Minutes IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| IEEE 802.11 TGbh Teleconference Minutes, August 22, 2023  Randomized and Changing MAC addresses (RCM) | | | | |
| Date: 2023-08-22 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Peter Yee | NSA-CSD | Mountain View, CA, US |  | [peter@akayla.com](mailto:peter@akayla.com) |

Abstract

This document contains the minutes of the IEEE 802.11bh teleconference of August 22, 2023.

Note: Highlighted text are action items.

Q- proceeds a question asked at the meeting

A- proceeds an answer

C- proceeds a comment

**Meeting August 22nd, 2023, 9:30 a.m. to 11:30 a.m. EDT**

**Chair: Mark Hamilton (Ruckus/CommScope)**

**Vice Chair: Peter Yee (NSA-CSD/AKAYLA)**

**Vice Chair: Stephen Orr (Cisco)**

**Secretary: Peter Yee**

**Editor: Carol Ansley (Cox Communications)**

**The teleconference was called to order by the Chair at 9:32 a.m. EDT.**

Agenda slide deck [11-23/1380r02](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1380-02-00bh-agenda-tgbh-2023-aug-22.pptx) (revised to [11-23/1380r03](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1380-03-00bh-agenda-tgbh-2023-aug-22.pptx) over the course of the meeting)

1. **Policies and procedures were presented by Chair Mark Hamilton. (Slides 4 to 15)**

There were no Patent declarations.

Copyright policy slides were presented (Slides 10 and 11)

1. **Agenda:**

* **Attendance, noises/recording, meeting protocol**
* **Policies, duty to inform, participation rules**
* **Organization topics:**
  + Timeline reminder (slide 16)
  + Motions record: [11-22/0651r22](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0651-22-00bh-tgbh-motions-list.pptx)
* **Motion: Motion #20 in** [11-22/0651r22](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0651-22-00bh-tgbh-motions-list.pptx)
* **Comment Resolution**
  + Tracking document: [11-23/1152r15](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1152-15-00bh-ieee-802-11bh-lb274-comments.xlsx)
  + Comment topics list (slide 17)
  + Comment resolution queue (slide 18)
* **Discussion on response to WBA liaisons:** [**11-21/0703r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0703-00-0000-2021-april-liaison-from-wba.docx)**,** [**11-21/1141r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-1141-00-00bh-excerpts-of-wba-document-wi-fi-id-scope.pptx)**,** [**11-22/0668r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0668-00-0000-liaison-statement-from-wba-re-wi-fi-devices-identification-group.pdf)**,** [**11-22/0653r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0653-00-0000-2022-march-wba-whitepaper-re-device-identification.pdf)
  + [11-23/0888r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0888-00-00bh-wba-liaison-discussion.pptx) Stephen Orr

The agenda was approved with unanimous consent.

1. **Timeline Review**

Hopefully, we will be able to wrap up comment resolution in time for a recirculation ballot by November if not earlier.

1. **Motion #20**

Jay Yang (ZTE) made motion #20 as listed in [11-22/0651r22](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0651-22-00bh-tgbh-motions-list.pptx). Carol Ansley (Cox) seconded the motion. The motion reads:

Approve the resolutions to CIDs listed below, per the resolutions recorded in [11-23/1152r15](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1152-15-00bh-ieee-802-11bh-lb274-comments.xlsx), and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbh draft:

* Technical/General CIDs: 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 10, 11, 15, 17, 23, 28, 32, 33, 36, 37, 49, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62, 86, 100, 101, 102, 110, 132, 134, 138, 149, 152, 193, 197, 207, 239, 272
* Editorial CIDs: 29, 35, 38, 39, 41, 43, 44, 45, 46, 63, 70, 71, 77, 93, 94, 115, 116, 118, 119, 139, 141, 144, 150, 151, 153, 154, 158, 161, 173, 189, 194, 199, 202, 204, 205, 206, 210, 211, 218, 219, 220, 221, 222, 225, 229, 254, 259, 263, 264, 269, 270, 271, 275, 279, 282, 285, 287, 288.

The motion passed with unanimous consent.

1. **Use Case 4.8 (randomized probes)**

Jay Zang presented [11-23/1314r01](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1314-01-00bh-cr-for-use-case-4-8.docx) covering CIDs 20, 89, and 98, which apply to use case 4.8. His suggested resolutions are to agree in principle with the commenters’ proposed changes. There was some pushback on the CID 98 resolution. Yang will give that further consideration.

1. **Numerous CIDs/topics (mostly Device ID)**

Yang next presented [11-23/1316r04](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1316-04-00bh-cr-for-cids-relevant-to-device-id-part-1.docx), which covers CIDs 1, 13, 14, 16, 19, 24, 72, 73, 75, 82, 83, 88, 91, 92, 103, 104, 105, 106, 121, 123, 133, 145, 166, 170, 171, 172, 174, 175, 176, 177, 178, 179, 180, 226, 232, 233, 234, 235, 236, 237, 238, 244, 245, 246, 247, 248, 249, 251, 253, and 255. In the order addressed, CIDs 19 and 88 deal with MLD support. These two have a common text resolution. CID 75 requests a change from “Device ID indication” to “Device ID operation”, which seems reasonable to the group. CID 103 questions the ordering of operations. The proposed resolution for CID 103 was updated. CID 123, which Yang proposed to reject, needs further consideration. While ostensibly a simple editorial fix, there’s a lot more that could be done to improve the sentence. CID 104 indicates that an ESS-wide normative requirement can’t be enforced and prefers a note. CID 170 affects the same text editorially. Yang suggested a text change that incorporates the gist of the proposed changes albeit not as a note. CID 249 deals with the subsequent text in the same paragraph and the proposed resolution is conjoined with the resolution to the previous two resolutions. CIDs 105 asks to have “shall send a device ID” made more precise in the text. CID 106 similarly asks to have “shall not send a device ID” made more precise in the text. The resolutions need to be updated as there’s confusion over the concept of the device ID vs. the field vs. the IE, not to mention the use of “include” vs. “provide”. Joseph Levy (InterDigital) will attempt to fix the language in this text so that it complies with the IEEE 802 style guide. CID 121 is the same as the approved CID 49.

Time ran out to consider further CIDs during this teleconference.

**Meeting adjourned at 11:31 a.m. EDT**

**Attendance**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Abidrabbu, Shaima | Vestel, IMU |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Ansley, Carol | Cox Communications |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Bhandaru, Nehru | Broadcom |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Harkins, Dan | HPE |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Henry, Jerome | Cisco |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Huang, Qisheng | ZTE |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Kneckt, Jarkko | Apple |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Li, Yan | ZTE |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Luo, Hui | CYSC CSS ICW ENG SYS |
| TGbh | 08/22 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Mutgan, Okan | Nokia |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Orr, Stephen | Cisco |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Sevin, Julien | Canon |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Smith, Graham | SRT Wireless |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Smith, Luther | CableLabs |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Thakore, Darshak | CableLabs |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Thakur, Sid | Apple |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Tsui, Yusen | TP-Link |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Yang, Jay | Nokia |
| TGbh | 08/22 | Yee, Peter | NSA-CSD |