IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Comment resolutions for SA2 CIDs 6000 and 6028 | | | | |
| Date: 2022-07-26 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Joseph LEVY | InterDigital, Inc. | 111 W 35th St., NY, New York | +1 631.622.4239 | joseph.levy@interdigital.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document provides proposed comment resolutions for CIDs submitted in response to the 802.11 TGbd D5.0 SA letter ballot SA2. CIDs: 6000 and 6028.

r1: As modified with some editorial changes during the 2022-07-26 TGbd Teleconference, resolutions are ready for motion, if no additional comments are received.

The comments are available: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0983-01-00bd-tgbd-sa2-comments.xlsx> (<https://802tools.org/comments/comments/P802.11bd_SA2>).

Status: Highlighting in CID column indicates the status of the discussion on the CID:

Not Discussed (not highlighted)

Discussed additional discussion required (date of discussion(s) is(are) located below CID number)

Discussed / ready for SP (date of discussion(s) is(are) located below CID number)

SP run / ready for Motion (date of the SP is located below the date of discussion)

Motioned (date of Motion is located below the date of the SP)

Resolution Status: Highlighting in the Resolution column indicates:

Yellow highlighted text needs to be discussed

Red highlighted text has been discussed and additional discussion is required

**CID for Clause 3.2 page 17, lines 64:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 6000 | Following amendment could be misunderstood, as "merging toghether" two channels to one channel:  The OCB secondary channel is adjacent to and the OCB primary channel are contiguous and together with the OCB primary channel form a 20 MHz channel for the transmission of 20 MHz next generation vehicle-to-everything (V2X) (NGV) physical layer (PHY) protocol data units (PPDUs) (#5091) | To point out that there still exists a primary and a secondary channel, I propose to write something like:  The OCB secondary channel and the OCB primary channel are two contiguous 10 MHz channels for the transmission of 20 MHz next generation vehicle-to-everything (V2X) (NGV) physical layer (PHY) protocol data units (PPDUs) (#5091) | Rejected:  The primary and secondary channels are “merged” into one 20 MHz channel for the transmission of OCB 20 MHz PPDUs. The primary and secondary sub-channels still exist in the 20 MHz OCB channel and OCB 20 MHz PPDUs are designed to be compatible with the sub-channel structure, to support compatibility with “legacy” non-NGV devices. But this does not mean that the primary and secondary channels are not “merged” into a 20 MHz channel, the OCB 20 MHz channel. |

**CIDs for Clause B.4.38.3 Page 133, line 28:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 6028 | It is confusing to call out MLME subclauses in a requirement subclause. Better to just call out 31.B (NGV MAC data service) and 31.6 (Radio env measurement). That will also help understand if receiving TX params from higher layers is M or O and also providing RX params to higher layer is M or O | Replace the cited subclauses in the References column with "31.5 (NGV MAC data service) and 31.6 (Radio env measurement)". I think the same needs to be done for the next row on 60G, but maybe 31.3 needs to be cited as well. | Revised:  Agree with the commentor, it is strange to callout MLME subclauses in the PICs. However, it is these higher layer MLME functions that must be supported. But referencing the MLME is not preferred, the references should be to the location in the specification where these MLME primitives are cited to impact device behavior. Clause 10.2.3.2 is where the device behavior is specified for NGVE1.1.  Regarding the next row – the device behavior is described in clause in 11.1.4 for NGVE1.2.  Text changes are provide in 11-22/1198r0 |

**CID 6000:**

**Existing text D5.0:**

**outside the context of a basic service set (OCB) secondary channel:** A 10 MHz channel that is designated by a higher layer (via medium access control (MAC) sublayer management entity (MLME) primitives and/or management information base (MIB) parameters). The OCB secondary channel and the OCB primary channel are contiguous and together form a 20 MHz channel for the transmission of 20 MHz next generation vehicle-to-everything (V2X) (NGV) physical layer (PHY) protocol data units (PPDUs)

**Revised text:**

**outside the context of a basic service set (OCB) secondary channel:** A 10 MHz channel that is designated by a higher layer (via medium access control (MAC) sublayer management entity (MLME) primitives and/or management information base (MIB) parameters). The OCB secondary channel and the OCB primary channel are contiguous and together form a 20 MHz channel for the transmission of 20 MHz next generation vehicle-to-everything (V2X) (NGV) physical layer (PHY) protocol data units (PPDUs)

**CID 6028:**

**Existing text D5.0:**

**Clause B.4.38.3**

* NGV extended MAC service features

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Item | Feature | References | Status | Support |
|  | Are the following NGV extended MAC service features supported? |  |  |  |
| NGVE1 | NGV extended MAC service features |  |  |  |
| NGVE1.1 | NGV extended MAC service features - MLME; 5.9 GHz band | 6.3.128 ( Cancel transmissions of MSDUs)  6.3.129 (NGV radio environment measurement) | CFNGV:M | Yes o No o N/A o |
| NGVE1.2 | NGV extended MAC service features - MLME; DMG | 6.3.130 ( DMG operation outside the context of a BSS) | CFNGV60:M | Yes o No o N/A o |

**Revised text:**

* NGV extended MAC service features

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Item | Feature | References | Status | Support |
|  | Are the following NGV extended MAC service features supported? |  |  |  |
| NGVE1 | NGV extended MAC service features |  |  |  |
| NGVE1.1 | NGV extended MAC service features - MLME; 5.9 GHz band  (MLME-CANCELTX) | 10.2.3.2 (HCF Contention based channel access (EDCA))) | CFNGV:M | Yes o No o N/A o |
| NGVE1.2 | NGV extended MAC service features - MLME; DMG  (MLME-DMG-OCB-START, MLME-DMG-OCB-STOP, MLME-OCB-DMGDISCOVERY, MLME-OCB-LINKSTATUS) | 11.1.4 (Acquiring synchronization, scanning),  11.27 (DMG Beamformed link and BSS maintenance) | CFNGV60:M | Yes o No o N/A o |

**References:**