IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Minutes for REVme Telecon Nov 6 2023 |
| Date: 2023-11-06 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 WHighland, Utah 84003 | +1 – 801 – 492 – 4023 | jrosdahl @ ieee . org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the TGme (REVme) Telecon for 6 November 2023

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Wednesday, Sept 6, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
	1. **Called to order** 10:03 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
	2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
		1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
		2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
		3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
		4. Editor - Edward AU (Huawei)
		5. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
	3. **Telecon Attendance:**
		1. IMAT Reported**:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 2 | Chen, Junbin | TP-Link Corporation Limited |
| 3 | Chen, You-Wei | MediaTek Inc. |
| 4 | Cui, Yaoshen | TP-Link Corporation Limited |
| 5 | Derham, Thomas | Broadcom Corporation |
| 6 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 7 | Hart, Brian | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
| 8 | Hedayat, Ahmadreza | Apple Inc. |
| 9 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 10 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
| 11 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| 12 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 13 | Patwardhan, Gaurav | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
| 14 | Petrick, Albert | Jones-Petrick and Associates, LLC. |
| 15 | Qi, Emily | Intel |
| 16 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 17 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 18 | Wei, Dong | NXP Semiconductors |
| 19 | YAGHOOBI, HASSAN | Intel |
| 20 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei |
|  |  |  |

* + 1. **Not reported in IMAT** but on WebEx:
			1. Yu Zhu, TP-Link
			2. Yan Xin, Huawei
			3. Haozheng Li,TP-Link
			4. Luo Hui (CSS ICW ENG SYS)
			5. Yu Zhu,TP-Link
			6. Reza Hedayat, Apple
			7. Gabor Bajko, Mediatek
			8. Yaoshen Cui, TP-Link
			9. David Boldy (Broadcom)
			10. Liwen Chu, NXP
			11. Shuyu TP-Link
			12. Sigurd Schelstraete (MaxLinear)
	1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
		1. No issues noted.
	2. **Review Agenda:** 11-23/1825r0:
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1825-00-000m-november-6-teleconference-agenda.docx>
		2. Proposed Agenda:

**The draft agenda for the teleconferences is below:**

1.       Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance> ), and patent and copyright policy

a.       **Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:**

1. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or
2. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or
3. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. **Copyright Policy:**

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c.**Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides: See slides 10-19 in** <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>

d.**Agenda Approval**

2.       **Editor report** – Emily QI/Edward AU

3.       **Comment resolution**

1. CIDs 6076, 6077, 6078. 6079, 6607 – Hart (Cisco)
2. CIDs 6585 (PHY) and 6256 (GEN) – Hamilton (Ruckus-Commscope)
3. CUD 6258 (GEN) – Hamilton (Ruckus-Commscope)
4. CIDs 6036 (PHY) and 6037 (PHY) – Xin (Huawei)
5. ED2 CIDs – doc 11-23/1762 – Au (Huawei)

5.       **AOB**

6. **Adjourn**

* + 1. Changes to the Agenda were made.

 3. Updated Comment resolution plan

a. ED2 CIDs – doc 11-23/1762, doc 11-23/1854 –

CID 6585 (PHY) – Au (Huawei) (30 min)

b. CIDs 6077, 6078 – doc 11-23/1903 – Derham (Broadcom)

c. CIDs 6076, 6079, 6607 –doc 11-23/1904 – Hart

(Cisco)

d. CID 6256 (GEN) – Hamilton (Ruckus-Commscope)

e. CID 6268 (GEN) – Hamilton (Ruckus-Commscope)

f. CIDs 6036 (PHY) and 6037 (PHY) – Xin (Huawei)
g.   GEN Review comments ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)

* + 1. Approved R1 of the agenda 11-23/1825r1.
			1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1825-00-000m-november-6-teleconference-agenda.docx>
	1. **Editor Report:**  Emily QI (Intel) and Edward Au (Huawei)
		1. Rollin of amendments should be ready by end of November.
		2. Ongoing updates in progress.
	2. **Review doc 11-23/1854 r0**: Edward AU (Huawei)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1854-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-6585.docx>
		2. CID 6585 (PHY)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 6585 (PHY): Revised.

At 4841.62 and 4841.64, replace “9.19.2.3a” with

“10.23.2.5 (EDCA channel access in a VHT or TVHT BSS)”, and add the appropriate

cross reference.

At 4842.7, replace “10.2.1.4a” with “11.2.3.16 (VHT

TXOP power save)” and add the appropriate cross reference.

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	1. **Review doc 11-23/1762r2** – Edward AU (Huawei)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1762-02-000m-proposed-resolution-for-miscellaneous-comments-on-initial-sa-ballot-on-d4-0-part-2.docx>
		2. CID 6595 (ED2)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 6595 (ED2): Revised. Remove “Table” at 3984.23.
			3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 6596 (ED2)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 6596 (ED2): Revised. At 3984.12, replace
			“Table 9-190” with “Table 9-228 and make sure that the cross reference (i.e., the hot link) of Table 9-228 is added.
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 6042 (ED2)
			1. Review Comment Proposed Resolution: CID 6042 (ED2): Revised. Replace “AID 38, AID 43, AID 50, AID 52, AID 59, AID 64, AID 71, AID 73, AID 80 and AID 85”

with

“AID 33, AID 38, AID 45, AID 47, AID 49, AID 54, AID 61, AID 63, AID 65, and AID 70” at 5716.34 in D4.0.

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		1. CID 6043 (ED2)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 6043 (ED2): Revised. Revise the encoding of EWL in Figure L-11 from “0 0 1” to “1 1 0".
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. Return to CID 6596 (ED2)
			1. Change resolution to remove the parententical after Table 9-228 in resolution. Change was made in the minutes above to be clear.
		3. CID 6044 (ED2)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 6045 (ED2)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 6045 (ED2): Revised.

Modify Inverse Bitmap bit in the Block Control field in Figure L-14 from “1 0 1” to “0 1 0”.

At 5719.28 in D4.0, replace “AID 1, AID 6, AID

13, AID 15, AID 17, and AID 22, AID 29, AID 31, AID 38, AID 43, AID 50, AID 52,

AID 59, AID 64, AID 71, AID 73, AID 80 and AID 85 “ with “AID 1, AID 6, AID 13,

AID 15, AID 17, AID 22, AID 29, AID 31, AID 33, AID 38, AID 45, AID 47, AID 49,

AID 54, AID 61, AID 63, AID 65, and AID 70”.

* + - 1. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		1. CID 6046 (ED2)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 6046 (ED2): Revised. Revise the encoding of EWL in Figure L-15 from “0 0 1” to “1 1 0”.
			3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 6152 (ED2)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 6152 (ED2): Rejected. For Draft 4.0, the 802.11az amendment has not been incorporated yet.
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 6034 (ED2)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Corrected some minor editorial issues.
			3. Proposed Resolution: CID 6034 (ED2): Revised.

At 2291.63 in D4.0, replace “has indicated a Page Slice Count equal to 0 and a Page Length greater than 1 in the Page Slice element” with “has indicated a Page Slice Count field equal to 0 and a Page Slice Length field greater than 1 in the Page Slice Control field of the Page Slice element”.

At 2292.8 in D4.0, replace “has indicated a Page Slice Count equal to 0 and a Page Length equal to 1 in the Page Slice element” with “has indicated a Page Slice Count field equal to 0 and a Page Slice Length field equal to 1 in the Page Slice Control field of the Page Slice element”.

* + - 1. No Objection -- Mark Ready for Motion
		1. CID 6145 (ED2)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 6092 and 6093 (ED2):
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolutions:

CID 6092 (ED2): Rejected. Having an equation with equation number inside a table is neither confusing nor hard to find. It is searchable by using the search function in the PDF.

CID 6093 (ED2): Revised.

Having an equation with equation number inside a table is neither confusing nor hard to find.

It is searchable by using the search function in the PDF.

At 1891.64 in

D4.0, replace “An AP should not assign to a STA an AID that results in a 0 value PARTIAL\_AID [as computed using Equation (10-13) (in Table 10-13 (Settings for the TXVECTOR parameters GROUP\_ID and PARTIAL\_AID for VHT STAs))]” with “An AP should not assign to a STA an AID that results in a 0 value PARTIAL\_AID as computed using Equation (10-13) in Table 10-13 (Settings for the TXVECTOR parameters GROUP\_ID and PARTIAL\_AID for VHT STAs)”.

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	1. **Review doc 11-23/1903r0** – Thomas DERHAM (Broadcom)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1903-00-000m-reginfo-back-compatibility-for-6-ghz-lpi-and-standard-power.docx>
		2. CIDs 6077 and 6078 (PHY):
			1. Review Comments
			2. Review discussion in submission.
			3. Proposed Resolution: CID 6077 (ED2): Revised. Agree in principle; adopt changes as per CID 6077 in 11-23-1903r0 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1903-00-000m-reginfo-back-compatibility-for-6-ghz-lpi-and-standard-power.docx>).
			4. Proposed Resolution: CID 6078 (ED2): Rejected. Value 3 is used to indicate an 802.11 AP operated by a device in a regulatory mode that permits a certain power limit based on reception of an enabling signal from an indoor AP (e.g. in LPI Client-to-Client communications as described in FCC’s FNRPM of Nov 1 2023). Whether or not a non-AP STA that associates with such an AP needs to know the AP’s regulatory operating mode in order to determine its own transmit power, is dependent on regulatory rules which are in general not yet finalized. Since this value is already defined in REVme, it is prudent to leave it as-is until regulatory requirements are clear.
			5. Not ready for Motion
			6. Mark More Work Required
			7. Schedule for November Plenary
	2. **Review doc 11-23/1904r0:** Brian HART (Cisco)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1904-00-000m-6ghz-indoor-sp-ap-tpe-and-connectivity-signaling.docx>
		2. CID 6076 (PHY):
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review discussion in submission
			3. Some editorial issues noted in WebEx chat but will be referred to Brian offline.
			4. Discussion:
				1. Regulatory requirements can be unique to a country, and if we make the changes, are we limiting the new element functionality to few countries?

Discussion on how it is extensible and how it can be as future proof as possible.

* + - * 1. Need to update the email thread with more details to this topic.
			1. Discussion on Option D.
				1. How to state the power limits for a client.
				2. 2 different elements – need to process them consistently.

EIRP or ERIP PSD

* + - 1. More Offline discussion is requested.
			2. Mark More Work Required.
			3. Schedule Tuesday PM2 of November Plenary.
	1. **2 Assigned CIDS** – Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus-Commscope)
		1. CID 6256 (GEN)
			1. Need more time.
			2. Schedule for November Plenary
		2. CID 6268 (GEN)
			1. Need more time.
			2. This CID is no longer in Mark HAMILTON’s assignment, it is included in Mark RISON’s doc 11-23/1750.
			3. Schedule for November Plenary.
	2. **Review Doc 11-23/1831r0** Yan XIN (Huawei)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1831-00-000m-resolution-for-cids-6036-and-6037-on-initial-sa-ballot-on-d4-0.docx>
		2. CID 6036 (PHY)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review submission description
			3. Proposed Resolution: CID 6036 (PHY): Revised. Replace "256" with "128" in the first paragraph of 24.3.6.2 (P3730.46).
			4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 6037 (PHY)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Discussion on the editorial issues of subscript and italic requirements.
			3. Yan to check with Editors to ensure proper notation is made in the document when is incorporated.
			4. Add to Note to Editor: x should be mult glyph, Tc should be T\_C (subscript and italicised) -- Whole of T\_C italicised.
			5. Review context at page 3758 – Note TC has two different values, so why does it not have two values for TCSTF?
				1. Discussion on this difference.
				2. More review should be done.
			6. Proposed Resolution:

CID 6037 (PHY): Revised. Incorporate the changes shown for CID 6037 in

https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1831-00-000m-resolution-for-cids-6036-and-6037-on-initial-sa-ballot-on-d4-0.docx. ACTION: Yan to clarify with Edward on formatting (italics, subscripts and multiplication glyphs). ("x" should be mult glyph, Tc should be T\_C (subscript and italicised). Whole of T\_C italicised.)

* + - 1. Mark More Work Required.
			2. CID 6037 (PHY): More work required - investigate if T\_C (and T\_seq) should be different for 540 MHz and 1080 MHz bandwidths, per P3758.
			3. Schedule for PM2 Tuesday, at F2F November Plenary
	1. **GEN AdHoc CIDs** – Jon Rosdahl (Qualcomm)
		1. CID 6159 (GEN)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: Rejected - SA Ballot was on P802.11me Draft 4.0. ARC SC is a different group, addressing open questions for that group should be done there.
			3. Updated Proposed Resolution: REJECTED (GEN: 2023-11-06 16:31:17Z) The commenter provides insufficient detail to determine changes would satisfy the comment.
			4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 6144 (GEN)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-11-06 16:34:35Z)
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 6575 (GEN)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Discussion of cases like FILS and Passpoint which do help facilitate transitions between ESSs.
			3. General agreement to move this out of the bullet list, as proposed. But, delete the sentence about not being supported in the Standard.
			4. Also, reword the service disruption phrase.
			5. Proposed Resolution: CID 6575 (GEN):

REVISED (GEN: 2023-11-06 16:43:56Z) In the first sentence of 4.5.3.2, change

"The three transition types of significance to this standard" to

"The two transition types that are supported within this standard".

Delete bullet c).

Add new paragraph after the NOTE below the bullet list:

"A third type of transition is STA movement from a BSS in one ESS to a BSS in a different ESS. Maintenance of upper-layer connections during transition between ESSs cannot be guaranteed by IEEE Std 802.11; disruption of service is likely to occur."

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		1. CID 6013 (GEN)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-11-06 16:46:03Z)
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 6106, 6107 and 6120 (GEN)
			1. Review CID 6106 (GEN) Comment
			2. Same as CID 6107 (GEN).
			3. Proposed Resolution: CID 6107 (GEN) ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-11-06 16:47:53Z)
			4. Proposed Resolution: CID 6106 (GEN) ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-11-06 16:48:30Z)
			5. Proposed Resolution: CID 6120 (GEN): Accepted. Note to Editor: This is the same changes as CID 6107 and 6106.
			6. No Objection – Mark all 3 CIDs Ready for Motion
	1. **Adjourned at 11:56am ET.**

**References:**