IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes for REVme Telecon December 15, 2023 | | | | |
| Date: 2023-12-15 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Stephen McCann | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd | Southampton, UK |  | stephen.mccann@ieee.org |

Abstract

Minutes for the TGme (REVme) Telecon for 15th December, 2023

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Wednesday, December 15, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order** 10:02 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
      1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
      2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
      3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Editor - Edward AU (Huawei)
      5. Secretary pro-tem – Stephen MCCANN (Huawei)
   3. **Telecon Attendance:**
      1. IMAT Reported**:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Name** | **Affiliation** |
| 1 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| 2 | Wei, Dong | NXP Semiconductors |
| 3 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 4 | Derham, Thomas | Broadcom Corporation |
| 5 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 6 | Yan, Peng | Wi-Fi Alliance |
| 7 | Halasz, David | Morse Micro |
| 8 | Hart, Brian | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
| 9 | Qi, Emily | Intel |
| 10 | Lungu, Alexandru | Samsung |
| 11 | Orr, Stephen | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
| 12 | Asterjadhi, Alfred | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| 13 | Huang, Po-Kai | Intel |
| 14 | Patwardhan, Gaurav | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
| 15 | Kneckt, Jarkko | Apple, Inc. |
| 16 | Gupta, Binita | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
| 17 | Rodriguez, Stephen | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
| 18 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
| 19 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 20 | Liu, Yong | Apple, Inc. |
| 21 | Ptasinski, Henry | Element78 Communications LLC |
| 22 | Petrick, Albert | Jones-Petrick and Associates, LLC. |

* 1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
     1. No issues noted.
  2. **Review Agenda:**
  3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2103-04-000m-november-january-teleconference-agenda.docx>
     1. Proposed Agenda:

**The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance> ), and patent and copyright policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA ([patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org)); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. **Copyright Policy:**

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c.**Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides: See slides 9-20 in** <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>

d.**Agenda Approval**

2.       **Editor report** – Emily QI/Edward AU

3.       **Motions**

* + 1. Doc 11-23/0024 slides 34 – 42

4.       **Comment Resolution**

* + 1. CID 6033 – doc 11-23/2074 – Halasz (Morse Micro)
    2. CID 6054 (MAC) – doc 11-23/1777 – Ptasinski (Morse Micro)
    3. PHY review/discuss CIDs

5.       **AOB**

6. **Adjourn**

* + 1. No objection to approving the agenda.
  1. **Motions:**  11-23/0024r15
     1. Motion 123: EDITOR1, EDITOR2 CIDs
        1. **Approve the comment resolutions in the**
        2. **“Motion ED2-SA1-03” (6 CIDs) tab in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1746-04-000m-revme-sa-ballot-1-ed2-ad-hoc-comments.xlsx**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1746-04-000m-revme-sa-ballot-1-ed2-ad-hoc-comments.xlsx)**,**
        3. **and incorporate the text changes into the TGme draft.**
        4. C: Regarding CID 6026, this seems to conflict with another CID. Please can you remove it from the motion.
        5. This pulls ED1 document entirely.
        6. CID 6026 (ED1): More work required. Bring back in January interim. Assign to Mark R.
        7. Moved: Emily Qi, 2nd: Stephen McCann
        8. Result: Unanimous Consent
     2. Motion 124 - GEN, MAC, PHY, SEC CIDs
        1. **Approve the comment resolutions in the**
        2. **“GEN Motion D” tab (6 CIDs),**
        3. **Adopting the resolution to CID 6419 to be the same as the resolution to CID 6483. in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1768-03-000m-revme-gen-ad-hoc-comments-on-sb.xlsx**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1768-01-000m-revme-gen-ad-hoc-comments-on-sb.xlsx)**,**
        4. **“Motion MAC-BJ” tab (39 CIDs), with the exception of CID 6016, 6017, 6169, 6261, 6509, 6588, and update the resolution to CID 6289 changing, “request.” to “requests.” in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2032-03-000m-revme-mac-sa-comments.xls**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2032-03-000m-revme-mac-sa-comments.xls)**,**
        5. **“PHY Motion 2” tab (2 CIDs) in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0727-28-000m-revme-phy-comments.xls**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0727-28-000m-revme-phy-comments.xls)**,**
        6. **“SEC Motion B” tab (24 CIDs) with the exception of CID 6085 in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1755-02-000m-revme-sa-0-sec-adhoc-comments.xlsx**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1755-02-000m-revme-sa-0-sec-adhoc-comments.xlsx)**,**
        7. **and incorporate the text changes into the TGme draft.**
        8. C: please can you remove CID 6085 (SEC) from this motion
        9. C: I have some concerns about the channel switch announcement.
        10. C: CID 6419 is also incorrect. CID 6483 (SEC) has the correct resolution. Can the editor use the CID 6483 resolution for CID 6419 (GEN), as it needs to have the capitalization aligned with CID 6483 in SEC.
        11. The "good" resolution is: In 12.7.6.2, in the Processing for PTK generation bullet list item (a), add after "Generates a new nonce SNonce", ", if no SNonce has yet been generated for this 4-way handshake. The same SNonce is reused within this 4-way handshake until a valid message 3 has been received".
        12. C: CID 6261 is not clear and should be removed. More work required. Bring back on Jan 8. Assign to Mark H.
        13. C: CID 6509 is also removed. More work required. Bring back in January interim. Assign to Mark R.
        14. C: CID 6588 should be rejected. More work required. Bring back in January interim. Assign to Mark R.
        15. C: CID 6289, there’s an “s” missing in the resolution. Change the resolution to make "request" (at the end of the changed text) to be plural (requests).
        16. Chair: Ok, we can update the motion text.
        17. Q: Can a STA send the channel switch announcement at any time?
        18. A: Yes, as the current text does not prevent this.
        19. Q: Ok, I’d prefer to remove CIDs 6016, 6017, 6169 please.
        20. Chair: ok, so CIDs 6016, 6017, 6169 are more work required. Bring back in January interim. Assign to Youhan Kim.
        21. Moved: Stephen McCann, 2nd: Jouni Malinen
        22. Result: Unanimous Consent
     3. Motion 125 - CID 6140 – Hex case
        1. **Approve the resolution for CID 6140 on the “GEN Motion Hex Case” tab in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1768-03-000m-revme-sb1-ed1-ad-hoc-comments.xlsx**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1768-03-000m-revme-sb1-ed1-ad-hoc-comments.xlsx)**, and instruct the editor to incorporate the changes into the REVme draft.**
        2. Moved: Stephen McCann, 2nd: Steve Rodriguez
        3. C: What is this CID 6140 about?
        4. A: This is about changing lower case hex to upper case
        5. C: I’d like to note that the voting status of people in the participants window is not clear
        6. Chair: Noted.
        7. Result: Yes:6, No: 5, Abstain: 11 (motion fails)
        8. Chair: I’ll create a rejection reason and bring this CID back in January interim. Assign to Mike M.
     4. Motion 126 - CID 6167 – TDLS cipher suite negotiation
        1. **Approve the resolution for CID 6167 on the “SEC Motion – CID 6167” tab in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1755-02-000m-revme-sa-0-sec-adhoc-comments.xlsx**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1755-02-000m-revme-sa-0-sec-adhoc-comments.xlsx)**, and instruct the editor to incorporate the changes into the next REVme draft**
        2. Moved: Stephen McCann, 2nd: Mark Hamilton
        3. C: Can we correct the CID reference in the motion text from 6147 to 6167 please?
        4. Chair: Oh, yes.
        5. C: Why has this been changed from “indicating” to “shall be used”? The STA seems to be setting a value for the AP.
        6. A: Although this is a TDLS peer STA, so I think it’s ok.
        7. C: This is related to 11az.
        8. Result: Unanimous Consent
     5. Motion 127 - CID 6100 and 6101 – Clause xref update
        1. **Approve the resolution for CIDs 6100 and 6101 on the “SEC Motion CID 6100 and 6101” tab in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1755-02-000m-revme-sa-0-sec-adhoc-comments.xlsx**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1755-02-000m-revme-sa-0-sec-adhoc-comments.xlsx)**, and instruct the editor to incorporate the changes into the next REVme draft.**
        2. Moved: Edward Au, 2nd: Joseph Levy
        3. C: I think this is a change to deprecated text and I don’t support the motion.
        4. C: However, these are cross references.
        5. C: Yes, REVme broke these references, so they should be fixed.
        6. Result: Yes: 11, No: 2, Abstain: 6 (motion passes)
     6. Motion 128 - CID 6076 – 6GHz operation related
        1. **Approve the resolution for CID 6076 on the “PHY Motion 2b” tab in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0727-28-000m-revme-phy-comments.xls**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0727-28-000m-revme-phy-comments.xls)**, and instruct the editor to incorporate the changes into the next REVme draft.**
        2. Moved: Brian Hart, 2nd: Stephen McCann
        3. C: This is about transmit power and AFC parameter signalling
        4. Result: Unanimous Consent
     7. Motion 129 - Doc 11-23/2146 – PMKSA for PASN
        1. **Approve the changes in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2146-00-000m-pmksa-from-pasn-for-pmksa-caching.docx**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2146-00-000m-pmksa-from-pasn-for-pmksa-caching.docx)**, and instruct the editor to incorporate the changes into the next REVme draft.**
        2. Moved: Emily Qi, 2nd: Jouni Malinen
        3. Result: Unanimous Consent
     8. Motion 130 - CID 6085 – Protected Password Identifiers
        1. **Approve the resolution for CID 6085 on the “SEC Motion B” tab in** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1755-02-000m-revme-sa-0-sec-adhoc-comments.xlsx**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1755-02-000m-revme-sa-0-sec-adhoc-comments.xlsx)**.**
        2. C: This is about CID 6085 for the protected password identifier.
        3. Moved: Yong Liu, 2nd: Stephen McCann
        4. Q: In the database, the resolution is “reject”. Is that correct?
        5. A: Yes
        6. Result: Yes: 16, No: 1, Abstain: 16 (Motion passes)
     9. Motion 131 - CID 6026
        1. **Approve the changes shown under “Proposed Resolution” for CID 6026 in 11-23/1747r5** [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1747-05-000m-proposed-resolutions-for-revme-sb1-ed1-comments.docx**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1747-05-000m-proposed-resolutions-for-revme-sb1-ed1-comments.docx)
        2. C: This is about CID 6085 for the protected password identifier.
        3. Moved: Emily Qi, 2nd: Yong Liu
        4. Result: Unanimous Consent
  2. **Review doc 11-23/2074r3** – Dave Halasz (Morse Micro)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2074-03-000m-cids6032-6033.docx>
     2. CID 6033 (MAC)
        1. Review Comments.
        2. C: I think some of this bitmap control field description is redundant, as that’s what the figure shows.
        3. C: The main change is regarding the word “Traffic Indicator”.
        4. Chair: This draft has been through mandatory editorial review.
        5. C: The first sentence is duplicating the contents of the Figure 9-193 that is no longer required.
        6. C: I think that the text is ok and should be changed in another way.
        7. REVISED (MAC: 2023-12-15 16:24:08Z): Incorporate the changes shown in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2074-03-000m-cids6032-6033.docx> for CID 6033.
        8. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* 1. **Review doc 11-23-1777r7** – Henry PTASINSKI (Morse Micro)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1777-07-000m-s1g-beacon-protection-text.docx>.
     2. CID 6054 (MAC)
        1. Review Comments.
        2. Q: There were some other editorial comments in your submission.
        3. A: These were addressed.
        4. Chair: However, the CID is not about changing the IEEE 802.11 header.
        5. REVISED (MAC: 2023-12-07 19:40:31Z): Incorporate the changes in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1777-07-000m-s1g-beacon-protection-text.docx>.
        6. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  2. **PHY database comments** – Mark Rison (Samsung)
     1. CID 6052 (PHY)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. C: The corrections seem reasonable.
        3. Accepted.
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     2. CID 6209 (PHY)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. C: It can state the average energy of the constellation.
        3. C: Constellations refers to the entire set of symbols.
        4. More work required. Assign to Youhan. Bring back at Jan interim.
     3. CID 6283 (PHY)
        1. Review Comment in J.4.2
        2. C: It looks like some previous ASCII editorial change. It should be a single quote.
        3. Revised: Change each pair of single quotes to a single double quote, 6x. In D4.0 on page 5664 the lines are 30, 35, 40 (two pairs per line).
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  3. **AoB**
     1. The next meeting will be on January 5th, 2024.
  4. **Adjourned at 11:58pm ET.**

**References:**

* 1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2103-04-000m-november-january-teleconference-agenda.docx>
  2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-2074-03-000m-cids6032-6033.docx>
  3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1777-07-000m-s1g-beacon-protection-text.docx>.