IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Proposed Comment Resolution for CIDs 1231 and 2310 |
| Date: 2022-05-13 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Company | Address | Phone | email |
| Stephen McCann | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd | Southampton, UK |  | stephen.mccann@ieee.org  |

Abstract

This document proposes a comment resolutions for CIDs 1231 and 2310 (REVme D1.0).

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|

| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** | **Owning Ad-hoc** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1231 | 217.23 | 3.2 | The defined term "detected access point" is not truly used. The places that deal with the concept (e.g., in sub clause 9.4.2.170) use another term (e.g., "might be detected by a STA") and then refer to the defintion specifically as if it provides clarifying information. In fact, the defintion text does not truly define the term and does not describe anything beyond the text used in the locations that reference the defintion. | Delete the defintion. In locations that refer to the defintion, delete the reference - the remaining text provides sufficient explanation. | Revised: Please make the changes shown in document: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0765-01-000m-comment-resolution-for-cids-1231-2310.docx> indicated by #1231. | GEN |
| 2310 | 1340.30 | 9.4.2.36 | The use of the term "detected access point" appears to be unecessary. All transmitted sub-fields in a frame tranmitted from an access point might be detected by a STA (or not). I don't think it is required to spell out every occurance of an access point sub-field that "might" be detected. | There are 6 or 7 occruances of this phrase throughout the draft and all of them can be re-moved, together with the definition of "detected access point" in clause 3.2. The commentor will bring a submission. | Revised: Please make the changes shown in document: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0765-01-000m-comment-resolution-for-cids-1231-2310.docx> indicated by #2310. | MAC |

 |

**CIDs 1231, 2310 Discussion**

*There are 7 occurrences of the phrase “detected access point” in the draft, all with specific references to the definition in clause 3.2. The clause 3.2 definition is [P217L23]:*

**detected access point (AP)**: An AP might be detected by a station (STA) if the STA and the AP are on the same channel and in range.

*For example, the next occurrence is [P1340L30]:*

The Unsolicited Probe Responses Active subfield is set to 1 if the reported AP is part of an ESS where all the APs that operate in the same channel as the reported AP and that might be detected by a STA receiving this frame [see the definition of “detected access point (AP)” in 3.2 (Definitions specific to IEEE Std 802.11)] have dot11UnsolicitedProbeResponseOptionActivated equal to true and so are transmitting unsolicited Probe Response frames every 20 TUs or less (see 26.17.2.3 (Scanning in the 6 GHz band))

*So, substituting the definition into the paragraph results in:*

The Unsolicited Probe Responses Active subfield is set to 1 if the reported AP is part of an ESS where all the APs that operate in the same channel as the reported AP and that might be detected by a STA receiving this frame [An AP might be detected by a station (STA) if the STA and the AP are on the same channel and in range.] have dot11UnsolicitedProbeResponseOptionActivated equal to true and so are transmitting unsolicited Probe Response frames every 20 TUs or less (see 26.17.2.3 (Scanning in the 6 GHz band)).

*Apart from the words “in range”, the 2 highlighted sentences repeat the same statement. Since “might be detected” is implied by “same channel and in range”, the definition of “detected access point” is not required.*

*In all of the other 6 occurrences, the sentence structure is very similar, with the same terminology and the same explicit reference to “detected access point (AP)” in 3.2)*

*In conclusion all 8 occurrences of “detected access point (AP)” can be removed*.

**Proposed Comment Resolutions**

REVISED: Make the following changes:

**3.2 Definitions specific to IEEE Std 802.11**

***TGme editor: Please delete the following definition on page 217 as follows:***

(#1231, #2310)

**9.4.2.36 Neighbor Report element**

***TGme editor: Please change paragraph 5 on page 1340 as follows:***

The Unsolicited Probe Responses Active subfield is set to 1, if the reported AP is part of an ESS where all the APs operate in the same channel as the reported AP and are on the same channel and in range of a STA receiving this frame (#1231, #2310), have dot11UnsolicitedProbeResponseOptionActivated equal to true and are transmitting unsolicited Probe Response frames every 20 TUs or less (see 26.17.2.3 (Scanning in the 6 GHz band)).

***TGme editor: Please change paragraph 6 on page 1340 as follows:***

The Member Of ESS With 2.4/5 GHz Co-Located AP subfield is set to 1, if the reported AP is part of an ESS where all the APs in the ESS are operating in the same band as the reported AP (irrespective of the operating channel in that band) are on the same channel and in range of a STA receiving this frame (#1231, #2310), have dot11MemberOfColocated6GHzESSOptionActivated equal to true and have a corresponding AP operating in the 2.4 GHz or 5 GHz bands that is in the same co-located AP set as that AP.

**9.4.2.170.2 Neighbor AP Information field**

***TGme editor: Please change paragraph 9 on page 1568 as follows:***

The Member Of ESS With 2.4/5 GHz Co-Located AP subfield is set to 1, if the reported AP is part of an ESS where all the APs in the ESS are operating in the same band as the reported AP (irrespective of the operating channel in that band) are on the same channel and in range of a STA receiving this frame (#1231, #2310), have dot11MemberOfColocated6GHzESSOptionActivated equal to true and have a corresponding AP operating in the 2.4 GHz or 5 GHz bands that is in the same co-located AP set as that AP.

***TGme editor: Please change paragraph 11 on page 1568 as follows:***

The Unsolicited Probe Responses Active subfield is set to 1, if the reported AP is part of an ESS where all the APs are operating in the same channel as the reported AP are on the same channel and in range of a STA receiving this frame (#1231, #2310), have dot11UnsolicitedProbeResponseOptionActivated equal to true and are transmitting unsolicited Probe Response frames every 20 TUs or less (see 26.17.2.3 (Scanning in the 6 GHz band)).

**11.53 Out-of-band discovery of a 6 GHz BSS**

***TGme editor: Please change paragraph 1 on page 3048 as follows:***

An AP may set the Unsolicited Probe Responses Active subfield to 1 for a reported AP in a Reduced Neighbor Report element or Neighbor Report element in a frame it transmits, if all 6 GHz APs, of the same ESS as the reported AP that operate in the same channel as the reported AP are on the same channel and in range of a STA receiving this frame (#1231, #2310), have dot11UnsolicitedProbeResponseOptionActivated equal to true and are transmitting unsolicited Probe Response frames every 20 TUs (see 26.17.2.3.2 (AP behavior for fast passive scanning)).

***TGme editor: Please change paragraph 2 on page 3048 as follows:***

An AP may set the Member Of ESS With 2.4/5 GHz Co-Located AP subfield to 1 in a Reduced Neighbor Report element in a frame it transmits, if the reported AP is a 6 GHz AP, is part of an ESS where all the APs in the ESS that is operating in the same band as the reported AP are on the same channel and in range of a STA receiving this frame (irrespective of the operating channel), have dot11MemberOfColocated6GHzESSOptionActivated equal to true and have a corresponding AP operating in the 2.4 GHz or 5 GHz band that is in the same co-located AP set as that AP. (#1231, #2310)

**26.17.2.3.3 Non-AP STA scanning behavior**

***TGme editor: Please change paragraph 6 on page 4276 as follows:***

Otherwise, if the STA has discovered the presence of an AP in that channel through means that are beyond the scope of this standard and the AP is on the same channel and is range of the STA (#1231, #2310), then the STA may send a Probe Request frame to the broadcast destination address in that channel, with the Address 3 field set to the BSSID of that AP, starting from step c) of 11.1.4.3.2 (Active scanning procedure for a non-DMG STA).