IEEE P802.11 Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| PAR Minutes – March 2023 | | | | |
| Date: 2023-03-16 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Michael Montemurro | Huawei | Toronto, ON, CANADA |  | [montemurro.michael@gmail.com](mailto:montemurro.michael@gmail.com) |

Abstract

This document contains the minutes of the PAR Standing Committee for the March 2023 session.

# Monday March 13, 13:30-15:30

### Jon Rosdahl, Qualcomm – Chair

### Michael Montemurro, Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd – Vice-Chair

Attendance: 5

1. Meeting called to order at 13:35
2. Review of IEEE-SA participation guidelines and policies and procedures.
3. We will provide comments on the PARs submitted for the July 2022 plenary.
   * Agenda Review – approved as document 11-23/187r0 - <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0187-00-0PAR-par-review-sc-meeting-agenda-and-comment-slides-march-2023-mixed-mode-plenary.pptx>

Result: **Approved. Unanimous.**

1. Motion to approve minutes from November PAR SC meetings:

MOTION: **Move to approve the minutes from November in document 11-22/1940r0:** <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-1940-00-0PAR-minutes-november-2022-session.docx> .

Mover: Michael Montemurro

Second: James Gilb

Result: **Approved. Unanimous.**

1. PAR and CSD comments are captured in 11-23/187r1
   * **802.1CS-2020/Cor 1- Link-local Registration Protocol - Corrigendum 1 Corrections to Management Modules and Protocol Encoding,**[**PAR modification**](https://protect2.fireeye.com/v1/url?k=31323334-501d5122-313273af-454445555731-5b71d938202925cb&q=1&e=3ce7bd91-7b15-445d-bcbf-04d2367d3f9b&u=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.ieee802.org%2F1%2Ffiles%2Fpublic%2Fdocs2023%2Fmaint-draft-cs-2020-cor1-PAR-modification-0123-v02.pdf)
   * The original expiry date for the PAR is 2026. The original PAR was approved in 2020.
   * Comments on editorial format of redline.
   * The SNMP, MIB, and TLV acronyms needs to be expanded on first use.
   * Expand OID in section 8.1

* 802.1ASdm - Amendment: Hot Standby and Clock Drift Error Reduction, [PAR modification](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dm-draft-PAR-modification-0123-v01.pdf) and [CSD](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dm-draft-CSD-modification-0123-v01.pdf)
* PAR modification:
  + Need full name for IEC-IEEE 60802 in 8.1
  + 5.5: Need a space between “1” and “µs”
  + 5.2b**:** remove the “more” in two locations in the added sentence. The purpose it to achieve 1 µs over 64 hops.
  + NESCOM prefers that comparative terms (e.g. more, higher) are not used without a numeric value.
* CSD:
  + 1.2.3: used “improved accuracy” rather than “more accuracy”
* 802.1Qdt - Amendment: Priority-based Flow Control Enhancements, [PAR modification](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dt-draft-PAR-modification-0123-v01.pdf) and [CSD](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dt-draft-CSD-modification-0123-v01.pdf)
* PAR modification:
  + No comments
* CSD:
  + No comments
* 802.1Qdx - Amendment: YANG Data Models for the Credit-Based Shaper, [PAR](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dx-draft-PAR-0123-v01.pdf) and [CSD](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dx-draft-CSD-0123-v01.pdf)
* PAR:
  + 5.2b: The “(8.6.8.2)” reference seems out of place.
* CSD:
* No comments
* 802.1DU - Standard: Cut-Through Forwarding Bridges and Bridged Networks, [PAR](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/du-draft-PAR-0123-v01.pdf) and [CSD](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/du-draft-CSD-0123-v01.pdf)
* PAR:
  + 4.2 and 4.3 are one month apart. Please change to allow at least 6 months.
  + 5.4 – “lower latency” should be replaced by “reduced latency”. There really should be a quantitative metric that the latency is being reduced.
  + 5.5 – Please revisit the 5.5 text as it gives more of a solution rather than describes the solution rather than the need for the project.
* CSD:
* No comments
* 802.15.4 - Amendment: Privacy Enhancements, [PAR](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.15/dcn/23/15-23-0040-00-0017-propsed-par-for-task-group-privacy.pdf) and [CSD](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.15/dcn/23/15-23-0041-02-0017-draft-csd.docx)
* PAR:
  + This amendment will remove the “purpose” clause for the amendment.
  + The letter for the amendment will be assigned by NESCOM unless suggested by the SG.
  + 7.1. The answer should be “Yes”
  + 7.2 should include IEEE 802E, IEEE 802.11, and fill in the details. There should be a differentiation between those standards and this project.
  + 8.1: There is no other 802.15.4 project similar to this. Remove the sentence in section 8.1.A couple of suggested change were made.
  + 8.1: IEEE Std 802.15.4 should be expanded.
  + 8.1: IEEE Std 802.11 needs to be expanded.
* CSD:
* The CSD should be based on the latest version, 2020. Update to the latest version. In the policy and procedures directory of the ieee802.org website.
* 1.1.1 should choose “option c”. The response is not complete.
* 1.1.2 should choose “option b”. The response is not complete.
* 1.2.1 a) The text looks like the purpose from the root standard, which is being removed by this project. Removing the first sentence would help clarify what the applicability is. Also there are excessive superlativces in the first paragraph, so may be better to just delete the first paragraph.
* 1.2.1 a) the “in them” in the second paragraph should be removed.
* 1.2.1 a) The last sentence does not make sense in the context of this project. Delete the sentence. This amendment adds privacy to the standard.
* 1.2.4 b) The response needs to be re-written to explain why the to answer the question why the amendment is “Proven similar technology via testing, model, simulation, etc.”. Are there similar technology that can validated this new technology via test, modelling, simulation, and/or third-party review.
* 1.2.4 a) the term “like” should be “such as”
* 1.2.5: The responses look to be copied from another CISD. Please consider generating responses that are relevant to this project.
* Chair will post the PAR/SC output to the 802 WG reflector and submit the result to the EC.

1. Recess at 15: 17 until Thursday March 16 at 10:30.

# Thursday March 16, 10:30-12:30

### Jon Rosdahl, Qualcomm – Chair

### Michael Montemurro, Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd – Vice-Chair

Attendance: 5

1. Meeting called to order at 10:45
2. Agenda Review – approved as document 11-23/187r2 - <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0187-02-0PAR-par-review-sc-meeting-agenda-and-comment-slides-march-2023-mixed-mode-plenary.pptx>
   * Agenda is approved unanimously.
3. PAR and CSD comments are captured in 11-21/187r3
   * **802.1CS-2020/Cor 1- Link-local Registration Protocol - Corrigendum 1 Corrections to Management Modules and Protocol Encoding,**[**PAR modification**](https://protect2.fireeye.com/v1/url?k=31323334-501d5122-313273af-454445555731-5b71d938202925cb&q=1&e=3ce7bd91-7b15-445d-bcbf-04d2367d3f9b&u=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.ieee802.org%2F1%2Ffiles%2Fpublic%2Fdocs2023%2Fmaint-draft-cs-2020-cor1-PAR-modification-0123-v02.pdf)
   * No comments

* 802.1ASdm - Amendment: Hot Standby and Clock Drift Error Reduction, [PAR modification](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dm-draft-PAR-modification-0123-v01.pdf) and [CSD](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dm-draft-CSD-modification-0123-v01.pdf)
* PAR modification:
  + No comments
* CSD:
  + No comments
* 802.1Qdt - Amendment: Priority-based Flow Control Enhancements, [PAR modification](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dt-draft-PAR-modification-0123-v01.pdf) and [CSD](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dt-draft-CSD-modification-0123-v01.pdf)
* PAR modification:
  + There is confusion with “this standard” terminology.
  + Change “this standard” to “the base standard” in both locations
* CSD:
  + No comments
* 802.1Qdx - Amendment: YANG Data Models for the Credit-Based Shaper, [PAR](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dx-draft-PAR-0123-v01.pdf) and [CSD](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dx-draft-CSD-0123-v01.pdf)
* PAR:
  + No comments
* CSD:
* No comments
* 802.1DU - Standard: Cut-Through Forwarding Bridges and Bridged Networks, [PAR](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/du-draft-PAR-0123-v01.pdf) and [CSD](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/du-draft-CSD-0123-v01.pdf)
* PAR:
  + 802.1DU Response: Change “This standard enables lower latency communication than is achievable in bridged networks without CTF” in 5.4 to “This standard enables lower latency communication compared to what is achievable without CTF and reduces the dependency of end-to-end latency on frame length” Change “The low latency achievable” in 5.5 to “The lower latency achievable” Note: Please find details on use-cases and quantities in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.1/dcn/21/1-21-0037-00-ICne-ieee-802-tutorial-cutthrough-forwarding-ctf-among-ethernet-networks.pdf>.
  + 802.11 Rebuttal: The Response while maybe an improvement for 5.4 and 5.5, it is not addressing the feedback.5.5 This section should document what the problem to be solved is, rather than providing a solution to an unspecified problem.The response item C) is great text you have given to us, but it would be better to include in 8.1 as further explanation for 5.5..
* CSD:
* No comments
* 802.15.4 - Amendment: Privacy Enhancements, [PAR](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.15/dcn/23/15-23-0040-00-0017-propsed-par-for-task-group-privacy.pdf) and [CSD](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.15/dcn/23/15-23-0041-02-0017-draft-csd.docx)
* PAR:
  + No comments
* CSD:
* No comments
* A summary for the 802.11 PAR review report is captured on slide xxf document 11-23/187r3
* ACTION: Chair to clean-up the report to be more presentable.
  + The review comments are captured in document 11-23/187r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0187-03-0PAR-par-review-sc-meeting-agenda-and-comment-slides-march-2023-mixed-mode-plenary.pptx>).
  + Review summary in Final Report to 802.11

1. Approval of PAR Review SC report

**MOTION:**

**Move to accept the report contained in** <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0187-02-0PAR-par-review-sc-meeting-agenda-and-comment-slides-march-2023-mixed-mode-plenary.pptx>  **as the report from PAR Review SC for the March 2023 Mixed-Mode 802 Plenary.**

**Moved: Stephen Palm**

**2nd: Joseph Levy**

**Results: 4 – Yes; 0 – No; 0 – Abstain. Motion Passes.**

1. Adjourn at 11:43