IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LB272 CR for OST CIDs (11.55.1.1 Overview) | | | | |
| Date: 2023-05-09 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Stephan Sand | German Aerospace Center (DLR) |  |  | stephan.sand@ieee.org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission discusses resolutions to the following 15 CIDs from LB272 of TGbf D1.0.

The CID list is:

1027, 1057, 1060, 1061, 1062, 1064, 1175, 1176, 1342, 1520, 1703, 1704, 1942, 1962, 1963

Proposed changes in this document are with reference to TGbf D1.0.

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Intitial version of the document

Proposed comment resolution

Presented and discussed, no open discussion points

Under discussion

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Cat** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 1520 | T | 167.14 | No need for the word 'first' in this paragraph. It may be interpreted that there is 'second', 'third' or 'last' where there is not. | Remove the word 'first' | Accepted |
| 1942 | E | 167.17 | First "Sensing" should be lower case, and ":" is not necessary in the following text "with termination frame exchanges: Sensing measurement setup termination and sensing session termination." | Change text to read: "with termination frame exchanges sensing measurement setup termination and sensing session termination." | Revised  Agree with comment and changes due to CID resolution 1330 in 23/0477r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0477-03-00bf-lb272-sensing-session.docx>) need to be accounted for  See also CID 1027  **TGbf Editor:**  Please change “Sensing measurement setup termination” to “sensing measurement setup termination”. |
| 1027 | E | 167.18 | Use lower case for sensing in " ... with termination frame exchanges: Sensing measurement setup termination ..." | As in comment | Revised  Agree with comment and changes due to CID resolution 1330 in 23/0477r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0477-03-00bf-lb272-sensing-session.docx>) need to be accounted for  See also CID resolution 1942 |
| 1057 | T | 167.20 | Sensing session setup does not result in an "agreement... to participate in a WLAN sensing procedure". Instead, it is simply a capabilities exchange - as defined in 170.38-41. | Replace the first sentence of the paragraph with the following text that is aligned with 170.38-41: "In the sensing session setup, sensing capabilities are exchanged between an AP and a non-AP STA." | Revised  Changes due to CID resolution 1330 in 23/0477r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0477-03-00bf-lb272-sensing-session.docx>) deleted this sentence. |
| 1342 | T | 167.20 | "A sensing session is an agreement between an AP and a non-AP STA" Couldn't the sensing session be an agremment between an AP and a number of non-AP stations which is more efficient in terms of protocol overhead and may better refelect the most of the sensing scenarios. | As in comment | Revised  Changes due to CID resolution 1330 in 23/0477r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0477-03-00bf-lb272-sensing-session.docx>) deleted this sentence. |
| 1060 | T | 167.27 | Sentence doesn't read well, mention of the implicit termination case is vague. | Replace sentence with "A sensing measurement setup is active until either explicitly terminated in a sensing measurement setup termination or implicitly terminated with the expiration of a measurement setup expiry timer (see 11.55.1.6 (Sensing Measurement setup termination))." | Revised  Agree with comment.  See also CID resolution 1703  **TGbf Editor:**  Please replace sentence with "A sensing measurement setup shall be active until either explicitly terminated in a sensing measurement setup termination or implicitly terminated with the expiration of a measurement setup expiry timer (see 11.55.1.6 (Sensing measurement setup termination))." |
| 1703 | T | 167.28 | Change the text "A sensing measurement setup is active until either explicitly" to | A sensing measurement setup shall be active until either explicitly | Accepted |
| 1061 | T | 167.30 | Mix of non-normative ("sensing session is terminated") and normative ("setups shall be terminated automatically") text. | Replace sentence with: "In the sensing session termination, a sensing session, and all of its associated sensing measurement setups, is terminated (see 11.55.1.7 (Sensing session termination))." Leave normative statements to 11.55.1.7. | Revised  Changes due to CID resolution 1330 in 23/0477r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0477-03-00bf-lb272-sensing-session.docx>) deleted this sentence. |
| 1176 | E | 167.34 | The sentence is hard to understand.  A STA acting as a sensing initiator may participate in a sensing measurement instance as a sensing transmitter, a sensing receiver, both a sensing transmitter and a sensing receiver, or neither a sensing transmitter nor a sensing receiver. | I suggest to separate this sentence and combine with the note.  A STA acting as a sensing initiator participate in a sensing measurement instance as a sensing transmitter, a sensing receiver, or both a sensing transmitter and a sensing receiver A STA acting as a sensing initiator may choose not to participate in a sensing measurement instance as a sensing transmitter nor sensing receiver, but may still initiate the WLAN sensing procedure and optionally obtain sensing measurement reports. | Revised  In principle agree with comment.  See also CID resolutions 1963 and 1962 |
| 1963 | T | 167.39  addressing  167.34-38 | "A STA acting as sensing initiator" -- a sensing initiator is a STA (per definition) so the "STA acting" part is unecessary. The participation possibilities are clearer if we repeat "as" with each permutation. | Change to "A sensing initiator may participate in a sensing measurement instance as a sensing transmitter, as a sensing receiver, as both a sensing transmitter and sensing receiver, or as neither a sensing transmitter nor a sensing receiver. A sensing responder may participate in a sensing measurement instance as a sensing transmitter, as a sensing receiver, or as both a sensing transmitter and a sensing receiver." | Accepted |
| 1175 | E | 167.36 | A STA acting as a sensing responder "may" participate in a sensing measurement instance as a sensing transmitter, a sensing receiver, or both a sensing transmitter and a sensing receiver. The "may" here sounds like the sensing responder can also choose not to participate. | remove "may" | Rejected  According to IEEE SA Standards Style Manual:  “The word may is used to indicate a course of action permissible within the limits of the standard (may equals is permitted to)”  See also CID resolution 1963 |
| 1062 | E | 167.39 | Letter a missing | Replace with "... as a sensing transmitter nor a sensing receiver..." | Revised  In principle agree with comment.  See also CID resolution 1962. |
| 1704 | T | 167.39 | Change the text "A sensing initiator may choose not to participate" to | "A sensing initiator can choose not to participate"  since it is part of a NOTE | Revised  In principle agree with comment.  See also CID resolution 1962. |
| 1962 | T | 167.39 | Notes are informative and must avoid using normative verbs. Also, inappropriate use of "nor". Finally, is transmitting and receiving is not a necessary condition for particiation so we need another verb to describe role the STA uses when participating. | "A sensing initiator that does not act as a sensing transmitter or sensing receiver in a sensing measurement instance might still obtain sensing measurement reports for that sensing measurement instance." | Accepted |
| 1064 | E | 167.49 | Choice of words | Replace "During a WLAN sensing procedure..." with "In a WLAN sensing procedure..." | Accepted |

# Straw Poll

Do you support the resolution of the following 15 CIDs and instruct TGbf editor to incorporate the changes into the latest TGbf draft: 1027, 1057, 1060, 1061, 1062, 1064, 1175, 1176, 1342, 1520, 1703, 1704, 1942, 1962, 1963?

Y/N/A