IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| IEEE 802.11bf - March 2023 Plenary Meeting Minutes |
| Date: 2023-03-16 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Leif Wilhelmsson | Ericsson AB | Mobilvägen 1, 22632 Lund, Sweden | +46-706-216956 | leif.r.wilhelmsson@ericsson.com |

Abstract

Rev 0: This document contains the IEEE 802.11bf March 2023 Plenary meeting minutes.

### Tuesday, March 14, 2023, 8:00-10:00 am

**Meeting Agenda:**

The meeting agenda is shown below, and published in the agenda document:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0182-01-00bf-tgbf-meeting-agenda-2023-03-plenary.pptx>

1. Call the meeting to order
2. Patent policy and logistics
3. Approve TGbf meeting minutes
4. TGbf Timeline
5. Call for contribution
6. Teleconference Times
7. Presentation of submissions
8. Guidance for Mix mode March Plenary
9. Motion (266)
10. Any other business?
11. Recess
12. The chair, Tony Xiao Han, calls the meeting to order at 8:00 am (47 persons are on the call after 15 minutes of the meeting, 13 persons are in the room).
13. The chair goes through “Meeting Protocol, Attendance, Voting &Documentation Status” (slide 4), “Registration for the March Plenary session” (slide 5), “Participants have a duty to inform the IEEE” (slide 7), and “Ways to inform IEEE” (slide 8).

The chair makes a Call for Potentially Essential Patents. No potentially essential patents reported, and no questions asked.

The chair goes through “Other Guideline for IEEE WG meetings” (slide 9), “Patent related information” (slide 10), “IEEE SA Copyright Policy” (slides 11 and 12), “Participant behavior in IEEE-SA activities is guided by the IEEE Codes of Ethics & Conduct” (slide 13), “Participants in the IEEE-SA “individual process” shall act independently of others, including employers” (slide 14), and “IEEE-SA standards activities shall allow the fair & equitable consideration of all viewpoints” (slide 15), and “Required notices” (slide 16).

The chair goes through the agenda (slide 17) and asks if there are any questions or comments on the agenda.

Claudio explains that Robert Stacy is not in the room, so his presentation may have to be in one of the other sessions.

Assaf announces that he has one more presentation.

The chair asks if there is any objection to approve the agenda by unanimous consent. No objection from the group so the agenda is approved.

1. **Motion:** Move to approve TGbf minutes of meetings and teleconferences from January 2022 meeting to today:
	* January Interim:

 <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0152-00-00bf-ieee-802-11bf-january-2023-interim-meeting-minutes.docx>

* + Teleconferences January-March:

 <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0259-01-00bf-teleconference-minutes-february-march-2023.docx>

**Move:** Leif Wilhelmsson

**Second:** Sang Kim

**Result:** Motion passed by unanimous consent

1. The chair presents the TGbf Timeline (slide 22).
2. The chair presents slide 23, Call for contributions.
3. The chair presents the teleconference times (slides 24 and 25). The chair also presents slides 30 and 31.
4. The chair presents Guidance for Mix mode March Plenary (slide 26).
5. Motions:

Discussions on Motion 266:

Q: Even in reasonably good shape, we did receive a many comments and the draft will change so I believe we should wait until we have D2.0

Q: I believe it would be helpful for some persons, and we have received requests for obtaining the draft.

**Motion 266:** Approve making P802.11bf D1.0 available for sale.

**Move:** Alecsander Eitan

**Second:** Claudio da Silva

**Result\*:** Y/N/A: 13/9/9 Motion passes

1. Presentation of submissions:

Claudio goes through the comment assignments, announcing that there are only 6 comments which have not been assigned. Claudio goes through these 6 comments and assigns them.

**11-13/0230r1, “802.11 Comment Resolution – a Tutorial”, Robert Stacey (Intel):**

Robert presents this tutorial as a means to introduce new members to the process of comment resolution.

**11-23/0379r0, “Approach to the MLME of the baseline spec”, Solomon Trainin (Qualcomm):** Solomon explains (his view on) the approach to the MLME of the baseline specification.

**11-23/0412r0, “LB272-DMG-CID-v1”, Assaf Kasher (Qualcomm):** This document proposes resolution to several LB272 DMG related CIDs.

CIDs 1299,1298, and 1355: No discussion.

CID 1353: No discussion.

CIDs 1229 and 2166: Some clarifying discussion.

Run out of time.

1. The chair asks if there is AoB. No response from the group.
2. The meeting is recessed without objection at 10.01 am (ET).

### Wednesday, March 15, 2023, 10:30am-12:30pm

**Meeting Agenda:**

The meeting agenda is shown below, and published in the agenda document:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0182-03-00bf-tgbf-meeting-agenda-2023-03-plenary.pptx>

1. Call the meeting to order
2. Patent policy and logistics
3. TGbf Timeline
4. Call for contribution
5. Teleconference Times
6. Presentation of submissions
7. Guidance for Mix mode March Plenary
8. Any other business?
9. Recess
10. The chair, Tony Xiao Han, calls the meeting to order at 10:30 am after some technical issues with the equipment (52 persons are on the call after 15 minutes of the meeting, 19 persons are in the room).
11. The chair goes through “Meeting Protocol, Attendance, Voting &Documentation Status” (slide 4), “Registration for the March Plenary session” (slide 5), “Participants have a duty to inform the IEEE” (slide 7), and “Ways to inform IEEE” (slide 8).

The chair makes a Call for Potentially Essential Patents. No potentially essential patents reported, and no questions asked.

The chair goes through “Other Guideline for IEEE WG meetings” (slide 9), “Patent related information” (slide 10), “IEEE SA Copyright Policy” (slides 11 and 12), “Participant behavior in IEEE-SA activities is guided by the IEEE Codes of Ethics & Conduct” (slide 13), “Participants in the IEEE-SA “individual process” shall act independently of others, including employers” (slide 14), and “IEEE-SA standards activities shall allow the fair & equitable consideration of all viewpoints” (slide 15), and “Required notices” (slide 16).

The chair goes through the agenda (slide 18) and asks if there are any questions or comments on the agenda. No response from the group.

The chair asks if there is any objection to approve the agenda by unanimous consent. No objection from the group so the agenda is approved.

1. The chair presents the TGbf Timeline (slide 22).
2. The chair presents slide 23, Call for contributions.
3. The chair presents the teleconference times (slides 24 and 25).
4. The chair presents Guidance for Mix mode March Plenary (slide 26).
5. Presentation of submissions:

**11-23/0412r0, “LB272-DMG-CID-v1”, Assaf Kasher (Qualcomm):** This document proposes resolutions to several LB272 DMG related CIDs. This is a continuation of the presentation in the last session.

CID 1356: No discussion.

CID 2070: No discussion.

CIDs 1302 and 2071: No discussion.

CID 1357: Some clarifying discussion. As a result, the proposed resolution is slightly updated.

CID 1235: Minor editorial comment.

**Straw Poll:** Do you agree to incorporate the changes in document 412r1.

Unanimously supported.

**11-23/0417r0, “LB272-DMG-CID-v2”, Assaf Kasher (Qualcomm):** This document proposes resolutions to several LB272 DMG related CIDs.

CIDs 1363,1359, 1360,1361,1362,1364, and 1365: Based on feedback from the group, the wording of the proposed resolution is slightly updated.

**Straw Poll:** Do you agree to incorporate the changes in document 417r1.

Unanimously supported.

**11-23/0370r2, “Comment Resolutions for 11bf D1.0 Segmented Report CID”, Rojan Chitrakar (Huawei):** This submission proposes resolutions of comments received from TGbf LB272 (TGbf Draft 1.0).

* CIDs: 1154, 2044, 2292 (3 CIDs)

CID 1154: Some clarifying discussion.

CID 2044: Some clarifying discussion.

CID 2292: No discussion.

**Straw Poll:** Do you agree to incorporate the changes proposed in document 11-23/0370r2 to the latest 11bf draft for the following CIDs? 1154, 2044, 2292

Unanimously supported.

**11-22/2101r5, “mmW Phase Feedback”, Kevin Tsunghan Tsai (Mediatek):**

Vital sign det. includes breathing rate and heart rate detection and can be used in many health applications. This contribution proposes to add phase feedback to support these use cases.

Q:I agree with the need to add the phase, but I believe it should be introduced in another way. So I will support the first SP, but not the other ones as they currently read.

Q: Can you add (E)DMG to SP1?

As a consequence, the SP is updated accordingly.

Q: I oppose to the approach of including a new feature to an approved draft, via the SFD. I would like to see that SP1 asks for that the specification should add an option.

**Straw Poll 1:** Do you agree that the 11bf amendment shall support phase report in (E)DMG image report?

* Y
* N
* Abstain

**Result:** Y/N/A: 29/3/17

**Straw Poll 3:** Do you agree to add a PDT based on the following :

* Use B4 in Axis Present field format to indicate Reflection Phase is presented or not
* Add one optional field “Reflection Phase” in Reflection subelement format for 2 axes, 3 axes and 4 axes, the number of bits is 12bits

**Result:** Y/N/A: 20/4/19

1. The chair asks if there is AoB. No response from the group.
2. The meeting is recessed without objection at 12.25 pm (ET).

### Thursday, March 16, 2023, 8:00am-10:00am

**Meeting Agenda:**

The meeting agenda is shown below, and published in the agenda document:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0182-05-00bf-tgbf-meeting-agenda-2023-03-plenary.pptx>

1. Call the meeting to order
2. Patent policy and logistics
3. TGbf Timeline
4. Call for contribution
5. Teleconference Times
6. Presentation of submissions
7. Guidance for Mix mode March Plenary
8. Motion (267-269)
9. Any other business?
10. Adjourn
11. The chair, Tony Xiao Han, calls the meeting to order at 8:00 am (50 persons are on the call after 15 minutes of the meeting, 20 persons are in the room).
12. The chair goes through “Meeting Protocol, Attendance, Voting &Documentation Status” (slide 4), “Registration for the March Plenary session” (slide 5), “Participants have a duty to inform the IEEE” (slide 7), and “Ways to inform IEEE” (slide 8).

The chair makes a Call for Potentially Essential Patents. No potentially essential patents reported, and no questions asked.

The chair goes through “Other Guideline for IEEE WG meetings” (slide 9), “Patent related information” (slide 10), “IEEE SA Copyright Policy” (slides 11 and 12), “Participant behavior in IEEE-SA activities is guided by the IEEE Codes of Ethics & Conduct” (slide 13), “Participants in the IEEE-SA “individual process” shall act independently of others, including employers” (slide 14), and “IEEE-SA standards activities shall allow the fair & equitable consideration of all viewpoints” (slide 15), and “Required notices” (slide 16).

The chair goes through the agenda (slide 19) and asks if there are any questions or comments on the agenda. No response from the group.

The chair asks if there is any objection to approve the agenda by unanimous consent. No objection from the group so the agenda is approved.

1. The chair presents the TGbf Timeline (slide 22).
2. The chair presents slide 23, Call for contributions.
3. The chair presents the teleconference times (slides 24 and 25).
4. The chair presents Guidance for Mix mode March Plenary (slide 26).
5. Motions

**Motion 267:** Move to approve resolutions to the following CIDs listed in the following document and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft:

* CIDs: 1154, 2044, 2292,
* as specified in 23/00370r2

**Move:** Rojan Chitrakar

**Second:** Rui Du

**Result:** Motion passed by unanimous consent

**Note：**

* Related document 23/00370r2
* SP Result: Unanimous consent

**Motion 268:** Move to approve resolutions to the following CIDs listed in the following document and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft:

* CIDs: 1299, 1298, 1355, 1353, 1229, 2166, 1356, 2070, 1354, 1302, 2071, 1357, 1235
* as specified in document 11-23-0412r1

**Move:** Assaf Kasher

**Second:** Claudio da Silva

**Result:** Motion passed by unanimous consent

**Note：**

* Related document 11-23-0412r1
* SP Result: Unanimous consent

**Motion 269:** Move to approve resolutions to the following CIDs listed in the following document and incorporate the text changes into the latest TGbf draft:

* CIDs: 1363. 1359, 1360, 1361, 1362, 1364, 1365
* as specified in document 11-23-0417r1

**Move:** Assaf Kasher

**Second:** Claudio da Silva

**Result:** Motion passed by unanimous consent

**Note：**

* Related document 11-23-0417r1
* SP Result: Unanimous consent
1. Presentation of submissions:

**11-23/0428r0, “LB272 Comments on Sensing Terminologies”, Rui Yang (Interdigital):** During the LB272 for 802.11bf D1.0, multiple commentors (~11 CIDs) brought up the concerns about the clarity of the terminologies for WLAN sensing and sensing procedures**.** This contribution discusses potential issues and an alternative solution.

Q: I believe we will get a lot of comments if we define S7G instead of non-DMG, so I would prefer to keep non-DMG. I also note that if there will be a new group on mmW, this will not be DMG so there needs to be updates on the terminology in the future.

A: I believe it is not really good to refer to something as non-DMG, because one then first needs to find out what DMG is.

Q: I basically have the same opinion as the previous commenter.

Q: I would suggest using sensing for sub 7 GHz, that is, WLAN sensing would then include both sub 7 GHz and DMG just as in the PAR.

A: I’m a bit reluctant to have a term that in a way sounds more general to denote only a subset.

Q: I prefer Non-DMG sensing.

Q: I don’t like adding “basic”.

**Straw Poll:** Which term you prefer to use to replace “WLAN sensing” defined in 3.2 in 802.11bf D1.0:

1. S7G sensing
2. Non-DMG sensing
3. Sensing
4. Abstain

**Result:** 1/2/3/4: 2/1/18/6

**11-23/0438r0, “LB272 Comments measurement setup comments resolution part 1”, Rui Du (Huawei):**

CIDs 1909, 2147, and 1070: Some discussion related to the use of “Accepted” and “Revised”. As a consequence, the CR for 1070 is changed from Accepted to Revised. The proposed resolution remains the same.

CIDs 1344, 2148, 2062, and 1072: Claudio points out that this example generates a lot of comments and if this is the case also in the next revision, we should probably consider removing the example. It is also suggested to update the figure by removing some part of it.

CIDs 1073, 1809, and 1858: One typo in the proposed resolution is identified.

The document will be revised and the new revision will be uploaded.

**11-23/0474r0, “LB272 CR for CIDs on Sensing Measurement Setup – Part 1”, Mahmoud Kamel (Interdigital):** This submission proposes resolutions for 18 CIDs (1009, 1534, 1996, 2239, 1101, 1282, 1496, 1560, 1103, 1548, 1549, 2109, 1105, 1106, 1428, 1550, 1551, 1863) in subclause 11.55.1.4 in P802.11bf D1.0:

CIDs 1534, 1009, 2239, and 1996: No discussion.

CIDs 1101, 1282, 1496, and 1560: Some clarifying discussion. The proposed resolution is slightly updated.

CID 1103: No discussion.

CIDs 1548,1549, and 2109: No discussion.

CIDs: 1105, 1106, 1428, 1550, 1551, and 1863: Run out of time.

1. The chair asks if there is AoB. No response from the group.
2. The meeting is adjourned without objection at 10.01 am (ET).