IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| TGbe November January Teleconference Minutes |
| Date: 2023-12-20 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jason Yuchen Guo | Huawei |  |  | guoyuchen@huawei.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains the minutes for the IEEE 802.11 TGbe teleconferences from November 2023 to January 2024.

Revision history:

* Rev0: initial version of the document

Abbreviations:

* C: Comment.
* A: Answer.

# 1st Conf. Call: December 20 (10:00–12:00 ET)–JOINT

* The Chair, Alfred Asterjadhi (Qualcomm), calls the meeting to order
* Jason Yuchen Guo (Huawei) is serving as the Secretary
* IEEE 802 and 802.11 IPR policy and procedure
	+ **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**
		- Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or
		- Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
		- Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair. **Nobody speaks/writes up**.

* + **Copyright Policy: Participants are advised that**
		- IEEE SA’s copyright policy is described in [Clause 7](https://standards.ieee.org/about/policies/bylaws/sect6-7.html#7) of the IEEE SA Standards Board Bylaws and [Clause 6.1](https://standards.ieee.org/about/policies/opman/sect6.html) of the IEEE SA Standards Board Operations Manual;
		- Any material submitted during standards development, whether verbal, recorded, or in written form, is a Contribution and shall comply with the IEEE SA Copyright Policy
		- **Copyright Policy was presented.**
	+ **Patent, Participation, Copyright and policy related subclause:** Please refer to Patent And Procedures
* Attendance reminder.
	+ Participation slide: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/16/ec-16-0180-05-00EC-ieee-802-participation-slide.pptx>
	+ Please record your attendance during the conference call by using the IMAT system:
		- 1) login to [imat](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), 2) select “802.11 Telecons (<Month>)” entry, 3) select “C/LM/WG802.11 Attendance” entry, 4) click “<Joint TGbe > conference call that you are attending.
	+ If you are unable to record the attendance via [IMAT](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance) then please send an e-mail to Jason Y. Guo (guoyuchen@huawei.com) and Alfred Asterjadhi (asterjadhi@gmail.com)
	+ Please ensure that the following information is listed correctly when joining the call:
		- "[voter status] First Name Last Name (Affiliation)"
* Discussion on the Attendance:
	+ Subir mentioned that the IMAT system is not ready for members to log attendance.
	+ After discussion, the chair decides to run a SP to obtain the list of attendees
* Attendee list

Al Petrick Interdigital

 William Li, Spreadtrum-US

 Yonggang Fang

 Dong Wei, NXP

 Salvatore T. Sony

 Kiseon Ryu NXP

 Sang Kim, LGE

 Qing Xia, Sony

 Liwen Chu, NXP

 Po-Kai Huang, intel

 Matthew Fischer

 Li-Hsiang Sun, MediaTek

 Abhishek Patil Qualcomm Technologies Inc

 Sigurd Schelstraete MaxLinear

 Qi Wang

 Chunyu Hu Chunyu Hu

 Mark Hamilton, CommScope

 Jung Hoon Suh Huawei

 Bin Tian

 Rubayet Shafin, Samsung Research America

 Yue Qi, Samsung Research America

 Rui Cao, NXP

 Gaurav Patwardhan, HPE

 Brian Hart

 Gaurang Naik, Qualcomm

 Lin Yang Qualcomm

 Binita Gupta, Cisco Systems

 Minyoung Park, Intel

 Alice Jialing Li Chen Qualcomm

 Vishnu V Ratnam, Samsung Research America

 Duncan Ho Qualcomm Technologies, Inc

 You-Wei Chen, MediaTek

 Xiaogang Chen, Spreadtrum-US

 Youhan Kim, Qualcomm Technologies, Inc.

 Ross Jian Yu Huawei

 Dongguk Lim, LGE

 Gwangho Lee, KNUT

 SunHee Baek LGE

 Jinyoung Chun, LG

 Kazuto Yano, ATR

 Maolin Zhang, Huawei

 Jinsoo Choi LG

 Yelin Yoon, LGE

 Chulho Chung Samsung

 Yingqiao Quan, Spreadtrum

 Youngwan So

 Ming Gan Huawei

 Zhi Mao, Huawei

 Wei Lin Huawei

 Jay Yang [ZTE]

 Yue Zhao, Huawei

 Yunbo Li Huawei.com

 Guogang Huang Huawei

 Xiangxin Gu, Spreadtrum

 Jason Yuchen Guo Huawei

 Mengshi Hu Huawei

 Yan Xin, Huawei

 Jeongki Kim Ofinno

 Edward Au, Huawei

 Serhat Erkucuk, Ofinno

 Osama Aboul-Magd, Huawei

 Mike Montemurro Huawei

 Pascal Viger Canon

 Shaima Abidrabbu, VESTEL, IMU

 Romain GUIGNARD Canon

 Thomas Handte Sony

 Sawaira Rafaqat Ali IMU;Vestel

 Mikael LORGEOUX Canon

 Stephen McCann [Huawei]

 Patrice NEZOU, Canon

 Stephane Baron Canon

 Massinissa Lalam, Sagemcom

 Subir Peraton Labs

 Hanqing Lou InterDigital

 Xiaofei Wang InterDigital

 Sara Norouzi - Huawei

 John Wullert, Peraton Labs

 Laurent Cariou Intel

 Naveen Kakani, Qualcomm

* Announcements:
	+ WG LB280 passed with ~95% approval. A total of 195 comments received.
		- System reported 21 remaining Disapprove voters:
			* 14 voters kept their vote of Disapprove from LB275
			* 6 voters had changed their vote to Yes post LB275 (via e-mail) but did not update their vote (to Approve) via the system (LB280)
			* 1 new Disapprove vote.
		- Actual: 15 disapprove votes, which brings the approval rate to ~97%.
* Latest status: We have conditional approval for going to SA ballot with TGbe D5.0.
	+ Conditions that need to be satisfied (per section 12 in [LSMC operations manual](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/17/ec-17-0090-26-0PNP-ieee-802-lmsc-operations-manual.pdf)):
		- After resolution of the recirculation ballot is completed, the approval percentage is at least 75% and there are no new valid DISAPPROVE votes.
		- No technical changes, as determined by the Working Group Chair, were made as a result of the recirculation ballot.
		- No new valid DISAPPROVE comments on new issues that are not resolved to the satisfaction of the submitter from existing DISAPPROVE voters.
		- If the Working Group Chair determines that there is a new invalid DISAPPROVE comment or vote, the Working Group Chair shall promptly provide details to the IEEE 802 LMSC.
		- The Working Group Chair shall immediately report the results of the ballot to the IEEE 802 LMSC including: the date the ballot closed, vote tally and comments associated with any remaining disapproves (valid and invalid), the Working Group responses and the rationale for ruling any vote invalid.
		- We are operating as a comment resolution committee (CRC) for this call.
* Editor’s Report – [11-23/2210r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2210-00-00be-tgbe-editor-s-report-on-lb280.ppt)
	+ The Editor went through the comment status for LB280
	+ There are 8 comments requiring discussion, 6 of them are “must be satisfied”
* Comment Resolutions (subject to ongoing updates):
	+ A list of CIDs have been withdrawn (refer to CIDs listed in Motion 670)
	+ A list of CIDs are pending (refer to CIDs listed in Motion 671)
		- Discuss CIDs in [11-23/2208r2](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2208-01-00be-ieee-802-11be-lb280-comments.xlsx) with Status “Resolution Drafted” and that do not have “Conditional Withdrawal”.
	+ A list of CIDs are classified as conditional withdrawal (refer to Motion 672)
	+ Discussions for certain CIDs
		- CID 21084
			* C: Mark is OK with the rejection, but is willing to bring the CID back in the SA ballot.
		- CID 21087
			* C: Mark is OK with the rejection, but want to see if there’s any immediate feedback on this issue
			* C: Po-kai mentioned that there are other places with the same issue, need to have a global check
		- CID 21088
			* C: Brian echos Mark on this issue
			* C: Mike mentioned that SA ballot is a good chance to make the change
		- CID 21089
			* C: Brian mentioned that there should be multiple PLME
		- Concluded discussions on these CIDs.
			* Chair asks commenter if he is okay with these rejections. Commenter indicates that he is okay and will plan to resubmit during SA ballot.
			* Chair asks commenter to send e-mail. Commenter confirms.
* Motions: [11-23/442r36](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0442-36-00be-tgbe-motions-list-part-4.pptx)

**Motion 670 (Withdrawal)**

**Move to approve “Rejected” resolutions to the CIDs:**

* 21136, 21137, 21138, 21139, 21140, 21141, 21142, 21143, 21144, 21145, 21146, 21147, 21148, 21149, 21150, 21151, 21152, 21153, 21154 *(****Al Petrick****) &* 21075, 21076, 21077, 21078 *(****Liwen****) &* 21006, 21007, 21008, 21010, 21028 *(****Thomas****) [28 CIDs]*
* 21018 *(****Weiyi****) &* 21000 *(****Xiaogang****) &* 21009, 21011, 21012, 21013 *(****Takuhiro****) &* 21015, 21016, 21017 ***(Qing)*** *[9 CIDs]*
* 21032, 21033, 21034, 21035, 21036, 21037, 21038, 21039, 21040, 21041, 21042, 21043 *(****Xiangdong****) [12 CIDs]*
* 21093, 21094, 21095, 21096, 21097, 21098, 21099, 21100 *(****Kazuto****) &* 21060 *(****Massinissa****) & 21014* ***(Yusuke)*** *[10 CIDs]*
* 21001, 21002, 21003, 21004, 21005 *(****Lei Zhou****) &* 21020 *(****Xiangxin Gu****) &* 21059, 21073, 21074 *(****Stephane****) [9 CIDs]*
* 21021, 21022, 21023, 21024, 21025, 21026, 21027 *(****Yingqiao****) & 21053, 21054 (****Mickael****) & 21029* ***(Henry)****[10 CIDs]*
* 21044, 21045, 21046, 21047, 21048, 21049, 21050, 21051 *(****Pascal****) & 21072 (****Guido****) & 21052 (****Romain****)[10 CIDs]*
* 21101, 21102, 21103, 21104, 21105, 21106, 21107, 21108, 21109, 21110, 21111, 21112, 21113, 21114, 21115, 21116, 21117, 21118, 21119, 21120, 21121, 21122, 21123, 21124, 21125, 21126, 21127, 21128, 21129, 21130, 21131, 21132, 21133, 21134, 21135, 21155, 21156, 21157, 21158, 21159, 21160, 21161, 21181, 21182, 21183, 21184 (***Rubayet***) *[46 CIDs]*
* 21079, 21080, 21081, 21082, 21083, 21085, 21086, 21090 ***(Mark H.)*** & 21030, 21031 **(Qi)** *[10 CIDs]*
* 21055, 21056, 21057, 21058, 21162, 21163, 21164, 21165, 21166, 21167, 21168, 21169, 21185, 21186, 21187, 21188, 21189, 21190, 21191, 21192, 21193, 21194 ***(Liuming)*** *[22 CIDs]*

**With the following rejection reason: “The commenter has withdrawn the comment”.**

**Move: Edward Au Second: Subir Das**

**Discussion: None**

**Result: Approved with unanimas consent**

**Note: These are CIDs for which the commenters have already sent an e-mail requesting withdrawal of the CIDs.**

**Motion 671 (Withdrawal)**

**Move to approve “Rejected” resolutions to the CIDs:**

* 21079, 21080, 21081, 21082, 21083, 21085, 21086, 21090 ***(Mark H.)*** & 21030, 21031 **(Qi)** *[10 CIDs]*
* 21055, 21056, 21057, 21058, 21162, 21163, 21164, 21165, 21166, 21167, 21168, 21169, 21185, 21186, 21187, 21188, 21189, 21190, 21191, 21192, 21193, 21194 ***(Liuming)*** *[22 CIDs]*
* 21019***(Youhan)*** *&* 21061, 21062, 21063, 21064, 21065, 21066, 21067, 21068, 21069 ***(Brian)*** *[10 CIDs]*
* 21170, 21171, 21172, 21173, 21174, 21175, 21176, 21177, 21178, 21179, 21180 ***(Binita)*** *[11 CIDs]*

**With the following rejection reason: “The commenter withdrew the comment”.**

**Move: Stephen McCann Second: Brian Hart**

**Discussion: None.**

**Result: Approved with unanimous consent.**

**Motion 672**

**Move to approve resolutions for all the comments received from WG LB280 on TGbe D5.0 as contained in** [**11-23/2208r3**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2208-03-00be-ieee-802-11be-lb280-comments.xlsx)

**Move: Mike Montemurro Second: Laurent Cariou**

**Discussion: None.**

**Result: Approved with unanimous consent.**

**SA Ballot Motion**

**Approve a 30 day Initial SA Ballot asking the question “Should TGbe Draft 5.0 be forwarded to RevCom?”**

**Moved: Subir Das Seconded: Abhishek Patil**

**Preliminary Result: 51Y, 0N, 2A (pass)**

**Result: 51Y, 0N, 2A (pass)**

Note: the voting details of this motion will be recorded for attendance purpose. No response will also be recorded for the attendance purpose.

Other discussions:

Q: When will the SA ballot start?

A: Try to do it in this week.

C: the reason of asking is that the following days are holidays.

Q: will tomorrow’s call be canceled?

A: will check with Dorothy, and send an email to cancel the call in 8 hours

C: the ballot can be longer than 30 days

A: Chair will check with WG leadership

* Plan for the Jan F2F meeting

The chair suggests that the group can have some discussions on certains aspects assuming the comments are there.

C: why not take a rest.

A: we need to reach the timeline.

C: understand that the purpose is to avoid the duplicate discussion, but we do need to spend some time to discuss the SA ballot comments, rather than pointing to a previous discussion.

* AoB: None
* Adjourned at 11:55