IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Comment Resolution for Setup CIDs (Part 2) | | | | |
| Date: 2022-08-03 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Anirudha Sahoo | NIST | 100 Bureau Dr, Gaithersburg, MD 20899 |  | anirudha.sahoo@nist.gov |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document resolves comment with CIDs 88, 431, 453, 612, 751 and 752

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commentor** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 88 | Alecsander Eitan | 11.2.18.4 | 67 | Is the "may" the correct wording ? | Text states "To perform a sensing measurement setup, a sensing initiator may transmit a Sensing Measurement Setup Request frame to a sensing responder with which it intends to perform a sensing measurement setup."  The word "may" implies that this is one option, and there are other posibilities. BUT are there other options? If not, the "may": shoiuld be "shall". |

**Proposed Resolution:** Revise

**Discussion:** Agree with the commentor in principle.

**Modifications:** Please see modification suggested at the end of CID #751 to address multiple CIDs with similar comments.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commentor** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 431 | Assaf Kasher | 11.21.18.4 | 57 | "To perform a sensing measurement setup, a sensing initiator may transmit a Sensing Measurement Setup  Request frame" - is it optional? Is there another way to do it? | replace with "To initiate a sensing measurement setup, a sensing initiator shall transmit a Sensing Measurement Setup  Request frame (see 9.6.7.50)" |

**Proposed Resolution:** Revise

**Discussion:** The page number in the comment should have been 67. Agree with the commentor in principle.

**Modifications:** Please see modification suggested at the end of CID #751 to address multiple CIDs with similar comments.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commentor** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 453 | Claudio da Silva | 11.21.18.4 | 67 | The sentence "To perform a sensing measurement setup, a sensing initiator may transmit a SMS Request frame..." gives the understanding that there are other ways to perform a sensing measurement setup (in addition to sending a Sensing Measurement Setup Request frame), which is not true. Thus, I believe a "shall" should be used here. | Replace "may" with "shall". If my reasoning is incorrect, define cases when the transmission of a Sensing Measurement Setup Request frame is required. |

**Proposed Resolution:** Revise

**Discussion:** Agree with the commentor in principle.

**Modifications:** Please see modification suggested at the end of CID #751 to address multiple CIDs with similar comments.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commentor** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 612 | Chaoming Luo | 11.21.18.4 | 67 | "May" indicates there are means to perform a sensing measurement setup other than transmit a MS request frame. | Beacon may carry a default MS. |

**Proposed Resolution:** Revise

**Discussion:** Trasmitting MS request frame is the only way to initiate measurement setup. Hence, the “may” should be replaced with “shall”.

**Modifications:** Please see modification suggested at the end of CID #751 to address multiple CIDs with similar comments.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commentor** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 751 | Alireza Raissinia | 11.21.18.4 | 67 | Change "may' to 'shall' as measurement setup exchange shall always starts with sensing initiator transmitting the MS request frame | As per comment |

**Proposed Resolution:** Revise

**Discussion:** Agree with the commentor in principle. Additionally, getting rid of repetition of phrase “to perform a sensing measurement setup” in the sentence.

**Modifications (for #88, 431, 453,612,751):** Editor, please modify the text at P82.L49-51 in tgbf draft 0.2 as shown below:

~~To perform a sensing measurement setup, a~~ A sensing initiator ~~may~~ shall transmit a Sensing Measurement Setup Request frame to a sensing responder with which it intends to ~~perform~~ initiate a sensing measurement setup.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commentor** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** |
| 752 | Alireza Raissinia | 11.21.18.4 | 67 | Change the text "the tuple <sensing initiator's MAC address, Measurement Setup ID> is used to identify a specific measurement setup." to | The measurement setup ID shall be assigned by a sensing initiator, the tuple <sensing initiator's MAC address, Measurement Setup ID> should be used to identify the coresponding measurement setup. |

**Proposed Resolution:** Revise

**Discussion:** Agree with the commentor in principle. However, the suggested change needs to be incorporated to the new text in the draft 0.2.

**Modifications:** Editor, please modify the text at P83.L5-7 in tgbf draft 0.2 as shown below:

The Measurement Setup ID(#217) shall be assigned by a sensing initiator, the tuple <sensing initiator’s

MAC address, Measurement Setup ID> ~~is~~ should be used to uniquely(#25) identify ~~a specific~~ the corresponding sensing measurement

setup(#861).

**References:**

1. Draft P802.11bf\_D0.2

**Acknowledgement:** The author would like to thank the Setup TTT members for their feedback in resolving these CIDs.