IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes for TGbe MAC Ad-Hoc teleconferences in January and March 2024 | | | | |
| Date: 2024-02-07 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Liwen Chu | NXP |  |  |  |
| Jeongki Kim | Ofinno |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains the meeting minutes for the TGbe MAC ad hoc teleconferences held in January 2024 and March 2024.

Revisions:

* Rev0:
  + Added the minutes from the telephone conferences held on February 07,
  + Added the minutes from the telephone conferences held on February 21,
  + Added the minutes from the telephone conferences held on March 06,

**Wednesday 07 Februray 2024, 10:00am – 12:00pm ET (TGbe MAC ad hoc conference call)**

Chairman: Jeongki Kim (Ofinno)

Secretary: Liwen Chu (NXP)

This meeting took place using a webex session.

**Introduction**

1. The Chair (Jeongki, Ofinno) calls the meeting to order at 10:02am EDT. The Chair introduces himself and the Secretary, Liwen (NXP)
2. The Chair goes through the 802 and 802.11 IPR policy and procedures and asks if there is anyone that is aware of any potentially essential patents.
   1. Nobody responds.
3. The Chair goes through the IEEE copyright policy.
4. The Chair recommends using IMAT for recording the attendance.
   * Please record your attendance during the conference call by using the IMAT system:
     1. 1) login to [imat](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), 2) select “802.11 Telecons (<Month>)” entry, 3) select “C/LM/WG802.11 Attendance” entry, 4) click “TGbe <MAC/PHY/Joint> conference call that you are attending.
   * If you are unable to record the attendance via [IMAT](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance) then please send an e-mail to Liwen Chu ([liwen.chu@nxp.com](mailto:liwen.chu@nxp.com)) and Jeongki Kim ([jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com](mailto:jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com))

**Recorded attendance through Imat and e-mail:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Asterjadhi, Alfred | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Bahn, Christy | IEEE STAFF |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | baron, stephane | Canon Research Centre France |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Baykas, Tuncer | Ofinno |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Bredewoud, Albert | Broadcom Corporation |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Carney, William | Sony Group Corporation |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | CHENG, yajun | Xiaomi Communications Co., Ltd. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Chisci, Giovanni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Chung, Chulho | SAMSUNG |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Dong, Xiandong | Xiaomi Communications Co., Ltd. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Fang, Yonggang | Mediatek |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Fischer, Matthew | Broadcom Corporation |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Fujimori, Yuki | Canon Research Centre France |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Gupta, Binita | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Huang, Po-Kai | Intel |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Jang, Insun | LG ELECTRONICS |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Klein, Arik | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Li, Weiyi | Spreadtrum Communication USA, Inc |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Lorgeoux, Mikael | Canon Research Centre France |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Lou, Hanqing | InterDigital, Inc. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Miwa, Shinya | Canon Research Centre France |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Naik, Gaurang | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Ng, Boon Loong | SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Palayur, Saju | Maxlinear Inc |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Park, Minyoung | Intel |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Patil, Abhishek | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Patwardhan, Gaurav | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Qi, Yue | Samsung Research America |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Quan, Yingqiao | Spreadtrum |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Ratnam, Vishnu | Samsung Research America |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Ryu, Kiseon | NXP Semiconductors |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Sosack, Robert | Molex Incorporated |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Talarico, Salvatore | Sony Corporation |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Wang, Qi | Apple Inc. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Wullert, John | Peraton Labs |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Xia, Qing | Sony Corporation |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Yang, Jay | ZTE Corporation |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Yano, Kazuto | Advanced Telecommunications Research Institute International (ATR) |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Yee, James | MediaTek Inc. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/7 | Yoon, Yelin | LG ELECTRONICS |

1. The Chair announces that the Initial SA ballot for TGbe D5.0 has closed with the Approval rate being 82%, and reminds that the agenda can be found in 11-24/0206r2. The Chair asks for the comments about the agenda. No comments are received. The proposed agenda is approved.

* Submissions:
  1. Editors report: [11-24/255r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0255-01-00be-tgbe-editor-s-report-on-initial-sa-ballot.ppt) Edward Au

The editor goes through 11-24/255r1.

Discussion:

C: I go through the security comments. Three of them should be allocated to Jay.

A: ok.

C: 22249 should be allocated to me, I have another similar comment.

A: ok. Po-kai mentions that he will review the CID in chat window.

* 1. Complete Comment Assignments from MAC tab: 11-24/254r0

The editor mentions that he has done the assignment for all CIDs. The chair agrees to skip this item.

* 1. The chair goes through the guidelines for the POCs. No comments are received
  2. [24/256](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0256-00-00be-proposed-resolution-for-miscellaneous-comments-on-initial-sa-ballot-on-d5-0.docx)r0 CR for misc. comments on init. SA ballot on D5.0 Edward Au [21C]

Discussion:

C: 22219. The ”in MLMR mode” should not be removed.

A: we can do offline discussion for updating the text to satisfy the commenter instead of agree with the comment.

C: 22270. Do we know whether the comment matches the real pages because of the wrong page number in the draft?

A: when allocating the comments, I have adjusted the page numbers already.

C: 22011. The reason for “or” is to address the two cases, MLD case and non-MLD case. The similar usage of “or” is in miultiple places.

A: will do offline checking with commenter.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-24/256r1 for the following CIDs?

22237, 22042, 22199, 22200, ~~22219,~~ 22004, 22270, 22198, ~~22011~~, 22006, 22223

, 22263, 22387, 22386, 22238, 22274, 22275, 22359, 22368, 22371, 22372

No Objection

* 1. [24/258](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0258-00-00be-proposed-resolution-for-miscellaneous-comments-on-initial-sa-ballot-on-d5-0-part-2.docx)r0 CR for misc. comments on init. SA ballot on D5.0–p2 Edward Au [11C]

Discussion:

C: 22366. It should be changed to ”zero or one Resourec Descriptor”

A: ok.

C: The commenter talks about baseline text. It should be addressed in 11me. Otherwise we should update all the related places.

C: We should reject the comment. The text should mention 0, 1 or more descriptors.

A: will defer 22366.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-24/258r1 for the following CIDs?

22221, 22324, ~~22366,~~ 22365, 22323, 22392, 22402, 22357, 22389, 22268, 22314

No Objection

The chair asks whether there is any other business before adjouruning the call. No response is received. The meeting is adjourned at 11:05am.

**Wednesday 21 Februray 2024, 10:00am – 12:00pm ET (TGbe MAC ad hoc conference call)**

Chairman: Jeongki Kim (Ofinno)

Secretary: Liwen Chu (NXP)

This meeting took place using a webex session.

**Introduction**

1. The Chair (Jeongki, Ofinno) calls the meeting to order at 10:02am EDT. The Chair introduces himself and the Secretary, Liwen (NXP)
2. The Chair goes through the 802 and 802.11 IPR policy and procedures and asks if there is anyone that is aware of any potentially essential patents.
   1. Nobody responds.
3. The Chair goes through the IEEE copyright policy.
4. The Chair recommends using IMAT for recording the attendance.
   * Please record your attendance during the conference call by using the IMAT system:
     1. 1) login to [imat](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), 2) select “802.11 Telecons (<Month>)” entry, 3) select “C/LM/WG802.11 Attendance” entry, 4) click “TGbe <MAC/PHY/Joint> conference call that you are attending.
   * If you are unable to record the attendance via [IMAT](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance) then please send an e-mail to Liwen Chu ([liwen.chu@nxp.com](mailto:liwen.chu@nxp.com)) and Jeongki Kim ([jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com](mailto:jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com))

**Recorded attendance through Imat and e-mail:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Ajami, Abdel Karim | Apple Inc. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Asterjadhi, Alfred | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Baek, SunHee | LG ELECTRONICS |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Bahn, Christy | IEEE STAFF |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Bhattacharya, Abhijit | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Bredewoud, Albert | Broadcom Corporation |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | CHENG, yajun | Xiaomi Communications Co., Ltd. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Chisci, Giovanni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Chung, Chulho | SAMSUNG |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Dong, Xiandong | Xiaomi Communications Co., Ltd. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Fan, Shuang | Sanechips Technology Co., Ltd. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Fischer, Matthew | Broadcom Corporation |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Kakani, Naveen | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Klein, Arik | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Li, Weiyi | Spreadtrum Communication USA, Inc |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Naik, Gaurang | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Norouzi, Sara | Huawei Technologies Canada; Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Patil, Abhishek | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Petrick, Albert | InterDigital, Inc. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Qi, Yue | Samsung Research America |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Quan, Yingqiao | Spreadtrum |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Ryu, Kiseon | NXP Semiconductors |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Wang, Qi | Apple Inc. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Wang, Ying | InterDigital, Inc. |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Wullert, John | Peraton Labs |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Xia, Qing | Sony Corporation |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Yang, Jay | ZTE Corporation |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Yano, Kazuto | Advanced Telecommunications Research Institute International (ATR) |
| TGbe (MAC) | 2/21 | Zhou, Lei | H3C Technologies Co., Limited |

1. The Chair announces that the agenda can be found in 11-24/0206r4. The Chair asks for the comments about the agenda. No comments are received. The proposed agenda is approved.

* Submissions:
  1. [296r4](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0296-00-00be-cr-for-miscellaneous-cids.docx) CR for Miscellaneous CIDs Po-Kai Huang [24C]

Discussion:

C: 22010. We may need to add non-AP MLD associated AP MLD in one ESS move to another AP MLD in another ESS.

A: I see what you mean. Will add the related text.

C: 22034. Please defer it.

A: ok.

C: 22174. The commneter is correct and the comment should not be rejected.

A: will defer it.

C: 22157. The unless part should refer to the table instead of a specific reason.

A: the specific reason code is in line with the original text.

C: it is better to change ”unless...” to ”or”.

A: ok.

C: prefer the use of ”unless”

A: ok.

C: 22250. It is not clear how to use the status code.

A: will defer the CID.

C: 22027. Need more time to think about it. It is too restrictive.

A: will defer it

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-24/296r5 for the following CIDs?

22010, ~~22027,~~ 22164, 22228, 22220, 22232, 22233, 22319, 22012, 22201,

22009, 22338, 22401, 22325, 22172, ~~22034,~~ 22173, ~~22174,~~ 22175, 22304,

22305, 22169, 22170, 22157, ~~22250, 22343,~~ 22014

No Objection

* 1. [304r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0304-00-00be-d5-0-cr-for-ml-reconfiguration-part-1.docx) D5.0 CR for ML Reconfiguration part 1 Binita Gupta [42C]

Discussion:

C: 22019. The ”shall” is changed to ”may”. Do we have the rules about when the capability is not included.

A: yes as defined in the new text for CID 22020. For the MLD capabilities not being included, the original capability will be applied.

C: Agree that the text should be added about the case when the capability is not included.

A: will add the related text.

C: do we have MLD level capabilities? If not, the related element should be used instead.

A: we add one note to clarify the MLD capabilities.

C: note2 can be updated to clarify the MLD capabilities.

A: ok.

C: the added sentence is not accurate.

A: ok to change to most recent.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-24/ for the following CIDs?

The chair asks whether there is any other business before adjouruning the call. No response is received. The meeting is adjourned at 12:00pm.

**Wednesday 06 March 2024, 10:00am – 12:00pm ET (TGbe MAC ad hoc conference call)**

Chairman: Jeongki Kim (Ofinno)

Secretary: Liwen Chu (NXP)

This meeting took place using a webex session.

**Introduction**

1. The Chair (Jeongki, Ofinno) calls the meeting to order at 10:02am EDT. The Chair introduces himself and the Secretary, Liwen (NXP)
2. The Chair goes through the 802 and 802.11 IPR policy and procedures and asks if there is anyone that is aware of any potentially essential patents.
   1. Nobody responds.
3. The Chair goes through the IEEE copyright policy.
4. The Chair recommends using IMAT for recording the attendance.
   * Please record your attendance during the conference call by using the IMAT system:
     1. 1) login to [imat](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), 2) select “802.11 Telecons (<Month>)” entry, 3) select “C/LM/WG802.11 Attendance” entry, 4) click “TGbe <MAC/PHY/Joint> conference call that you are attending.
   * If you are unable to record the attendance via [IMAT](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance) then please send an e-mail to Liwen Chu ([liwen.chu@nxp.com](mailto:liwen.chu@nxp.com)) and Jeongki Kim ([jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com](mailto:jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com))

**Recorded attendance through Imat and e-mail:**

1. The Chair reminds that the agenda can be found in 11-24/0206r8. The Chair asks for the comments about the agenda. No comments are received. The proposed agenda is approved.

* Submissions:
  1. [289r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0289-01-00be-tgbe-sa1-security-comment-resolutions.docx) TGbe SA1 Security Comment Resolutions Mike Montemurro [12C]

Discussion:

C: 22239, it seems you add reassociation, right?

A: yes.

C: agree with the resolution. The sentense is related to affiliated STA.

C: the added sentense doesn’t cover the case that a non-AP MLD removes and adds the link back.

A: agree that it should be clarified. It should be coverred by another comment.

C: 22247. Have some concern of TPK that mentions AP MLD of the previous comment. PN assignment of TPK should not be done by AP MLD.

A: ok will accept the comment.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-24/289r2 for the following CIDs?

22013, 22239, 22242, 22243, 22244, 22245, 22246, 22247, 22101, 22361, 22362, 22363, 22379, 22380

No Objection

* 1. [298r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0298-01-00be-tgbe-sa1-eapol-key-notation-cleanup.docx) TGbe SA1 EAPOL Key notation cleanup Mike Montemurro [1C]

Discussion:

None

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-24/298r1 for the following CIDs?

22012

No Objection

* 1. [300r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0300-00-00be-proposed-resolutions-for-cid-22382-cid-22383.docx) Prop. Res. for CID-22382 & CID-22383 Salvatore Talarico [2C]

Discussion:

C: 22382. While I understand the intention, the added text may create maintaining issue, i.e. the exception of the other cases like Beacon.

A: the added text is self-contained. Don’t understand your concern.

C: prefer not to explicitly mention the exception. You can make changes in Beacon paragraph.

A: You still need to refer to R-TWT subclause. However ok to defer the CID.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-24/ for the following CIDs?

SP deferred

* 1. [363r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0363-00-00be-saballotd5-0-cid22216.docx) SABallotD5.0 CID22216 Thomas Derham [1C]

The contributor is not in the call.

* 1. [293r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0293-01-00be-sa-ballot-cr-for-35-3-7-5-2.docx) SA ballot: CR for 35.3.7.5.2 Arik Klein [9C]

Discussion:

C: 22061. Please change ”Disassociation” to ”disassociation”.

A: will check with the editor.

C: 22061. It is not clear whether the whole paragraph is for unicast only. The rules in the paragraph are ok for unicast BTM request. In your responding email you mentioned that the frame can be broadcast frame.

A: the point is that the Disassociation is unicast frame while the BYM Request is unicast frame. can defer it.

C: 22060. You shouldn’t just delete Link Removal Imminent field. The whole sentence should be deleted.

A: the group agree to delete Link Removal Imminent field previously.

C: I think the group had the discussion and would like to keep Link Removal Imminent field.

C: please defer 22060 and 22059 for the further discussion.

A: ok.

C: 22036. It seems we don’t want to change the paragraph.

A: the proposed change doesn’t follow what the commenter asked.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-24/ for the following CIDs?

SP deferred

* 1. [294r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/24/11-24-0294-00-00be-sa-ballot-cr-for-35-3-7-5.docx) SA ballot: CR for 35.3.7.5 Arik Klein [6C]

Discussion:

C: 22282. Not clear this acception. Prefer the keep the text simple.

A: The transition to state 2 in 11.3.5.8 for AP disassociation is not applied to MLD. Will defer the CID.

C: 22283. The commenter asked to add some sentense. Did you add it?

A: no. Don’t think it is necessary.

C: it seems 22057 is related deferred CID, right?

A: 22057 is fine.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-24/ for the following CIDs?

SP deferred

The chair asks whether there is any other business before adjouruning the call. No response is received. The meeting is adjourned at 12:00pm.