IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes for REVme 2023 May and June Telecons | | | | |
| Date: 2023-05-26 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1 801 492 4029 | jrosdahl @ ieee . org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the TGme (REVme) telecons held during May and June 2023.

R0: May 26, 2023: Initial minutes.

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Friday, May 26, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order** 10:04 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
      1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
      2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
      3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Edward AU (Huawei) Joined late about 10:40am
      5. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
      6. Not present:
   3. **IMAT Reported attendance:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Au, Kwok Shum | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 2 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
| 3 | Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| 4 | Kim, Youhan | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 5 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| 6 | McCann, Stephen | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 7 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 8 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 9 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 10 | Qi, Emily | Intel |
| 11 | Hart, Brian | Cisco |

* 1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
     1. No issues noted.
  2. **Review Agenda:** 11-23/0897r0:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-00-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
     2. Friday’s Agenda:

1. Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance>), and patent and copyright policy

a. Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:

i. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or

ii. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or

iii. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. Copyright Policy:

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c. Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides:

See slides 10-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>

d. Agenda Approval

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3. Comment resolution and motions

a) **Friday May 26, 2023 – 10am – noon Eastern**

a. MAC CIDs 4179, 4261, 4312, 4337, 4341, 4370 – Rison (Samsung)

b. ED1 Review CIDs – Qi (Intel)

5. AOB

6. Adjourn

* + 1. Discussion of Agenda.
       1. The Doc number for Emily’s Comments = 11-23/928
       2. Discussion on having Brian Hart to the Agenda. – 23/929r0
       3. Change the order of the presentation.
       4. No objection to updated Agenda. See 11-23/0897r1.
  1. **Editor Report** Emily QI
     + 1. We have started MDR review.
       2. We will get Review report by July Plenary Session.
  2. **Review Doc 11/23/929r0** CID 4312 and 4198 (MAC) - Brian HART (Cisco)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-00-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>
     2. CID 4312 and 4198 (MAC)
        1. Review submission and CID history old CID 3225.
        2. Revert the CID 3225.
        3. Review updated changes and resulting text.
        4. There is a problem with the version of the draft used for one figure.
        5. Need to update the submission to use D3.0 references.
        6. Several figures need to be corrected; Revision will be posted.
        7. Discussion of changing the reference location from Northwest to Southwest.
        8. Determined that GeoPriv RFC definitions were used in making this definition, so while we change the subelement fields, the reference of North-West should not be changed.
        9. Discussion on how the “url” is being defined or lack of how it is encoded.
        10. Harmonize with the RFCs to make sure we are aligned with them to avoid conflicts.
        11. Discussion on possible removal of this set of elements, but there was not support for that in sideline conversations.
        12. Discussion on how to tie the floorplan and map image together.
        13. RFC 7035 discusses location coordinate systems and map URLs. It may be worth looking at.
        14. Set to more Work required.
        15. Schedule June 12
  3. **Review doc 11-23/0933r0 -** **MAC CIDs 4179, 4261, 4312, 4337, 4341, 4370** – RISON (Samsung)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-00-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>
     2. CID 4179 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review potential set of changes.
        3. Discuss changing recognition with received and remove “valid.”
        4. Mark More Work Required
        5. Schedule for July 12
     3. CID 4261 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review discussion in submission.
        3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4261 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-26 14:50:41Z): Make the changes proposed by the commenter, and additionally: - in the replacement para say “between a GDD” not “between the GDD” (2x) - before “secured connection” in the NOTE add “a ” - at 2635.37 change “Advertisement protocol ID” to “advertisement protocol ID” - at 1131.44 delete “The Advertisement protocol ID value 221 is reserved for vendor specific advertisement protocols.”
        4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     4. CID 4337 (MAC) – not in doc 11-23/0933r0
        1. Review on screen from Database.
        2. Review context of comment
        3. Discussion on changing “may” to shall.
        4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4337 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2023-05-26 14:53:02Z)
        5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
     5. CID 4341 (MAC) – is included in 11-23/953r0.
        1. Review comment
        2. Review discussion in submission
        3. CID 4341 (MAC): MAC: 2023-05-26 15:00:43Z - status set to: More Work Required.
        4. Scheduled to bring back later in June 19.
        5. ACTION ITEM: #1: Mark RISON to post to the reflector, for input on direction.
     6. CID 4370 (MAC) and 4116 (MAC)
        1. CIDs 4370 and 4116 (MAC): Note that these are Ready for Motion. They just missed the motion prep window during May. Will be included in the next motion.
  4. **Review Doc 11-23/928r0** Emily QI (Intel)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0928-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-lb273-ed1-comments.docx>
     2. CID 4013 (ED1)
        1. Review Comment
        2. We cannot just accept as there is an “in” that also needs to be deleted.
        3. Proposed Resolution: Revised:

Change the table title to “Maximum data unit sizes and durations.”

Change “size” of the first row to “size (in octets)”

Change “duration” of the first column to “duration (in microseconds)”.

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4025 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
       3. After deciding the commented location was ok, it was pointed out that there was another location that should also be changed.
       4. Updated Proposed Resolution: Revisit CID 4025 (ED1): Revised. Change "non-RSN association" to "non-RSNA" at 1871.20, and "RSN association" to "RSNA" 2864.24, and "RSNA (re)associations" to "RSNAs" at 1871.24.
       5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    2. CID 4096 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4106 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review Discussion in submission.
       3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4106 (ED1): Accepted. Note to editor: locations are: 202.22 and 202.56.
       4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    2. CID 4114 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review Discussion in Submission.
       3. Mark CID More Work Required
       4. Assign to Mark HAMILTON.
       5. Schedule for June 12 telecon.
    3. CID 4122 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Review discussion in Submission.
       3. 2 options for resolving today presented.
       4. Mark CID More Work Required
       5. Assign to Mark HAMILTON.
       6. Schedule for June 12 telecon.

* + 1. CID 4125 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Discussion on if it should be SA Field or SA Parameter.
       3. After a short discussion, a reject may be better course.
       4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4125 (ED1): Rejected. The SA and DA are associated with an MSDU but are not fields (rather they are parameters in the MA-UNITDATA.request (where they are called "source/destination address")).  The current text is accurate.
       5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4170 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4209 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Discussion on if we need to delete the word “decimal.”
       3. Proposed Resolution CID 4209 (ED1): Revised. Replace "includes a decimal value" with "includes a value (decimal, if numeric)"
    2. CID 4238 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4296 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    2. CID 4301 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    3. CID 4310 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    4. CID 4333 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. Note that the change includes changing “See” to “see”.
       4. Updated Proposed Resolution: CID 4333 (ED1): Accepted. Note to editor, change "See" to "see”.
       5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    5. CID 4334 (ED1)
       1. Review comment
       2. Similar to CID 4214 and 4065 (GEN)
       3. Assign to Jouni MALEN
       4. Mark More Work Required
       5. Move to GEN AdHoc
       6. More offline work will be needed.
    6. CID 4361 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review Discussion in submission.
       3. Discussion that there may be an incorrect reference.
       4. Request to check the original 802.11ax reference in this case.
       5. 10.12.5 in 802.11-2020 is the reference that 11ax pointed.
       6. Move to MAC AdHoc
       7. Assign to Stephen MCCANN
       8. Mark CID as More Work Required.
       9. Assign to June 16.
    7. CID 4387 (ED1)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  1. **Return to doc 11-23/0933r0** - MAC CIDs 4179, 4261, 4312, 4337, 4341, 4370 – RISON (Samsung)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-00-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>
     2. CID 4139 (ED2)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review Discussion in Submission.
        3. The use of “Subclause” is not normal – remove from changes.
        4. In Figure 13-2, there is a hyphen that should be fixed another time.
        5. Corrected proposed resolution.
        6. Proposed Resolution: CID 4139 (ED2): Revised. Make the changes proposed by the commenter except say just "13.1" not "subclause 13.1" in 9.4.2.201.
        7. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  2. **Adjourned at 12:01pm ET.**

**References:**

May 26, 2023:

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0897-00-000m-may-june-teleconference-agenda.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0929-00-000m-civiclocationcommentreoslutions.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0933-00-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d3-0-lb273.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0928-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-lb273-ed1-comments.docx>