document: [11-24/0380r2](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0380-02-00bh-ieee-802-11bh-lb283-comments.xlsx)
  + Review MDR comments response/disposition: [11-24/0586r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0586-01-00bh-p802-11bh-d3-0-mdr-report-response.docx)
  + ANA assignments, per Editor’s report
  + Update to bit assignments (11be conflict): [11-24/0539r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0539-00-00bh-bit-assignment-of-optional-subelement-ids-for-beacon-request.pptx)
* **Review EC Report:** [**11-24/0181r2**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0181-02-00bh-tgbh-report-to-ec-on-conditional-approval-to-go-to-sa-ballot.pptx)
* **Comment resolution approval motion (see Motions deck)**
* **Recirc, and SA Ballot start motions (see Motions deck)**

The motion was accepted by unanimous consent.

1. **Timeline review**

A recirculation ballot will be undertaken coming out of this meeting. An IEEE SA ballot is then expected for next month. All of this will require the technical editor to create Draft 4.0 by 22 March. The IEEE 802.11 WG chair will then need to start the recirculation ballot on the 22nd to close 15 days later. There will then be an ad hoc Comment Resolution Committee (CRC) teleconference on 9 April (Tuesday, 9:30 a.m. EDT). Hopefully, the SA ballot will start on 10 April to close 10 May. If the WG chair can turn around the received comments by 13 May, the task group can address them during the Warsaw interim session (12-17 May). A face-to-face ad hoc might then be held 18-20 June at CommScope, Sunnyvale, CA for the resolution of initial SA ballot comments. That ad hoc meeting is to be confirmed.

1. **Review of comment resolution document**

No one requested a review of the updated comment resolution document ([11-24/0380r02](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0380-02-00bh-ieee-802-11bh-lb283-comments.xlsx)).

1. **MDR comment response/disposition**

There were no requests to review the updated MDR comment response/disposition ([11-24/0586r01](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0586-01-00bh-p802-11bh-d3-0-mdr-report-response.docx)).

1. **ANA assignments**

There appear to be no concerns over the current ANA assignments.

1. **Update to bit assignments**

The bit assignments in [11-24/0539r00](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0539-00-00bh-bit-assignment-of-optional-subelement-ids-for-beacon-request.pptx) are fine according to Carol Ansley, the technical editor.

1. **EC Report**

Mark Hamilton displayed the EC report [11-24/0181r02](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0181-02-00bh-tgbh-report-to-ec-on-conditional-approval-to-go-to-sa-ballot.pptx), which will be used to obtain approval to a conditional SA ballot.

1. **Motions**

Motion #31 from [11-22/0651r037](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0651-37-00bh-tgbh-motions-list.pptx) was given. It reads:

Approve the following:

* Resolutions to all CIDs on LB283, per the resolutions recorded in [11-24/0380r2](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0380-02-00bh-ieee-802-11bh-lb283-comments.xlsx)
* Change to use the values 166 and 167 in Table 9-141 (Optional subelement IDs for Beacon request) for “IRM Recommendation” and “Measurement ID”, respectively, as described in: [11-24/0539r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0539-00-00bh-bit-assignment-of-optional-subelement-ids-for-beacon-request.pptx)
* Incorporate changes per the MDR findings, as recorded here: [11-24/0586r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0586-01-00bh-p802-11bh-d3-0-mdr-report-response.docx)
* Update the <ANA> assignments, as provided by the ANA

and direct the Editor to incorporate all the above text changes into the latest TGbh draft

This motion was made by Stephen McCann (Huawei) and seconded by Peter Yee. It was approved by unanimous consent.

Motion #32 was offered. It reads:

Having approved comment resolutions for all of the comments received from LB 283 on P802.11bh D3.0, as contained in 11-24/0380r2,

Instruct the editor to prepare P802.11bh D4.0 incorporating those changes, and

Approve a 15 day Working Group Recirculation Ballot asking the question “Should P802.11bh D4.0 be forwarded to SA Ballot?”

The motion was made by Stephen Orr (Cisco) and seconded by Carol Ansley. The motion passed with voting results of 11/0/1 (Y/N/A).

Motion #33 was shown. It reads:

Approve document [11-24/0181r2](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0181-02-00bh-tgbh-report-to-ec-on-conditional-approval-to-go-to-sa-ballot.pptx) as the report to the IEEE 802 Executive Committee (EC) on the requirements for conditional approval to forward P802.11bh D4.0 to SA Ballot.

The motion was made by Peter Yee and seconded by Luther Smith. The motion passed on a vote of 11/0/0.

The next motion was #34, reading:

Request the IEEE 802 Executive Committee to conditionally approve forwarding P802.11bh D4.0 to SA Ballot.

Jerome Henry made the motion, which was seconded by Stephen Orr. The motion passed with a 10/1/0 vote.

Motion #35 was shown. It reads:

Re-affirm the P802.11bh PAR in document <https://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/11/PARs/P802.11bh.pdf>

This motion was made by Stephen McCann and seconded by Peter Yee. The vote on this motion was 10/0/1, which passed.

Next, Motion #36 was made, reading:

Re-affirm the P802.11bh CSD in document <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/22/ec-22-0088-00-ACSD-p802-11bh.pdf>

Peter Yee moved this motion, which was seconded by Jerome Henry. The motion passed on voting results of 11/0/1.

All of these motions will be confirmed offline by the task group chair to ensure that only the votes of IEEE 802.11 voters are counted.

1. **Forward planning**

The teleconference plan appears reasonable. For the May interim meeting, 4 or 5 slots will be requested. This may be a tough request given competition for slots (and attendees) from TGbi, TGbe, and TGbn. The goal will be creation of a Draft 5.0 and start of the first recirculation SA ballot.

**The meeting was adjourned at 11:17 a.m. MDT.**