IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Minutes for REVme 2023 May and June Telecons |
| Date: 2023-06-12 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 WHighland, UT 84003 | +1 801 492 4029 | jrosdahl @ ieee . org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the TGme (REVme) telecons held during May and June 2023.

R0: May 26, 2023: Initial minutes.

R1: June 2, 2023, Minutes added.

R2: Jun 12, 2023, Minutes Added – Attendance updates made for previous Telecon.

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Friday, May 26, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
	1. **Called to order** 10:04 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
	2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
		1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
		2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
		3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
		4. Edward AU (Huawei) Joined late about 10:40am
		5. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
		6. Not present:
	3. **Telecon Attendance:**
		1. IMAT Reported**:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 2 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
| 3 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 4 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 5 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| 6 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 7 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 8 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 9 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 10 | Qi, Emily | Intel |
| 11 | Hart, Brian | Cisco |

* + 1. Not reported in IMAT but on WebEx:
			1. Shantidev Mohanty (??)
			2. Brian Hart (Cisco)
			3. Reza Hedayat (Apple)
	1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
		1. No issues noted.
	2. **Review Agenda:** 11-23/0897r0:
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-00-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
		2. Friday’s Agenda:

1. Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance>), and patent and copyright policy

a. Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:

i. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or

ii. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or

iii. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. Copyright Policy:

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c. Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides:

See slides 10-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>

d. Agenda Approval

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3. Comment resolution and motions

a) **Friday May 26, 2023 – 10am – noon Eastern**

a. MAC CIDs 4179, 4261, 4312, 4337, 4341, 4370 – Rison (Samsung)

b. ED1 Review CIDs – Qi (Intel)

5. AOB

6. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda.
			1. The Doc number for Emily’s Comments = 11-23/928
			2. Discussion on having Brian Hart to the Agenda. – 23/929r0
			3. Change the order of the presentation.
			4. No objection to updated Agenda. See 11-23/0897r1.
	1. **Editor Report** Emily QI
		+ 1. We have started MDR review.
			2. We will get Review report by July Plenary Session.
	2. **Review Doc 11/23/929r0** CID 4312 and 4198 (MAC) - Brian HART (Cisco)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-00-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>
		2. CID 4312 and 4198 (MAC)
			1. Review submission and CID history old CID 3225.
			2. Revert the CID 3225.
			3. Review updated changes and resulting text.
			4. There is a problem with the version of the draft used for one figure.
			5. Need to update the submission to use D3.0 references.
			6. Several figures need to be corrected; Revision will be posted.
			7. Discussion of changing the reference location from Northwest to Southwest.
			8. Determined that GeoPriv RFC definitions were used in making this definition, so while we change the subelement fields, the reference of North-West should not be changed.
			9. Discussion on how the “url” is being defined or lack of how it is encoded.
			10. Harmonize with the RFCs to make sure we are aligned with them to avoid conflicts.
			11. Discussion on possible removal of this set of elements, but there was not support for that in sideline conversations.
			12. Discussion on how to tie the floorplan and map image together.
			13. RFC 7035 discusses location coordinate systems and map URLs. It may be worth looking at.
			14. Set to more Work required.
			15. Schedule June 12
	3. **Review doc 11-23/0933r0 -** **MAC CIDs 4179, 4261, 4312, 4337, 4341, 4370** – RISON (Samsung)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-00-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>
		2. CID 4179 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review potential set of changes.
			3. Discuss changing recognition with received and remove “valid.”
			4. Mark More Work Required
			5. Schedule for July 12
		3. CID 4261 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review discussion in submission.
			3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4261 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-26 14:50:41Z): Make the changes proposed by the commenter, and additionally: - in the replacement para say “between a GDD” not “between the GDD” (2x) - before “secured connection” in the NOTE add “a ” - at 2635.37 change “Advertisement protocol ID” to “advertisement protocol ID” - at 1131.44 delete “The Advertisement protocol ID value 221 is reserved for vendor specific advertisement protocols.”
			4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		4. CID 4337 (MAC) – not in doc 11-23/0933r0
			1. Review on screen from Database.
			2. Review context of comment
			3. Discussion on changing “may” to shall.
			4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4337 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2023-05-26 14:53:02Z)
			5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
		5. CID 4341 (MAC) – is included in 11-23/953r0.
			1. Review comment
			2. Review discussion in submission
			3. CID 4341 (MAC): MAC: 2023-05-26 15:00:43Z - status set to: More Work Required.
			4. Scheduled to bring back later in June 19.
			5. ACTION ITEM: #1: Mark RISON to post to the reflector, for input on direction.
		6. CID 4370 (MAC) and 4116 (MAC)
			1. CIDs 4370 and 4116 (MAC): Note that these are Ready for Motion. They just missed the motion prep window during May. Will be included in the next motion.
	4. **Review Doc 11-23/928r0** Emily QI (Intel)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0928-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-lb273-ed1-comments.docx>
		2. CID 4013 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. We cannot just accept as there is an “in” that also needs to be deleted.
			3. Proposed Resolution: Revised:

Change the table title to “Maximum data unit sizes and durations.”

Change “size” of the first row to “size (in octets)”

Change “duration” of the first column to “duration (in microseconds)”.

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4025 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
			3. After deciding the commented location was ok, it was pointed out that there was another location that should also be changed.
			4. Updated Proposed Resolution: Revisit CID 4025 (ED1): Revised. Change "non-RSN association" to "non-RSNA" at 1871.20, and "RSN association" to "RSNA" 2864.24, and "RSNA (re)associations" to "RSNAs" at 1871.24.
			5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 4096 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4106 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment.
			2. Review Discussion in submission.
			3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4106 (ED1): Accepted. Note to editor: locations are: 202.22 and 202.56.
			4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 4114 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment.
			2. Review Discussion in Submission.
			3. Mark CID More Work Required
			4. Assign to Mark HAMILTON.
			5. Schedule for June 12 telecon.
		3. CID 4122 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review discussion in Submission.
			3. 2 options for resolving today presented.
			4. Mark CID More Work Required
			5. Assign to Mark HAMILTON.
			6. Schedule for June 12 telecon.

* + 1. CID 4125 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Discussion on if it should be SA Field or SA Parameter.
			3. After a short discussion, a reject may be better course.
			4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4125 (ED1): Rejected. The SA and DA are associated with an MSDU but are not fields (rather they are parameters in the MA-UNITDATA.request (where they are called "source/destination address")).  The current text is accurate.
			5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4170 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4209 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Discussion on if we need to delete the word “decimal.”
			3. Proposed Resolution CID 4209 (ED1): Revised. Replace "includes a decimal value" with "includes a value (decimal, if numeric)"
		2. CID 4238 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4296 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 4301 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 4310 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		4. CID 4333 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
			3. Note that the change includes changing “See” to “see”.
			4. Updated Proposed Resolution: CID 4333 (ED1): Accepted. Note to editor, change "See" to "see”.
			5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		5. CID 4334 (ED1)
			1. Review comment
			2. Similar to CID 4214 and 4065 (GEN)
			3. Assign to Jouni MALEN
			4. Mark More Work Required
			5. Move to GEN AdHoc
			6. More offline work will be needed.
		6. CID 4361 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment.
			2. Review Discussion in submission.
			3. Discussion that there may be an incorrect reference.
			4. Request to check the original 802.11ax reference in this case.
			5. 10.12.5 in 802.11-2020 is the reference that 11ax pointed.
			6. Move to MAC AdHoc
			7. Assign to Stephen MCCANN
			8. Mark CID as More Work Required.
			9. Assign to June 16.
		7. CID 4387 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	1. **Return to doc 11-23/0933r0** - MAC CIDs 4179, 4261, 4312, 4337, 4341, 4370 – RISON (Samsung)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-00-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>
		2. CID 4139 (ED2)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review Discussion in Submission.
			3. The use of “Subclause” is not normal – remove from changes.
			4. In Figure 13-2, there is a hyphen that should be fixed another time.
			5. Corrected proposed resolution.
			6. Proposed Resolution: CID 4139 (ED2): Revised. Make the changes proposed by the commenter except say just "13.1" not "subclause 13.1" in 9.4.2.201.
			7. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	2. **Adjourned at 12:01pm ET.**
1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Friday, May 26, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
	1. **Called to order** 10:04 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
	2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
		1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
		2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
		3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
		4. Edward AU (Huawei) Joined late about 10:40am
		5. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
		6. Not present:
	3. **Telecon Attendance:**
		1. IMAT Reported

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 2 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
| 3 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| 4 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 5 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 6 | Mukkapati, Lakshmi Narayana | Wi-Fi Alliance |
| 7 | Patwardhan, Gaurav | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
| 8 | Petrick, Albert | Jones-Petrick and Associates, LLC. |
| 9 | Qi, Emily | Intel |
| 10 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 11 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 12 | Smith, Graham | SR Technologies |
| 13 | Thakore, Darshak | Cable Television Laboratories Inc. (CableLabs) |

* + 1. Not reported in IMAT but on WebEx:
			1. Youhan Kim, (Qualcomm)
			2. Reza Hedayat (Apple)
			3. Chang-Mou Yang (Moxa)
			4. Yong Liu (Apple)
			5. Jarkko Kneckt (Apple)
			6. Ziming He, (Samsung)
			7. Sidharth Thakur (Apple)
			8. Po-Kai Huang, (Intel)
			9. Peshal Nayak, (Samsung Research America)
			10. Robert Stacey, (Intel)
			11. Brian Hart (Cisco Systems)
	1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
		1. No issues noted.
	2. **Review Agenda:** 11-23/0897r2:
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-02-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
		2. Friday’s Agenda:

1. Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance>), and patent and copyright policy

a. Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:

i. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or

ii. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or

iii. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. Copyright Policy:

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c. Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides:

See slides 10-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>

d. Agenda Approval

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3. Comment resolution and motions

1. **Friday June 2, 2022 – 10am – noon Eastern**
	1. Comment resolution
		1. ED1 CIDs – Rison (Samsung)
		2. CIDs 4068, 4070, 4071, 4075, 4254, 4266, 4273, 4315, 4214, 4065, 4334 – doc 11-23/858 – Malinen (Qualcomm)
		3. CID 4069 – doc 11-23/537 – Malinen (Qualcomm)
		4. ED1 CIDs – Qi (Intel)

5. AOB

6. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda.
			1. Mark RISON must leave early, so move to first.
			2. Alfred Asterjadhi is not present – move his to another Telecon.
			3. Jouni MALINEN validated his list of CIDs and added another doc 11-23/537
			4. Three additional CIDs 4214, 4065, 4334 added.
			5. Note we will Cancel the June 19th Telecon and request an extra slot in the July Plenary.
			6. No objection to updated Agenda. See 11-23/0897r2.
	1. **Editor Report** Emily QI
		1. **No Items from Editor**
	2. ED1 CIDs – RISON (Samsung)
		1. Emily QI to show the Database to review the ED1 CIDs.
		2. CID 4199 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. The direction was discussed.
			3. No objection to Direction but need to bring in submission.
			4. Mark More Work Required
			5. Schedule for Mid-June Telecon.
		3. CID 4201 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Discussion of the Direction
			3. Concern/Objection on possible changes in Clause 12 and 13.
			4. CID 4201 (ED1): More work required.
			5. Bring back in mid-June.
			6. Assign to Mark RISON

* + 1. CID 4208 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review Context on page 1876.
			3. No objection to Direction.
			4. CID 4208 (ED1): More work required.
			5. Bring back in mid-June. Assign to Mark RISON.
		2. CID 4216 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Discussion on if wakeup is wake-up with a hyphen or not.
			3. Discussion on the direction of changes to wakeup.
			4. The use of “wake-up” has 406 instances for Wake-up Radio 802.11ba.
			5. No consensus for the proceeding in this direction.
			6. Proposed Resolution: Rejected; Insufficient Details.
			7. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
		3. CID 4220 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review Context on page 762.
			3. Change to “allocated to” as a possible direction.
			4. Discussion on how values may be allocated to a requesting outside group.
			5. Look at the naming of the fields where it is now called “Reserved” .
			6. Discussion on what the field should be called and how to note it.
			7. What the information field name should be changed to.
			8. 802.11 COR has the following in this particular field: “Used by a specific organization. This reserved bit is used by the Wi-FiAlliance®: https://www wifi.org. This information is given for theconvenience of the user of this standard and does not constitute anendorsement by the IEEE.”
			9. The Draft should be updated to use the Corrigendum text.
			10. Mark CID as More work required.
			11. Schedule to bring back in late-June.
			12. Assign to Mark RISON.
			13. Expect Discussion on the reflector
		4. CID 4278 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Discussion on the direction.
			3. Discussion on the need to add a general statement in 1.4 for lower case “beacon” usage.
			4. There is a distinct meaning for upper- and lower-case use of “Beacon”.
			5. Mark CID as More work required.
			6. Schedule to bring back in mid-June.
			7. Assign to Mark RISON.

* + 1. CID 4303 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review page 651 as example for context.
			3. Discussion on the naming of the frame and when the usage of Acronyms.
			4. There should be one name, and then the Acronyms should be explained in body of text.
			5. Mark CID as More work required.
			6. Schedule to bring back in mid-June.
			7. Assign to Mark RISON.

* + 1. CID 4340 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Mark CID as More work required.
			3. Schedule to bring back in mid-June.
			4. Assign to Mark RISON.

* + 1. CID (4356 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Look at uses with “GAS” vs without “GAS”.
			3. Mark CID as More work required.
			4. Schedule to bring back in mid-June.
			5. Assign to Mark RISON.
		2. Need to prioritize Mark RISON’s CIDs to ensure that the MBS CIDs are resolved first and not use too much time on the non-MBS CIDs.
	1. Review doc: 11-23/0858r6 - Jouni MALINEN (Qualcomm)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>
		2. CID 4068 (SEC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review the discussion in the submission.
			3. Review Proposed Changes.
			4. Same change as proposed by CID 4254.
			5. The figure U-1 is now in different Annex, but unchanged.
			6. Proposed Resolution: CID 4068 (SEC): REVISED – At P3009 L51 delete “The Remote Request/Response frame contains Version, Type, and Length fields, along with the AP Address.”. Note to Editors: CID 4254 has an identical change.
			7. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 4254 (SEC)
			1. Review comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4254 (SEC): ACCEPTED. Note to Editors: CID 4068 has an identical change.
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		4. CID 4070 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review the discussion in the submission.
			3. These changes are necessary for WUR and 11az to work correctly.
			4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4070 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-02 15:09:20Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-23/0858r6 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>) for CID 4070.
			5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		5. CID 4071 (SEC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review the discussion in the submission.
			3. Discussion of the options.
			4. If we deprecate “preauthentication”, it should be noted in may be more than one location.
			5. Jouni M will add the other locations to mark deprecated per our discussion.
			6. Proposed Resolution: CID 4071 (SEC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-02 15:09:20Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-23/0858r7 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-07-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>) for CID 4071, option 2.
			7. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4075 (SEC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review the discussion in the submission.
			3. From the WebEx chat, to capture the places that were mentioned on CID 4071: It was suggested the "NOTE--Preauthentication is deprecated" in 9.4.2.23.1 RSNE/General, and 9.4.2.23.4 RSNE/RSN capabilities (on the Bit 0 description).
			4. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (SEC: 2023-06-02 15:23:15Z) - Incorporate changes under the “Proposed changes for CID 4075” section of <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>. S1G STAs are required to use PV1 Management frames when the peer is known to support them (see 10.57). While there are no PV1 version of Deauthentication and Disassociation frames, reordering of PV1 Action frame and a PV0 Deauthentication/Disassociation frame is not of much concern since the Action frame is not valid after deauthentication/disassociation. The changes to the standard add a note to describe this.
			5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4135 (SEC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review the discussion in the submission.
			3. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (SEC: 2023-06-02 15:24:45Z) - Incorporate changes under the “Proposed changes for CID 4075” section of <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>. S1G STAs are required to use PV1 Management frames when the peer is known to support them (see 10.57). While there are no PV1 version of Deauthentication and Disassociation frames, reordering of PV1 Action frame and a PV0 Deauthentication/Disassociation frame is not of much concern since the Action frame is not valid after deauthentication/disassociation. The changes to the standard add a note to describe this.
			4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4266 (SEC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review the discussion in the submission.
			3. Discussion on the language that may be considered rather than reject the CID.
			4. Mark More Work Required
			5. Assign to Jouni MALINEN
			6. Schedule for June 12 or 16.
		2. CID 4273 (SEC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review the discussion in the submission.
			3. Two options reviewed.
			4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4273 (SEC): REVISED – Incorporate changes under the “Proposed changes for CID 4273” section of 11-23/0858r6 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>) This implements a change that addresses the receiver side requirement more appropriately following the likely intent of the comment.
			5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 4065 (GEN) 4214 (GEN) and 4334 (GEN)
			1. Review Comments
			2. Review the discussion in the submission.
			3. These CIDS were in different AdHoc Groups but have now been moved to GEN AdHoc Group.
			4. Proposed Resolution: CIDs 4065 (GEN), 4214 (GEN), 4334 (GEN): Revised. Incorporate changes under the “Proposed changes for CID 4065/4214/4334” section of 11-23/0858r6,( <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>).
			5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	1. **Review Doc 11-23/0537r5 - Jouni MALINEN (Qualcomm)**
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0537-05-000m-reassociating-sta-recognition.docx>
		2. CID 4069 (MAC)
			1. Review Comments
			2. Review the discussion in the submission.
			3. The Resolution needs to not promise future work or assigned to other TG.
			4. One objection to the proposed resolution, but unsure if we need more debate at a later time.
			5. Mark this CID as a Separate Motion (Expected motions are on June 16th).
			6. Discussion on adding “(re)” to association.
			7. A Note to the discussion was requested.
			8. Discussion on when SA-Query can be skipped.
			9. Proposed Resolution: CID 4069 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-02 15:49:42Z): Incorporate changes under the “Proposed changes for CID 4069” section of11-23/0537r6 ( <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0537-06-000m-reassociating-sta-recognition.docx>). This is an updated version of the changes proposed in the comment with additional changes to address items that came up while discussing the comment. This covers only the optimization for reassociation-back-to-same-BSS case. Recognition of a returning STA for protecting a MAC address is being discussed in P802.11bh.
			10. CID 4069 (MAC): Bring on separate motion.
			11. ACTION ITEM #2: Jouni to post to the reflector a discussion on CID 4069 (MAC) resolution in this direction for motion and call for comments ahead of the motion meeting. (June 16)
			12. Mark Ready for Motion.
	2. **Adjourned 12:01pm**
1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Monday, June 12, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
	1. **Called to order** 10:04 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
	2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
		1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
		2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
		3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
		4. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
		5. Not present:
			1. Secretary - Edward AU (Huawei)
	3. **Telecon Attendance:**
		1. IMAT Reported

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 2 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| 3 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 4 | Qi, Emily | Intel |
| 5 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 6 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |

* + 1. Not reported in IMAT but on WebEx:
			1. Sidharth Thakur (Apple)
			2. Reza Hedayat (Apple)
			3. Brian Hart (Cisco)
			4. Joseph Levy, (Interdigital)
	1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
		1. No issues noted.
	2. **Review Agenda:** 11-23/0897r2:
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-02-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
		2. Proposed Agenda:

1. Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance>), and patent and copyright policy

a. Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:

i. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or

ii. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or

iii. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. Copyright Policy:

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c. Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides:

See slides 10-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>

d. Agenda Approval

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3. Comment resolution and motions

1. **Monday June 12, 2022 – 10am – noon Eastern**
	1. Comment resolution
		1. CIDs 4312, 4198 (MAC) – doc 11-23/929 – Hart (Cisco)
		2. MAC CIDs 4179 – RISON (Samsung)
		3. Misc CIDs – Asterjadhi (Qualcomm)
		4. CID 4114, 4122 (ED1) – Hamilton (Ruckus-Commscope
		5. GEN Review CIDs – Rosdahl (Qualcomm)

5. AOB

6. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda.
			1. Alfred not present move to June 23.
			2. Add CIDs 4071, 4266, 4069 – Jouni MALINEN (Qualcomm) (11-23/858 & 11-23/537)
			3. Add doc 11-23/831 Brian HART (Cisco)
		2. No Objection to updated Agenda –
	1. **Editor Report** Emily QI (Intel).
		1. Nothing to report.
	2. **Review doc 11-23/929 – CIDs 4312, 4198 (MAC**) – Brian HART (Cisco)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-02-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>
		2. CID 4312, 4198 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment.
			2. Review history of comments.
			3. Review discussion in submission.
			4. New sub element use “set to” and non-extensible.
			5. Discussion on the use of the sub element.
			6. Discussion on when X Max field is present and what value.
			7. Discussion on how different sub elements relate one to another.
			8. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-12 14:33:14Z): Incorporate the changes shown in 11-23/929r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-02-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>), which restored Location Reference (CID 4312) and addresses points made in CID 4198.
			9. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	3. **Review Doc 11-21/933r1Mark** RISON (Samsung)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-01-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>
		2. CID 4179 (MAC)
			1. Review Comment.
			2. Review the discussion and proposed changes in the submission.
			3. Discussion on the proposed changes did not necessitate any changes.
			4. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2023-06-12 14:47:11Z): Incorporate the changes shown in 11-23/0933r1 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-01-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>) for CID 4179, which removes "valid"s, and also changes "recognizes" wording to "receives" wording.
			5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
	4. **Review doc 11-23/858r7 CID 4071, 4266, 4069 (SEC)** – Jouni MALINEN (Qualcomm)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-07-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>
		2. CID 4071 (SEC)
			1. Review Comment.
			2. Review proposed updated changes.
			3. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (SEC: 2023-06-02 15:18:33Z) - Incorporate changes under the “Proposed changes for CID 4071 – option 2” section of <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-07-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>. This deprecates preauthentication as proposed in the comment. In addition, this explicitly disallows use of PMKSAs from preauthentication when using AKMs that use longer PMK.
			4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 4266 (SEC)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Review proposed updated changes.
			3. Proposed Resolution:
			4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		4. CID 4069 is in 11-23/537r6:
			1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0537-06-000m-reassociating-sta-recognition.docx>
			2. No negative feedback on this CID. The Action item was to follow up on the Listserv reflector.
	5. **GEN CIDS –** Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
		1. Show Database, but participants can follow along in doc 11-23/0840r2:
			1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0840-02-000m-revme-gen-ad-hoc-comments-on-lb273.xlsx>
		2. CID 4269 (GEN)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:03:30Z)
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 4339 (GEN)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:05:49Z)

Note to Editor Please use R1 as noted and see margin Comments.

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		1. CID 4107 (GEN)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4107 (GEN) REVISED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:14:32Z) Add to the second bullet second sentence (the exceptions): ", or the frame is received at an AP from a non-AP STA with an individual RA."
			3. Mark CID 4107 and 4270 (GEN) - More work required.
			4. Schedule for review on June 26 telecon
		2. CID 4127 (GEN)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4127 (GEN) REVISED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:26:55Z) Change "The services provided by the MLME to the SME are specified in this subclause." to "The services provided by the MLME to the SME are specified in Table 6-1. "
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 4129 (GEN)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:29:14Z)

Note to Editor The new row may be inserted after "Load"

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		1. CID 4153 (GEN)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: REJECTED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:31:57Z) Rejected; The "Channel Switch Timing,(11ax)" parameter is in the list of parameters, and then in the table at p439.3" there is not a "Channel Switch Time" parameter.
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		2. CID 4332 (GEN)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4332 (GEN) REVISED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:38:39Z) Change "The MAC uses the key with the associated Key ID and Address parameters(#3711) for the transmission of subsequent frames to which the key applies (as defined by the Key Type, Key ID and Address parameters)." to The MAC uses the key and key ID for the transmission of subsequent frames to which the key and key ID apply (as defined by the Key Type and Address parameters). NOTE—If more than one key (and key ID) can be used for transmission for a particular key type and address, the MAC chooses the key and key ID to use.
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
		3. CID 4054 (GEN)
			1. Review Comment
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4054 (GEN) REVISED (GEN: 2023-06-12 15:50:22Z) Replace the cited Note with "NOTE 1—Whether or not a Max Channel Switch Time element is included, regulations in certain regulatory domains might forbid a STA from transmitting on a new channel until it has received an enabling signal (e.g., a Beacon frame)."
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* 1. **Review doc 11-23/831r1** Brian HART (Cisco)
		1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0831-01-000m-miscellaneous-comment-resolutions.docx>
		2. CID 4013 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment.
			2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4013 (ED1): Revised. Incorporate the changes in 23/831r2 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0831-02-000m-miscellaneous-comment-resolutions.docx>) that substantially align with the commenter’s resolution.
			3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
		3. CID 4023 (ED1)
			1. Review Comment.
			2. Review Proposed changes.
			3. Discussion on if we make change, where to put it.
			4. Addressing Non-AP STA are already covered in IEEE 802, so we don’t need to replicate the concept here.
			5. Alternate would be to move the last two sentences to the PMKSA clause.
			6. No consensus was identified on the call.
			7. More Work Required.
			8. Assign to Brian Hart
			9. Scheduled for June 26th telecon.
	2. **Adjourned 12:01 PM ET.**

**References:**

May 26, 2023:

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-00-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-00-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-00-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0928-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-lb273-ed1-comments.docx>

June 2, 2023:

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-02-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-06-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-07-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0537-05-000m-reassociating-sta-recognition.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0537-06-000m-reassociating-sta-recognition.docx>

June 12, 2023:

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-02-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-02-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-02-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-01-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-07-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0537-06-000m-reassociating-sta-recognition.docx>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0840-02-000m-revme-gen-ad-hoc-comments-on-lb273.xlsx>
9. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0831-01-000m-miscellaneous-comment-resolutions.docx>
10. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0831-02-000m-miscellaneous-comment-resolutions.docx>