IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| LB 272 Comment Resolution – Part I |
| Date: 2023-05-14 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Osama Aboul-Magd | Huawei Technologies |  |  | oamagd@gmail.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission conyains proposed resolution for the following CIDs

1830, 1831, 1856, 1857, 1880, 1881, 1996, 1900, 1901, 1903, 1904, 1905, 1906, 2017, 2054, 2055, 2127, 2128, 2129, 2130, 2132, 2133, 2134, 2135, 2136, 2163

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 1830 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 73.60 | The initial sentence of the paragraph can be shortened. | Change the initial sentence of the paragraph to:"The STA Info field is used in the non-TB sensing measurement instance(see 11.55.1.5.3 (Non-TB sensing measurement instance)) to carry the SI2SR NDP TX Power and SR2SINDP Target RSSI subfields." |  The STA Info field with AID11 subfield equal to 2045 is used in the non-TB sensing measurement instance(see 11.55.1.5.3 (Non-TB sensing measurement instance)) to carry the SI2SR NDP TX Power and SR2SINDP Target RSSI subfields.The suggested change doesn’t introduce significant shortening of the sentence. Additionaly the qualification “with AID11 subfield equal to 2045” adds clarity to the sentence.**Rejected** |
| 1831 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 74.01 | B28 - B31 are the is the Measurement Setup ID and Sensing subfields. They need to be described. | Change the sentence to:"The Measurement Setup ID subfield, B28 - B30 is set to the value of the Measurement Setup ID of the correspondingsensing measurement instance and the Sensing subfield, B31, is set to 1 to indicate that the frame is a SensingNDP Announcement frame." | “In the STA Info field with AID subfield equal to 2045, bit B31 is set to 1 to indicate that the frame is a SensingNDP Announcement frame, and bits B28 through B30 are set to the Measurement Setup ID of the correspondingsensing measurement instance.”Change to “In the STA Info field with AID subfield equal to 2045, if bit B31 is set to 1 to indicate that the frame is a SensingNDP Announcement frame, ~~and~~ bits B28 through B30 are set to the Measurement Setup ID of the correspondingsensing measurement instance.”**Revised** |
| 1856 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 73.05 | The meaning of 'SI2SR and SR2SI NDP subfields' is unclear | Change 'SI2SR and SR2SI NDP subfields' to 'SI2SR and SR2SI NDP frames that follow' |  “in the SI2SR and SR2SI NDP subfields, respectively.”**Accepted** |
| 1857 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 73.30 | The second sentence of the paragraph is incomplete | Revise the second sentence of the paragraph | “The STA Info field with AID11 subfield equal to 2044 is used in TB sensing measurement instances (see 11.55.1.5.2 (TB sensing measurement instance)) to carry the Partial TSF subfield. The Partial TSF subfield contains 16 bits of the AP’s TSF time, TSF[21:6], if the AP that transmitted the Sensing Poll Trigger frame that preceded the Sensing NDP Announcement frame carrying this STA Info field with AID subfield is equal to 2044.”**Revised**The second sentence looks complete; however it is written in a convoluted way. The proposal is to replace the aecond sentence with:Change the second sentence to: TGbf Editor to make changes to harmonize with previous related commentsIf the AP that transmitted the Sensing Poll Trigger frame that preceded the Sensing NDP Announcement frame carrying this STA Info field with AID subfield is equal to 2044, the Partial TSF subfield contains 16 bits of the AP’s TSF time, TSF[21:6]. |
| 1880 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 73.19 | Is it right format for the IE field "AID: 2044"? | Suggest to delete 2044 in "AID:2044" |  **Revised**Replace AID:2044 with AID 11 in Figure 9-83dReplace AID:2045 with AID 11 in Figure 9-83e |
| 1881 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 73.50 | Is it right format for the IE field "AID: 2045"? | Suggest to delete 2044 in "AID:2045" |  **Revised**Replace AID:2044 with AID 11 in Figure 9-83dReplace AID:2045 with AID 11 in Figure 9-83e |
| 1886 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 72.25 | Remove "always" | As in comment. | In a non-TB sensing measurement instance (see 11.55.1.5.3 (Non-TB sensing measurement instance)), there is always only one intended recipient STA and the RA field is set to the address of that STA. **Revised**Revised delete the word “only” |
| 1900 | 9.3.1.19.1 | 70.25 | On ) too many | Remove ")" | (see 11.55.1.5.3 (Non-TB sensing measurement instance)),**Rejected**The order and the number of parenthesis are correct. |
| 1901 | 9.3.1.19.1 | 70.42 | RA address is tautologi, I believe the intention was to write RA field | replace "address" with "field" |  In the case of Sensing NDP Announcement frames, the RA address is set to the address ofthe AP or non-AP STA that is the intended recipient of the frame**Accepted** |
| 1903 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 71.65 | Remove (n) | As in comment. Everyone knows what one or more means, no need to write (n), and if doing so one should anyway write (n, where n is an interger > 1) |  **Accepted** |
| 1904 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 72.21 | Replace "equal to or less than 2007" with less than 2008" | As in comment. In all other places, less than 2008 is used so let's make it consistent. |  **Accepted** |
| 1905 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 72.58 | the word "is" is missing | add "is" between "Announcement frame" and "less than" |  When used in a non-TB sensing measurement instance (see 11.55.1.5.3 (Non-TB sensing measurementinstance)), if the bandwidth of the PPDU carrying the NDP Announcement frame is less than or equal to 160MHz,**Accepted** |
| 1906 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 75.01 | The legend of Table 9-45a is not complete | complete the legend |  **Table 9-45a—AID11 subfield encoding in an NDP Announcement frame (Contin-****Revised** **Table 9-45a—AID11 subfield encoding in an NDP Announcement frame (Continued)** |
| 2017 | 9.3.1.19.1 | 71.29 | in Table 9-42b, it seems more logical to move the third column to be in first place (i.e., list the types of NDPA and specify the corresponding presence/values of the subfields). | See comment |  **Rejected**It seems to be the norm to specify the values of the subfields first and then the types of a specifi frame. For example, see Table 9-46 Trigger Type Subfield Encoding in the baseline. |
| 2054 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 71.56 | Confusing references, sometimes to HE variant and sometimes to VHT variants. Is this on purpose? Suggest to harmonize throughout. | As in comment. |  **Rejected**Refer to Figure 9-76 and Figure 9-80 of the baseline. The format of the VHT and HE NDPA frames are not the same. However setting of the RA and TA fields follow that of the VHT format, while the format itself is the same as HE format. |
| 2055 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 72.16 | Suggest consistency, either less than 2008 or less than or equal to 2007. | As in comment |  **Revised**Replace less than or equal to 2007 by less than 2008 allover the draft |
| 2127 | 9.3.1.19.1 | 70.23 | The subfield name "AID" is incorrect. | Replace "AID subfield" with "AID11 subfield" | **Accepted** |
| 2128 | 9.3.1.19.1 | 70.25 | The subfield name "AID" is incorrect. | Replace "AID subfield" with "AID11 subfield" | **Accepted** |
| 2129 | 9.3.1.19.1 | 70.27 | The subfield name "AID" is incorrect. | Replace "AID subfield" with "AID11 subfield" |  **Accepted** |
| 2130 | 9.3.1.19.1 | 71.24 | The subfield name "AID" is incorrect in Table 9-42b (two places). | Replace "AID subfield" with "AID11 subfield" |  **Accepted** |
| 2132 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 73.19 | The subfield name "AID: 2044" is incorrect. | Replace "AID: 2044" with "AID11 subfield" | **Accepted** |
| 2133 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 73.34 | The subfield name "AID" is incorrect. | Replace "AID subfield" with "AID11 subfield" |  **Accepted** |
| 2134 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 73.49 | The subfield name "AID: 2045" is incorrect. | Replace "AID: 2045" with "AID11 subfield" |  **Accepted** |
| 2135 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 74.01 | The subfield name "AID" is incorrect. | Replace "AID subfield" with "AID11 subfield" | **Accepted** |
| 2136 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 74.16 | The subfield name "AID" is incorrect in Table 9-45a. | Replace "AID subfield" with "AID11 subfield" |  **Accepted** |
| 2163 | 9.3.1.19.5 | 0.00 | The texts on P73 L9-L10 and the texts on P72 L49-55 are repetitive. | Delete the texts on P73 L9-L10. | L49-L55 When used in a TB sensing measurement instance (see 11.55.1.5.2 (TB sensing measurement instance)), ifthe bandwidth of the PPDU carrying the NDP Announcement is equal to 320 MHz,— the SI2SR NSTS subfield is used to indicate the number of spatial streams in the SI2SR NDP thatfollows— the SI2SR Rep, SR2SI NSTS, and SR2SI Rep subfields are reservedL9-L10-P73When used in a TB sensing measurement instance, if the bandwidth of Sensing NDP Announcement frameis equal to 320 MHz, both the SI2SR Rep and the SR2SI Rep subfields are reserved.**Accepted** |

**References:**