IEEE P802.11 Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| LB 271 Resolution for some CIDs related to R-TWT |
| Date: Mar. 2023 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Chunyu Hu | Meta |  |  | chunyuhu07@gmail.com |
| Kumail Kaider | Meta |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

 Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for following **23** CIDs received for TGbe LB271:

15832, 16669, 16064, 16065, 16066, 16141, 16570, 16571, 15841, 16697,

17268, 16698, 16143, 16144, 18255, 15842, 16067, 17083, 15933, 16650

16142, 16115, 15848

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.

***TGbe editor: The baseline for this document is 11be D3.1 and REVme2.1***

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGbe Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGbe Draft (i.e., they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).

TGbe Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGbe Editor” are instructions to the TGbe editor to modify existing material in the TGbe draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGbe editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGbe Draft.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause** | **Pg/Ln** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 15832 | Muhammad Kumail Haider | 35.8.4 | 0.00 | "..with the Restricted TWT Schedule subfield set to 2.." Field is missing here | amend as "..with the Restricted TWT Schedule Info subfield set to 2" | **Revised.**Added the missing word “Info”. **TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #15832.** |
| 16064 | Binita Gupta | 35.8.4 | 619.14 | R-TWT schedule' is a more generic term and covers all the SPs associated with that schedule. Suggest renaming the subclause title to "R-TWT Schedule announcement" | As in comment. | **Revised.**Agree in principle. Following the baseline text (see REVmeD2.0 P3907L43-46: *Broadcast TWT**announcements are broadcast TWT schedules advertised in broadcast TWT elements contained in broadcast Management frames.***)**, change “R-TWT SPs announcement” to “R-TWT announcement”.**TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #16064.** |
| 16065 | Binita Gupta | 35.8.4 | 619.17 | The requirement applies only if R-TWT membership is setup on the link where the EHT AP is operating, and not in general when any R-TWT membership is set up. Clarify this to be precise. | Modify to "f there is any R-TWT membership set up on the link where an EHT AP is operating, the EHT AP shall announce ..." | **Rejected**The comment fails to point out an issue –TWT operation is per link. In the MLO context, a STA (AP or non-AP STA) is also referring to a STA operating on a specific link. There is no need to call it out. |
| 16141 | SunHee Baek | 35.8.4 | 619.20 | The terms both "nontransmitting AP" and "transmitting AP" aren't official terms. "nontransmitting AP" is changed to "AP corresponding to the nontransmitted BSSID" and "transmitting AP" is changed to "AP corresponding to the transmitted BSSID". | As in the comment | **Revised****TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #16141.** |
| 16570 | Arik Klein | 35.8.4 | 619.20 | Please replace the term "nontransmitting AP" with "AP corresponding to nontransmitted BSSID within a multiple BSSID set" | As in comment | **Revised****TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #16570.** |
| 16571 | Arik Klein | 35.8.4 | 619.20 | An AP that is corresponding to nontransmitted BSSID is relevant only in multiple BSSID set only but not for co-hosted BSSID set, where each of the APs in this set transmits Beacon and Probe Response frames (as defined in 26.17.7) | Please remove the words "or co-hosted BSSID set" from the following sentence: "The membership is setup either with its associated EHT AP, or with any nontransmitting AP that belongs to the same multiple BSSID set or co-hosted BSSID set as the transmitting AP" | **Revised****TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #16571.** |
| 16142 | SunHee Baek | 35.8.4 | 619.22 | If an STA associate with an AP corresponding to the nontransmitted BSSID and receives a Beacon frame including all R-TWT schedules from an AP corresponding to the transmitted BSSID, then how does the STA distinguish the R-TWT schedules for the associated AP among the other R-TWT schedules with Restricted TWT Schedule Info subfield equal to 3? | Please clarify this case. | **Revised –TBD. Please see discussion.**(~~To facilitate the STA to know this info, overload the bTWT ID subfield with the last 5 bits of the corresponding BSSID, bits 43-47.~~**~~TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #16142.)~~** |
| 16115 | Insun Jang | 35.8.4 | 619.23 | When a STA is associated with a NonTxBSSID, how can it differentiate which rTWT schedules (carried in Beacon from TxBSSID) corresponds to the NonTxBSSID to has a membership with that NonTxBSSID? Please clarify that issue | As in the comment | **Revised –TBD. Please see discussion.**~~(To facilitate the STA to know this info, overload the bTWT ID subfield with the last 5 bits of the corresponding BSSID, bits 43-47.~~**~~TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #16115.)~~** |
| 15848 | Chunyu Hu | 9.4.2.199 | 244.50 | When the Restricted TWT Schedule Info has value 3, the schedule doesn't correspond to the transmitting AP, the Broadcast TWT ID needs to be re-interpreted otherwise there can be duplicated value. | As in comment. | **Revised – (depending on the outcome of the above two CIDs).** |
| 16697 | Yonggang Fang | 35.8.4 | 619.29 | "An R-TWT scheduling AP that includes a Restricted TWT Parameter Set field in a broadcast TWT element shall set the Restricted TWT Traffic Info Present subfield of the Restricted TWT Parameter Set field to 0 ...". The Restricted TWT Parameter Set should be Broadcast TWT Info according to Figure 9-770 | Please have consistence in the spec | **Rejected**.Text was added back in D2.0 stating “A Broadcast TWT Parameter Set field that has the Broadcast TWT Recommendation field value equal to 4 is referred to as a Restricted TWT Parameter Set field.” See D3.1 P245L40.  |
| 17268 | Zinan Lin | 35.8.4 | 619.32 | If the Restricted TWT Schedule subfield is set to 0 (a.k.a. the schedule is idle), is there any need for the presence of the Restricted TWT Traffic Info? In other words, when the Restricted TWT Schedule subfield is set to 0, what is the value setting of the Restricted TWT Traffic Info Present? | Please clarify it | **Rejected**The baseline (e.g. P802.11axD8.0 P420L37 26.8.3.2) states that “The TWT scheduling AP shall include one or more TWT parameter sets in the TWT element, and each TWT parameter set may indicate a periodic occurrence of TWTs.” The additional changes introduced for R-TWT doesn’t change the above baseline rule.One benefit I can see is that the AP may announce a schedule per its pre-configured preference; or per network configuration while waiting for STAs to join. |
| 16698 | Yonggang Fang | 35.8.4 | 619.33 | How to set the value of Restricted TWT Schedule Info field in the adertisement of R-TWT schedule for the csae that shedule is for non-transsmited BSS and is not available for new membership? | Please clarify in the spec | **Rejected**For purpose of membership setup, a non-AP STA still needs to parse the R-TWT Parameter Set subfield (in the Broadcast TWT element) carried in the RNR element as described in 11.1.3.8.4 (Inheritance of element values). This is baseline. |
| 16143 | SunHee Baek | 35.8.4 | 619.38 | The term "transmitting AP" isn't official terms. "transmitting AP" is replaced to "AP corresponding to the transmitted BSSID". | As in the comment | **Revised****TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #16141.** |
| 16144 | SunHee Baek | 35.8.4 | 619.42 | The term "nontransmitting AP" isn't official term. "nontransmitting AP" is replaced to "AP corresponding to the nontransmitted BSSID". | As in the comment | **Revised****TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #16141.** |
| 15841 | Muhammad Kumail Haider | 35.8.4 | 619.24 | Subclause 11.1.3.8.4 doesn't fully cover the case for the transmitted BSSID as there is a new additional change as specified in the third bullet at L42. Fix the last setence to reflect so. | As in comment. | **Revised.** **TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #15841.** |
| 16066 | Binita Gupta | 35.8.4 | 619.17 | The first paragraph in 35.8.4 needs to be revised to account for different cases - 1) the EHT AP is not in a multiple BSSID set, or 2)the EHT AP is a transmitted BSSID of the multiple BSSID set or 3) the EHT AP is a Nontransmitted BSSID of the multiple BSSID set. 4) EHT AP is a co-hosted BSSID. Define how R-TWT schedules can be advertised for each of these cases. | Revise the paragraph as per the comment to capture requirements for R-TWT schedule announcement for the cases mentioned. | **Revised****TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #16066.** |
| 18255 | Li-Hsiang Sun | 35.8.4 | 619.42 | There should be a requirement that TWT element with rTWT Schedule Info set to 3 is not included in nonTXBSSID profile, and not subject to inheritance | as in comment | **Revised**Agree with principle. **TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #18255.** |
| 16669 | Liwen Chu | 35.8.4 | 0.00 | since a transmitted BSSID AP or co-hosted AP transmits the non-idle R-TWT schedules of the other APs in the same multiple BSSID set or co-hosted AP set. The critical update of AP MLD and the AP that transmitted Beacon etc. should be changed accordingly. | As in comment | **Revised.**Agree in principle. Identified a few gaps (see more details in discussion)**TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #16669.** |
| 15842 | Muhammad Kumail Haider | 35.8.4 | 619.44 | It's best to add an exemplary illustration/diagram of the announcement for the MBSS case to be clear. | As in comment. | **Revised.**Instead of adding a figure, adding a subclause to describe the behavior.**TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #15841.** |
| 16067 | Binita Gupta | 35.8.4 | 619.45 | Would be good to add a Figure to show for clarity how R-TWT schedules for transmitted and nontransmitted BSSID APs are carried in a Beacon or Probe Response frame, similar to Figure 35-12a. | As in comment. | **Revised.**Instead of adding a figure, adding a subclause to describe the behavior.**TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #16066.** |
| 17083 | Mark RISON | 35.8.4 | 619.46 | "A non-AP STA should not request to establish membership in an R-TWT schedule advertised by the R-TWTscheduling AP with the Restricted TWT Schedule subfield set to 2.NOTE--The R-TWT scheduling AP that receives a request from a non-AP STA to establish membership in an R-TWTschedule advertised by the AP with Restricted TWT Schedule Info subfield set to 2 might reject the request." -- why allow this? | Change "should" to "shall" and delete the NOTE | Revised – the “should” is for flexibility. E.g. there might be a STA tearing down its membership at the same time another STA requesting a new membership.Agree the NOTE is extra and can be removed.**TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #17083.** |
| 15933 | Zhou Lan | 35.8.4 | 619.49 | The following note is ont needed and does not add any new information "NOTE--The R-TWT scheduling AP that receives a request from a non-AP STA to establish membership in an R-TWT schedule advertised by the AP with Restricted TWT Schedule Info subfield set to 2 might reject the request." | Remove the note | **Revised**.**TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #15933.** |
| 16650 | Mohamed Abouelseoud | 35.8.4 | 619.49 | The following note is ont needed and does not add any new information "NOTE--The R-TWT scheduling AP that receives a request from a non-AP STA to establish membership in an R-TWT schedule advertised by the AP with Restricted TWT Schedule Info subfield set to 2 might reject the request." | Remove the note | **Revised**.**TGbe editor: please revise as specified in this doc {11-23/458r0} tagged by #15933.** |

# Discussion For CID 16142,16115

One possible solution is to set the Broadcast TWT ID subfiled to bits [43:47] of the corresponding BSSID, when the Restricted TWT Schedule Info subfield, if present in the same Broadcast TWT Info subfield, is set to 3. This solution is shown below and in 25.8.3.1.

## 9.4.2.199 TWT element

…

B0 B1 B2 B3 B7 B8 B15

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Restricted TWT Traffic Info Present | Restricted TWT Schedule Info | Broadcast TWT ID | Broadcast TWT Persistence |

Bits: 1 2 5 8

**Figure 9-770—Broadcast TWT Info subfield format**

***TGbe Editor: revise the paragraph (“Within a TWT element that includes a TWT setup command value of Request TWT, Suggest TWT or Demand TWT, the Broadcast TWT ID, if present …”, P802.11beD3.1 P246L57) as follows:***

Within a TWT element that includes a TWT setup command value of Request TWT, Suggest TWT or Demand TWT, the Broadcast TWT ID, if present, indicates a specific Broadcast TWT in which the transmitting STA is requesting to participate. Within a TWT element that includes a TWT setup command value of Accept TWT, Alternate TWT, Dictate TWT or Reject TWT, the Broadcast TWT ID, if present, indicates a specific Broadcast TWT for which the transmitting STA is providing TWT parameters. (#16142,#16115)When the Restricted TWT Schedule Info subfield is present and equal to 3, the Broadcast TWT ID subfield is set to BSSID[43:47] of the corresponding AP. Within a TWT element that includes a TWT setup command value of TWT Grouping, the Broadcast subfield is 0 and the Broadcast TWT ID, is not present. The value 0 in the Broadcast TWT ID subfield indicates the broadcast TWT whose membership corresponds to all STAs that are members of the BSS corresponding to the BSSID of the Management frame carrying the TWT element and that is permitted to contain Trigger frames with RA-RUs for unassociated STAs. The Broadcast TWT ID subfield in a Restricted TWT Parameter Set field is always set to a nonzero value.

***---- TGbe Editor: this is end of change***

**Concern** was raised against this proposed change, however, with the following reason:

The legacy STA (pre-EHT) may not recognize this TWT parameter set is for R-TWT, and simply use Broadcast TWT ID to identify the schedule and execute the operation (membership add/change/terminate). Reusing the Broadcast TWT ID for BSSID identification may cause issues, and hence is not recommended.

Next: defer for now, and collect feedback, if any.

# Discussion related to a few CIDs 16669, 18255 etc.:

As introduced in D3.0, when an R-TWT scheduling AP advertises its R-TWT schedules, it also advertises schedules for co-located APs. For the latter, the Restricted TWT Schedule Info subfield value carried in the corresponding R-TWT Parameter Set is set to 3. A set of questions are raised related to these:

* **Q1**. Does the nonTxBSSID profile also advertise the R-TWT schedule for the TxBSSID, or only includes its own R-TWT schedule?
* **Q2**. How the non-AP STA associated with the AP with the TxBSSID parse the TWT element for R-TWT that is outside the nonTxBSSID profile and in the nonTxBSSID profile in the multiple BSSID element?
* **Q3**: the same question but for a non-AP STA associated with the AP with the nonTxBSSID.
* **Q4**: how the criticial update flag (CUF) and the BSS Parameter Change Counter subfield for the TxBSSID and nonTxBSSID (in multiple BSSID element) are updated?

Consideration:

Each R-TWT Parameter Set field in the announcement has 15 bytes. If for Q1, we let the nonTxBSSID profile in the multiple BSSID element also advertise for the TxBSSID, then the Beacon (and other management frames) will be ‘bloated’ unnecessarily. Here is an example:

* In a multiple BSSID set with 16 APs, each AP establishes 4 R-TWT schedules.
* If the nonTxBSSID AP also needs to carry the R-TWT schedules of other APs in the same multiple BSSID set, the Beacon will carry (16 x 4 x 16 = 1024 R-TWT schedules.
* If the nonTXBSSID AP is not required to do so, then the R-TWT schedules carried in a Beacon takes (16 x 4 + 15 x 4) = 124 schedule.

Given this, we think it’s best not let nonTxBSSID profile to include R-TWT schedule for TxBSSID, and add necessary clarification and changes along with this direction, as laid out below.

Notation:

**RTSIV**: the Restricted TWT Schedule Info subfield value

## AP side behavior:

* **1.a)** In the TWT element outside the Multiple BSSID element, it includes R-TWT Parameter Set field with RTSIV set to {0, 1, 2} for its TxBSSID; and R-TWT Parameter Set field with RTSIV set to 3 for an active R-TWT schedule belonging to the nonTxBSSID. [already in D3.0]
* **1.b)** TWT IE carries within the nonTxBSSID profile only carries R-TWT schedule info for its own nonTxBSSID, and hence won’t have any RTSIV set to 3. [clarification to be added]
	+ Perhaps a NOTE to clarify that the R-TWT parameter set with RTSIV 1 or 2 in its nonTxBSSID profile will have a corresponding parameter set in the TWT element outside the Multiple BSSID element with RTSIV set to 3.
* **1.c)** In the multiple BSSID set case, follows the 11.1.3.8.4 (Inheritance of element values). [already in D3.0]
* **1.d)** In the co-located BSSID set case, each AP carries in its transmitted Beacon the R-TWT schedules of its own (w/ RTSIV set to {0, 1, 2}); and R-TWT schedule for other APs in the same set with RTSIV set to 3. [in line with D3.0, call out explicitly]

## STA side behavior:

Notation: STA1 – associated with the AP with TxBSSID; STA2 – associated with the AP with nonTxBSSID.

* **2.a)** STA1 honors all active R-TWT schedules ( RTSIV set to values other than 0). ‘Honor’ means following the channel access rules defined in 35.8.4 (Channel access rules for R-TWT SPs). [already in D3.0]
* **2.b)** STA2 also recognize the R-TWT Parameter Set field outside the Multiple BSSID element, and honors all active R-TWT schedules. [New text to be added]
* **2.c)** STA2 parses the R-TWT schedule info in its own nonTxBSSID profile and conduct necessary membership setup/change as it wishes. [Baseline]

Example:

**AP1**: corresponds to a TxBSSID (BSSID-1)

**AP2**: corresponds to a nonTxBSSID (BSSID-2)

R-TWT schedule **R1**: AP1’s active R-TWT schedule.

R-TWT schedule **R2**: AP2’s active R-TWT schedule.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| R1 is present (for AP1) | R2 is present(for AP2) | # of Restricted Parameter Set fields outside the Multiple BSSID element and their respective RTSIV  | # of Restricted TWT Parameter Set fields in the nontransmitted BSSID profile and their respective RTSIV |
| Y | N | 1, with RTSIV = 1 | 0 |
| N | Y | 1, with RTSIV = 3 | 1, with RTSIV = 1 |
| Y | Y | 2, with RTSIV = 1 and 3, respectively | 1, with RTSIV = 1 |

## CUF and BPCC:

* A) Currently, it’s required to set CUF and increment BPCC when a broadcast TWT element is inserted or removed. [Per baseline]
	+ This covers the case where a schedule changes information such as {SP duration, Target Wake Time, Wake Interval}, which is considered as a combined action of schedule removal and insertion.
* B) When the RTSIV changes from active (non-zero values) to inactive (0), and vice versa, CUF and BPCC need to be set/incremented as well. [new to cover the gap]
	+ This condition can be described as: “*whenever RTSIV changes, and the original and new values are not both in the set {1, 2},*” the CUF and BPCC need to be …
		- Note that if RTSIV changes to 3 from 1, e.g., it’s a schedule removal/insertion. Vice versa.
* C) When there are any R-TWT schedule critical parameters change (as defined in above) for the TxBSSID (only), the CUF/PBCC in the nonTxBSSID profile need to be set/incremented as well (despite it’s not reflected in the R-TWT Parameter Set field contained in the nonTxBSSID profile). [new to cover the gap]
	+ Otherwise the STA associated with the nonTxBSSID AP may skip parsing the Beacon.
* D) When there are any active R-TWT schedule critical parameters changes for the nonTxBSSID (only), the CUF/PBCC outside for the TxBSSID (outside the Multiple BSSID element) need to be set/incremented. [Per baseline]

***TGbe Editor: please revise the title of the subclause 35.8.3 to be “35.8.3 R-TWT Announcement” as follows. Please also change other places accordingly where this subclause is referred.***

## 35.8.3 R-TWT ~~SPs~~ announcement (#16064)

***TGbe Editor: please add a new subclause number here as follows:***

## 35.8.3.1 General (#16669, #18255)

***TGbe Editor: please revise the first few paragraphs in this subclause as below:***

If there is any R-TWT membership set up, the EHT AP shall announce the R-TWT schedule information by including Restricted TWT Parameter Set field(s) in the broadcast TWT element as specified in 9.4.2.199 (TWT element) contained in transmitted Management frames, which are specified in 26.8.3 (Broadcast TWT operation). (#16066,#16141,#16570,#16571)The membership is setup with its associated EHT AP that corresponds to a transmitted or a nontransmitted BSSID in a multiple BSSID set that the transmitting AP belongs to, or that belongs to a co-hosted BSSID set that the transmitting AP belongs to, or that is neither a member of a multiple BSSID set nor a member of a co-hosted BSSID set. (#15841,#16066,#18255)

An R-TWT scheduling AP that includes a Restricted TWT Parameter Set field in a broadcast TWT element shall set the Restricted TWT Traffic Info Present subfield of the Restricted TWT Parameter Set field to 0 if the Negotiation Type subfield of the TWT element is equal to 2.

When advertising an R-TWT schedule, the R-TWT scheduling AP shall set the value of the Restricted TWT Schedule Info subfield as follows:

* If the schedule does not have any non-AP member STA, or the schedule is suspended for all member STAs, (#16141,#16570,#16571)the value shall be set to 0 (a.k.a. the schedule is idle); otherwise,
* If the R-TWT schedule is for the BSS operated by the transmitting AP, (#16141,#16570,#16571)the value shall be set to 2 to indicate the schedule is not available for accepting new membership due to resource constraints (a.k.a. the schedule is full), and otherwise (#16141,#16570,#16571)the value shall be set to 1;
* If the R-TWT schedule is for a BSS operated by (#16141,#16570,#16571)an AP that corresponds to a nontransmitted BSSID in a multiple BSSID set or that belongs to a co-hosted BSSID set, and the schedule is not idle, (#16141,#16570,#16571)the value shall be set to 3 (#16142,#16115), and set the Broadcast TWT ID subfield to the corresponding BSSID[43:47].

A non-AP STA should not request to establish membership in an R-TWT schedule advertised by the R-TWT scheduling AP with the Restricted TWT Schedule (#15832)Info subfield set to 2.

(#17083,#15933)

***TGbe Editor: please add a new subclause as follows:***

## 35.8.3.1 Announcement for Co-Located APs (#15841,#16066,#18255)

An R-TWT scheduling AP advertises the R-TWT schedule information belonging to its own BSS as well as that belonging to other BSS in the same multiple BSSID set or the same co-hosted BSSID set following the rules specified in 11.1.3.8.4 (Inheritance of element values) and what are specified below:

* The TWT element carried in the nontransmitted BSSID profile contained in the Multiple BSSID element may not have any Restricted TWT Schedule Info subfield, if present, set to value 3.
* When the AP belongs to a co-hosted BSSID set, each AP of the same BSSID set shall include in its transmitted Management frames its own R-TWT schedule information as well as those active schedules belonging to other APs in the same BSSID set, if any.

An R-TWT scheduled STA upon receiving a Management frame that advertises R-TWT schedules, if it is associated to the AP corresponding to a nontransmitted BSSID, it follows the rules specified in the 11.1.3.8 (Multiple BSSID Procedure) and the additional rule below in processing the TWT element:

* The non-AP STA shall recognize the Restricted TWT parameter set in the Management frame outside the Multiple BSSID element, and honor all the active R-TWT schedules as specified in 35.8.4 (Channel access rules for R-TWT SPs).

## 11.2.3.15 TIM Broadcast

***TGbe Editor: revise the thirteenth paragraph (“The following events about …”) as follows:***

The following events about the BSS parameters of the AP shall classify as a critical update:

…

m) Insertion (#16669)or deletion of a Broadcast TWT element

m1) Insertion (#16669)or deletion of a Broadcast TWT Parameter Set field in an existing Broadcast TWT element

m2) Modification of a Restricted TWT Schedule Info subfield, if present, when the value is changed from or to 0 (#16669)

…

***TGbe Editor: insert a new paragraph right after NOTE 4 as follows:***

…

(#16669)When the AP belongs to a multiple BSSID set and the critical update occurs for any of the reasons as specified in m), m1) and m2), but not due to any other reasons, and the relevant TWT parameter set is a Restricted TWT parameter set, then this critical update shall be also considered as a critical update for all the reported nontransmitted BSSID(s).

An AP may classify other changes in the Beacon frame as critical updates.