IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes for REVme 2023 March Telecons | | | | |
| Date: 2023-03-03 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W  Highland, UT 84003 | +1 801 492 4029 | jrosdahl @ ieee . org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the TGme (REVme) telecons held during March 2023.

R0: March 03, 2023: Initial minutes.

1. **TGme (REVme) Telecon –Friday, March 03, 2023, at 10:00-12:00 ET**
   1. **Called to order** 10:05 am ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of other Officers present:**
      1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope) – Absent - Traveling
      2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
      3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
      5. Not present:
         1. Edward AU (Huawei) Absent
   3. **IMAT Reported attendance:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Name | Affiliation |
| 1 | Coffey, John | Realtek Semiconductor Corp. |
| 2 | Halasz, David | Morse Micro |
| 3 | Harkins, Daniel | Aruba Networks, Inc. |
| 4 | Hedayat, Ahmadreza | Apple Inc. |
| 5 | Huang, Po-Kai | Intel |
| 6 | Kneckt, Jarkko | Apple, Inc. |
| 7 | Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
| 8 | Liu, Yong | Apple, Inc. |
| 9 | Malinen, Jouni | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc |
| 10 | Montemurro, Michael | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| 11 | Patwardhan, Gaurav | Hewlett Packard Enterprise |
| 12 | Petrick, Albert | Jones-Petrick and Associates, LLC. |
| 13 | Qi, Emily | Intel |
| 14 | RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| 15 | Rosdahl, Jon | Qualcomm Technologies, Inc. |
| 16 | Stacey, Robert | Intel |
| 17 | Yang, Jay | Nokia |
| 18 | Yong, Su Khiong | Apple, Inc. |

* 1. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
     1. No issues noted.
  2. **Review Agenda:** 11-21/0155r11:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0155-11-000m-january-march-teleconference-agenda.docx>
     2. Friday’s Agenda:

1. Call to order, attendance (<https://imat.ieee.org/attendance>), and patent and copyright policy

a. Patent Policy: Ways to inform IEEE:

i. Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or

ii. Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or

iii. Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

b. Copyright Policy:

i. By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

c. Participation and policy related (including Patent and Copyright) slides:

See slides 10-19 in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>

d. Agenda Approval

2. Editor report – Emily QI/Edward AU

3. Comment resolution and motions

i) **Friday March 3, 2023 – 10am – noon Eastern**

4. Comment resolution

a. CIDs 3082 (MAC) and 3083 (MAC) – Withdrawn

b. 11-22/1988 – Protected Password Identifiers – Harkins

c. CID 3753 – doc 11-23/156 (SEC)– Huang (Intel)

d. CID 3742 – doc 11-23/154 (SEC) – Huang (Intel)

e. CID 3743, 3744, 3745, 3746 (SEC) – doc 11-23/153 – Huang (Intel)

f. SEC CIDs – 11-22/2163 – Montemurro (Huawei)

5. AOB

6. Adjourn

* + 1. Add CID 3165 (MAC) and 3032 (GEN) to list of withdrawn CIDs.
    2. No objection to updated Agenda.
    3. Updated Agenda R12 to be posted:
       1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0155-12-000m-january-march-teleconference-agenda.docx>
  1. **Withdrawn CIDS:** 
     1. CIDs 3165 (MAC), 3082 (MAC), 3032 (GEN), and 3083 (MAC) –
        1. Proposed resolution: Rejected; Comment has been withdrawn by the commenter.
        2. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  2. **Editor Report:** Emily QI (Intel)
     1. We have completed the Comment approval updates,
     2. Will start review today (March 3) by sending comments to the Adhoc chairs for review.
     3. Expect review completed by Next week (March 10).
     4. May not post interim Draft if we are going to Recirc out of March, but we will get the review completed, and then if we are going to recirc, we will just post the updated draft with extra comment resolutions included for recirc and skip the interim draft.
  3. **Review doc: 11-23/0044r4** – Dan HARKINS (HPE)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0044-04-000m-hpke-protected-password-identifiers.docx>
     2. Abstract: This submission proposes a way to provide privacy protections to SAE password identifiers.
     3. No Associated CID.
     4. Review updates to submission.
     5. Minor updates were identified. Dan noted the suggested edits and will bring back a future revision.
     6. There were many suggestions that were requested to be sent to the Author offline.
     7. Discussion on concern with TOFO (Trust on First use).
     8. Discussion on if Public Key can be trusted or not. Can Public Key be protected.
     9. Discussion on intent of increasing privacy by using public keys.
     10. There is an Urgency to get these proposed changes to the market sooner than if we were to use TGbi.
     11. Discussion on use of Diff-Helmman for detecting DOS attacks.
     12. Thanks to Dan, and request to group to work offline (but on the reflector) between now and March Pleanary to make as much progress as we can to find consensus.
  4. **Review doc 11-23/154– CID 3742 (SEC)** – Po-Kai HUANG (Intel)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0154-01-000m-kck-clarification-in-12-4.docx>
     2. CID 3742 (SEC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review submission showing proposed changes.
        3. Review how key is derived – See top of page 4.
        4. Discussion on where the “SAE-“are needed to be added.
        5. Missing Test Vector location that needs “SAW-“added.
        6. Add Missing Editor Instructions to the end of the document.
        7. These changes are for the locations noted. Other CIDs handle other potential changes to KCK naming issues.
        8. Proposed Resolution: CID 3742 (SEC): Revised. Incorporate the changes in 11-23/0154r2: (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0154-02-000m-kck-clarification-in-12-4.docx>).
        9. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.

* 1. **Review doc 11-23/156 – CID 3753 (SEC)** – Po-Kai HUANG (Intel)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0156-01-000m-cr-for-cid-3753.docx>
     2. CID 3753 (SEC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review submission for proposed changes.
        3. Changes correct slash confusion, but the table 12-12 is not changed.
        4. Discussion on concern on having 3 lines in the table 12-11 for the same AKM.
        5. Suggestion to make a change similar to FILS for SAE and not make changes in the table 12-11
        6. Ask to continue offline – Proposal is to add a sentence similar to FILS without changing the tables.
        7. Mark CID 3753 (SEC): More Work Required
        8. Assign to Po-Kai HUANG
        9. Schedule for March Plenary
  2. **Review doc 11-23/153r1 - CID 3743, 3744, 3745, 3746 (SEC)** - Po-Kai HUANG (Intel)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0153-01-000m-kck-and-kek-definition-clarification.docx>
     2. CID 3743, 3744, 3745, 3746 (SEC)
        1. Review comments
        2. Review submission for proposed changes.
        3. No objection to the Direction
        4. Schedule for discussion for March Plenary.
        5. Mark CIDs 3743-3746 (SEC): More work required.
        6. Assign to Po-Kai HUANG.
        7. Schedule to Bring back in March.
  3. **Review doc 11-22/2163 – SEC CIDs** – Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2163-04-000m-lb270-sec-adhoc-comment-resolutions-part-2.docx>
     2. CID 3486 (SEC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review submission discussion.
        3. Need to be revised, the proposed change is updated.
        4. Proposed Resolution: Revised; Add the following text at the end of the referenced paragraph “Unless stated otherwise, KDEs defined in this started are not extensible.”
        5. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
     3. CID 3492 (SEC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Noted that Tx subfield was used in TGi.
        3. Discussion on how “Reserved” got defined and what happens if this value is “1”.
        4. There would be 3 fields “Reserved”, may be the editors could combine to one field with 14 bits of “Reserved.”
        5. Proposed resolution: Accepted.
        6. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
     4. CID 3497 (SEC)
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Review discussion in submission.
        3. Discussion on if “zero length” vs “zero or more triplets”.
        4. Suggestion that we should just get rid of the triplets wording in this clause.
        5. Proposed Resolution: REVISED;

At 2929.31, change

“All other fields shall be set to 0.”

to

“The Optional Parameter(s) field has zero length. All other fields shall be set to 0.”

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    1. CID 3551 (SEC)
       1. Review comment.
       2. Review discussion in submission.
       3. Discussion on use of Key ID to determine which key is being replaced.
       4. Discussion on use of “old vs new” GTK keys.
       5. How to force the removal of the old GTK key? You can do a double GTK rekey, or state that the AP is to not use the old Key once the new key is used. The existing text is implicit and could be left as is.
       6. Mark CID 3551 (SEC): More work required.
       7. Assign to Mark RISON.
       8. Schedule to Bring back in March.
    2. CID 3575 (SEC)
       1. Review comment.
       2. Review discussion in submission.
       3. Redirecting to document (on similar topic): 11-22/2069r5: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2069-05-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d2-0-lb270.docx>
       4. CID 3573 and 3574 (SEC)
          1. Review comments
       5. Review discsion in 11-22/2069r5 for CID 3573 and 3574 (SEC)
          1. Discussion on how many counters there are when PV0 vs PV1.
       6. Review proposed changes to resolve the CIDs.
       7. Suggestion to change to “PVO robust Management frames.”
       8. Need discussion on S1G SME to ensure security issue is addressed.
       9. Ran out of Time.
       10. Need updated for doc 11-22/2069 and 11-22/2163.
       11. Mark CIDs 3575, 3573 and 3574 (SEC): More work required.
       12. Assign to Mark RISON.
       13. Schedule to bring back in March.
  1. **Adjourned at 12:01pm ET.**

**References:**

March 3, 2023

1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0155-11-000m-january-march-teleconference-agenda.docx>
2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2139-00-0000-2nd-vice-chair-report-january-2023.pptx>
3. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0155-12-000m-january-march-teleconference-agenda.docx>
4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0044-04-000m-hpke-protected-password-identifiers.docx>
5. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0154-01-000m-kck-clarification-in-12-4.docx>
6. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0154-02-000m-kck-clarification-in-12-4.docx>
7. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0156-01-000m-cr-for-cid-3753.docx>
8. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0153-01-000m-kck-and-kek-definition-clarification.docx>
9. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2163-04-000m-lb270-sec-adhoc-comment-resolutions-part-2.docx>
10. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2069-05-000m-resolutions-for-some-comments-on-11me-d2-0-lb270.docx>