IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Minutes of TGbe 2023 Sept Interim MAC |
| Date: 2023-05-15 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Liwen Chu | NXP |  |  |  |
| Jeongki Kim | Ofinno |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains the meeting minutes for the TGbe MAC ad hoc teleconferences held in May 2023.

Revisions:

* Rev0:
	+ Adding the minutes of PM 1 MAC session held on May 15, 2023.
	+ Adding the minutes of AM 1 MAC session held on May 16, 2023.
	+ Adding the minutes of AM 2 MAC session held on May 16, 2023.
	+ Adding the minutes of PM 2 MAC session held on May 16, 2023.

**Monday, 15 May 2023, 01:30PM –03:30PM EDT (TGbe MAC F2F session)**

Chairman: Jeongki Kim (Ofinno)

Secretary: Liwen Chu (NXP)

This meeting took place using a mixed webex session and F2F session.

**Introduction**

1. The Chair (Jeongki, Ofinno) calls the meeting to order at 10:30am EDT. The Chair introduces himself and the Secretary, Liwen Chu (NXP)
2. The Chair goes through the registration information, the meeting protocol, the attendance reminder, the copyright policy, the 802 and 802.11 IPR policy and procedures and asks if there is anyone that is aware of any potentially essential patents.
	1. Nobody responds.
3. The Chair recommends using IMAT for recording the attendance.
	* Please record your attendance during the conference call by using the IMAT system:
		1. 1) login to [imat](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), 2) select “802.11 Telecons (<Month>)” entry, 3) select “C/LM/WG802.11 Attendance” entry, 4) click “TGbe <MAC/PHY/Joint> conference call that you are attending.
	* If you are unable to record the attendance via [IMAT](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance) then please send an e-mail to Liwen Chu (liwen.chu@nxp.com) and Jeongki Kim (jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com)

**Recorded attendance through Imat and e-mail:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
|   |   |   |  |

1. The Chair reminds that the agenda can be found in 11-23/0597r2. The Chair asks for the comments about the agenda. 673 and 746 were removed from the agendaper the requests. The updated agenda is approved.
* Technical Submissions:
	1. [**548r2**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0548-00-00be-tgbe-lb271-security-comment-resolutions-part-1.docx) **LB271 Security Comment Resolutions Part 1 Michael Montemurro [30C]**

Discussion:

C: CID 15194, 15067. the definition of ”SAE Entity” should be changed to ”SAE Peer” accordingly.

A: ok.

 C: add respectively.

A: ok.

C: Change the defnition to ” (SAE) entity: A STA or MLD that supports SAE.”.

A: ok

C: CID 151979. I have presentation about MAC privacy. Please defer the CID for me to review it.

A: ok.

C: CID 15512, 18283. The frame body being transmitted in another link may be changed if the MPDU carries some Management frame.

C: need to be very careful. A PN can’t be applied to the retransmitted frame with frame body change.

A: do offline discussion.

C: 15198. CID should be applied to GCMP also.

A: the comment is only mentioned CCMP.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/548r3 for the following CIDs?

15068, 15179, 15180, 15181, 15188, 15191, 15192, 15193, 15179, 15198, 15148, 15149, 15199, 18062, 15150, 15025, 15151, 15152, 15200, 15201, 15136, 15153, 15154, 15137, 15202, 15203, 15206, 15207

No Objection

* 1. [**458r4**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0458-00-00be-lb271-crs-for-35-8-4-r-twt-announcement.docx) **CRs for 35.8.4 R-TWT announcement Chunyu Hu [23C]**

Discussion:

C: CID 15832 Revised🡪Accepted

A: ok.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/ for the following CIDs?

Unfinished document

The meeting was recessed at 03:30PM

**Tuesday, 16 May 2023, 08:00AM –10:30AM EDT (TGbe MAC F2F session)**

Chairman: Jeongki Kim (Ofinno)

Secretary: Liwen Chu (NXP)

This meeting took place using a mixed webex session and F2F session.

**Introduction**

1. The Chair (Jeongki, Ofinno) calls the meeting to order at 08:00am EDT. The Chair introduces himself and the Secretary, Liwen Chu (NXP)
2. The Chair goes through the registration information, the meeting protocol, the attendance reminder, the copyright policy, the 802 and 802.11 IPR policy and procedures and asks if there is anyone that is aware of any potentially essential patents.
	1. Nobody responds.
3. The Chair recommends using IMAT for recording the attendance.
	* Please record your attendance during the conference call by using the IMAT system:
		1. 1) login to [imat](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), 2) select “802.11 Telecons (<Month>)” entry, 3) select “C/LM/WG802.11 Attendance” entry, 4) click “TGbe <MAC/PHY/Joint> conference call that you are attending.
	* If you are unable to record the attendance via [IMAT](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance) then please send an e-mail to Liwen Chu (liwen.chu@nxp.com) and Jeongki Kim (jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com)

**Recorded attendance through Imat and e-mail:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
|   |   |   |  |

1. The Chair reminds that the agenda can be found in 11-23/0597r3. The Chair asks for the comments about the agenda. 673 was deferred per the request. The updated agenda is approved.
* Technical Submissions:
	1. [**458r4**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0458-00-00be-lb271-crs-for-35-8-4-r-twt-announcement.docx) **CRs for 35.8.4 R-TWT announcement Chunyu Hu [23C]**

Discussion:

C: Reserved means value 0 and is ignored by the receipient. It should not be value 31.

C: Agreed.

C: value 31 indicates the R-TWT schdule of the other Aps.

C: Agree with the direction. However the change in first paragraph of 35.8.3.1 is not needed.

A: can do offline discussion.

C: please show the text change for the ono-deferred CIDs.

A: ok.

C: it is hard to track the changes. IT is better to run the SPs for the rejected CIDs.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/ for the following CIDs?

**SP deferred. The author will prepare the CIDs being Sped.**

* 1. [**693r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0693-00-00be-lb271-cr-on-btm.docx) **CR on BTM Guogang Huang [10C]**

Discussion:

C: 15960. No ”the”.

A: ok.

C: 17766 should be accepted.

A: ok.

C: P7.

C: since the last CID is deferred, the related text should be removed.

A: ok.

C: 17766 is not accepted since the changes are more than what the CID asks.

A: can defer it.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/693r1 for the following CIDs?

15960 17764 18256 17767 17768 17769 17910

No Objection

* 1. [**458r5**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0458-00-00be-lb271-crs-for-35-8-4-r-twt-announcement.docx) **CRs for 35.8.4 R-TWT announcement Chunyu Hu [23C SP]**

Discussion:

.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/458r5 for the following CIDs?

15832, 16064, 16065, 16697, 17268, 16698

No Objection

* 1. [**373r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0373-00-00be-lb271-cr-for-two-bqrs.docx) **LB271 CR for Two BQRs Yunbo Li [7C]**

Discussion:

C:15910. Per 20MHz sensing is not covered by the reference.

A: this is a diffrent comment. Do you want to defer this CID.

C: I cna find another CID.

C: 19511. The discssion says that the other bits are set to 0. Is it specified?

A: will check the spec.

C: it makes no sense that a STA do the CCA outside STA’s operating BW.

A: discussed with the commenter. The commenter mentioned that somce STAs have the capabilities.

C: how does the AP know such capabilitties.

A: will defer this CID.

C: 17387. Delete ”, or” in the first bullet, and add ”,” before when of each bullet.

A: ok.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/373r0 for the following CIDs?

**Unfinished document**

**The meeting was recessed at 10:00AM**

**Tuesday, 16 May 2023, 10:30AM –12:30PM EDT (TGbe MAC F2F session)**

Chairman: Jeongki Kim (Ofinno)

Secretary: Liwen Chu (NXP)

This meeting took place using a mixed webex session and F2F session.

**Introduction**

1. The Chair (Jeongki, Ofinno) calls the meeting to order at 08:00am EDT. The Chair introduces himself and the Secretary, Liwen Chu (NXP)
2. The Chair goes through the registration information, the meeting protocol, the attendance reminder, the copyright policy, the 802 and 802.11 IPR policy and procedures and asks if there is anyone that is aware of any potentially essential patents.
	1. Nobody responds.
3. The Chair recommends using IMAT for recording the attendance.
	* Please record your attendance during the conference call by using the IMAT system:
		1. 1) login to [imat](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), 2) select “802.11 Telecons (<Month>)” entry, 3) select “C/LM/WG802.11 Attendance” entry, 4) click “TGbe <MAC/PHY/Joint> conference call that you are attending.
	* If you are unable to record the attendance via [IMAT](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance) then please send an e-mail to Liwen Chu (liwen.chu@nxp.com) and Jeongki Kim (jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com)

**Recorded attendance through Imat and e-mail:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
|   |   |   |  |

1. The Chair reminds that the agenda can be found in 11-23/0597r4. The Chair asks for the comments about the agenda. 754 was removed from the agenda per the request. The updated agenda is approved.
* Technical Submissions:
	1. [**373r1**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0373-00-00be-lb271-cr-for-two-bqrs.docx) **LB271 CR for Two BQRs Yunbo Li [7C]**

Discussion:

C: 17032. Since non-AP EHT STA set the MIB variable based on whether 320MHz is supported, the same condition should be applied to AP side.

A: will defer this.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/373r1 for the following CIDs?

15910, 15911, 17387, 17388, 17328

No Objection

* 1. [**738r1**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0738-00-00be-lb271-cr-for-clause-35-3-7-4-2-part-2.docx) **CR for Clause 35.3.7.4.2 - Part 2 Arik Klein [13C]**

Discussion:

C:16113. You can just remove ML before Probe Request since Probe Request already includes ML Probe Request.

C: agree. A note can be added to mention that Probe Request includes ML Probe Request.

A: ok.

C: 16512. please change ”the link to become disabled” to ” the link that will be disabled”

A: ok.

C: 16513. The added paragraph is coverred by other place.

A: it is coverred by the description, not the normative text. Will defer it to check offline.

C: 16021. What is the meaning of NOTE 1? What NOTE described is obvious.

A: will defer it.

C: 18021. Goupcast is not used in baseline. Group-addressed is used. Change ”management frame” to ”Management frame”.

A: ok.

C: ”on the link ...” is not needed since an AP will own one link only.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/738r2 for the following CIDs?

15530, 15531, 16022, 16023, 16113, 16191, 16511, 16512, 17815, 18155, 18201

No Objection

* 1. [**757r1**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0757-01-00be-cr-for-lb271-cids-part3.docx) **CR for LB271 CIDs - Part3 Rubayet Shafin [10C]**

Discussion:

C: please clarify that the alligned schedule is in another link.

A: adding ”by checking schedule 2”.

C: the example should be in annex AF.

A: will add a note to the editor to place the example in Annex AF.

C: 18254. The last sentence in the paragraph adds more restriction than required.

A: will defer the CID.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/757r2 for the following CIDs?

15232, 15732, 15742, 17956, 15704, 15243, 15242, 15741

No Objection

* 1. [**731r2**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0731-00-00be-tgbe-lb271-security-comment-resolutions-part-2.docx) **Security Comment Resolutions Part 2 Michael Montemurro [15C]**

Discussion:

C: 15144. Does the baseline use MFP?

A: not sure, will change to management frame protection.

C: 15513should be accepted.

A: ok.

C: pealse defer 16683

A: ok

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/ for the following CIDs?

15145, 15697, 16683, 15205, 15208, 15168, 15143, 15144, 15513, 15204, 16329. 16330, 15514, 15532, 15515

No Objection

* 1. [**786r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0786-00-00be-lb271-cr-for-cid-16338.docx) **CR for CID 16338 Juseong Moon [1C]**

Discussion:

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/ for the following CIDs?

**Unfinished document**

**The meeting was recessed at 12:30PM**

**Tuesday, 16 May 2023, 04:00PM–06:00PM EDT (TGbe MAC F2F session)**

Chairman: Jeongki Kim (Ofinno)

Secretary: Liwen Chu (NXP)

This meeting took place using a mixed webex session and F2F session.

**Introduction**

1. The Chair (Jeongki, Ofinno) calls the meeting to order at 08:00am EDT. The Chair introduces himself and the Secretary, Liwen Chu (NXP)
2. The Chair goes through the registration information, the meeting protocol, the attendance reminder, the copyright policy, the 802 and 802.11 IPR policy and procedures and asks if there is anyone that is aware of any potentially essential patents.
	1. Nobody responds.
3. The Chair recommends using IMAT for recording the attendance.
	* Please record your attendance during the conference call by using the IMAT system:
		1. 1) login to [imat](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance), 2) select “802.11 Telecons (<Month>)” entry, 3) select “C/LM/WG802.11 Attendance” entry, 4) click “TGbe <MAC/PHY/Joint> conference call that you are attending.
	* If you are unable to record the attendance via [IMAT](https://imat.ieee.org/attendance) then please send an e-mail to Liwen Chu (liwen.chu@nxp.com) and Jeongki Kim (jeongki.kim.ieee@gmail.com)

**Recorded attendance through Imat and e-mail:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Breakout | Timestamp | Name | Affiliation |
|   |   |   |  |

1. The Chair reminds that the agenda can be found in 11-23/0597r4. The Chair asks for the comments about the agenda. 754 was removed from the agenda per the request. The updated agenda is approved.
* Technical Submissions:
	1. [**786r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0786-00-00be-lb271-cr-for-cid-16338.docx) **CR for CID 16338 Juseong Moon [1C]**

Discussion:

C: for P2P, there are some schedules between the peers.

A: I think there is not P2P schedule.

C: the P2P EMLSR operation should be done in UHR.

C: not sure why the problem is related to TXOP sharing.

C: STA1 may not know whether STA2 is in EMLSR mode.

A: STA1 knows STA2’s capability. However the padding may not be required, e.g. when the peer STA is not in EMLSR mode.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/786r0 for the following CIDs?

SP deferred

* 1. **754r2 CR for R-TWT - Part 2 Kumail Haider [20C]**

Discussion:

C: fine with the last two CIDs. For the first group CIDs, please defer them.

A: Ok.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/754r2 for the following CIDs?

15421, 16668

No Objection

* 1. [**791r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0791-00-00be-lb271-cr-for-cids-in-35-3-23.docx) **CR for CIDs in 35.3.23 Laurent Cariou [8C]**

Discussion:

C: 16564, the text before ”shall” in the first sentence should be changed to a note since each EHT STA is HE STA and HE STAs shall support BSS transition.

A: ok.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/791r1 for the following CIDs?

16564 15570 16058 16991 17623 16992

No Objection

* 1. [**796r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0796-00-00be-lb271-cr-for-r-twt-part-3.docx) **CR for R-TWT - Part 3 Kumail Haider [5C]**

Discussion:

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/796r0 for the following CIDs?

Deferred

* 1. [**720r2**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0720-00-00be-lb271-4-9-6-mlo-reference-model.docx) **LB271-4.9.6 (MLO reference model) Duncan Ho [12C]**

Discussion:

C: please defer 18071 about the text at P73L44.

A: ok.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/720r2 for the following CIDs?

15160, 15355, 15494, 16121, 16387, 16690, 18051, 18068, 18069, 18070, 18072

No Objection

* 1. [**802r0**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0802-00-00be-lb271-cr-for-cid-16415-on-35-3-17-enhanced-multi-link-single-radio-operation.docx) **CR for CID 16415 on 35.3.17 EMLSR operation Liuming Lu [1C]**

Discussion:

C: the current rules for group-addressed frame reception of EMLSR non-AP MLDs are receiving group-addressed frames after DTIM Beacon of a link where the EMLSR non-AP MLDs are working. The link selection is implementaiton choice.

A: will do offline discussion

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/802r0 for the following CIDs?

**SP deferred**

* 1. [**803r2**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0803-01-00be-lb271-cr-for-35-3-7-1-7-part-ii.docx) **cr-for-35.3.7.1.7-Part-II Jason Y. Guo [8C]**

Discussion:

C: 16501, 15525. NOTE 2 is replaced by another document 296r5.

A: will defer the two CIDs.

C: 16502. Please chow the related change.

A: the change is to delete the repeated sentence.

C: 17945, not sure what does the change for the last CID mean. We have the text that the ending time of the old TID to link mapping and the start time of the new TID to link mapping will indicate the same time.

A: we can do offline discussion.

C: please defer 16502

A: ok.

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/803r2 for the following CIDs?

18141 18261 17827 18143

No Objection

* 1. [**772r4**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0772-01-00be-resolution-of-epcs-edca-related-cids.docx) **Resolution of EPCS EDCA-Related CIDs John Wullert [14C]**

Discussion:

SP: Do you support to accept the resolution in 11-23/ for the following CIDs?

**Unfinished document**

The chair announced to cancel the evening session.

The meeting was recessed at 05:58PM