IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| IEEE 802.11bf – Teleconference Minutes September - November 2023 |
| Date: 2023-09-22 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Leif Wilhelmsson | Ericsson AB | Mobilvägen 1, 22632 Lund, Sweden | +46-706-216956 | leif.r.wilhelmsson@ericsson.com |
| Sang Kim  | LGE |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains minutes for the TG 802.11bf teleconferences in September - November 2023.

Rev 0: Minutes for TG 802.11bf teleconference on the 19th of September.

Rev 1: Minutes for TG 802.11bf teleconference on the 21st of September added.

Rev 2: Two errors in the CID numbering corrected and one typo corrected.

Rev 3: Minutes for TG 802.11bf teleconference on the 25st of September added.

**Tuesday, September 19, 2023, 10:00am - 12:00pm (ET)**

**Meeting Agenda:**

The meeting agenda is shown below, and published in the agenda document:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1650-01-00bf-tgbf-meeting-agenda-2023-09.pptx>

1. Call the meeting to order
2. Patent policy and logistics
3. TGbf Timeline
4. Call for contribution
5. Teleconference Times
6. Presentation of submissions
7. Any other business
8. Adjourn
9. The chair, Tony Han, calls the meeting to order at 10:00 am ET (24 persons are on the call after 15 minutes of the meeting).
10. The chair goes through “Meeting Protocol, Attendance, Voting & Documentation Status” (slide 4), “Participants have a duty to inform the IEEE” (slide 6), and “Ways to inform IEEE” (slide 7).

The chair makes a Call for Potentially Essential Patents. No potentially essential patents reported, and no questions asked.

The chair goes through “Other Guideline for IEEE WG meetings” (slide 8), “Patent related information” (slide 9), “ IEEE SA Copyright Policy” (slides 10 and 11), “Participant behavior in IEEE-SA activities is guided by the IEEE Codes of Ethics & Conduct” (slide 12), “Participants in the IEEE-SA “individual process” shall act independently of others, including employers”(slide 13), and “IEEE-SA standards activities shall allow the fair & equitable consideration of all viewpoints” (slide 14), and “Required notices” (slide 15).

The chair goes through the agenda (slide 16) and asks if there are any question on the agenda. Contributions 11-23/1487, 11-23/1476, and 11-23/1474 are deferred due to more offline discussions needed and the absence of the contributor.

The chair asks if there is any objection to approve the updated agenda by unanimous consent. No response from the group. As a result, the agenda is approved.

1. The chair goes through the timeline (slide 17).
2. The chair goes call for contribution (slide 18)
3. The chair presents the telco Teleconference Times (slides 19 and 20).

The chair stated that teleconference times and f2f information are separated into 2 slides. The chair goes through the planned teleconferences after the f2f and asks if there are any comments. No response from the group.

The chair also announces that he intends to request 8 slots for the November f2f as we hopefully will be targeting to generate D3.0 out of that meeting. Suggestion was made to have 7 slots by cancelling the Thursday PM2, but it is decided to keep 8 slots as of now and will revisit one week before November f2f to check whether it is needed or not.

Claudio gives a status update. He accommodated around 90% of the comments resolved so far and will send D2.1 to Tony and Robert Stacey.

1. Presentation of submissions:

**11-23/1552r0, “LB 276 CR for CIDs on Reporting, Exchange, and OST”, Mahmoud Kamel (InterDigital):** This submission proposes resolutions for 11 CIDs (3295, 3394, 3396, 3399, 3417, 3473, 3303, 3069, 3070, 3402, 3486) in subclause 9.4.1.73.1, 9.4.2.320, 9.3.1.19.1, 11.55.1 in P802.11bf D2.0.

CID 3394: No discussion.

CID 3417: No discussion.

CID 3295: No discussion.

CID 3396: No discussion.

CID 3397: No discussion.

CID 3473: When AID 11 subfield is 0, an unassociated case is missing. The CID is deferred for further offline discussion.

CID 3303: It is stated that the comment is not clear to understand. SBP initiator may not request report (local consuming). If it wants, then it can request it. This implies that “reporting” is not always needed. The CID is deferred for further offline discussion.

CID 3069: The CID is deferred for further offline discussion.

CID 3070: No discussion.

CID 3402 & 3486: The capital “S” and “C” are used because Status Code is used as a name of a field. When referring to the value of a field, small “s” and “c” are used. Mahmoud mentioned that he enlisted the names of the field. Claudio will handle the issue and will add “field” after Status Code.

**11-23/1633r0, “LB276 CR for CIDs on SR2SR Variant”, Dong Wei (NXP):**

This document aims to resolve the following LB276 comments: CIDs 3177, 3178, 3196, 3197, 3215, 3317, 3319, 3338, 3493, and 3543.

CID 3177: No discussion.

CID 3197: Claudio stated that it is already clear enough to add more description. We don’t need to provide every detail on field. It is decided not to add more description. The commenter agreed.

CID 3196 and 3197: Resolutions will be changed from “Accepted” to “Rejected”. Dong will add the reasons for rejection.

CID 3215: Question was raised if 2 measurements per responder is possible in one availability window. Ali stated that sensing receiver role is “1” in availability window, but sensing transmitter role can be many in availability window.

CID 3317: No discussion.

CID 3319: A suggestion is made that the sentence is not constructive. It should be straight forward to the point, not opening the door for another discussion. Dong will have offline discussion with Chaoming and bring a new revision next time.

CID 3338: Suggestion is made that we keep the sentence as it is and add “If no polling, the polling is reserved.” New text will be discussed and brought back next time.

CID 3493: No discussion.

CID 3543: No discussion.

No SP is run today and it is decided the contribution is still in the queue.

**11-23/1634r0, “LB276 CR for CID 3082”, Dong Wei (NXP):** This document aims to resolve the following LB276 comment: CID 3082.

**Straw Poll**: Do you agree to the resolution provided in the document 11-23/1634r0 for CID 3082?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-23/1635r0, “Draft 2.0 Bug Fix: Comeback field”, Dong Wei (NXP):** This document aims to fix a bug on Comeback field.

**Straw Poll**: Do you agree to the text change to Draft P802.11bf\_D2.0 proposed in document 11-23/1635r0?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-23/1653r0, “Proposed resolutions for editorial comments on D2.0 - Part 1”, Claudio da Silva (Meta Platforms):** This document contains proposed resolutions for editorial comments on D2.0 (LB276).

**Straw Poll**: Do you agree to the resolution provided in the document 11-23/1653r0 for CIDs CIDs: 3420, 3160, 3202, 3401, 3251, 3325, 3021, 3488, 3424, 3405, 3172, 3252, 3539, 3132, 3058, 3328, 3135, 3257, 3014, 3259, 3136, 3329, 3428, 3323, 3368, 3262, 3263, 3264, 3097, 3015, 3124, 3430, 3029, 3016, 3030, 3271, 3272, 3125, 3432, 3274, 3275, 3276, 3437, 3277, 3278, 3008, 3530, 3474, 3436, 3475, 3222, 3416, and 3013?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

The chair stated that motions will be run after the first week of October, probably October 10th or 12th. A motion request will be sent out after September 26th.

1. Any other business. No response from the group.
2. The meeting is adjourned without objection at 11:54 am.

**List of Attendees:**

**Thursday, September 21, 2023, 11:00pm - 01:00am (ET)**

**Meeting Agenda:**

The meeting agenda is shown below, and published in the agenda document:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1650-03-00bf-tgbf-meeting-agenda-2023-09.pptx>

1. Call the meeting to order
2. Patent policy and logistics
3. TGbf Timeline
4. Call for contribution
5. Teleconference Times
6. Presentation of submissions
7. Any other business
8. Adjourn
9. The chair, Tony Han, calls the meeting to order at 11:00 pm ET (23 persons are on the call after 15 minutes of the meeting).
10. The chair goes through “Meeting Protocol, Attendance, Voting & Documentation Status” (slide 4), “Participants have a duty to inform the IEEE” (slide 6), and “Ways to inform IEEE” (slide 7).

The chair makes a Call for Potentially Essential Patents. No potentially essential patents reported, and no questions asked.

The chair goes through “Other Guideline for IEEE WG meetings” (slide 8), “Patent related information” (slide 9), “ IEEE SA Copyright Policy” (slides 10 and 11), “Participant behavior in IEEE-SA activities is guided by the IEEE Codes of Ethics & Conduct” (slide 12), “Participants in the IEEE-SA “individual process” shall act independently of others, including employers”(slide 13), and “IEEE-SA standards activities shall allow the fair & equitable consideration of all viewpoints” (slide 14), and “Required notices” (slide 15).

The chair goes through the agenda (slide 17) and asks if there are any question on the agenda. The chair explains that one contribution from Pei is missing. Claudio explains that his contribution 1654 has to be deferred until next time, but asks to get 10 minutes to give a status update. Pei asks to present after Naren and the group agrees with this.

The chair asks if there is any objection to approve the updated agenda by unanimous consent. No response from the group. As a result, the agenda is approved.

1. The chair goes through the timeline (slide 18).
2. The chair goes call for contribution (slide 19)
3. The chair presents the telco Teleconference Times (slides 20) and asks if it OK with the group to run the motions on the 10th of October. No objection from the group. The chair presents the plan for the f2f.

Claudio announces that D2.1 has been published, which contains about 25% of the comments received on D2.0. Claudio encourages people to check to make sure that there are no mistakes.

Claudio explains that there are risks with proposed changes that basically implies global changes as these may imply a risk for mistakes and that the draft has to be changed which eventually may mean that we may have more drafts before having a stable one. Therefore, proposed changes on e.g. terminology should preferably be discussed now rather than making formal comments on the draft.

1. Presentation of submissions:

11-23/1474r1, “LB276 CR for OST related editorial CIDs”, Atsushi Shirakawa (Sharp Corporation): This submission proposes resolutions for CID 3003, 3004, 3005, 3006, 3032, 3033, 3034, 3071, 3081, 3093, 3094, 3131, 3213, 3340, 3342, 3398, 3399, 3404, 3480, 3481, 3487 received for TGbf LB276.

Rev 0 has been presented, but CID 1657 has been removed in r1 and moved to another contribution. In addition, the format of the document has been updated. No updates of the proposed resolutions.

**Straw Poll:** Do you agree to the resolution provided for following CIDs 3003, 3004, 3005, 3006, 3032, 3033, 3034, 3071, 3081, 3093, 3094, 3131, 3213, 3340, 3342, 3398, 3399, 3404, 3480, 3481, 3487 in r2 of this document to be included in the latest 11bf Draft?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-23/1633r1, “LB276 CR for CIDs on SR2SR Variant”, Dong Wei (NXP):**

This document aims to resolve the following LB276 comments: CIDs 3177, 3178, 3196, 3197, 3215, 3317, 3319, 3338, 3493, and 3543.

CIDs 3196 and 3197: No discussion.

CID 3319: No discussion.

CID 3338: Some clarifying discussion. It is pointed out by the group that there may be another related CID handled by Dongguk and as a result this CID is deferred.

**Straw Poll:** Do you agree to the resolutions provided in the document 11-23/1633r2for the following CIDs: 3177, 3178, 3196, 3197, 3215, 3317, 3319, ~~3338,~~ 3493, and 3543?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-23/1648r1, “Bug fix – MLME-SENSREPORTRQ primitives”, Narengerile (Huawei):**

This document addresses a technical issue mentioned during offline discussions about MLME-SENSREPORTRQ primitives.

**Straw Poll:** Do you agree to include the proposed draft text in DCN 23/1648r1 in the latest 11bf Draft?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-23/1487r1, “LB276 CR for CIDs on Sensing capabilities exchange”, Pei Zhou (TCL):**

This submission proposes resolutions to the following LB276 CIDs. 3044, 3045, 3047, 3205, 3339, 3391, 3479.

Revision 0 has been presented and Pei goes through the made updates.

CID 3045: No discussion.

CID 3047: No discussion.

**Straw Poll:** Do you approve resolutions to CIDs 3044, 3045, 3047, 3205, 3339, 3391, 3479,

as specified in doc.: 11-23/1487r1 and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft.

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-23/1651r1, “LB276 CR for CIDs on Exchange and Reporting”, Zhanjing Bao (TCL):** This document proposes resolutions to the following comments submitted in LB276.

CIDs: 3084, 3089, 3105, 3108, 3109, 3142, 3218, 3321

CIDs 3084. 3089, 3105, and 3142: No discussion.

CIDs 3109 and 3218: Some clarifying discussion. Claudio asks to get the Visio file.

CID 3108 and 3321: No discussion.

As one of the figures is moved, it is proposed to add a reference to the figure in the text where the text used to be.

**Straw Poll:** Do you support the proposed resolutions to the CIDs 3084, 3089, 3105, 3108, 3109, 3142, 3218, 3321 and incorporate the changes into the latest TGbf draft?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-23/1661r0, “LB276 comment resolutions for OST part 1”, Rui Du (Huawei):** This submission contains the proposed comment resolutions for the CIDs 3158, 3425, 3471, 3505, 3168 and 3489.

CIDs 3158, 3425, 3471 and 3505: No discussion.

CIDs 3168 and 3489: Some editorial remarks by the editor. As a result the document will be updated to r1.

**Straw Poll:** Do you support resolutions to the following CIDs and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft: 3158, 3425, 3471, 3505, 3168 and 3489 in 11-23/1661r1?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

1. Any other business. No response from the group.
2. The meeting is adjourned without objection at 00:30 am.

**Monday, September 25, 2023, 10:00am - 12:00pm (ET)**

**Meeting Agenda:**

The meeting agenda is shown below, and published in the agenda document:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1650-05-00bf-tgbf-meeting-agenda-2023-09.pptx>

1. Call the meeting to order
2. Patent policy and logistics
3. TGbf Timeline
4. Call for contribution
5. Teleconference Times
6. Presentation of submissions
7. Any other business
8. Adjourn
9. The chair, Tony Han, calls the meeting to order at 10:00 am ET (23 persons are on the call after 15 minutes of the meeting).
10. The chair goes through “Meeting Protocol, Attendance, Voting & Documentation Status” (slide 4), “Participants have a duty to inform the IEEE” (slide 6), and “Ways to inform IEEE” (slide 7).

The chair makes a Call for Potentially Essential Patents. No potentially essential patents reported, and no questions asked.

The chair goes through “Other Guideline for IEEE WG meetings” (slide 8), “Patent related information” (slide 9), “ IEEE SA Copyright Policy” (slides 10 and 11), “Participant behavior in IEEE-SA activities is guided by the IEEE Codes of Ethics & Conduct” (slide 12), “Participants in the IEEE-SA “individual process” shall act independently of others, including employers”(slide 13), and “IEEE-SA standards activities shall allow the fair & equitable consideration of all viewpoints” (slide 14), and “Required notices” (slide 15).

The chair goes through the agenda (slide 18) and asks if there are any question on the agenda. Mahmoud announces that he may be able to present contribution 1552 today.

The chair asks if there is any objection to approve the updated agenda by unanimous consent. No response from the group. As a result, the agenda is approved.

1. The chair goes through the timeline (slide 19).
2. The chair goes call for contribution (slide 20)
3. The chair presents the telco Teleconference Times (slides 21) and announces the the call tomorrow may be cancelled.

Claudio goes through the D2.0 status. We have resolved 43% up until now.

1. Presentation of submissions:

**11-23/1654r1, “Proposed resolutions for technical comments on D2.0 - Part 1”, Claudio da Silva (Intel):** This document contains proposed resolutions for technical comments on D2.0 (LB276). The text used as reference is D2.1.

CIDs: 3442, 3369, 3443, 3444, 3445, 3446, 3447, 3448, 3449, 3450, 3451, 3452, 3453, 3454, 3455, 3456, 3457, 3458, 3459, 3460, 3461, 3462, 3463, 3464, 3018, 3019, 3020

CIDs 3442, 3369: No discussion.

CIDs 3443, 3444, and 3445: No discussion.

CID 3446: Some clarifying discussion.

CIDs 3447, 3448, 3449, and 3450: No discussion.

CIDs 3451, 3452, 3453, and 3454: No discussion.

CIDs 3455, 3456, 3457, and 3458: No discussion.

CIDs 3459, 3460, 3461, 3462, and 3463: No discussion.

CID 3464: No discussion.

CID 3018: No discussion.

CID 3019: No discussion.

CID 3020: No

**Straw Poll:** Do you support the proposed resolutions in r2 of this contribution?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-23/1592r0, “****LB276 CR for Threshold-based Reporting - Part 1”, Mengshi Hu (Huawei):** This submission contains the proposed comment resolutions of CIDs in 23/1394 LB276 comments and approved resolutions.

The following CIDs related to the threshold-based reporting are resolved:

All the related CIDs in Clause 9: 3017, 3066, 3150, 3360, 3361

Some CIDs in Clause 11: 3365, 3366

CID 3017: No discussion.

CID 3150: No discussion.

CID 3360: No discussion.

CID 3361: No discussion.

CID 3066: No discussion.

CID 3365: No discussion.

CID 3366: No discussion.

**Straw Poll:** Do you support the proposed resolutions in this contribution?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-23/1640r1, “LB276 CR for Threshold-based Reporting - Part 2”, Mengshi Hu (Huawei):** This submission contains the proposed comment resolutions of CIDs in 23/1394 LB276 comments and approved resolutions.

The following CIDs related to the threshold-based reporting are resolved:

All the remaining CIDs related to the threshold-based reporting in Clause 11: 3059, 3060, 3061, 3064, 3067, 3134, 3180, 3181, 3182, 3183, 3184, 3256, and 3364.

CIDs 3059, 3060, 3061, 3064, 3067, 3134, 3180, 3181, 3182, 3183, 3256, 3364: Some clarifying discussion related to 3061

CID 3184: Some clarifying discussion.

**Straw Poll:** Do you support the proposed resolutions in r2 of this contribution?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

**11-23/1552r1, “LB 276 CR for CIDs on Reporting, Exchange, and OST”, Mahmoud Kamel (InterDigital):** This submission proposes resolutions for 10 CIDs (3295, 3394, 3396, 3399, 3417, 3473, 3069, 3070, 3402, 3486) in subclause 9.4.1.73.1, 9.4.2.320, 9.3.1.19.1, 11.55.1 in P802.11bf D2.0.

Revision 0 has been presented in a previous session and Mahmoud goes through the updates that have been made based on the feedback from the group.

CID 3473: Discussion with respect to that this has an impact on the baseline. As a result this CID is deferred.

**Strawpoll:** Do you support the proposed resolutions to the 10 CIDs (3295, 3394, 3396, 3399, 3417, ~~3473,~~ 3069, 3070, 3402, 3486) in r2 and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft?

**Result:** Unanimously supported.

1. Any other business. Tony announces that he will cancel the meeting tomorrow.
2. The meeting is adjourned without objection at 11:54 am.