IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Resolutions for Editorial Comments in CC40 - Part 2 |
| Date: 2022-06-28 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Claudio da Silva | Meta Platforms, Inc |  |  | claudiodasilva@fb.com |
| Chris Beg | Cognitive Systems |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions to editorial comments submitted in CC40. The text used as reference is D0.1.

Comments: 023, 229, 429, 665, 841, 848, 852, 853, 854, 856, 858, 859, 894

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| **429** | 11.21.18.1 | 64.50 | "operationalattributes associated with a sensing measurement instance are set" - the operation attribures are related to multiple measurement instances! | replace with "operationalattributes associated with sensing measurement instances are set" |
| 665 |  | 23.48 | What does "operational attributes" mean? Why don't use Sensing Measurement parameters which I believe is the intended meaning | As in comment |
| **848** | 11.21.18.1 | 64.49 | Use of different terms for the same thing - "operational parameters" vs "operational attributes". Also a sensing measurement setup can be applicable to one or more sensing measurement instances and not only one sensing measurement instance. | Change text to:"In the sensing session setup, a sensing session is established, and in the sensing measurement setup, operational parameters associated with one or more sensing measurement instances are set." |
| 852 | 11.21.18.1 | 65.02 | Use of different terms for the same thing - "operational parameters" vs "operational attributes". | Change text to: "The set of operational parameters used in a sensing measurement instance are also determined in the sensing measurement setup." |
| 853 | 11.21.18.1 | 65.21 | Use of different terms for the same thing - "operational parameters" vs "operational attributes". | Change text to: "A first sensing measurement setup procedure is then performed, which defines a set of operational parameters labeled with a Measurement Setup ID equal to 1. The concept of Measurement Setup ID is defined in 11.21.18.3 (Sensing session setup). After the sensing measurement setup, sensing measurement instances are performed based on the defined operational parameter set (Measurement Setup ID equal to 1)." |
| 854 | 11.21.18.1 | 65.27 | Use of different terms for the same thing - "operational parameters" vs "operational attributes". | Change text to: "After some time, a second sensing measurement setup procedure is performed between the AP and STA A that defines a second operational parameter set that is labeled with a Measurement Setup ID of 2. After the second sensing measurement setup, any subsequent sensing measurement instances may be performed based on either the first (Measurement Setup ID equal to 1) or second (Measurement Setup ID equal to 2) operational parameter sets. An operational parameter set may be terminated by performing a sensing measurement setup termination procedure; for example, ..."" |
| 856 | 11.21.18.1 | 66.19 | Use of different terms for the same thing - "operational parameters" vs "attribute set". | Also in both figures, while the AP and STA A still have the first sensing session active, a new sensing session setup procedure is performed between the AP and STA B that establishes a sensing session identified by the UID of STA B (UID 2). In Figure 11-41a (Example of a WLAN sensing procedure), a first sensing measurement setup procedure between the AP and STA B defines operational parameters that are identical to the operational parameters corresponding to Measurement Setup ID equal to 2 established between the AP and STA A and, therefore, shares the label of Measurement Setup ID equal to 2. Subsequent measurement instances associated with Measurement Setup ID equal to 2 may thus be associated with STA A, STA B, or both STA A and STA B. Each measurement instance may have one-to-many (including one-to-one) announcement and/or triggering, and may have either one-to-many or many-to-one (including one-to-one) sounding. As also illustrated in Figure 11-41a (Example of a WLAN sensing procedure), after a measurement setup is terminated, its label (specifically, the Measurement Setup ID) becomes available for re-use when a new measurement setup is performed, potentially with a different corresponding operational paramater set. |
| **858** | 11.21.18.4 | 67.07 | Use of different terms for the same thing - "operational parameters" vs "operational attributes". Also operational parameters may be associated with more than one sensing measurement instance. | Change text to:"Sensing measurement setup allows for a sensing initiator and a sensing responder to exchange and agree on operational parameters associated with one or more sensing measurement instances. |
| 859 | 11.21.18.5 | 68.03 | Use of different terms for the same thing - "operational parameters" vs "operational attributes". | Change text to: "The Measurement Instance ID may be used to identify the sensing measurement instance that utilizes operational parameters of the same tuple <Sensing Initiator's MAC address, Measurement Setup ID>." |
| 841 | 9.6.7.49 | 58.02 | Use of different terms for the same thing - "operational parameters" vs "assigned parameters" | Change text to: "The Measurement Setup ID field in the Sensing Measurement Setup Request frame indicates a Measurement Setup ID that identifies operational parameters in the Sensing Measurement Parameters Element ...." |

**Note:**  Comments 429, 848, and 858 were included in revision 2 of this document.

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Discussion**:

* The word attribute, as evidenced by the comments above, is leading to misunderstanding. Also, the word attribute is mainly used in the baseline text in the context of MIB (“MIB attribute”).
* There was a discussion on whether the word “parameter” refers to “numerical or other measurable factor(s)” only and would, thus, be inappropriate (since roles such as “sensing transmitter” are defined in the Sensing Measurement Parameters element). It was brought to our attention that one of the usage examples provided by Merriam-Webster uses “parameter” with non-“numerical or other measurable factor(s)”: “health care is a universal parameter, … a ubiquitous concern across every age, occupation, and class line.”
* Propose to replace “operational attributes” with “operational parameters” (as suggested by comments 848, 852, 853, 854, 856, 858, and 859).

**Modifications**: Editor – Modify the following pages/lines as indicated:

33.6-8 The Sensing Measurement Parameters element indicates ~~operational attributes~~ operational parameters associated with ~~of the corresponding~~ sensing measurement instance(s).

64.48-50 In the sensing session setup, a sensing session is established, and in the sensing measurement setup, ~~operational attributes associated with a~~ operational parameters associated with sensing measurement instance(s) are set.

65.1-5 As defined in 11.21.18.3 (Sensing session setup), ~~the sensing transmitter and sensing receiver roles are determined during the sensing measurement setup. The set of operational attributes~~ operational parameters associated with ~~used in a~~ sensing measurement instance(s) are ~~also determined~~ set in the sensing measurement setup.

65.19-36 A first sensing measurement setup procedure is then performed, which defines ~~a set of operational attributes~~ operational parameters that are labeled with a Measurement Setup ID equal to 1. The concept of Measurement Setup ID is defined in 11.21.18.3 (Sensing session setup). After the sensing measurement setup, sensing measurement instances are performed based on the defined ~~operational attribute set~~ operational parameters (Measurement Setup ID equal to 1). Each measurement instance is labeled with a Measurement Instance ID (see 11.21.18.4 (Sensing measurement setup)). After some time, a second sensing measurement setup procedure is performed between the AP and STA A that defines a second ~~operational attribute~~ set of operational parameters that is labeled with a Measurement Setup ID of 2. After the second sensing measurement setup, any subsequent sensing measurement instances may be performed based on either the first (Measurement Setup ID equal to 1) or second (Measurement Setup ID equal to 2) ~~operational attribute sets~~ set of operational parameters. ~~An operational attribute set~~ A sensing measurement setup may be terminated by performing a sensing measurement setup termination procedure; for example, Measurement Setup ID equal to 1 is terminated for the sensing session between the AP and STA A in both figures.

66.21-33 In Figure 11-41a (Example of a WLAN sensing procedure), a first sensing measurement setup procedure between the AP and STA B defines ~~an attribute set~~ a set of operational parameters that is identical to the one corresponding to Measurement Setup ID equal to 2 established between the AP and STA A and, therefore, shares the label of Measurement Setup ID equal to 2. Subsequent measurement instances associated with Measurement Setup ID equal to 2 may thus be associated with STA A, STA B, or both STA A and STA B. Each measurement instance may have one-to-many (including one-to-one) announcement and/or triggering, and may have either one-to-many or many-to-one (including one-to-one) sounding. As also illustrated in Figure 11-41a (Example of a WLAN sensing procedure), after a measurement setup is terminated, its label (specifically, the Measurement Setup ID) becomes available for re-use when a new measurement setup is performed, potentially with a different ~~corresponding operational attribute set~~ set of operational parameters.

67.6-8 Sensing measurement setup allows for a sensing initiator and a sensing responder to exchange and agree on ~~operational attributes~~ operational parameters associated with ~~a~~ sensing measurement instance(s).

68.3-5 The Measurement Instance ID may be used to identify the sensing measurement instance that ~~utilizes attributes of~~ has the same tuple <Sensing Initiator’s MAC address, Measurement Setup ID>.

75.44-51 A measurement setup procedure is then performed, which ~~defines a set of operational attributes~~ sets operational parameters labeled with a DMG Measurement Setup ID equal to 1. The agreed ~~operational attributes~~ set of operational parameters includes the intra-burst and the inter-burst intervals.

75.52-54 After the measurement setup, DMG sensing instances are performed based on the defined ~~operational attribute set~~ set of operational parameters (DMG Measurement Setup ID equal to 1).

76.5-6 The PCP/AP establishes the sensing session with one responder STA A and negotiates ~~the operational attributes~~ operational parameters with it.

76.8-10 The ~~operational attributes~~ operational parameters of the measurement belong to the DMG Measurement Setup ID equal to 1 and include the intra-burst interval.

76.44-46 The PCP/AP establishes the sensing session with one responder STA A and negotiates ~~the operational attributes~~ operational parameters with it.

76.48-49 The ~~operational attributes~~ operational parameters of the measurement belong to the DMG Measurement Setup ID equal to 1 and include the intra-burst and inter-burst intervals.

77.25-27 The PCP/AP establishes the sensing session with one responder STA and negotiates ~~the operational attributes~~ operational parameters with it.

77.43-44 ~~The operational attributes~~ Operational parameters of the measurement belong to the DMG Measurement Setup ID equal to 1 and include the intra-burst interval.

78.6 A DMG measurement setup procedure is then performed, which defines a set of ~~operational attributes~~ operational parameters.

78.9-11 ~~The operational attributes~~ Operational parameters identified with the same DMG Measurement Setup ID may be different among the involved STAs, besides the intra-burst and inter-burst intervals.

78.14-16 After the measurement setup, DMG sensing instances are performed based on the defined ~~operational attribute sets~~ set of operational parameters (DMG Measurement Setup ID equal to 1 and DMG Measurement Setup ID equal to 2).

82.42-49 An optional negotiation process in the DMG measurement setup is defined that allows for a sensing initiator and a sensing responder to exchange and agree on ~~operational attributes~~ operational parameters associated with DMG sensing bursts and DMG sensing instances. ~~The operational attributes~~ Operational parameters may include intra-burst and inter-burst schedule, number of instances per burst, roles of sensing initiator and sensing responder, DMG sensing type, DMG measurement report types, and other parameters. ~~The set of the operational attributes~~ Operational parameters agreed between the sensing initiator and the sensing responder ~~is~~ are labeled with the DMG Measurement Setup ID.

83.1-6 ~~The set of the operational attributes and parameters~~ Operational parameters established upon the negotiation ~~is~~ are identified by the DMG Measurement Setup ID.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 229 | 11.21.18.1 | 66.30 | There isn't a defination for "label" on Line 30 so readers cannot know what a label represents exactly. | Add a sentence to explain what the label is, e.g., it contains measurement setup ID and/or instance ID?Or simply remove "label" and use "Measurement setup ID" instead." |

**Proposed resolution**: Revised

**Discussion**: Reference text is:

“As also illustrated in Figure 11-41a (Example of a WLAN sensing procedure), after a measurement setup is terminated, its label (specifically, the Measurement Setup ID) becomes…”

Given that more than one comment has been received on the use of the word “label”, the proposed change consists of removing it not only from 66.30 but from the draft altogether.

**Note**: The following modification was made with the resolution of CID 851:

65.25: “…Operational attribute set (Measurement Setup ID equal to 1). Each measurement instance is ~~labeled with~~ assigned a Measurement Instance ID (see 11.21.18.4 (Sensing measurement setup)).”

**Modifications**: Editor – Modify the following pages/lines as indicated:

65.19-23: A first sensing measurement setup procedure is then performed, which defines a set of operational attributes ~~labeled with~~ that is assigned a Measurement Setup ID equal to 1.

66.24.27: a first sensing measurement setup procedure between the AP and STA B defines an attribute set that is identical to the one corresponding to Measurement Setup ID equal to 2 established between the AP and STA A and, therefore, ~~shares the label of~~ is also assigned a Measurement Setup ID equal to 2.

66.29-31 As also illustrated in Figure 11-41a (Example of a WLAN sensing procedure), after a sensing measurement setup is terminated, ~~its label (specifically,~~ the Measurement Setup ID~~)~~ becomes available for re-use when a new sensing measurement setup is performed,

75.44-47 A measurement setup procedure is then performed, which defines a set of operational attributes ~~labeled with~~ that is assigned a DMG Measurement Setup ID equal to 1.

75.54-56 Each DMG sensing instance is ~~labeled with~~ assigned a DMG sensing instance number (11.21.20.5 (DMG sensing instance)),

78.6-10 Two sets are established. The AP establishes with ~~the~~ STA A and ~~the~~ STA B ~~the set labeled with~~ a set that is assigned a DMG Measurement Setup ID equal to 1, and it establishes with ~~the~~ STA A and ~~the~~ STA C another set ~~labeled with~~ that is assigned a DMG Measurement Setup ID equal to 2.

78.23-24 Each DMG sensing instance ~~is labeled with~~ is assigned a a DMG sensing instance number, DMG Sensing Burst ID, and DMG Measurement Setup ID.

80.9-11 In the immediately following reporting phase it reports ~~with the~~ results ~~that are labeled with the~~ assigned with DMG Measurement Setup ID equal to 1,

80.15-18 In the immediately following reporting phase, both sensing responders report ~~with the~~ results ~~that are labeled with the~~ assigned with DMG measurement setup ID equal to 1,

81.13 The reports are ~~labeled with the~~ assigned DMG Measurement Setup ID equal to 1,

82.49 The set of the operational attributes agreed between the sensing initiator and the sensing responder is ~~labeled with the~~ assigned a DMG Measurement Setup ID.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 894 | 9.4.1.9 | 31.12 | It is a Status Code field. Table 9-78 shows the title of "Status Codes", which is contradictory to Status Code field | change the title of Table 9-78 to "Values of Status Code" |

**Proposed resolution**: Reject

**Discussion**: The baseline text refers to codes carried within the Status Code field, which are defined in Table 9-78, as "status codes" (and not "value(s) of Status Code"). For example, the following two sentences can be found in 9.4.1.9:

- "If an operation is successful, then the status code is set to SUCCESS (0)"

- "A status code of SUCCESS\_POWER\_SAVE\_MODE also indicates a successful operation"

In these two examples, SUCCESS and SUCCESS\_POWER\_SAVE\_MODE are referred to as "status codes" (and not "values of status code"). Therefore, the title of Table 9-78 is consistent with notation defined in 9.4.1.9.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 23 | 11.21.18.1 | 66.22 | title of the figure put in parenthesis when referring to the figure. | no need to put the caption of a figure in parenthesis when referring to the figure. This is a global problem in the document. |

**Proposed resolution**: Reject

**Discussion**: The draft follows the format used in the baseline document (IEEE P802.11REVme™/D1.1) and in the 802.11 Style Guide ([https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/09/11-09-1034-20-0000-802-11-editorial-style-guide.docx](https://urldefense.com/v3/__https%3A/gcc02.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https*3A*2F*2Fmentor.ieee.org*2F802.11*2Fdcn*2F09*2F11-09-1034-20-0000-802-11-editorial-style-guide.docx&data=05*7C01*7Canirudha.sahoo*40nist.gov*7C98d25f8ea917459f5b4408da4a63db28*7C2ab5d82fd8fa4797a93e054655c61dec*7C1*7C0*7C637904089998133987*7CUnknown*7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWIjoiMC4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0*3D*7C0*7C*7C*7C&sdata=Tl*2F*2F3LkajOuMxjGJwyxpk1hmp2dtE5Luy8Homg0drRM*3D&reserved=0__;JSUlJSUlJSUlJSUlJSUlJSUlJSUlJSUlJQ!!Bt8RZUm9aw!7hKpJN7kS27YbdM6abWIOZtw9Gy6W7s8DfvqH5_44K1hFGjrEMV_4q3J_Ty0EFFnfleu54ydVFuOi5hvqP2cue3LCwsb$)), which shows the caption of figures and tables when reference is made.