Minutes IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| IEEE 802.11 TGbh Teleconference Minutes, October 10th, 2023Randomized and Changing MAC addresses (RCM) |
| Date: 2023-10-10 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Stephen Orr | Cisco | San Jose, CA, US |  | sorr@cisco.com |

Abstract

This document contains the minutes of the IEEE 802.11bh teleconference of October 10, 2023.

Note: Highlighted text are action items.

**Meeting October 10th, 2023, 9:30 a.m. to 11:30 a.m. EDT**

**Chair: Mark Hamilton (Ruckus/CommScope)**

**Vice Chair: Peter Yee (NSA-CSD/AKAYLA)**

**Vice Chair: Stephen Orr (Cisco)**

**Secretary: Peter Yee**

**Editor: Carol Ansley (Cox Communications)**

**The teleconference was called to order by the Vice Chair at 9:33 a.m. EDT.**

Agenda slide deck [11-23/1687r00](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1687-00-00bh-agenda-tgbh-2023-oct-10.pptx)

1. **Policies and procedures were presented by Vice Chair Peter Yee. (Slides 4 to 15)**

There were no Patent declarations.

Copyright policy slides were presented (Slides 10 and 11)

1. **Agenda:**
* **Attendance, noises/recording, meeting protocol**
* **Policies, duty to inform, participation rules**
* **Organization topics:**
	+ Timeline reminder (slide 16)
	+ Motions record: [11-22/0651r25](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0651-25-00bh-tgbh-motions-list.pptx)
* **Comment Resolution**
	+ Comment resolution document: [11-23/1152r22](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1152-22-00bh-ieee-802-11bh-lb274-comments.xlsx)
	+ Comment topics list (slide 17)
	+ Comment resolution queue (slide 18)
* **Discussion on response to WBA liaisons (was due Sept):** [**11-21/0703r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0703-00-0000-2021-april-liaison-from-wba.docx)**,** [**11-21/1141r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1141-00-00bh-excerpts-of-wba-document-wi-fi-id-scope.pptx)**,** [**11-22/0668r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0668-00-0000-liaison-statement-from-wba-re-wi-fi-devices-identification-group.pdf)**,** [**11-22/0653r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0653-00-0000-2022-march-wba-whitepaper-re-device-identification.pdf)
	+ [11-23/0888r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0888-00-00bh-wba-liaison-discussion.pptx) Stephen Orr

The agenda, with comment resolution submission updates acknowledged, was approved with unanimous consent.

1. **Timeline Review**

Hopefully, we will be able to wrap up comment resolution in time for a recirculation ballot by November, if not earlier. We still appear to be on track.

1. **CID 40 (no need for 11-23/1372?) and related: CIDs 19, 88 in 11-23/1316 (Yang)**

Will hold these CIDs until further discussion with Mark

1. **Numerous CIDs/topics (mostly Device ID):** [**11-23/1316r11**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1316-11-00bh-cr-for-cids-relevant-to-device-id-part-1.docx) **(Yang): CIDs 75, 123, 249, 106, 105, 121, 91, 92, 172, 166, 251**

CID 75: no comments

CID 123: no comment

CID 249:

C: change language to “A STA shall not send a frame containing a Device ID”

C: If its an element – it should say “Device ID element”

CID 105: No Comments

CID 121: No Comments

CID 91,92,172: No Comments

CID 166: No Comment

CID 251: No Comment

CID 178: No Comment

CID 171:

C: Comment to reject this change. Don’t think we need this.

1. **Continue** [**11-23/1245r21**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1245-21-00bh-cid-resolutions-irm-1.docx) **(Numerous CIDs) (Smith):**

CID 34 and 241:

C: Adjusments to section numbers – no text changes

C:Is the red text the change?

A: Yes

CID 109:

 C: There is no negotiation – therefore reject

 A: Rejected

CID 128: Propose to Reject Comment

 A: Rejected

CID 137: Rejected

C: I don’t see value in dedicating addresses for one specific use – complicates things. Allocated addresses should be able to be used for anything.

C: Adding multiple MAC addresses should be moved to bi.

A: Propose to Reject for now

C: This is a privacy improvement not an RCM improvement.

 CID 140:

C: Do we need a statement that says “how random is random”

A: There is a statement in the standard that talks about random number generation

C: How many bits are random

A: 46 bits

C: Instead of saying “random MAC address” could say “another” or “different

C: Point to the IRM subsection – may not be relevant to this CID

C: Is this the IRM or what the non-AP STA is using?

A: Reject – section is being re-written.

 CID 148: Accepted

 CID 155: Accept

 CID 160: Reject

 CID 164: Accept

 CID 156: Revised using texts as agreed for CID 240

 CID 240: Revised

 C: How does this mitigate 3rd party traffic analysis

 C: Mitigation not prevention – making it more difficult to do traffic analysis

 C: Change “continuing to mitigate’ to just “mitigate”

 CID 196: Rejected

 CID 198: Rejected

 CID 208: Accept

 CID 214: Accept

**No meeting Oct 17th**

**Meeting adjourned at 11:30 a.m. EDT**

**Attendance**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
| TGbh | 10/10 | DeLaOlivaDelgado, Antonio | InterDigital, Inc. |
| TGbh | 10/10 | Henry, Jerome | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
| TGbh | 10/10 | Mutgan, Okan | Nokia |
| TGbh | 10/10 | Orr, Stephen | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
| TGbh | 10/10 | Sam, Harvey | Broadcom Corporation |
| TGbh | 10/10 | Sevin, Julien | Canon Research Centre France |
| TGbh | 10/10 | Smith, Graham | SRT Wireless |
| TGbh | 10/10 | Smith, Luther | Cable Television Laboratories Inc. (CableLabs) |
| TGbh | 10/10 | Yang, Jay | Nokia |
| TGbh | 10/10 | Yee, Peter | NSA-CSD |