IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes for REVme 2023 May and June Telecons | | | | |
| Date: 2023-06-26 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1 801 492 4029 | jrosdahl @ ieee . org |
| Stephen McCann | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd | Southampton, UK |  | stephen.mccann@ieee.org |

Abstract

Minutes for the TGme (REVme) telecons held during May and June 2023.

R0: May 26, 2023: Initial minutes.

R1: June 2, 2023, Minutes added.

R2: June 12, 2023, Minutes added – Attendance updates made for previous Telecon.

R3: June 16, 2023, Minutes added – Action items added to Abstract.

R4: June 23, 2023, Minutes added. (Thanks to Stephen MCCANN for capturing the minutes.)

R5: June 26, 2023, Minutes added.

**ACTION ITEMS:**

* + - 1. ACTION ITEM: #1: Mark RISON to post to the reflector a discussion on CID 4341 (MAC), for input on direction.
      2. ACTION ITEM #2: Jouni to post to the reflector a discussion on CID 4069 (MAC) resolution in this direction for motion and call for comments ahead of the motion meeting. (June 16)
      3. ACTION ITEM #3: Mike MONTEMURRO - Need to update the Rejection reason for CID 4229 (SEC) –will update and notify TGme
      4. ACTION ITEM #4: Edward AU to send an email to the reflector on the topic of performance values in the DMG clause See CID 4045 (PHY).
      5. ACTION ITEM #5: Mark HAMILTON to send the proposed resolution for CID 4244 to the Reflector.

6.11.10.4 ACTION ITEM #6: Mark HAMILTON to post resolutions to CID 4150 and 4324 to the reflector for review.

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Friday, May 26, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order** 10:04 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
      1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
      2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
      3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Editor - Edward AU (Huawei) Joined late about 10:40am
      5. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
      6. Not present:
   3. **Telecon Attendance:**
      1. IMAT Reported**:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 2 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
| 3 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 4 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 5 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| 6 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 7 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 8 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 9 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 10 | Qi, Emily | Intel |
| 11 | Hart, Brian | Cisco |

* + 1. Not reported in IMAT but on WebEx:
       1. Shantidev Mohanty (??)
       2. Brian Hart (Cisco)
       3. Reza Hedayat (Apple)
  1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
     1. No issues noted.
  2. **Review Agenda:** 11-23/0897r0:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-00-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
     2. Friday’s Agenda:

1. Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance>), and patent and copyright policy

a. Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:

i. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or

ii. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or

iii. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. Copyright Policy:

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c. Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides:

See slides 10-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>

d. Agenda Approval

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3. Comment resolution and motions

a) **Friday May 26, 2023 – 10am – noon Eastern**

a. MAC CIDs 4179, 4261, 4312, 4337, 4341, 4370 – Rison (Samsung)

b. ED1 Review CIDs – Qi (Intel)

5. AOB

6. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda.
       1. The Doc number for Emily’s Comments = 11-23/928
       2. Discussion on having Brian Hart to the Agenda. – 23/929r0
       3. Change the order of the presentation.
       4. No objection to updated Agenda. See 11-23/0897r1.
  1. **Editor Report** Emily QI
     + 1. We have started MDR review.
       2. We will get Review report by July Plenary Session.
  2. **Review Doc 11/23/929r0** CID 4312 and 4198 (MAC) - Brian HART (Cisco)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-00-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>
     2. CID 4312 and 4198 (MAC)
        1. Review submission and CID history old CID 3225.
        2. Revert the CID 3225.
        3. Review updated changes and resulting text.
        4. There is a problem with the version of the draft used for one figure.
        5. Need to update the submission to use D3.0 references.
        6. Several figures need to be corrected; Revision will be posted.
        7. Discussion of changing the reference location from Northwest to Southwest.
        8. Determined that GeoPriv RFC definitions were used in making this definition, so while we change the subelement fields, the reference of North-West should not be changed.
        9. Discussion on how the “url” is being defined or lack of how it is encoded.
        10. Harmonize with the RFCs to make sure we are aligned with them to avoid conflicts.
        11. Discussion on possible removal of this set of elements, but there was not support for that in sideline conversations.
        12. Discussion on how to tie the floorplan and map image together.
        13. RFC 7035 discusses location coordinate systems and map URLs. It may be worth looking at.
        14. Set to more Work required.
        15. Schedule June 12
  3. **Review doc 11-23/0933r0 -** **MAC CIDs 4179, 4261, 4312, 4337, 4341, 4370** – RISON (Samsung)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-00-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>
     2. CID 4179 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review potential set of changes.
        3. Discuss changing recognition with received and remove “valid.”
        4. Mark More Work Required
        5. Schedule for July 12
     3. CID 4261 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review discussion in submission.
        3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4261 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-26 14:50:41Z): Make the changes proposed by the commenter, and additionally: - in the replacement para say “between a GDD” not “between the GDD” (2x) - before “secured connection” in the NOTE add “a ” - at 2635.37 change “Advertisement protocol ID” to “advertisement protocol ID” - at 1131.44 delete “The Advertisement protocol ID value 221 is reserved for vendor specific advertisement protocols.”
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     4. CID 4337 (MAC) – not in doc 11-23/0933r0
        1. Review on screen from Database.
        2. Review context of comment
        3. Discussion on changing “may” to shall.
        4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4337 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2023-05-26 14:53:02Z)
        5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
     5. CID 4341 (MAC) – is included in 11-23/953r0.
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review discussion in submission
        3. CID 4341 (MAC): MAC: 2023-05-26 15:00:43Z - status set to: More Work Required.
        4. Scheduled to bring back later in June 19.
        5. ACTION ITEM: #1: Mark RISON to post to the reflector a discussion on CID 4341 (MAC), for input on direction.
     6. CID 4370 (MAC) and 4116 (MAC)
        1. CIDs 4370 and 4116 (MAC): Note that these are Ready for Motion. They just missed the motion prep window during May. Will be included in the next motion.
  4. **Review Doc 11-23/928r0** Emily QI (Intel)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0928-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-lb273-ed1-comments.docx>
     2. CID 4013 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. We cannot just accept as there is an “in” that also needs to be deleted.
        3. Proposed Resolution: Revised:

Change the table title to “Maximum data unit sizes and durations.”

Change “size” of the first row to “size (in octets)”

Change “duration” of the first column to “duration (in microseconds)”.

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4025 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
       3. After deciding the commented location was ok, it was pointed out that there was another location that should also be changed.
       4. Updated Proposed Resolution: Revisit CID 4025 (ED1): Revised. Change "non-RSN association" to "non-RSNA" at 1871.20, and "RSN association" to "RSNA" 2864.24, and "RSNA (re)associations" to "RSNAs" at 1871.24.
       5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    2. CID 4096 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4106 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review Discussion in submission.
       3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4106 (ED1): Accepted. Note to editor: locations are: 202.22 and 202.56.
       4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    2. CID 4114 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review Discussion in Submission.
       3. Mark CID More Work Required
       4. Assign to Mark HAMILTON.
       5. Schedule for June 12 telecon.
    3. CID 4122 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review discussion in Submission.
       3. 2 options for resolving today presented.
       4. Mark CID More Work Required
       5. Assign to Mark HAMILTON.
       6. Schedule for June 12 telecon.

* + 1. CID 4125 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Discussion on if it should be SA Field or SA Parameter.
       3. After a short discussion, a reject may be better course.
       4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4125 (ED1): Rejected. The SA and DA are associated with an MSDU but are not fields (rather they are parameters in the MA-UNITDATA.request (where they are called "source/destination address")).  The current text is accurate.
       5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4170 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4209 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Discussion on if we need to delete the word “decimal.”
       3. Proposed Resolution CID 4209 (ED1): Revised. Replace "includes a decimal value" with "includes a value (decimal, if numeric)"
    2. CID 4238 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4296 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    2. CID 4301 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    3. CID 4310 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    4. CID 4333 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. Note that the change includes changing “See” to “see”.
       4. Updated Proposed Resolution: CID 4333 (ED1): Accepted. Note to editor, change "See" to "see”.
       5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    5. CID 4334 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Similar to CID 4214 and 4065 (GEN)
       3. Assign to Jouni MALEN
       4. Mark More Work Required
       5. Move to GEN AdHoc
       6. More offline work will be needed.
    6. CID 4361 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review Discussion in submission.
       3. Discussion that there may be an incorrect reference.
       4. Request to check the original 802.11ax reference in this case.
       5. 10.12.5 in 802.11-2020 is the reference that 11ax pointed.
       6. Move to MAC AdHoc
       7. Assign to Stephen MCCANN
       8. Mark CID as More Work Required.
       9. Assign to June 16.
    7. CID 4387 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  1. **Return to doc 11-23/0933r0** - MAC CIDs 4179, 4261, 4312, 4337, 4341, 4370 – RISON (Samsung)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-00-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>
     2. CID 4139 (ED2)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review Discussion in Submission.
        3. The use of “Subclause” is not normal – remove from changes.
        4. In Figure 13-2, there is a hyphen that should be fixed another time.
        5. Corrected proposed resolution.
        6. Proposed Resolution: CID 4139 (ED2): Revised. Make the changes proposed by the commenter except say just "13.1" not "subclause 13.1" in 9.4.2.201.
        7. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  2. **Adjourned at 12:01pm ET.**

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Friday, May 26, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order** 10:04 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
      1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
      2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
      3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Editor - Edward AU (Huawei) Joined late about 10:40am
      5. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
   3. **Telecon Attendance:**
      1. IMAT Reported

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 2 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
| 3 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| 4 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 5 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 6 | Mukkapati, Lakshmi Narayana | Wi-Fi Alliance |
| 7 | Patwardhan, Gaurav | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
| 8 | Petrick, Albert | Jones-Petrick and Associates, LLC. |
| 9 | Qi, Emily | Intel |
| 10 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 11 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 12 | Smith, Graham | SR Technologies |
| 13 | Thakore, Darshak | Cable Television Laboratories Inc. (CableLabs) |

* + 1. Not reported in IMAT but on WebEx:
       1. Youhan Kim, (Qualcomm)
       2. Reza Hedayat (Apple)
       3. Chang-Mou Yang (Moxa)
       4. Yong Liu (Apple)
       5. Jarkko Kneckt (Apple)
       6. Ziming He, (Samsung)
       7. Sidharth Thakur (Apple)
       8. Po-Kai Huang, (Intel)
       9. Peshal Nayak, (Samsung Research America)
       10. Robert Stacey, (Intel)
       11. Brian Hart (Cisco Systems)
  1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
     1. No issues noted.
  2. **Review Agenda:** 11-23/0897r2:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-02-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
     2. Friday’s Agenda:

1. Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance>), and patent and copyright policy

a. Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:

i. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or

ii. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or

iii. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. Copyright Policy:

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c. Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides:

See slides 10-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>

d. Agenda Approval

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3. Comment resolution and motions

1. **Friday June 2, 2022 – 10am – noon Eastern**
   1. Comment resolution
      1. ED1 CIDs – Rison (Samsung)
      2. CIDs 4068, 4070, 4071, 4075, 4254, 4266, 4273, 4315, 4214, 4065, 4334 – doc 11-23/858 – Malinen (Qualcomm)
      3. CID 4069 – doc 11-23/537 – Malinen (Qualcomm)
      4. ED1 CIDs – Qi (Intel)

5. AOB

6. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda.
       1. Mark RISON must leave early, so move to first.
       2. Alfred Asterjadhi is not present – move his to another Telecon.
       3. Jouni MALINEN validated his list of CIDs and added another doc 11-23/537
       4. Three additional CIDs 4214, 4065, 4334 added.
       5. Note we will Cancel the June 19th Telecon and request an extra slot in the July Plenary.
       6. No objection to updated Agenda. See 11-23/0897r2.
  1. **Editor Report** Emily QI
     1. **No Items from Editor**
  2. ED1 CIDs – RISON (Samsung)
     1. Emily QI to show the Database to review the ED1 CIDs.
     2. CID 4199 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. The direction was discussed.
        3. No objection to Direction but need to bring in submission.
        4. Mark More Work Required
        5. Schedule for Mid-June Telecon.
     3. CID 4201 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Discussion of the Direction
        3. Concern/Objection on possible changes in Clause 12 and 13.
        4. CID 4201 (ED1): More work required.
        5. Bring back in mid-June.
        6. Assign to Mark RISON

* + 1. CID 4208 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review Context on page 1876.
       3. No objection to Direction.
       4. CID 4208 (ED1): More work required.
       5. Bring back in mid-June. Assign to Mark RISON.
    2. CID 4216 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Discussion on if wakeup is wake-up with a hyphen or not.
       3. Discussion on the direction of changes to wakeup.
       4. The use of “wake-up” has 406 instances for Wake-up Radio 802.11ba.
       5. No consensus for the proceeding in this direction.
       6. Proposed Resolution: Rejected; Insufficient Details.
       7. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
    3. CID 4220 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review Context on page 762.
       3. Change to “allocated to” as a possible direction.
       4. Discussion on how values may be allocated to a requesting outside group.
       5. Look at the naming of the fields where it is now called “Reserved” .
       6. Discussion on what the field should be called and how to note it.
       7. What the information field name should be changed to.
       8. 802.11 COR has the following in this particular field: “Used by a specific organization. This reserved bit is used by the Wi-FiAlliance®: https://www wifi.org. This information is given for theconvenience of the user of this standard and does not constitute anendorsement by the IEEE.”
       9. The Draft should be updated to use the Corrigendum text.
       10. Mark CID as More work required.
       11. Schedule to bring back in late-June.
       12. Assign to Mark RISON.
       13. Expect Discussion on the reflector
    4. CID 4278 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Discussion on the direction.
       3. Discussion on the need to add a general statement in 1.4 for lower case “beacon” usage.
       4. There is a distinct meaning for upper- and lower-case use of “Beacon”.
       5. Mark CID as More work required.
       6. Schedule to bring back in mid-June.
       7. Assign to Mark RISON.

* + 1. CID 4303 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review page 651 as example for context.
       3. Discussion on the naming of the frame and when the usage of Acronyms.
       4. There should be one name, and then the Acronyms should be explained in body of text.
       5. Mark CID as More work required.
       6. Schedule to bring back in mid-June.
       7. Assign to Mark RISON.

* + 1. CID 4340 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Mark CID as More work required.
       3. Schedule to bring back in mid-June.
       4. Assign to Mark RISON.

* + 1. CID (4356 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Look at uses with “GAS” vs without “GAS”.
       3. Mark CID as More work required.
       4. Schedule to bring back in mid-June.
       5. Assign to Mark RISON.
    2. Need to prioritize Mark RISON’s CIDs to ensure that the MBS CIDs are resolved first and not use too much time on the non-MBS CIDs.
  1. Review doc: 11-23/0858r6 - Jouni MALINEN (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>
     2. CID 4068 (SEC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review the discussion in the submission.
        3. Review Proposed Changes.
        4. Same change as proposed by CID 4254.
        5. The figure U-1 is now in different Annex, but unchanged.
        6. Proposed Resolution: CID 4068 (SEC): REVISED – At P3009 L51 delete “The Remote Request/Response frame contains Version, Type, and Length fields, along with the AP Address.”. Note to Editors: CID 4254 has an identical change.
        7. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4254 (SEC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4254 (SEC): ACCEPTED. Note to Editors: CID 4068 has an identical change.
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     4. CID 4070 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review the discussion in the submission.
        3. These changes are necessary for WUR and 11az to work correctly.
        4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4070 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-02 15:09:20Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-23/0858r6 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>) for CID 4070.
        5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     5. CID 4071 (SEC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review the discussion in the submission.
        3. Discussion of the options.
        4. If we deprecate “preauthentication”, it should be noted in may be more than one location.
        5. Jouni M will add the other locations to mark deprecated per our discussion.
        6. Proposed Resolution: CID 4071 (SEC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-02 15:09:20Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-23/0858r7 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-07-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>) for CID 4071, option 2.
        7. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4075 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review the discussion in the submission.
       3. From the WebEx chat, to capture the places that were mentioned on CID 4071: It was suggested the "NOTE--Preauthentication is deprecated" in 9.4.2.23.1 RSNE/General, and 9.4.2.23.4 RSNE/RSN capabilities (on the Bit 0 description).
       4. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (SEC: 2023-06-02 15:23:15Z) - Incorporate changes under the “Proposed changes for CID 4075” section of <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>. S1G STAs are required to use PV1 Management frames when the peer is known to support them (see 10.57). While there are no PV1 version of Deauthentication and Disassociation frames, reordering of PV1 Action frame and a PV0 Deauthentication/Disassociation frame is not of much concern since the Action frame is not valid after deauthentication/disassociation. The changes to the standard add a note to describe this.
       5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4135 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review the discussion in the submission.
       3. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (SEC: 2023-06-02 15:24:45Z) - Incorporate changes under the “Proposed changes for CID 4075” section of <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>. S1G STAs are required to use PV1 Management frames when the peer is known to support them (see 10.57). While there are no PV1 version of Deauthentication and Disassociation frames, reordering of PV1 Action frame and a PV0 Deauthentication/Disassociation frame is not of much concern since the Action frame is not valid after deauthentication/disassociation. The changes to the standard add a note to describe this.
       4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4266 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review the discussion in the submission.
       3. Discussion on the language that may be considered rather than reject the CID.
       4. Mark More Work Required
       5. Assign to Jouni MALINEN
       6. Schedule for June 12 or 16.
    2. CID 4273 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review the discussion in the submission.
       3. Two options reviewed.
       4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4273 (SEC): REVISED – Incorporate changes under the “Proposed changes for CID 4273” section of 11-23/0858r6 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>) This implements a change that addresses the receiver side requirement more appropriately following the likely intent of the comment.
       5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    3. CID 4065 (GEN) 4214 (GEN) and 4334 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment.s
       2. Review the discussion in the submission.
       3. These CIDS were in different AdHoc Groups but have now been moved to GEN AdHoc Group.
       4. Proposed Resolution: CIDs 4065 (GEN), 4214 (GEN), 4334 (GEN): Revised. Incorporate changes under the “Proposed changes for CID 4065/4214/4334” section of 11-23/0858r6,( <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>).
       5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  1. **Review Doc 11-23/0537r5 - Jouni MALINEN (Qualcomm)**
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0537-05-000m-reassociating-sta-recognition.docx>
     2. CID 4069 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.s
        2. Review the discussion in the submission.
        3. The Resolution needs to not promise future work or assigned to other TG.
        4. One objection to the proposed resolution, but unsure if we need more debate at a later time.
        5. Mark this CID as a Separate Motion (Expected motions are on June 16th).
        6. Discussion on adding “(re)” to association.
        7. A Note to the discussion was requested.
        8. Discussion on when SA-Query can be skipped.
        9. Proposed Resolution: CID 4069 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-02 15:49:42Z): Incorporate changes under the “Proposed changes for CID 4069” section of11-23/0537r6 ( <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0537-06-000m-reassociating-sta-recognition.docx>). This is an updated version of the changes proposed in the comment with additional changes to address items that came up while discussing the comment. This covers only the optimization for reassociation-back-to-same-BSS case. Recognition of a returning STA for protecting a MAC address is being discussed in P802.11bh.
        10. CID 4069 (MAC): Bring on separate motion.
        11. ACTION ITEM #2: Jouni to post to the reflector a discussion on CID 4069 (MAC) resolution in this direction for motion and call for comments ahead of the motion meeting. (June 16)
        12. Mark Ready for Motion.
  2. **Adjourned 12:01pm**

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Monday, June 12, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order** 10:04 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
      1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
      2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
      3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
      5. Not present:
         1. Editor - Edward AU (Huawei)
   3. **Telecon Attendance:**
      1. IMAT Reported

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 2 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| 3 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 4 | Qi, Emily | Intel |
| 5 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 6 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |

* + 1. Not reported in IMAT but on WebEx:
       1. Sidharth Thakur (Apple)
       2. Reza Hedayat (Apple)
       3. Brian Hart (Cisco)
       4. Joseph Levy, (Interdigital)
  1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
     1. No issues noted.
  2. **Review Agenda:** 11-23/0897r2:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-02-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
     2. Proposed Agenda:

1. Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance>), and patent and copyright policy

a. Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:

i. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or

ii. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or

iii. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. Copyright Policy:

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c. Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides:

See slides 10-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>

d. Agenda Approval

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3. Comment resolution and motions

1. **Monday June 12, 2022 – 10am – noon Eastern** 
   1. Comment resolution
      1. CIDs 4312, 4198 (MAC) – doc 11-23/929 – Hart (Cisco)
      2. MAC CIDs 4179 – RISON (Samsung)
      3. Misc CIDs – Asterjadhi (Qualcomm)
      4. CID 4114, 4122 (ED1) – Hamilton (Ruckus-Commscope
      5. GEN Review CIDs – Rosdahl (Qualcomm)

5. AOB

6. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda.
       1. Alfred not present move to June 23.
       2. Add CIDs 4071, 4266, 4069 – Jouni MALINEN (Qualcomm) (11-23/858 & 11-23/537)
       3. Add doc 11-23/831 Brian HART (Cisco)
    2. No Objection to updated Agenda –
  1. **Editor Report** Emily QI (Intel).
     1. Nothing to report.
  2. **Review doc 11-23/929 – CIDs 4312, 4198 (MAC**) – Brian HART (Cisco)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-02-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>
     2. CID 4312, 4198 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review history of comments.
        3. Review discussion in submission.
        4. New sub element use “set to” and non-extensible.
        5. Discussion on the use of the sub element.
        6. Discussion on when X Max field is present and what value.
        7. Discussion on how different sub elements relate one to another.
        8. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-12 14:33:14Z): Incorporate the changes shown in 11-23/929r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-02-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>), which restored Location Reference (CID 4312) and addresses points made in CID 4198.
        9. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  3. **Review Doc 11-21/933r1Mark** RISON (Samsung)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-01-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>
     2. CID 4179 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review the discussion and proposed changes in the submission.
        3. Discussion on the proposed changes did not necessitate any changes.
        4. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-12 14:47:11Z): Incorporate the changes shown in 11-23/0933r1 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-01-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>) for CID 4179, which removes "valid"s, and also changes "recognizes" wording to "receives" wording.
        5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  4. **Review doc 11-23/858r7 CID 4071, 4266, 4069 (SEC)** – Jouni MALINEN (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-07-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>
     2. CID 4071 (SEC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review proposed updated changes.
        3. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (SEC: 2023-06-02 15:18:33Z) - Incorporate changes under the “Proposed changes for CID 4071 – option 2” section of <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-07-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>. This deprecates preauthentication as proposed in the comment. In addition, this explicitly disallows use of PMKSAs from preauthentication when using AKMs that use longer PMK.
        4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4266 (SEC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review proposed updated changes.
        3. Proposed Resolution:
        4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     4. CID 4069 is in 11-23/537r6:
        1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0537-06-000m-reassociating-sta-recognition.docx>
        2. No negative feedback on this CID. The Action item was to follow up on the Listserv reflector.
  5. **GEN CIDS –** Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
     1. Show Database, but participants can follow along in doc 11-23/0840r2:
        1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0840-02-000m-revme-gen-ad-hoc-comments-on-lb273.xlsx>
     2. CID 4269 (GEN)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:03:30Z)
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4339 (GEN)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:05:49Z)

Note to Editor Please use R1 as noted and see margin Comments.

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    1. CID 4107 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4107 (GEN) REVISED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:14:32Z) Add to the second bullet second sentence (the exceptions): ", or the frame is received at an AP from a non-AP STA with an individual RA."
       3. Mark CID 4107 and 4270 (GEN) - More work required.
       4. Schedule for review on June 26 telecon
    2. CID 4127 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4127 (GEN) REVISED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:26:55Z) Change "The services provided by the MLME to the SME are specified in this subclause." to "The services provided by the MLME to the SME are specified in Table 6-1. "
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    3. CID 4129 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:29:14Z)

Note to Editor The new row may be inserted after "Load"

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    1. CID 4153 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: REJECTED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:31:57Z) Rejected; The "Channel Switch Timing,(11ax)" parameter is in the list of parameters, and then in the table at p439.3" there is not a "Channel Switch Time" parameter.
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    2. CID 4332 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4332 (GEN) REVISED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:38:39Z) Change "The MAC uses the key with the associated Key ID and Address parameters(#3711) for the transmission of subsequent frames to which the key applies (as defined by the Key Type, Key ID and Address parameters)." to The MAC uses the key and key ID for the transmission of subsequent frames to which the key and key ID apply (as defined by the Key Type and Address parameters). NOTE—If more than one key (and key ID) can be used for transmission for a particular key type and address, the MAC chooses the key and key ID to use.
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    3. CID 4054 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4054 (GEN) REVISED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:50:22Z) Replace the cited Note with "NOTE 1—Whether or not a Max Channel Switch Time element is included, regulations in certain regulatory domains might forbid a STA from transmitting on a new channel until it has received an enabling signal (e.g., a Beacon frame)."
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* 1. **Review doc 11-23/831r1** Brian HART (Cisco)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0831-01-000m-miscellaneous-comment-resolutions.docx>
     2. CID 4013 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4013 (ED1): Revised. Incorporate the changes in 23/831r2 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0831-02-000m-miscellaneous-comment-resolutions.docx>) that substantially align with the commenter’s resolution.
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
     3. CID 4023 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review Proposed changes.
        3. Discussion on if we make change, where to put it.
        4. Addressing Non-AP STA are already covered in IEEE 802, so we don’t need to replicate the concept here.
        5. Alternate would be to move the last two sentences to the PMKSA clause.
        6. No consensus was identified on the call.
        7. More Work Required.
        8. Assign to Brian Hart
        9. Scheduled for June 26th telecon.
  2. **Adjourned 12:01 PM ET.**

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Friday, June 16, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order** 10:08 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
      1. Present:
         1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
         2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
         3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
         4. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm) arrived late 10:24am.
      2. Not present:
         1. Editor - Edward AU (Huawei)
   3. **Telecon Attendance:**
      1. IMAT Reported**:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Bredewoud, Albert | Broadcom Corporation |
| 2 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 3 | Hedayat, Ahmadreza | Apple Inc. |
| 4 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 5 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
| 6 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| 7 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 8 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 9 | Mukkapati, Lakshmi Narayana | Wi-Fi Alliance |
| 10 | Petrick, Albert | Jones-Petrick and Associates, LLC. |
| 11 | Qi, Emily | Intel |
| 12 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 13 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 14 | Thakur, Sidharth | Apple Inc. |

* + 1. Not reported in IMAT but on WebEx:
       1. Brian Hart (Cisco)
  1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
     1. No issues noted.
  2. **Review Agenda:** 11-23/0897r4:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-04-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
     2. Proposed Agenda:

1. Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance>), and patent and copyright policy

a. Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:

i. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or

ii. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or

iii. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. Copyright Policy:

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c. Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides:

See slides 10-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>

d. Agenda Approval

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3. Comment resolution and motions

**d) Friday June 16, 2023 – 10am – noon Eastern**

1. Motions

a. Doc 11-23/24r8 slides 21 to 23.

2. Comment resolution

a. CID 4361 – doc 11-23/1013 – McCann (Huawei)

b. SEC CIDs – doc 11-23/780 – Montemurro (Huawei)

4. AOB

5. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda.
    2. No Objection to updated Agenda.
  1. **Editor Report** Emily QI (Intel).
     1. Nothing to report.
  2. **Motions 11-23-0024r8**
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0024-08-000m-revme-motions.pptx>
     2. **Motion 110 – EDITOR1, EDITOR2 CIDs (2023-06-16)**
        1. Approve the comment resolutions in the

“Motion-EDITOR1-3A” (17 CIDs) tabs in 11-23/0834r4 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0834-04-000m-revme-wg-lb273-editor1-ad-hoc-comments.xlsx>),

“Motion ED2-273-03” (1 CIDs) tab in 11-23/0778r4 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0778-04-000m-revme-editor2-ad-hoc-comments-on-lb273.xlsx>)

and incorporate the text changes into the TGme draft.

* + - 1. Moved: Emily QI
      2. Seconded: Stephen MCCANN
      3. Discussion:
         1. Is the fix for the missing hyphen included in the EDITOR1 comments?
         2. Yes.
      4. **Results Motion #110:** No Objection – Unanimous Consent – Motion Approved.
    1. **Motion 111 – GEN, MAC, PHY, SEC CIDs (2023-06-16)**
       1. Approve the comment resolutions in the

“GEN Motion A” (3 CIDs) and "GEN Motion B" (7 CIDs) in 11-23/0840r4 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0840-04-000m-revme-gen-ad-hoc-comments-on-lb273.xlsx>),

“Motion MAC-BF” tabs (22 CIDs) with the exception of CID 4014, 4312, and 4198 in 11-21/0793r40 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0793-40-000m-revme-mac-comments.xls>),

“Security Motion B” tab (7 CID) in 11-23/0780r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0780-03-000m-revme-lb273-sec-adhoc-comments.xlsx>)

and incorporate the text changes into the TGme draft.

* + - 1. Moved: Stephen MCCANN
      2. Seconded: Mark HAMILTON
      3. Discussion:
         1. Pulled 4014. Defer to 11-23/0831 (Brian HART).
         2. Request to pull 4312, 4198. We’ve spent a lot of time on these, not sure we have more agenda time available. If we pull these for further discussion, we may not get it finished.
         3. Decided to pull into a separate motion.
         4. Discussion on CID 4014 and decided the resolution was trivial and resolved it in an earlier meeting (May 18)
         5. There is a document (11-23-0831) associated with these CIDs.
         6. Discussion to keep it open and not include it in this motion.
      4. **Results Motion #111:** No Objection – Unanimous Consent – Motion Approved.
    1. **Motion 112 – CID 4069 (MAC) (2023-06-16)**
       1. Approve the comment resolution for CID 4069 on the “Motion MAC-4069” tab of doc 11-21/0793r40 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0793-40-000m-revme-mac-comments.xls>),

and incorporate the text changes into the TGme draft.

* + - 1. Moved: Mark Hamilton
      2. Seconded: Stephen McCann
      3. Discussion:
         1. Does the Comment Resolution not include some Review Comment.s made by email?
         2. Yes, that’s correct; they were received too late.
      4. **Results Motion #113**: 4 –Yes; 1 – No, 6 – Abstain. Passes.
         1. *(Post Meeting, the chair validated the results – no change).*
    1. **Motion 113 – CID 4312, and 4198 (MAC) (2023-06-16)**
       1. Approve the comment resolutions for CIDs 4312 and 4198 on the “Motion MAC-BF” tab of doc 11-21/793r40 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0793-40-000m-revme-mac-comments.xls>),

and incorporate the text changes into the TGme draft.

* + - 1. Moved: Mark HAMILTON
      2. Second Stephen MCCANN
      3. Discussion:
         1. There is apparently an existing implementation that uses URL parameters for map representation. We could motion this in, and do clean-up next time, or hold this off and do it all next time.
         2. Discussion on we could try to address those concerns and motion this at the July plenary, or motion today, and fix it up at the July plenary.
         3. Chair: Stated concern that we won’t have time to get to this during July plenary.
      4. **Results Motion #113:** No Objection – Unanimous Consent – Motion Approved.
  1. **Review Doc 11-23/1013r0** -- CID 4361 - Stephen MCCANN (Huawei)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1013-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4361.docx>
     2. CID 4361 (MAC):
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review discussion in submission
        3. Correct cross reference is 10.12.2.
        4. Extra locations noted.
        5. Review proposed changes.
        6. Discussion on why A-MPDU clause is cited instead of a MPDU clause?
        7. Discussion of taking a 10.12.5 sentence may need to be duplicated in a different place. (10.12.2?).
        8. There does not seem to be a separate clause on MPDU sizes.
        9. An Alternative would be to remove the Cross reference (9 of them).
        10. Discussion on direction.
        11. Mark CID More Work Required
        12. Assigned to Stephen MCCANN
        13. Schedule for 26 June
  2. **Review Doc 11-23/0946r2** - SEC CIDS – Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0946-02-000m-lb273-sec-adhoc-comment-resolutions-part-1.docx>
     2. CID 4175 (SEC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4300 (SEC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     4. CID 4117 (SEC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution:

REVISED. The current cited text is correct in terms of FILS behavior. A note is added to tie that behaviour to the MIB variable for authentication.

At 2948.45, insert the following note: “NOTE – An AP with dot11AuthenticationAlgorithmsTable including an entry with dot11AuthenticationAlgorithm equal to filsSharedKeyWithoutPFS, filsSharedKeyWithPFS, or filsPublicKey is capable of performing FILS authentication.”

At 2949.23, insert the following note: “NOTE – A STA with dot11AuthenticationAlgorithmsTable including an entry with dot11AuthenticationAlgorithm equal to filsSharedKeyWithoutPFS, filsSharedKeyWithPFS, or filsPublicKey is capable of performing FILS authentication.”

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    1. CID 4293 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    2. CID 4166 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Discussion on proposed changes that needed updating.
       3. Reference page 2844 –
       4. Remove the word “link” to allow this proposed change to meet consensus for the group.
       5. Proposed Resolution:

Revised.  Update the text at 5 locations indicating that the condition is “If MFP is negotiated …”

At 2844.18 and 2854.6, change “If the receiver set the MFPC bit on a given link to 1, it shall” to “If management frame protection is negotiated, the receiver shall”

At 2844.1 and 2853.54, change “If the recipient set the MFPC bit on a given link to 1, it shall” to “If management frame protection is negotiated, the receiver shall”

At 2537.61, change “If a STA and its peer on a given link both set the MFPC bit to 1, the STA…” to “If a STA and its peer negotiate management frame protection, the STA…”

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    1. CID 4319 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review discussion in submission
       3. Discussion on the proposed change that seems to be adding what 802.11bc will add when it is rolled in.
       4. Alternate wording to Reject the CID was discussed.
       5. Proposed Resolution: REJECTED. When P802.11bc is rolled-in to the baseline, a group-addressed management frame can be transmitted to a multicast RA.
       6. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    2. CID 4322 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review discussion in submission
       3. Look for rationale for Rejection.
       4. Discussion reason for accepted.
       5. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
       6. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    3. CID 4299 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review discussion in submission
       3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
       4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    4. CID 4108 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review discussion in submission
       3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4108 (SEC): Rejected. The resolution approved by the TG was REVISED and adopted the changes in doc 11-22/2069r9 in D3.0.
       4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    5. CID 4109 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review discussion in submission
       3. Discussion on the reject reason, but not clear what the reason for rejecting would be.
       4. Mark CID More Work Required.
       5. Assigned to Mike MONTEMURRO
       6. Schedule for July F2F
    6. CID 4230 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review discussion in submission.
       3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
       4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    7. CID 4144 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review discussion in submission.
       3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
       4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    8. CID 4165 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review discussion in submission.
       3. Discussion on the proposed change consequences and determine a better resolution.
       4. Discussion on if the scope of the changes was to primarily just fix up the field names.
       5. Proposed Resolution: REVISED. At cited location, change “PairwiseCipherSuite field of the RSNE identifies the cipher suite used to protect the Data frames sent over the TDLS direct link” to “Pairwise Cipher Suite List field of the RSNE identifies the cipher suite used to protect the Data frames sent over the TDLS direct link” At line 41, Change "TimeoutIntervalType" to "Timeout Interval Type"  At line 47 change "AKM suite list" to "AKM Suite List", but should be “AKM Suite List field”
       6. With one Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    9. CID 4229 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review discussion in submission.
       3. Discussion on RSNE and TDLS operation in practice.
       4. We should not change this as TDLS would be broken.
       5. Proposed Resolution: REJECTED. The purpose of the RSNE used in the TPK handshake is to negotiate a secure TDLS link. The TDLS Responder STA is required to evaluate the RSN Capabilities received in TPK handshake message one and include the same value in message 2.
       6. ACTION ITEM #3: Mike MONTEMURRO - Need to update the Rejection reason for CID 4229 (SEC) –will update and notify TGme
       7. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    10. CID 4143 (SEC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review discussion in submission.
        3. Discussion on context on page 2934.
        4. Discussion on how to change the procedure on page 2934
           1. Add to p2934.44. # Global initialization and at line 50 “# Per-frame processing”
        5. Proposed Resolution: REVISED. Change “PreANonce” to “PrevANonce” at cited locations.

At 2933.44, add “# Global initialization PrevANonce ← 0”

At 2933.50, add “# Frame specific processing”

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    1. CID 4396 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review discussion in submission.
       3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4396 (SEC): REVISED. The use of FT with SAE is covered in the next paragraph. See p2971.32. Change the caption of Figure 13.2 to the following: “FT initial mobility domain association in an RSN using Open System authentication.”
       4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* 1. **Adjourned 12:00**

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Friday, June 23, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order** 10:03 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
      1. Present:
         1. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
         2. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
         3. Editor - Edward AU (Huawei)
      2. Not present:
         1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
         2. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
   3. **Telecon Attendance:**
      1. IMAT Reported**:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Ajami, Abdel Karim | Qualcomm Incorporated |
| 2 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 3 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
| 4 | Hedayat, Ahmadreza | Apple Inc. |
| 5 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 6 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 7 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 8 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 9 | Smith, Graham | SR Technologies |
| 10 | Thakore, Darshak | Cable Television Laboratories Inc. (CableLabs) |
| 11 | Urabe, Yoshio | Panasonic Holdings Corporation |
| 12 | Wei, Dong | NXP Semiconductors |

* + 1. Not reported in IMAT but on WebEx:
       1. [Alfred Asterjadhi, (Qualcomm Inc.](javascript:;))
       2. Brian Hart (Cisco)
       3. [Emily Qi (Intel)](javascript:;)
       4. [Sidharth Thakur, (Apple](javascript:;))
       5. [You-wei Chen (Mediatek](javascript:;))
  1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
     1. No issues noted.
  2. **Review Agenda:** 11-23/0897r7:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-07-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
     2. Proposed Agenda:

1. Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance>), and patent and copyright policy

a. Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:

i. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or

ii. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or

iii. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. Copyright Policy:

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c. Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides:

See slides 10-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>

d. Agenda Approval

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3. Comment resolution and motions

**e) Friday June 23, 2023 – 10am – noon Eastern**

2. Comment resolution

a. CID 4027, 4414 – Withdrawn by commenter

b. ED1 CIDs – Qi (Intel)

c. Doc 11-23/1004 – Qi (Intel)

d. Misc CIDs – Asterjadhi (Qualcomm)

e. MAC CIDs 4341 – Rison (Samsung)

f. PHY Review CIDs – Rison (Samsung)

4. AOB

5. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda.
    2. No Objection to updated Agenda.
  1. **Editor Report** Emily QI (Intel).
     1. The resolved and motioned comment resolutions from May and June should be complete by July 4th. Volunteers to review the update draft would be appreciated. D3.1 should be ready before the IEEE 802.11 July plenary.
  2. **Withdrawn Comments**
     1. CID 4027 (SEC) and CID 4414 (MAC)
        1. Comments have been withdrawn.
        2. Proposed Resolution: Rejected. Comment has been withdrawn by commenter.
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  3. **Review Doc 11-23/0928r3** – Emily Qi (Intel)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0928-02-000m-proposed-resolution-for-lb273-ed1-comments.docx>
     2. CID 4156 (ED1):
        1. Review Comment.
        2. The recommendation is rejected, as the cited text is clear.
        3. Q: This is ok, but I thought the process of IEEE editing needs to be clarified.
        4. Chair: I think the REVme editor just needs to note the CID number and that’s it.
        5. C: That’s fair enough, although the IEEE editor should be mentioned in the database.
        6. Proposed Resolution: Rejected: REJECTED. The standard will be professionally edited prior to publication. The Greek letter glyphs usage will be referred to the publication editor for consideration during preparation for publication.
        7. No Objection – Mark Ready for motion
     3. CID 4169 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. C: I would pronounce “an SID”, as “an ESS-EYE-DEE”.
        3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted, Note to Editor: 12 instances.
        4. No Objection – Mark Ready for motion
     4. CID 4181 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted, Note to Editor: 18 instances.
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     5. CID 4210 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment
        2. C: Perhaps the same resolution as CID 4209 could be used.
        3. Chair: There doesn’t appear to be a set of changes for this comment.
        4. Proposed Resolution: Rejected: It is OK to have numeric values in a field or subfield.
        5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     6. CID 4336 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. C: I think the style guide should be followed.
        3. C: However, the style guide does state “may”, so perhaps we can change the capitalization after all.
        4. **Straw poll: Do you agree to reject CID 4336?**
           1. Yes: 4, No: 1, Abstain: 5
        5. Proposed Resolution: Rejected: “Operating Class and Channel field" is legacy text and remains unchanged. For any new field name definition, all words in the name (excluding acronyms) should be capitalized, including prepositions and conjunctions, as it stated in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/09/11-09-1034-20-0000-802-11-editorial-style-guide.docx>.”
        6. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     7. CID 4357 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. C: It appears that an earlier change was made to the wrong definition in D1.4.
        3. Q: This change will lose the acronym in square braces.
        4. A: Yes, but that can be modified.
        5. More work required. Scheduled for the July plenary, Tuesday PM2
        6. CID re-assigned to Youhan Kim.
     8. CID 4359 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     9. CID 4406 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. C: It looks as though the wrong field is being referred to.
        3. Proposed Resolution: Revised: At 1283.13, Change “The NDP Paging field is present if the NDP Paging Indicator subfield is equal to 1; otherwise, the NDP Paging field is not present.” To“The NDP Paging Indicator subfield is set to 1 to indicate that the NDP Paging field is present; otherwise, it is set to 0.”
        4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  4. **Review Doc 11-23/1004r0** – Emily Qi (Intel)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1004-00-000m-proposed-additional-changes-for-cid-4028.docx>
     2. Additional changes on top of the approved resolution to CID 4028.
     3. Feedback from various members has mentioned that a sentence needs to be replaced, to how it was before.
     4. Therefore this document proposes that an additional sentence be added in 11.21.15 and CID 4028 does not need to be re-opened.
     5. C: The sentence contains the word “shall” that I’m not sure about. I think it’s ambiguous. It may be better to say “the STA uses the channel switch procedures…”
     6. C: Or “follows”
     7. C: There’s a typo in the motion text.
     8. Q: In the paragraph, there appear to be some “TBD”s. Is that correct?
     9. A: Yes. They will change in the next draft.
     10. The submission is updated to 11-23-1004r1.
         1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1004-01-000m-proposed-additional-changes-for-cid-4028.docx>
     11. C: I think a note should also be provided to assist the reader with the channel switch procedures reference.
     12. **Straw Poll: The proposed additional changes for CID 4028 should be a note?**
         1. Yes: 2, No: 4, Abstain: 8
     13. Chair: Can an email be sent to the reflector asking for opinions?
     14. A: I don’t think that is necessary, as I’m ok to change the additional sentence to a note.
     15. Chair: Let’s decide how to move forward during the July plenary.
  5. **Review Doc 11-23/0951r0** – Alfred Asterjadhi (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0951-00-000m-cr-for-assigned-cids-part-1.docx>
     2. CID 4416 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Q: I’m not sure how this change could be made?
        3. A: Yes, as It is difficult to check all the missing entries.
        4. Chair: Can the second note be removed?
        5. Agree with the comment. Proposed resolution is to provide editorial instructions to the editor to make the change.
        6. REVme Editors: Please insert a new bullet "QoS Null" in p2002.39 of REVme D3.0
        7. REVme Editors note: Please ensure that all changes in IEEE Std 802.11ax-2021.
        8. are rolled into REVme drafts.
        9. Submission revised to 11-23-0951r1:
           1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0951-01-000m-cr-for-assigned-cids-part-1.docx>
        10. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4413 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Q: If the last 9 bits are 0, then it’s a multiple of 512, whereas I thought it was a multiple of 1024.
        3. A: Oh, ok.
        4. C: I don’t think the changed sentence is the same. The TWT wake interval can be any value, but if it’s not a multiple of 1 TU, then misalignment can occur. Therefore, the new sentence may change the behavior of the device.
        5. C: That was not the intention.
        6. Proposed Resolution: Revised: Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution is to clarify that the TWT wake interval is set to values that are multiples of 1 TU, so that the times indicated by the TWT field and the TWT wake interval + the previous TWT fields are consistent. This is for the periodic case.   
           TGme editor: please implement changes as shown in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0951-01-000m-cr-for-assigned-cids-part-1.docx> tagged 4413.
        7. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     4. CID 4005 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Q: It appears that the only different between the 1st and 2nd sentences are a “shall” and a “should”.
        3. A: Yes
        4. Q: So, perhaps a sentence or a note can be added to clarify this.
        5. C: So this will apply for 11ax devices and legacy devices.
        6. More work required. Present during the July plenary.
     5. CID 4341 (MAC)
        1. This is about a BlockAck agreement.
        2. Reflector discussion continues.
        3. **Straw Poll:**
        4. **Do you think that when a BA agreement is modified, any framesthat have been transmitted at least once are discarded at theoriginator (even if an acknowledgment has not been received)and cleared in the recipient scoreboard (even if they werereceived and acked)?**
        5. Yes: 1, No: 2, Abstain: 6
        6. More work required. Present during the July plenary.
  6. **PHY comment review** – Mark Rison (Samsung)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0727-24-000m-revme-phy-comments.xls>
     2. CID 4045 (PHY)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. C: Some of these values appear to be very pessimistic and I’m hesitant to change this.
        3. C: I think a cross reference back to clause 17 would be ok.
        4. C: But this is a DMG clause, so the values are meaningless.
        5. C: Can I send an email before we make a decision?
        6. Edward AU to send an email to the reflector on this topic.
        7. ACTION ITEM #4: Edward AU to send an email to the reflector on the topic of performance values in the DMG clause See CID 4045 (PHY).
        8. Chair: Let’s do that in parallel to resolving the comment.
        9. Proposed Resolution: Revised: Delete the sentence at the referenced location and at 3720.47.
        10. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4046 (PHY)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  7. **Adjourned 12:00 ET**

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Friday, June 23, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order** 10:03 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
      1. Present:
         1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
         2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
         3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
         4. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
      2. Not present:
         1. Editor - Edward AU (Huawei)
   3. **Telecon Attendance:** 
      1. IMAT Reported**:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Halasz, David | Morse Micro |
| 2 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 3 | Harkins, Daniel | Aruba Networks, Inc. |
| 4 | Hart, Brian | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
| 5 | Hedayat, Ahmadreza | Apple Inc. |
| 6 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 7 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 8 | Qi, Emily | Intel |
| 9 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 10 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 11 | Wentink, Menzo | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |

* + 1. Not reported in IMAT but on WebEx:
       1. [Graham Smith (SRT Wireless)](javascript:;)
       2. [Lakshmi Narayana Mukkapati- [Wi-Fi Alliance]](javascript:;)
  1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
     1. No issues noted.
  2. **Review Agenda:** 11-23/0897r7:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-07-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
     2. Proposed Agenda:

1. Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance>), and patent and copyright policy

a. Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:

i. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or

ii. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or

iii. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. Copyright Policy:

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c. Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides:

See slides 10-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>

d. Agenda Approval

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3. Comment resolution and motions

**f) Monday June 26, 2023 – 10am – noon Eastern**

* 1. Comment resolution
     1. CID 4361 – doc 11-23/1013 – McCann (Huawei)
     2. CID 4036 (GEN) – Rosdahl (Qualcomm)
     3. CID 4114, 4122 (ED1) – Hamilton (Ruckus-Commscope)
     4. CID 4270 and 4107 (GEN) – Hamilton (Ruckus-Commscope)
     5. CID 4023 (SEC) – doc 11-23/831 – Hart (Cisco)
     6. MAC Review CIDs – Hamilton (Ruckus-Commscope)

4. AOB

5. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda.
    2. No Objection to updated Agenda.
  1. **Editor Report** Emily QI (Intel).
     1. Rollin of the approved comments nearly done.
     2. Will have review draft ready Monday, if we can review and back to Emily by Thursday, she may have a draft to post on Friday.
  2. Review doc 11-23/1013 – CID 4361 –McCann (Huawei)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1013-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4361.docx>
     2. CID 4361 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review proposed Resolution.
        3. R1 has some updates and will need to be posted.
        4. References in the change are not any better than existing references.
        5. Another option would be to just remove the references.
        6. Another round to produce a consolidated location of description may be good in next round.
        7. By all references pointing to wrong place would make it easier to fix later.
        8. Not sure that the change would be better, so maybe better to just reject the comment.
        9. Straw Poll: Do you support marking CID 4361 as revised with the resolution in doc 11-23/1013r1?
           1. Results: Yes 3/10 ( 20%)  No 3/10 (30%) Abstain 3/10 ( 30%)
        10. CID 4361 (MAC): Still More Work Required. (Straw Poll results: 3/3/3). Bring back in July.
  3. CID 4036 (GEN) Jon ROSDAHL
     1. Review Comment.
     2. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (GEN: 2023-06-26 14:25:50Z) add editor’s note on top of Figure i (P9L8) as follows: "Editor’s Note: The figure will be updated once amendments are finalized."
     3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
  4. **Review document: 11-23/1059r0** Mark HAMILTON
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1059-00-000m-revme-cids-4270-4107-4114-4122.docx>
     2. This submission covers “4270, 4107, 4114, 4122.”
     3. CID 4270 and 4107 (GEN)
     4. Review submission.
     5. Proposed Resolution: CID 4270 (GEN): Accepted.
     6. Proposed Resolution: CID 4107 (GEN): Revised. At P339.57, change the second bullet to, “-- QoSNoAck, if the frame is a QoS Data frame with an ack policy of No Ack. This service class is also used when the DA parameter is a group address unless the frame is received by an AP or was delivered via DMS or the GCR block ack retransmission policy”.
     7. CID 4114 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review submission discussion.
        3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4114: Revised. Change "PHY Sublayer" to "PHY Layer" in Figure 4-24 (2x), and in Figure 4-25 (2x), and also in text at locations: P3130.23, P3132.39, P3137.37, P3156.33, P3161.12, P3166.12, P3195.56, P3198.28, P3203.34, P3221.28, P3225.53, P3532.1, P3585.20, P4677.38, P4693.29.
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
     8. CID 4122 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review submission discussion.
        3. Request for direction for being able to solve the issue.
        4. May be better to change to consistent use of primitive.
        5. Assigned to Mark HAMILTON
        6. Status: More Work Required.
        7. Schedule for Monday in July Plenary.
  5. **Review doc 11-23/831** – CID 4023 (SEC) – Brian HART (Cisco)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0831-03-000m-miscellaneous-comment-resolutions.docx>
     2. CID 4023 (SEC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review proposed changes and updates made since last presentation.
        3. Review 2 options for resolution.
        4. Discussion on which option to choose.
        5. May be better to do option 1 and send option 2 to TGbh.
        6. Discussion on changing MAC address in other standards.
        7. Option A may be better path to avoid issues that were resolved in the RAC when the cited text was inserted.
        8. No objection to choosing Option A.
        9. Discussion on “This object is not used by APs”
        10. Suggested to have “Not used by APs”
        11. Proposed resolution: CID 4023 (SEC): Make changes under Option A in 11-2/0831r4 (note: r4).
        12. Actual Proposed Resolution: REVISED (SEC: 2023-06-26 14:57:43Z) - Change the description for the dot11MACPrivacyActivated mib variable. At 4941.26, change "This is a control variable. It is written by an external management entity or the SME. Changes take effect as soon as practical in the implementation. This attribute when true, indicates that the STA enables MAC privacy considerations. The capability is disabled otherwise." to "This is a control variable. It is written by an external management entity or the SME. Changes take effect as soon as practical in the implementation. This attribute when true, indicates that the non-AP STA enables MAC privacy considerations. Otherwise, The capability is disabled, and the STA’s MAC address is unchanging. Not used by APs.”
        13. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
  6. **MAC CIDs - Review** – Mark HAMILTON
     1. Follow along with doc: 11-21/0793r40:
        1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0793-40-000m-revme-mac-comments.xls>
     2. CID 4366 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
        3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4352 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review context p1954
        3. Discussion on possible change.
        4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4352 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-26 15:01:51Z): Change to "except that MLME-ADDBA primitives are not used by the originator"
        5. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     4. CID 4244 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proceed with the presumption that the proposed change is ok.
        3. ACTION ITEM #5: Mark HAMILTON to send the proposed resolution for CID 4244 to the Reflector.
        4. Proposed Resolution: Change to "(11ay)In a DMG BSS, when transmitted between EDMG STAs as part of the HT-immediate agreement, BlockAck frames shall be of EDMG Compressed BlockAck frame variant or of EDMG Multi-TID BlockAck variant, and BlockAckReq frames shall be of Compressed BlockAckReq variant or of Multi-TID BlockAckReq variant." (This is the same as the Proposed Change).
        5. No objection -- Mark Ready for Motion
     5. CID 4245 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
        3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
        4. *Secretary Note: we revised the resolution later in today’s call.*
     6. CID 4292 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review Context on page 1807.
        3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     7. Return to CID 4245 (MAC)
        1. Review the context 2004
        2. The comment and the d3.0 text did not match.
        3. Changed resolution: CID 4245 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-26 15:13:05Z) - Delete "(11ay)The EDMG STA may aggregate in a multi-TID A-MPDU QoS Data frames with multiple TIDs as defined in Table 9-632 (A-MPDU contents in the data enabled no immediate response context)" at 2004.7.
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     8. CID 4291 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
        3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     9. CID 4150 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Discussion on need to also fix PPDUs carrying a CMMG NDP as well.
        3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4150 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-26 15:17:10Z) - Make the proposed change, and also at P2046.27 change "only PPDUs carrying a CMMG NDP" to "only PPDUs that are CMMG NDPs".
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     10. CID 4324 (MAC)
         1. Review Comment.
         2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4324 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-26 15:19:58Z): Change the cited text to "The AP shall increase the value (modulo 256) of the Check Beacon field in the next transmitted TIM frame(s) when a critical up-date occurs to any of the elements inside the Beacon or DMG Beacon frame"  (Note to commenter, this clarifies which "Beacon" is being changed.)
         3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
         4. ACTION ITEM #6: Mark HAMILTON to post resolutions to CID 4150 and 4324 to the reflector for review.
     11. CID 4009 (MAC)
         1. Review Comment.
         2. Review proposed changes to be made.
         3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4009 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-26 15:25:47Z) : Change the paragraph to, "The channel usage procedures may be used to assist the STA that operates a noninfrastructure BSS or an off-channel TDLS direct link to better coexist with the infrastructure network by exchanging Channel Usage Request and Response frames."
         4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     12. CID 4353 (MAC)
         1. Review Comment.
         2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
         3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     13. CID 4409 (MAC)
         1. A presentation is coming in July.
         2. Change status to Submission Required – note 11-23/1046 is expected.
     14. CID 4365 (MAC)
         1. Review Comment.
         2. Review context and changes together.
         3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
         4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     15. CID 4275 (MAC)
         1. Review Comment.
         2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
         3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. Review some MAC Discuss CIDS.
    2. CID 4024 (MAC)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Review Context on page 1958
       3. Discussion on how to adjust the figures.
       4. The “O” is ok in the figure, it is just smaller.
       5. 12 WinsizeOJ andWinstartOJ to check.
       6. Mark this CID as submission required.
       7. Assign to Chaoming Luo
    3. Look at other CIDs that are on EDMG/CDMG.
       1. Assign the following CIDs to Mark R: 4196, 4187, 4200, 4195.
    4. CID 4043 (MAC)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Unable to find specific context.
       3. Mark CID as Submission Required
       4. Assigned to Jarkko Kneckt.
    5. CID 4341 (MAC)
       1. Still ongoing discussion on reflector.
    6. CID 4221 (MAC)
       1. Review Comment
       2. There are 22 DTIM in the draft.
       3. Review definition for DTIM Beacon or DTIM Interval. No DTIM by itself.
       4. P2383 – The usage on line 34 should probably be DTIM Beacon.
       5. Mark CID “More Work Required”
       6. Schedule for July Plenary.

* + 1. CID 4329 (MAC)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Discussion on if all locations do talk of Probe Response frames.
       3. Mark CID “Submission Required”
       4. This not about NDP responses – only NDP Probe Requests.

* + 1. CID 4187 (MAC)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Review Table 10-14 for context.
       3. Table 10-15 has conditions that are different.
       4. Mark as “Submission Required”
       5. Assigned to Mark RISON.
  1. **Adjourned at 12:00pm ET.**

**References:**

**May 26, 2023:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-00-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-00-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-00-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0928-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-lb273-ed1-comments.docx>

**June 2, 2023:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-02-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-07-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0537-05-000m-reassociating-sta-recognition.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0537-06-000m-reassociating-sta-recognition.docx>

**June 12, 2023:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-02-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-02-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-02-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-01-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-07-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0537-06-000m-reassociating-sta-recognition.docx>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0840-02-000m-revme-gen-ad-hoc-comments-on-lb273.xlsx>
9. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0831-01-000m-miscellaneous-comment-resolutions.docx>
10. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0831-02-000m-miscellaneous-comment-resolutions.docx>

**June 16, 2023:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-04-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0024-08-000m-revme-motions.pptx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0834-04-000m-revme-wg-lb273-editor1-ad-hoc-comments.xlsx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0778-04-000m-revme-editor2-ad-hoc-comments-on-lb273.xlsx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0840-04-000m-revme-gen-ad-hoc-comments-on-lb273.xlsx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0793-40-000m-revme-mac-comments.xls>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0780-03-000m-revme-lb273-sec-adhoc-comments.xlsx>
9. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1013-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4361.docx>
10. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0946-02-000m-lb273-sec-adhoc-comment-resolutions-part-1.docx>

**June 23, 2023:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-07-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0928-02-000m-proposed-resolution-for-lb273-ed1-comments.docx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1004-00-000m-proposed-additional-changes-for-cid-4028.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0951-01-000m-cr-for-assigned-cids-part-1.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0727-24-000m-revme-phy-comments.xls>

**June 26, 2023:**

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-07-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1013-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4361.docx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-1059-00-000m-revme-cids-4270-4107-4114-4122.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0831-03-000m-miscellaneous-comment-resolutions.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0793-40-000m-revme-mac-comments.xls>